# ART MUSIC FOR BRASS: ASPECTS OF BRASS CHAMBER MUSIC AND ITS PERFORMANCE PRACTICE

# PROF JOHN ADAMSON MILLER

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the Manchester Metropolitan University for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy by Published Works

> Awarded for a programme of research at the Royal Northern College of Music by the Manchester Metropolitan University

> > June 2025

#### Abstract

The following critical appraisal of submitted published works presents me with an opportunity to track my activities as a performer-scholar, to bring new knowledge of my subject field to music students and scholars and add a practical dimension to the archival resources of RNCM, that now includes the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble Archive and the papers of Elgar Howarth (1935–2024). My monograph, *The Modern* Brass Ensemble in Twentieth-Century Britain (2022), is the first detailed account of a branch of music making that has been active for half a century. In addition, a selection of sixteen audio recordings in which I have played significant performing roles breaks new ground in several ways; these recordings are integral to my thesis as evidence of my arguments in regard to performance practice, viewpoints of contemporary music composers, concepts of virtuosity, reception of brass music, and historically informed performance. The earliest submitted recording, Pictures at an Exhibition (LP, 1978) captures a performance given by the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble that marked a point of change in performance practice and reception, and to many an epiphany. Likewise, Peter Maxwell Davies: Music for Brass (CD, 2015) captures The Wallace Collection's performance of his Brass Quintet, op. 100 (1981), a key work that received acclaim as an important chamber music work of its time. A further fourteen recordings document historical re-creations of original works and transcriptions for brass from the long nineteenth century. This branch of music making has grown significantly since the 1990s and my thesis will refer to my contribution to this development. Overall, this thesis underlines my concentration on maintaining dialogue between performance and scholarship and intends to contribute towards the cause of enhancing live art music-making in the widest sense.

## List of submitted published works

| Monograph  | Notes  |
|--|--|
| Miller, John. The Modern Brass Ensemble in<br>Twentieth-Century Britain. Woodbridge:<br>Boydell, 2022.   |  |
| CDs listed by dates of recording   | Notes  |
| Ovation (CD, 1991) [Decca. BIEM/Sterma.<br>425.022-2]. Philip Jones Brass Ensemble,<br>cond. Elgar Howarth. Mussorgsky arr.<br>Howarth, Pictures at an Exhibition. | Tracks 1–10: Digital remastered version of<br><i>Pictures at an Exhibition</i> (Vinyl LP record,<br>1978) [Argo. ZRG 885]. I was a member of the<br>Philip Jones Brass Ensemble 1972–80. Role:<br>trumpet 2 in C and off-stage trumpet.    |
| Gabrieli & St Mark's: Venetian Brass Music (CD,<br>1990) [Nimbus. NI 5236]. The Wallace<br>Collection, cond. Simon Wright.   | Music of Giovanni Gabrieli and his<br>contemporaries played on modern orchestral<br>brass instruments. John Wallace and John<br>Wallace: solo trumpets. John Miller:<br>flugelhorn.  |
| Baltic Brass (CD, 2001) [Deux-Elles. DXL 1042].<br>The Wallace Collection. Brass music by<br>Jean Sibelius and Victor Ewald.                                       | Contents: Jean Sibelius, <i>Petite Suite</i> and <i>Tiera</i> ;<br>Victor Ewald, Brass Quintets nos. 1–3.<br>Premier recording on historical instruments.<br>John Miller: cornet 1 in Ewald Quintet no. 1,<br>cornet 2 in all other items. |
| Peter Maxwell Davies: Music for Brass (CD, 2015)<br>[Nimbus. NI 5936]. The Wallace<br>Collection.  | Recorded in the presence of the composer in<br>1999 and 2001.<br>Premier recordings of <i>Fanfare for Lowry</i><br>(2000) for two solo trumpets, and Brass<br>Quintet (1981).  |

| The Origin of the Species: Virtuoso Victorian Brass<br>Music from Cyfarthfa Castle. (CD, 1996)<br>[Nimbus. NI 5470]. The Wallace<br>Collection, cond. Simon Wright.  | Played on period instruments. Keyed bugles<br>and ophicleides, slide trombones, rotary and<br>piston valved instruments match as close as<br>possible the instrumentation of the original<br>band.<br>John Miller: joint solo cornet. Courtois 'Levy<br>Model' Bb cornet (1872–76).   |
|--|---|
| Origin of the Species Revisited (CD, 2021) [The<br>Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2020-001].<br>The Wallace Collection. Bellon: Quintets<br>nos. 1–3, 12.   | Premier recordings of 12 brass quintets by<br>Jean-François Bellon (c. 1848–50) played on<br>historical instruments. John Miller plays a<br>Courtois 'Levy Model' Bb cornet (1872–76).  |
| Origin of the Species Revisited: Bellon Complete<br>Edition vol. 2 (CD, 2021) [The Wallace<br>Collection. TWC-FR2021-001]. The<br>Wallace Collection. Bellon: Quintets nos.<br>4–7.  | John Miller plays a Kohler 'Bayley's Acoustic<br>Model' Bb cornet with Berlin valves (1862).  |
| Origin of the Species Revisited: Bellon Complete<br>Edition vol. 3. (CD, 2021) [The Wallace<br>Collection. TWC-FR2021-002]. The<br>Wallace Collection. Bellon: Quintets nos.<br>8–11, no.12 finale 'Tema con<br>variazione'. | John Miller plays a Kohler 'Bayley's Acoustic<br>Model' Bb cornet with Berlin valves (1862).  |
| <i>Resonances of Waterloo</i> (CD, 2018)<br>[Sanctiandree. SAND0007]. St Salvator's<br>Chapel Choir, University of St Andrews.<br>The Wallace Collection. Tom Wilkinson<br>and Anthony George, conductors.                   | Sigismund von Neukomm, <i>Requiem à la<br/>memoire de Louis XVI</i> . Tracks 4–38.<br>John Miller, solo keyed trumpet. Replica by<br>Rainer Egger after Alois Doke, Linz, c. 1823.  |
| Haydn Transformed: Seven CD set of nineteenth-<br>century Parisian brass transcriptions.<br>The Wallace Collection: John Miller, John<br>Wallace, Fergus Kerr, Paul Stone,<br>Anthony George                                 | Twenty-three Haydn String Quartets were<br>transcribed by Julien Tollot in nineteenth<br>century Paris for quintets of valved brass<br>instruments. The players compiled part sets<br>from original materials. Op. 74, no. 3 was<br>reconstructed by Sandy Coffin.<br>John Miller: Mezzo-soprano cornet in Bb and<br>soprano cornet in Eb.<br>Courtois 'Levy Model' Bb cornet (1872–76).<br>Mahillon Eb trumpet Model M (Brussels, c.<br>1900). Higham's Clear-bore contesting<br>soprano cornet in Eb (Manchester, c. 1923). |
| Details continue below:  |   |
|  |   |
|  |   |

| Haydn Transformed vol. 1: The Bird, The Emperor<br>and The Dream (CD, 2023) [The Wallace<br>Collection. TWC-SR2023-001]. The<br>Wallace Collection.             | Joseph Haydn arr. Julien Tollot (c. 1806–96):<br>Quartet Hob.III: 39 (op.33, no. 3) 'The Bird'<br>Tracks 1–4.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 77 (op.76, no. 3) 'The<br>Emperor' Tracks 5–8.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 48 (op.50, no.5) 'The Dream'<br>Tracks 9–12. |
|---|---|
| Haydn Transformed vol. 2: The Seven Last Words<br>of Christ on the Cross (CD, 2025) [The<br>Wallace Collection. Pre-release copy ©<br>2025].                    | Joseph Haydn arr. Julien Tollot (c. 1806–96):<br>Seven last Words Hob.III: 50–56 (op. 51).<br>Tracks 1–9: Introduzione; Sonatas 1–7; II<br>Terremoto (The Earthquake).  |
| Haydn Transformed vol. 3: The Father of the<br>Brass Quintet2025) [The Wallace<br>Collection. Pre-release copy © 2025].   | Joseph Haydn arr. Julien Tollot (c. 1806–96):<br>Quartet Hob.III: 31 (op. 20 no. 1) Tracks 1–4.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 32 (op. 20 no. 2) Tracks 5–8.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 33 (op. 20 no. 3) Tracks 9–12.  |
| Haydn Transformed vol. 4: Russian and Prussian<br>(CD, 2025) [The Wallace Collection. Pre-<br>release copy © 2025].   | Joseph Haydn arr. Julien Tollot (c. 1806–96):<br>Quartet Hob.III: 44 (op. 33 no. 4) Tracks 1–4.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 45 (op. 50 no. 2) Tracks 5–8.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 46 (op. 50 no.3) Tracks 9–12.   |
| Haydn Transformed vol. 5: Apponyi Quartets I<br>(CD, 2025) [The Wallace Collection. Pre-<br>release copy © 2025].   | Joseph Haydn arr. Julien Tollot (c. 1806–96):<br>Quartet Hob.III: 69 (op. 71 no. 1) Tracks 1–4.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 70 (op. 71 no. 2) Tracks 5–8.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 71 (op. 71 no. 3) Tracks 9–12.  |
| Haydn Transformed vol. 6: For Count and Concert<br>Hall. Apponyi Quartets II (CD, 2023) [The<br>Wallace Collection. TWC-SR2023-001].<br>The Wallace Collection. | Joseph Haydn arr. Julien Tollot (c. 1806–96):<br>Quartet Hob.III: 72 (op. 74, no. 1) Tracks 1–4.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 73 (op.74, no. 2) Tracks 5–8.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 74 (op.74, no. 3) 'The Rider'<br>Tracks 9–12.                              |
| Haydn Transformed vol. 7: Erdödy, Fifths and<br>Sunrise I (CD, 2025) [The Wallace<br>Collection. Pre-release copy © 2025].                                      | Joseph Haydn arr. Julien Tollot (c. 1806–96):<br>Quartet Hob.III: 75 (op. 76, no. 1) Tracks 1–4.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 76 (op. 76, no. 2) 'Fifths'<br>Tracks 5–8.<br>Quartet Hob.III: 78 (op.76, no. 4) 'Sunrise'<br>Tracks 9–12.                   |

Preface

Matters of terminology and further technical details pertinent to this thesis are to be found in *The Modern Brass Ensemble* (The Boydell Press, 2022), xiii–xv.

I thank the Research Department of the Royal Northern College of Music for supporting the study towards this thesis, and in particular Prof Wiebke Thormählen who has provided expert guidance and unfailing rigour over the last year. My friend and colleague John Wallace, with Fergus Kerr, Paul Stone, Anthony George, and Sandy Coffin have comprised a musical and social nucleus where musical harmony and 'Pastyme with Good Companye' have been inseparable in Glasgow, Skye, New York and beyond. My family: Rebecca, Julian & Domi, Ruth, Helen & Dan and their children, alongside Bill Wilson and my friends in Lancaster have been a wonderful personal support.

I dedicate this thesis to the memory of my wife

June Patricia Wilkinson (1949–2024)

#### List of figures

Fig. 1. Bookplate: The Philip Jones Brass Ensemble Library.

**Fig. 2.** The harmonic series of a natural trumpet with a fundamental of C2, and the corresponding sounding pitches of a trumpet in 6½ft Eb.

**Fig. 3.** Natural and keyed pitches utilised in Haydn's Trumpet Concerto, Hob. VIIe, no. 1.

Fig. 4. Haydn, Trumpet Concerto, second movement, bars 19–24.

Fig. 5. Haydn, Trumpet Concerto, first movement, bars 107–17.

Fig. 6. Haydn, Trumpet Concerto, first movement, bars 144–54.

Fig. 7. Hummel, Trumpet Concerto, first movement, bars 116–19.

Fig. 8. Hummel, Trumpet Concerto, first movement, bars 136–14.

Fig. 9. Hummel, Trumpet Concerto, first movement, bars 176–182.

Fig. 10. Hummel, Trumpet Concerto, third movement, bars 45–58.

**Fig. 11.** Neukomm, *Zwischenspiele*, no. 5 from Neukomm's Requiem. Keyed trumpet in Eb, bars 1–8.

**Fig. 12.** Table listing Julien Tollot's transcriptions of Haydn string quartets for brass quintet, held at the Bibliothèque nationale de France. Courtesy of Sandy Coffin.

**Fig. 13.** Selected fundamental articulations for cornet from St Jacome's *Grand Method.* 

**Fig. 14.** Haydn, String quartet Hob. III: 39 (op. 33, no. 3): Lafleur publication no. 6, fourth movement, bars 1–5.

**Fig. 15.** Haydn, String quartet Hob. III: 39 (op. 33, no. 3): Lafleur publication no. 6: Haydn's third movement, bars 1–4 becomes Tollot's second movement, bars 1–11.

**Fig. 16.** Haydn, String quartet Hob. III: 48 (op. 50, no. 5): Tollot manuscript no. 14, movement 2, bars 1–4.

**Fig. 17.** Haydn, String quartet Hob. III: 48 (op. 50, no. 5): Tollot manuscript no. 14, movement 3, bars 1–5.

**Fig. 18.** Haydn, String quartet Hob. III: 77 (op. 76, no. 3) 'Emperor': Tollot manuscript no. 15, movement 4, bars 101–106.

**Ex. 19.** Haydn, String quartet Hob. III: 77 (op. 76, no. 3) 'Emperor': Tollot manuscript no. 15, movement 2, variation 2, bars 41–48. **c** 

**Fig. 20.** Haydn, String quartet Hob. III: 77 (op. 76, no. 3) 'Emperor'. Tollot manuscript no. 15, movement 4, bars 101–106.

Fig. 21. The culmination of St Jacome's high register training for cornet.

**Fig. 22**. St Jacome's second cornet flourish (stems down *ossia* notes in the final two bars).

**Fig. 23.** Table of selective published editions and audio records of Giovanni Gabrieli's *Sonata pian e forte.* 

Fig. 24: Wasielewski's edition of Sonata pian e forte, bars 1–4.

Fig. 25. Benvenuti's edition of Sonata pian e forte, bars 1-4.

## Contents

| Introduction1  |
|--|
| 1. Research background and methodologies of submitted published works5 |
| 2. The Viennese keyed trumpet and its performance practice             |
| 3. Evocation of the Classical and Romantic string quartet27            |
| 4. Giovanni Gabrieli's Sonata pian e forte: A contextual case study55  |
| Concluding remarks73   |
| Bibliography74   |
| Discography  |

#### Introduction

The following critical appraisal of my submitted published works presents me with an opportunity to track my activities as a performer-scholar, to bring new knowledge of my subject field to music students and scholars and add a practical dimension to the archival resources of RNCM, that now includes the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble Archive and the papers of Elgar Howarth (1935–2024).

My monograph, The Modern Brass Ensemble in Twentieth-Century Britain (2022), is the first detailed account of a branch of music making that has been active for half a century. In addition, a selection of sixteen audio recordings in which I have played significant performing roles breaks new ground in several ways; these recordings are integral to my thesis as evidence of my arguments in regard of performance practice, viewpoints of contemporary music composers, concepts of virtuosity, reception of brass music, and historically informed performance. The earliest submitted recording, Pictures at an Exhibition (LP, 1978) captures a performance given by the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble that marked a point of change in performance practice and reception, and to many an epiphany. Likewise, Peter Maxwell Davies: Music for Brass (CD, 2015) captures The Wallace Collection's performance of his Brass Quintet, op. 100 (1981), a key work that received acclaim as an important chamber music work of its time. A further fourteen recordings document historical re-creations of original works and transcriptions for brass from the long nineteenth century. This branch of music making has grown significantly since the 1990s and my thesis will refer to my contribution to this development.

My research of the subject area of brass chamber music stemmed from knowledge of the Philip Jones Brass Archive at the RNCM, that I helped establish following its bequest in 2001. Donna McDonald's monograph (1986) tells the story of the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble's cumulative success, with excellent appendices of commissions, premieres, and gramophone records, but makes less reference to wider musical developments.<sup>1</sup> Building on this account, my first journal article (2019) expanded the narrative, drawing extensively on primary sources in the College's archive.<sup>2</sup> The article signalled the need for a wider study of the brass ensemble as a musical entity and its cultural significance within British musical life. Despite compelling book chapters and encyclopaedia entries,<sup>3</sup> in 2019 there was no existing resource that focused entirely on the performance practice, repertoire, and context of the 'brass ensemble' comparable to studies of the British 'brass band' such as Herbert (2000), a comprehensive edited musical and social history.<sup>4</sup> This is understandable: whereas the British 'brass band' has a strong identity, with standardised instrumentation and a distinctive idiom,<sup>5</sup> what is perceived as a 'brass ensemble' in Britain has a variety of configurations and sources of repertory. Consequently, in my monograph a primary aim was to define the shared characteristics and aims of musical entities that performed transcriptions of the instrumental music of Giovanni Gabrieli, Ruggles' *Angels*, Janáček's *Capriccio*, Copland's *Fanfare for the Common Man*, brass quintets by Arnold, Carter and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Donna McDonald, The Odyssey of the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble (Bulle: Bim, 1986).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> John Miller, "The Philip Jones Brass Ensemble, 1951–1986," *Historic Brass Society Journal* 31 (2019): 51–76. https://doi.org/10.2153/0120190011003.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> John Wallace, "Brass solo and chamber music from 1800," in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, eds. Trevor Herbert & John Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 236–54.

Elisa Koehler, "Brass Chamber Music," in *Fanfares and Finesse: A Performer's Guide to Trumpet History and Literature* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2014), 165-75.

Trevor Herbert and John Wallace. "Brass ensemble." in *The Cambridge Encyclopedia of Brass*. edited by Trevor Herbert, Arnold Myers & John Wallace. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019, 76–80.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Trevor Herbert, ed., *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Regarding bands' repertoire, Trevor Herbert writes of a group of composers in the mid-twentieth century, epitomised by Eric Ball and Gilbert Vinter, who contributed to the expansion of a considerable repertory of contest set pieces. Trevor Herbert. "British brass band." in *The Cambridge Encyclopedia of Brass*, edited by Trevor Herbert, Arnold Myers & John Wallace. Since the 1970s, composers Derek Bourgeois, Edward Gregson, Elgar Howarth, John McCabe, Philip Sparke and Philip Wilby have all added substantial works to this genre.

Maxwell Davies, as well as significant transcriptions, notably Elgar Howarth's transcription of Mussorgsky's *Pictures at an Exhibition*. Another undertaking was to address a research gap; prominent British ensembles that arose from the 1960s proliferated, but their histories were scantly documented. In these respects, my monograph provides a wealth of new knowledge.

The genesis of *The Modern Brass Ensemble in Twentieth-Century Britain* (The Boydell Press, 2022) dates back over twenty years. In 1999 Philip Jones CBE (1928–2000) agreed to bequeath the music of the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble (*fl.* 1951–86) to the RNCM. He was founding Head of School of Wind and Percussion 1975–77. I was a member of his ensemble (PJBE) 1972–80, playing in the recording and premiere of Howarth's transcription of Mussorgsky's *Pictures at an Exhibition* (1978), a further eleven albums, many concerts, broadcasts, and overseas tours until the PJBE's disbandment in 1986. It fell upon me to collect his library and papers from his former London home and categorise items before transference to the RNCM's archivist. Jones was musically inquisitive, fastidious, and pragmatic, and his library appeared a valuable resource for the College's music-making and research. Items suitable for loan (published and unannotated sheet music) were transferred to RNCM Library stock during 2002, identifiable by a distinctive bookplate (Fig. 1).



**Fig. 1.** Bookplate: The Philip Jones Brass Ensemble Library. The logo and typeface replicate those of the PJBE.

All other bequeathed items are held in the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble Archive in thirteen boxes of manuscripts, annotated scores, and additional boxes of correspondence, programmes and press cuttings.<sup>6</sup> This historical resource will soon be augmented by the papers of Elgar Howarth (1935–2025) which were being catalogued in November 2024, and cross-referenced holdings are likely to be of considerable significance to scholars.

The acquisition of the PJBE Archive coincided with the commencement of my full-time employment at RNCM 1999–2017, and although I was interested in researching brass chamber music, I prioritised running the brass programme. After the PJBE disbanded in 1986, John Wallace set up The Wallace Collection (TWC) as a flexible ensemble to fill a musical vacuum. He moved north from London to be Principal of the Royal Scottish Academy of Music and Drama (later Royal Conservatoire of Scotland) 2002–14. During this period TWC and its related activities went into abeyance.<sup>7</sup> In 2012, however, I made my first conference presentation at a meeting of the Historic Brass Society (HBS) in New York, and this international forum became a focus of my scholarship and performance practice.<sup>8</sup> I presented further work-in-progress at subsequent HBS conferences in 2014 and 2017, leading to an article drawn from the unique resource of the PJBE Archive.<sup>9</sup> In 2017 I relinquished my position of Head of School of Wind, Brass and Percussion at the RNCM to pursue rapidly developing interests.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Philip Jones Brass Ensemble Archive. GB GB1179 PJBE

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> I am a founder member of TWC, set up in 1986 following the disbandment of PJBE.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> John Miller. 2012. "Trumpet Meets Cornet: The musical development of the valved trumpet and cornet in the nineteenth century, and the emergence of a twentieth-century virtuosity." Presentation at the 2<sup>nd</sup> International Historic Brass Symposium, New York, 12–15 July 2012. Gunther Schuller (1925–2015) attended this presentation; at a subsequent open forum he asserted that his Symphony for Brass and Percussion (1950) and the instrumental works of Giovanni Gabrieli were the two pillars of brass history.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> John Miller, "The Philip Jones Brass Ensemble, 1951–1986," *Historic Brass Society Journal* 31 (2019): 51–76. <u>https://doi.org/10.2153/0120190011003</u>.

### 1. Research background and methodologies of submitted published works

My ongoing research relating to *The Modern Brass Ensemble* raised key questions. Artistic endeavour and changes in reception in Britain had been led by the PJBE in its programming and practice, but lines of enquiry arose through defining various types of brass ensembles, their repertoire, performance practice, and reception: when and where did the aspiration of brass players to create and perform art chamber music begin? How could this be defined in a brass ensemble milieu? Did this activity interrelate with other idioms? Did seemingly disparate musical cultures coalesce into a common cause? Were key developments local, national or global? In framing this study, I settled on 1815 as a starting point, just after the Napoleonic wars when complete families of chromatic brass emerged. I played at Philip Jones's memorial concert at the Barbican Hall with TWC on 17<sup>th</sup> January 2001, exactly one year after his death, and to many this event marked the culmination of fifty years of development of 'the brass ensemble'.<sup>10</sup> Following this clear cut-off point, an envoi encompassing 2001-2015 shows the principal trends of brass ensembles and their twenty-first century audiences. In addition, developments in brass higher education of the last two decades of the twentieth century became more established and widespread. The envoi remains a key area for other researchers to look at in the future. My book has paved the way for this work.

Initial mapping of significant brass-related events 1815–2015 highlighted developments in professional, amateur and educational cultures, and creative hubs throughout Europe, Russia and USA where inventors, pioneering players, composers and others shared and developed common interests. In addition to identifying points of change, sustained strands of activity emerged that related to the origins or development of my subject area: the activities of the British-style brass band and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 123. This sets out the concert programme and the participants.

music of the military; the orchestral idiom; brass interactions with canonical chamber music, jazz and popular music; contemporary music societies. Whilst this may read as a disparate list, my objective was to chart and define the repertory, performance practice, and reception of a 'modern brass ensemble' typified by the brass quintet but including other formations of orchestral instruments. A book proposal-rationale and sample chapters-was submitted to The Boydell Press in August 2018, a contract subsequently issued in March 2019. This requested a manuscript submission by 1<sup>st</sup> October 2021 with a nominal word count of 100,000 words, including footnotes, appendices, and bibliography. Peer reviews were invaluable; they refined the structure, leading me to add a chapter on historical performance from a revivalist perspective, and expand on wider social agendas.<sup>11</sup> The narrative is styled for general readers and brass enthusiasts, and footnotes serve two further purposes: to point academics to sources related to an underresearched subject; to explain technicalities incomprehensible to a non-specialist, such as 'demilune trumpet' or 'double horn.' Finally, a selective list of published works, a selective discography (the first of its kind), and a functional index add reference tools. In my final manuscript of late 2021, the proposed title was 'The Modern Brass Ensemble: Art Music for Brass and Britain's Part in its Evolution.' The pragmatic preference of the publisher for a more general title focusing on twentieth century British culture prevailed; this was appropriate although earlier periods and wider locations were necessary to contextualise the heart of the narrative.

The seven chapters of the book stand as self-sufficient cause-and-effect articles, based around major points of change. Chapter One, an outline of nineteenth century brass music, charts the developments that followed the establishment of families of chromatic brass instruments, and relies largely on secondary sources. Nonetheless, this contextualises the first substantial body of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 1–4. The introduction explains the book's final outline and contents.

original brass quintets, in mid-nineteenth century Paris, and pinpoints the rise of brass transcriptions of music of the High Renaissance in Germany thirty years later.

Chapter Two is broader in scope and framed around the interlocking developments mentioned above. It investigates the advent of jazz and its popularisation of brass instruments, performances of radical brass music at international composers' societies, and the emergence of distinct all-brass ensembles following World War II. In addition, the British-style brass band attained significant respect from the establishment following Holst's A Moorside Suite (1928) and subsequent contest test pieces by prominent British composers; the chapter clarifies differences in idiom, repertoire and performance practice between its amateur culture and contemporaneous professional orchestral ensembles. At this stage in my write-up during a Covid epidemic lock-down, correspondence with archivists of the Archives Théàtre de Champs Elysées, Yale University Music Library, New York Public Library and others uncovered information on landmark works: for example, the premiere of Poulenc's Sonata for Horn, Trumpet and Trombone; the history of Ruggles' Angels for six muted trumpets; the function of Hindemith's Morgenmusik. In addition, music familiar to general listeners such as Copland's Fanfare for the Common Man and Janáček's Sinfonietta are contextualised. Overall, this chapter provides detailed information on music that brass enthusiasts know well.

Chapters Three to Six are woven around the history of the PJBE, that arguably created unparalleled change in reception in Britain, Germany, Japan, the United States, and Scandinavia. My monograph targets particular information not contained in McDonald (1986), for example the programme of the PJBE's first significant public concert in 1962; the concert programme of the New York Brass Quintet at the American Embassy in 1963. Data was gathered from the Britten Pears Arts Archives, surviving members of the New York Brass Quintet (fl. 1954–84) and American Brass Quintet (fl. 1960–), and information not in the public domain through Jones's widow, Ursula. Otherwise, there was scant existing information in regard of other professional brass ensembles that proliferated in the succeeding decades: London Gabrieli Brass Ensemble, London Symphony Orchestra Brass, London Brass, Fine Arts Brass Ensemble, The Wallace Collection. Consequently, my account is substantiated through data held in the British Library, record liner notes, archived concert programmes, the BBC's Genome archive, the archives of the London Symphony Orchestra and the Hallé Orchestra, and through personal meetings with key musicians willing to provide first-hand testimony.

Chapter Seven, 'Aspects of Historical Brass: Uncovering Phenomena of the Past' was prompted by proposals put forward in peer review following my initial planning. Written from a revivalist perspective, this concentrates on activities in Britain 1970–2000, that saw the foundation and establishment of 'early music' brass groups, a serious engagement of higher education institutions, and the emergence of specialist practitioners who criss-crossed from performance to scholarship and vice versa. Some duplication from historical detail in Chapter One is addressed through cross-referencing.

I doubt whether I could have conceived *The Modern Brass Ensemble* without a pre-understanding of the subject field, set up through experiences as witness and/or participant. This emanated partly from key events, namely the recording and premiere of Howarth's transcription of *Pictures* in 1978; the re-creation in 1996 of the Victorian music of the Cyfarthfa Band, Wales; the premier recording of Peter Maxwell Davies's Brass Quintet in 2001 in the presence of the composer. More generally, these and other events exemplified a well-established collegiality in respect of professional and scholarly approaches to this type of music-making. In addition, my tenures as an educationalist at the Guildhall School of Music, the Royal Northern College of Music, the National Youth Orchestra and European Union Youth Orchestra placed me close to several innovations in music education in late twentieth century Britain.

From Chapter Five, therefore, the book embraces autobiographical recollection, acknowledging subjective experience as an important source of knowledge. However, given the attendant risk of misremembering, it was critical to incorporate checks and balances during the processes of planning and writing; formal peer review and personal mentoring alerted me to potential dangers of selfindulgence or misrepresentation. Firstly, specific written sections were shared with contemporaries for feedback and comment: for example, my account of the activities of the Gallina Brass Quintet that I witnessed in the 1970s was refined by Helen Crayford, a leading member; a six-page narrative regarding London Brass required significant revision following e-mail feedback to the author from two of its former player-managers, Roger Harvey and David Purser; a final draft of Chapter Seven was shared with Anneke Scott, a leading exponent of historical brass chamber music, in addition to specific detail checks of particular historically informed ensembles.<sup>12</sup> Tests of validity and accuracy that linked these personal and joint perspectives with the book's historical approach required my corroboration through such documentary evidence that was available, prior to the final scrutiny of the publisher's peer review. Most importantly, notwithstanding the autobiographical factors discussed above, the narrative of The Modern Brass Ensemble carefully avoids a rich personal narrative, typical for example in autoethnography, but rather draws out wider changes, continuities, trends and innovation.

Moving on from the focus on my book, this thesis extends outwards from subjects outlined or recurrently mentioned therein, presented in three case studies: a concise account of the Viennese keyed trumpet concentrates on three important works written within a short time frame when a complete family of chromatic brass emerged. Next, a cross-historical case study discusses brass music that aspired to evoke the Classical and Romantic string quartet. Thirdly, a historiography of Giovanni Gabrieli's *Sonata pian e forte* argues the aesthetic merits of transcriptions that have endured as a valuable component of a brass repertory. Whereas the methodology of *The Modern Brass Ensemble* concentrates on archival research, historical study and repertoire study based on selected key works, the three case studies provide in-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, ix. At the foot of the Acknowledgements page, twenty individuals are listed who provided information and followed with feedback on my drafts.

depth information on performance practice and repertoire, embracing qualitative methods and prioritising reflectivity.

On performance practice, the years 2016–24 embraced opportunities to develop research-based practice, deepening methods of engagement with historical performance. In the three following case studies, audio recordings made then are integrated as evidence of research-in-performance. These document historical recreations of original works and transcriptions for brass from the long nineteenth century, and are referred to extensively, underpinning my concentration on maintaining dialogue between performance and scholarship.

#### 2. The Viennese keyed trumpet and its performance practice

My involvement as solo keyed trumpeter in the premier historical recording of Sigismund von Neukomm's Requiem à la memoire de Louis XVI led me to reflect in depth on early Romantic brass music and its performance, the essence of Chapter One of The Modern Brass Ensemble.<sup>13</sup> In addition, although this section is constructed around secondary literature, it revolves around my considerations of performance practice, informed through study and experimentation on an appropriate replica period instrument. My interest in the keyed trumpet was spontaneous, initiated through acquiring an instrument and studying Haydn's Concerto in 1998. The only prerequisite was having a good working knowledge of the natural trumpet, and common fingering patterns came naturally, with the guidance of a fingering chart from the method of Andreas Nemetz (1827). I hold the view that the possession of a suitable Classical trumpet mouthpiece is critical to development. My keyed trumpet is a replica of a model by Alois Doke, Linz, c. 1823, made in 2013 by Rainer Egger, Basel, Switzerland. Understanding the scope, nuances and limitations of this Austrian-style keyed trumpet has brought a fresh understanding to my performance and teaching of the two famous concertos written for it, by Joseph Haydn and Johann Hummel, that prevail as key solo repertoire for modern and historical trumpet. In addition, the practical experience of performing Neukomm's Requiem has signalled pathways for future research.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Sigismund von Neukomm, *Requiem à la memoire de Louis XVI*. Tracks 4–38, on *Resonances of Waterloo* (CD, 2018) [Sanctiandree. SAND0007]. St Salvator's Chapel Choir, University of St Andrews, cond. Tom Wilkinson; The Wallace Collection. Brass ensemble: John Miller, solo keyed trumpet; Anneke Scott, [hand] horn by Raoux, 1850; Christopher Larkin, horn by John Webb; Fergus Kerr, horn by Schmid; Rachel Brady, horn by John Webb; Susan Addison, alto trombone by Egger, replica of 1780 model by Crone; Emily White, tenor trombone by Egger, replica of 1778 model by Schmied; Adrian France, bass trombone by Egger, replica of 1789 model by Schmied. Anthony George adds independent parts for serpent and ophicleide: Serpent (replica of 1810 Baudouin by Monk) in *Sed Signifer*, and ophicleide (by Gautrot, 1850) in several movements

The recording sessions in 2016 coincided with the planning of the book and the juxtaposition proved serendipitous. The historic performance of Neukomm's Mass in 1815 is politically and musically important, and the phenomenon of the choir of chromatic brass reinforcing the solemnity of this international event consequently marks the chronological start of *The Modern Brass Ensemble*.<sup>14</sup>

The curation of the recording venue and process demonstrates significant attention to detail with an objective of encapsulating the essence of Neukomm's music. The record was captured 14–17 June 2016 at St James's Church, Bermondsey (1827–29), designed by James Savage (1779–1852) and subsidised £17,666 by a Church Building Grant that marked Britain's appreciation for the defeat of Napoleon Bonaparte. St Salvator's choir and soloists, from St Andrews University, were accompanied by the resonance of St James's original organ by Bishop and Son (1829) and a professional brass ensemble playing period instruments at pitch A4 = 430 Hz.

The resultant record, *Resonances of Waterloo* (CD, 2018) was launched at a public concert given at St Alfege Church, Greenwich, on 2<sup>nd</sup> July 2018. In preparation for this, I rehearsed alongside hornist Christopher Larkin (1947–2021) and trombonist Susan Addison (b. 1955) as joint side-by-side mentors of hornists and trombonists studying at the Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance.

Amongst the earliest chromatic brass instruments that used mechanical means to change the pitch of the harmonic series, the keyed trumpet achieved much wider use than supposed by most trumpeters. In his PhD dissertation (2022), Robert Apple traces 720 works that include keyed trumpet that occurred from 1796 to c. 1855, of which 676 have survived.<sup>15</sup> The instrument became obsolete in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 7–11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Robert Warren Apple, "The Music Composed for the Keyed Trumpet" (PhD diss., University of Memphis, 2022), vii–viii, <u>https://digitalcommons.memphis.edu/etd/3402.</u> The works identified and catalogued by Apple were mostly performed in Austria, Bohemia, and Italy, and include chamber, dance, military, and sacred music, keyed trumpet solos, and Italian Opera. Much of the repertory was subsequently performed on flugelhorn or early valved trumpet in this period of transition.

mid-nineteenth century, and its later recognition and historical revival arose from interest in the two aforementioned works– Concerto [for Clarino in Eb] by Joseph Haydn (1796) and Concerto [a Tromba principale] by Johann Nepomuk Hummel (1803)–and interest in the activities of Anton Weidinger (1766–1852), the player who persuaded these composers to write for the chromatic instrument he developed. The two concertos were rediscovered c. 1900 and 1957 respectively, and since their re-establishment as canonical works have maintained long-lasting popularity with players and concert audiences.<sup>16</sup>

Swedish musicologist Reine Dalqvist (1945–2014) triggered scholarship on the keyed trumpet through a master's thesis at the University of Gothenburg in 1969, revised into a twenty-four-page monograph published by The Brass Press in 1975.<sup>17</sup> The invention and emergence of the keyed trumpet are unclear, however. Recent literature by Sabine Klaus concludes that it is impossible to identify one inventor; from the 1770s there were many simultaneous and parallel developments over several decades, some initially aiming to correct intonation rather than provide diatonic or chromatic capabilities. Klaus defines the term *Inventions-Trompete* firstly as an instrument with the capability to change crooks easily, and secondly a short-model with a second loop, that enables the player to reach the bell and handstop. The latter could accommodate exchangeable U-shaped crooks in the centre of the corpus (rather than terminal crooks inserted into the mouthpiece receiver).<sup>18</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Despite a copy of Haydn's Trumpet Concerto in the Royal Conservatoire of Brussels being used for teaching purposes c. 1907, documented by Edward Tarr in the preface to his 1982 edition of the work, the first published score is by Alfa Verlag, Berlin, 1931. George Eskdale made the first recording of the Andante and Rondo on modern Eb trumpet (Shellac 12" disc, Columbia DX933, 1938). The first publication of Hummel's concerto ed. Fritz Stein was transposed down to Eb major (Leipzig: Hofmeister, 1957) and first recorded by Armando Ghitalla (member of Boston Symphony Orchestra) in 1964, on a modern C trumpet in the original key of E major (Vinyl mono record, Cambridge CRM1819, 1964).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Reine Dalqvist, *The Keyed Trumpet and its Greatest Virtuoso, Anton Weidinger* (Nashville: The Brass Press, 1975).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Sabine Katharina Klaus, "The Keyed Trumpet," in *Ways to Expand the Harmonic Series*, vol. 2, *Trumpets and other High Brass* (Vermillion: National Music Museum, 2013), 140, 167.

#### Weidinger and Joseph Haydn

Despite uncertainties over the keyed trumpet's origins, there is no doubt that Weidinger was a key figure in its development. In 1800, prior to the premiere of Haydn's concerto, Weidinger spent seven years in perfecting his *Organiesirte Trompete*. During this period, he premiered modest but imaginative works by Leopold Koželuch (1798) and Joseph Weigl Jr. (1799). Although there is no surviving instrument or further documentary evidence, my analysis bears out that Haydn's concerto can be performed on an Eb natural trumpet equipped with three keys that open a series of tone-holes that shorten the sounding length of its tube by a semitone, a tone, and a minor third (Figs.2,3).<sup>19</sup>

**Fig. 2** shows the harmonic series of a natural trumpet with a fundamental of C2. The lower stave shows the corresponding sounding pitches of a trumpet in 6½-ft Eb. Notes marked  $\uparrow$  or  $\downarrow$  identify harmonics that diverge furthest from equal temperament:



When the three keys are used to open individual vent holes an almost complete chromatic scale is possible. Nonetheless, as shown in Fig. 3, Haydn was cautious in his use of pitches between the third and fourth harmonics; he theoretically could have used two further pitches, A3 and Bb3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> See Klaus, *The Keyed Trumpet*, 164. Figs. 5.11–15 depict a trumpet dated 1817 and supports the notion that early instruments may well have resembled natural models. See also Apple, "The Music Composed for the Keyed Trumpet," 47–49, that discusses collaborative experimentation in 2019 by Robert Apple, trumpeter Friedemann Immer, and instrument maker Günter Hett.

Fig. 3. Natural and keyed pitches utilised in Haydn's Trumpet Concerto.



0 = no keys open. 1 = the key nearest the bell. 2 = the key second from the bell. 3 = the key furthest from the bell. The customary working range of the keyed trumpet is harmonic 3–harmonic 14. Fig. 3 sounds a minor third above the written pitch.

One salient feature of Haydn's writing for the instrument is that his chromatic writing is scholarly and understated, and effect arises from musical context. I concur with Wallace, who describes a passage in the tranquil Andante as "the most chromatic and turbulent part of the work as far as the trumpet is concerned–it modulates through key after key until it arrives in the outlandish key for any instrument, far less the trumpet at that time, of C flat major."<sup>20</sup> (See Fig. 4) The urtext source of Figs. 4–6 contains many omissions and discrepancies, clues that Haydn wrote the work in haste.<sup>21</sup>

**Fig. 4.** Haydn, Trumpet Concerto, second movement bars 19–24. Henceforth the musical examples in regard of Haydn and Hummel are annotated with the author's fingerings for five-keyed replica keyed trumpet played with a Classical period mouthpiece:



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> John Wallace and Alexander McGrattan, *The Trumpet* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2011), 180.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Joseph Haydn, Concerto in Eb major for Trumpet and Orchestra, Urtext study score from "Joseph Haydn Werke", ed. Makoto Ohmiya and Sonja Gerlach (Munich: Henle, 1985).

On the other hand, Haydn's most flamboyant writing is exemplified in the following upper-register diatonic passagework at the end of the development section in the first movement (bars 107–109). By contrast, a final chromatic touch before the recapitulation (bars 115–17) is masterly, set discreetly within the orchestral *tutti* (Fig. 5).





In 2015, Michael Lorenz presented substantial evidence that suggests that the concerto may have been a wedding present to Weidinger and Suzanna Zeissen. Weidinger married Zeissen in Vienna on 6<sup>th</sup> February 1797, and Haydn was a witness at the ceremony. Zeissen was the crucial link between Weidinger and Haydn, being an orphaned minor living in Haydn's residence prior to her marriage.<sup>22</sup> Loren's facts reinforce the prevailing view that prior to 1796 Haydn understood the workings, subtleties and limitations of Weidinger's *Organiesirte Trompete*, and debunks an opposing hypothesis put forward by Bryan Proksch in 2014. Proksch speculates that Haydn's concerto may have been composed as an abstract conception, due to the composer's absence at the premiere and other circumstantial reasons.<sup>23</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Michael Lorenz, "Six More Unknown Godchildren of Joseph Haydn," Musicological Trifles and Biographical Paralipomena (blog), March 1, 2015, <u>http://michaelorenz.blogspot.com/2015/03/six-more-unknown-godchildren-of-joseph.html,2</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Bryan Proksch, "Reassessing Haydn's Friendship with Anton Weidinger," *Historic Brass Society Journal* 26 (2014): 1-11.

Weidinger premiered the concerto in Vienna on 28<sup>th</sup> March 1800. A review of a subsequent concert given in Leipzig in December 1802, the first stop of a European concert tour, is the most comprehensive known report of Weidinger's prowess:

The Imperial Royal Court Trumpeter Mr. Weidinger of Vienna gave us the opportunity to judge for ourselves his significant invention for the improvement of the trumpet ... and at the same time to admire his masterful playing. It is entirely true that Mr. W. has command of all the semitones that lie within the compass of his instrument, and indeed in such a manner that he plays rapid scale passages through them. Furthermore, the concern we expressed upon the first report of this Invention, that this instrument might lose something of its ostentatious character as a result, has been proven completely belied by [Weidinger's] public demonstrations. The instrument still possesses its full, penetrating tone, but at the same time one so gentle and delicate that one would not even be able to play it softer on a clarinet ... The crescendo and diminuendo, the clear high register that penetrates to the very marrow, especially in those places where Mr. W. remained within the natural key of the instrument, are truly incomparable and, in the literal sense of the word, unheard-of. We cannot decide how much is due to the new invention and how much to the skilled virtuoso, since for the meantime he keeps for himself detailed knowledge of his instrument. In any case, Mr. W. deserves much acclaim, and his instrument every attention.<sup>24</sup>

The above comments on Weidinger's wide dynamic control are intriguing. Scholarship to date focuses on the timbre of keyed trumpet in medium and soft dynamics: Dalqvist felt that the flugelhorn could best approach 'the original sound' in modern performance;<sup>25</sup> Edward Tarr likened the nuances of open and keyed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Allgemeine Musikalische Zeitung 5, no. 15, 5 January 1803, 245; translation after Dahlqvist, *The Keyed Trumpet*, 15. Cited in Klaus, *The Keyed Trumpet*, 164.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Dalqvist, *The Keyed Trumpet*, 3.

notes to the hand-stopping of Mozart's hornists;<sup>26</sup> Scientific analysis of Campbell and Greated in 1998 led Klaus to explain,

When a tone hole is opened, the effective length of the tube ends at that hole, changing the bore. The bell, now limited in its influence on the instrument's acoustical system, forfeits its corrective impact on the intonation of the harmonics, which cannot support each other as effectively as before. For this reason, the notes played with the open keys sound weaker than those with all keys closed.<sup>27</sup>

Notwithstanding these observations, the above report of "the clear high register that penetrates to the very marrow" and my trialling lead me to emphasise that the keyed trumpet changes timbre in stronger dynamics; this 'spectral enrichment' (increased brassiness) is common to all brass instruments.<sup>28</sup> Numerous passages in Haydn's concerto are written in the *principale* register (using no keys) for special effect, mimicking 'field-playing' (for example movement one, bars 8, 49–50, movement three bars 276–79). This is contemporaneous with the unaccompanied eight-bar second trumpet fanfare in the 'Military' Symphony that was premiered in London in 1794.<sup>29</sup> Moreover, Fig. 6 illustrates that the high point of the first movement recapitulation requires few keyed notes, whether in arpeggiated or running diatonic passages.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Preface to Joseph Haydn, *Trumpet Concerto* ed. Edward Tarr and H. C. Robbins Landon (Vienna: Universal, 1982).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Klaus, *The Keyed Trumpet*, 168, expounding on information from Murray Campbell and Clive Greated, *The Musician's Guide to Acoustics* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), 381.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Murray Campbell, Joël Gilbert, and Arnold Myers, *The Science of Brass Instruments* (n.p.: ASA Press, 2021), 55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Joseph Haydn, Symphony no. 100 (Military) (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, n.d.), movement 2, bars 152–59.



Fig. 6. Haydn, Trumpet Concerto, first movement bars 144–54.

The above angularity and triplet arpeggios recall the heroic offstage natural trumpet fanfare in Eb in Beethoven's overture *Leonore* no. 2, albeit premiered in Vienna in 1805. Subsequent writing for Eb trumpets in the storm scene of Symphony no. 6, 'The Pastoral' is arguably Beethoven's most strident use.<sup>30</sup> It was much later, in the mid-twentieth century that larger-bore instruments were designed to be more homogenous at elevated dynamics. The point is that the keyed trumpet has a palette of timbres, like the nineteenth-century horn and trombone.

#### **Nineteenth-Century Methods for Keyed Trumpet**

In the early decades of the nineteenth century, keyed trumpets progressed in regard of chromatic capability and adopted regional designs. Friederich Anzenberger's annotated bibliography of five nineteenth-century published method books sheds light on trends and performance practice.<sup>31</sup> These reveal a typical working range from G3 (harmonic 3) to G5 (harmonic 12). Models with four keys conform to a consistent fingering system in which the fourth key raises the pitch by a major third, adding B3, thus completing the chromatic scale.

Eugène Roy's *Méthode de Trompette* (1824) is the first major tutor for keyed trumpet. The text is set out in French and German, and sections work through

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Ludwig van Beethoven, Symphony no. 6, (*Pastoral*) (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, n.d.), movement 4, bars 78–118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Friedrich Anzenberger, "Method Books for Keyed Trumpet in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century: An Annotated Bibliography," *Historic Brass Society Journal* 6 (1994): 1–10.

articulation, duets and trios, and provide a fingering chart for a five-keyed model crooked in D, Eb, F, G and C. This charts alternate fingerings for different crookings and contains musical examples with rapid diatonic and chromatic passagework.<sup>32</sup>

Written slightly later, the *Allgemeine Trompeten-schule* by Andreas Nemetz, trombonist in the Imperial Royal Court Opera House, is the earliest known Viennese method (1827).<sup>33</sup> This comprises sections for natural trumpet, keyed trumpet, valve trumpet, and bass trumpet/post horn. A line drawing of a four-keyed model by Joseph Riedl is informative. This is a short model, double wrapped with the first loop shorter than the second; it is played in a horizontal plane, with keys arranged in a star shape, worked by the left hand. The illustration shows sample fingerings and refers to multiple crooking; in addition, it details two Classical period mouthpieces (for first and second playing), bowl shaped with a sharp-shouldered throat and a long and tapered back-bore.<sup>34</sup>

#### Johann Hummel's Concerto [a Tromba principale] (1803)

Weidinger premiered Hummel's concerto at the Hapsburg court's New Year's Day celebration in 1804. This requires an instrument in 6-ft E§ with four (or more) keys and presents more technical complexities than Haydn's work.<sup>35</sup> Although Hummel's concerto is more melodic in style, its key structure is somewhat capricious. The first movement, in E major, has a development (bar 176) that starts in C major and modulates to G major. The andante begins in A minor and modulates to C major for example. In addition to this more flexible harmonic approach,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Eugène Roy, *Méthode de Trompette* (Mainz, 1824).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Allgemeine Trompeten-Schule verfasst von Andr[eas] Nemetz, Posuanist im KK Hofopern-Theatre in Wien (Vienna, 1827).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Klaus, *The Keyed Trumpet*, 172, identifies the earliest dated specimen of a trumpet of this type (as used in Austria, Bohemia and Moravia) to be by Jacob Cidrich, 1824; see also Wallace and McGrattan, *The Trumpet*, 50. This discusses a German orchestral trumpet mouthpiece in a treatise of 1811, very similar to those of Riedl.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> See Dalqvist, *The Keyed Trumpet*, 15–17.

Hummel integrates the low register much more markedly than Haydn. Klaus comments that the work's title, '... a trombe principale' alludes to its use of the low register.<sup>36</sup> Both the first subject and phrases in the second subject (see Fig.7) require a fourth key.

Fig. 7. Hummel, Trumpet Concerto, first movement, bars 116–19.



To conclude the exposition the soloist performs an unprecedented, augmented eleventh downward slur to double the *basso* part at the octave (bars 139–41). The F# in bar 141 is executed by 'lipping down' (Fig. 8).<sup>37</sup> This illustrates the degree to which Hummel understood keyed-trumpet technique, that notes could be 'lipped down' and intonation could be tempered by the player when playing chromatically.

Fig. 8. Hummel, Trumpet Concerto, first movement, bars 136–143.



The exposition concludes in B major, and a tutti finally resolves into the development (bar 176), opening in the key of C major (notated in Ab major for the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Klaus, The Keyed Trumpet, 170.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> The F# is a factitious tone that does not exist on the instrument.

E§ keyed trumpet. The passage illustrated in Fig. 9 is not so difficult as it may appear; most of the chromatic pitches are executed with the first key.



Fig. 9. Hummel, Trumpet Concerto, first movement, bars 176–182.

A greater challenge, however, arises in the Rondò finale in regard of Hummel's demands of rapid chromaticism and dexterity. As opposed to Haydn's nuanced approach, the composer's objective here is virtuosity (Fig. 10), followed later with a comparable succession of inverted mordents (bars 194–202). Such aspects of keyed-trumpet technique became widespread in the subsequent decades, as illustrated in Roy's *Méthode* (1824).

Fig. 10. Hummel, Trumpet Concerto, third movement, bars 45–58.



In his research towards a 2012 PhD thesis, Czech trumpeter Jaroslav Rouček devised an individual approach to performing this concerto on keyed trumpet, changing crook at strategic points to achieve easier fingerings.<sup>38</sup> This strategy is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Jaroslav Rouček, "Chromatizace Žesťových Hudebních Nástrojů v 1. Pol. 19. St., Nástroje Opatřené Klapkovým Mechanismem" (PhD diss., Academy of Performing Arts in Prague, 2012).

highly speculative. In Hummel's manuscript score the solo part was added after everything else, in clear black ink, signed "prodotto il 1<sup>mo</sup> Genajo [1]804 alla tavola di Corte dal Sig Weidinger." There is no evidence of crook changes, nor in later amendments in pencil and red crayon.<sup>39</sup>

This manuscript shows that the concerto was carefully tailored (and possibly adapted later) for Weidinger's playing, and that its *maggiore* conclusion incorporated music to please the Habsburg court. This is an extract from Cherubini's 'Rescue' opera, *Les deux journées*, that was highly popular in Vienna by 1803.<sup>40</sup> More specifically, Hummel's third movement conclusion (bar 167 to the end) is drawn directly from a vocal ensemble in No. 10, also set in E major. An extract from the text, "... mar-chons, mar-chons en di-li-gence ..." reinforces my belief that Hummel's Rondò warrants a steady *alla marcia* approach that may differ from prevailing modern interpretations.<sup>41</sup>

#### Weidinger and Sigismund von Neukomm

During the Congress of Vienna held September 1814 to June 1815, a commemoration on 21<sup>st</sup> January 1815 marked the twenty-second anniversary of the execution of Louis XVI. For this occasion, the French diplomat Prince Talleyrand-Périgord (1754-1838) commissioned Sigismund von Neukomm (1778–1858) to write *Requiem à la Memoire de Louis XVI* (1815) for performance in Vienna's *Stephansdom*. The work is a revision of Neukomm's Requiem in C minor (1813) that was set for two *a capella* choirs: in the 1815 revision a chamber choir is supported by clarinets and bassoons, and a tutti choir by double basses and organ.<sup>42</sup> Neukomm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Hummel, *Concerto a Tromba Principale, 1803*, Manuscript facsimile (Vaumarens: The Brass Press/Bim, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> John A. Rice, "The Musical Bee: References to Mozart and Cherubini in Hummel's 'New Years' Concerto," *Music & Letters* 77, no. 3 (August 1996): 414–22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Luigi Cherubini, *Les deux journées* (Paris, c. 1800), 232. Digitised score, IMSLP. https://ks15.imslp.org/files/imglnks/usimg/3/3c/IMSLP21652-PMLP49827-LES\_DEUX\_JOURNEES.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Dalqvist, *The Keyed Trumpet*, 17.

also added eight brass interludes for "*die Weidinger'sche Inventionstrompete,*" four hand-horns and three trombones. In the Mass held in Vienna's *Stephansdom,* Neukomm in collaboration with Antonio Salieri (who organised the Congress music) directed more than three hundred singers. The event was consequential: Louis XVIII invested Neukomm as Chevalier of the Légion d'honneur; the brass interludes were considered sufficiently important to be published separately by Peters Edition in 1817.<sup>43</sup>

A brief *Vorspiel* and a final *Trauermarsch*, both solemn and imposing, frame the entire event (Resonances of Waterloo [CD, 2018], tracks 4, 38).<sup>44</sup> Taruskin comments on a well-known passage for hand-horn in Beethoven's Ninth as evoking an "other-worldly quality" and I venture that Neukomm's notion of the new keyed trumpet's role in the natural brass group was similarly ethereal.<sup>45</sup> Focusing again on a nineteenth-century palette of timbres, the remaining interludes are mainly brassy flourishes to announce movements and dramatic expansions of scoring to underpin choruses, the most strident instance being the repeated fortissimo interjections in the Tuba Mirum. Conversely, the serene Eb major *Zwischenspiele* after the Sanctus is the very antithesis, scored for solo keyed trumpet and four horns (Resonances of Waterloo [CD, 2018], track 26). Neukomm studied with Haydn 1794–1804, and mid-November 1808–February 1809 visited his former teacher every day. Consequently, it is tempting to liken this interlude to the Andante of Haydn's trumpet concerto (see Fig. 11).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Sigismund von Neukomm, Vor- und Zwischenspiele: nebst e. Trauermarsch für d. Weidingersche Inventionstrompete, 4 Hörner u. 3 Posaunen zu d. Vocal-Requiem (Leipzig: Peters, 1817). Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Münchener Digitalisierungs Zentrum. <u>https://www.digitale-</u> sammlungen.de/en/details/bsb11307041. Accessed 10 May 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Henceforth, references to submitted recordings follow this pattern, referring to the list on pages iii–v, with some track numbers and timings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Richard Taruskin, *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995), 235–36. This essay based around Beethoven's Ninth is a reprint of a journal article published in *Nineteenth-Century Music* in 1989.





The performance of *Requiem à la Memoire de Louis XVI* was Weidinger's greatest exposure as a trumpet soloist, and almost certainly led Neukomm to write a concerto for Weidinger (lost). In December 1816 Weidinger wrote to Louis XVIII requesting to perform Neukomm's concerto at the 1817 New Year's Day concert and repeated his petition on 9 January.<sup>46</sup> It is not known whether the second request was successful.

From 1819 Weidinger offered seven-keyed instruments for sale (none surviving), but most extant instruments from this period are five-keyed. Klaus identifies a four-keyed instrument by August Beyde (1823) as the only known surviving model of its type, by a maker who made designs that followed Weidinger's models.<sup>47</sup>

There is much to investigate about the keyed trumpet outside the scope of this case study. Klaus identifies two three-keyed models by James Cowlan, Liverpool, dated between 1822 and 1834, in 6-ft F and 8-ft C, and another by Joseph Greenhill, London, c. 1835. She considers a source of the times that hints that the keyed trumpet may have existed in England earlier than the keyed bugle and poses

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Lindner, *Die Kaiserlichen Hoftrompeter*, 568-69; Rouček, "Chromatizace Žesťových Hudebních Nástrojů," 170.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Klaus, The Keyed Trumpet, 173.

an open question, whether an English-made instrument could have played some part in the conception of Haydn's concerto in the 1790s.<sup>48</sup>

I conclude this section with the prospect of researching brass performance practice of the keyed trumpet and ensuing nineteenth-century brass developments in further detail. My narrative on performance practice of the concertos of Haydn and Hummel (and later, music by Neukomm) ensued jointly from my practical experimentation and reference to recent scholarship and intends to breathe new life into the execution and interpretation of these and other works in modern and historical contexts. Further to this topic, the subsequent chapter of this thesis identifies important sources of information yet to be fully researched. For instance, Clive Brown's extensive study, *Classical & Romantic Performance Practice 1750– 1900* (1999) lacks detail pertaining to brass playing, and I consider that current knowledge can be duly extended.<sup>49</sup> Beyond scholarly discourse, performance on the keyed trumpet can be stimulating as part of a wider instrumental study. In addition to the familiar concertos of Haydn and Hummel, works by Joseph Fiala, Joseph Höffner, Leopold Koželuch and Giuseppi Alessandro Scaramelli are available in modern editions, and moreover may serve as ideal repertoire for flugelhorn.<sup>50</sup>

### 2. Evocation of the Classical and Romantic string quartet

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Ibid., 182–88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Clive Brown, *Classical & Romantic Performance Practice* 1750–1900 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Joseph Fiala, Divertimento in D; Joseph Höffner, Introduction and Polonaise; Leopold Koželuch, Sinfonia in Eb major for violin, keyed trumpet, bass, and fortepiano; Giuseppi Alessandro Scaramelli, Variazioni Brilliante, op. 13.

Examples of brass music that evoke the Classical and Romantic string quartet arise in almost every chapter of *The Modern Brass Ensemble*. Notably, this occurred in amateur and professional hubs of activity in mid-nineteenth century Paris, turnof-the-twentieth-century St Petersburg, and more widely in Amsterdam, Paris, New York and London after World War II. This case study provides in-depth information of historical contexts and repertoire, details of instrumentation and performance practice, and reflection on the re-creation of uncovered music on historical instruments in the concert hall and recording studio. The latter is largely based on historical performance on period instruments in which I engaged 2020–24.

The transition from 'natural' to chromatic brass instruments in the early nineteenth century, discussed above, was characterised by advances in several European cities by manufacturers, pioneer players, composers, and other parties with shared interests, intensified through competitiveness. Resultant watersheds contributed to a rapid evolution: the expansion of military bands in France and Prussia into symbols of stately power; the growth the amateur brass band movement in Britain; further developments in popular music and in the symphony orchestra. This resonated with social change; the decades of peace in Europe after the Congress of Vienna were generally prosperous and saw the emergence of middle-class audiences in metropolitan centres.

Paris was a hub of technological activities and musical advances. The ophicleide, patented by Parisian maker Halary (Jean-Hilaire Asté) in 1821, added an effective bass to the brass family. The *cornet à pistons* appeared in 1825, a development of a circular post horn, with two Stölzel valves and crooks to play in other keys. Hector Berlioz's adoption of the ophicleide and the cornet early in their histories is familiar to scholars. Other inventors worked in separate centres: unlike the trumpet and the horn, which adopted valves, the tuba was a Prussian invention; after other antecedents, military bandmaster Wilhelm Wieprecht and manufacturer
J. G. Moritz introduced a five-valved bass tuba in 1835. Later in the century, further improvements and developments in brass technology and distribution, by Gustave Besson in London, Charles Mahillon in Brussels, and others around Europe accommodated the needs of increasing numbers of brass players in various environments.

Early in this development, however, the inventive genius and commercial drive of Antoine-Joseph ('Adolphe') Sax (1814–94) was pivotal, not least through his design of a complete family of chromatic 'saxhorns' in 1843. The Distin family brass quintet (fl. 1835–48) achieved wide admiration in Britain, even from Queen Victoria and Prince Albert, and its Parisian encounter with Sax in 1844 was a key to its progress. Its advocacy of Sax's instruments was a key factor in the growth of the British amateur brass band movement. Within this development, the significant brass chamber music that emerged in mid-nineteenth-century Paris remained little known until uncovered within a revivalist culture that grew from the 1990s.<sup>51</sup>

#### The brass quintets of Jean-François-Victor Bellon

In 1997 a new British Library complex opened in London, amalgamating collections and integrating a new searchable digitised catalogue. English ophicleidist Anthony George uncovered four brass quintets by Jean-François-Victor Bellon (1795–1869). These works were composed in Paris c. 1848–50 and published by Éditions Richault (without scores) from 1851. The British Library held parts of nos. 1–3 as well as a separate transcription for valved brass of no. 12 dated 1881, but excluding a final *Tema con variazione*.<sup>52</sup> The Parisian parts include a tantalising thematic catalogue that displays incipits of all movements of the twelve works.<sup>53</sup> I part-presented and played nineteenth-century cornet in the first modern performance of Bellon's brass music with TWC, in a concert of works of Rossini,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 16–20, 138.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Ibid., 18, n. 35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Ibid., 19.

Bellon, Levy, and Verdi held on 13<sup>th</sup> March 1999 at the Cité de la Musique, Paris. This was part of a symposium, 'Les Cuivres Anciens' hosted by the Historic Brass Society. Soon thereafter I participated in recording the four works 28–29 June but a formal record release was shelved until 2020.<sup>54</sup>

Players read from copies of the original parts, and nineteenth-century instruments matched pitch and other playing characteristics. Some from John Webb's Padbrook Collection are now held at the RCS. Notably, John Wallace used an Eb keyed bugle prior to establishing that the part was intended for an early valved model; two others played rare instruments by Adolphe Sax.<sup>55</sup> The Parisian printed parts include a diagram of Bellon's layout for the players in a semicircle, left to right: cornet à pistons, cor à pistons, ophicleide, trombone, and *petit bugle* (Eb soprano flugelhorn).<sup>56</sup> This highlights the several instrumental characteristics: the Bb cornet can vie against the *petit bugle*; the horn and trombone are narrow-bored, capable of a tender piano to an intense fortissim*o*; the ophicleide doubles as bass lynchpin and tenor soloist.

French musicologist Raymond Lapie acquired original published parts of nos. 3–11 from a French antique dealer and compiled a complete modern performing edition for Editions Bim (less the missing *Tema con variazione* of No. 12).<sup>57</sup> Lapie scores for two Bb cornets, french horn in F, trombone, and tuba. I believe that this

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Origin of the Species Revisited (CD, 2020) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2020-001]. The Wallace Collection. Jean-Françoise Bellon: Quintette no.1 in Eb major; Quintette no.2 in Bb major; Quintette no.3 in G minor; Quintette no.12 in F minor. The editing and production of this CD was suspended during and following Wallace's term as Principal of the RCS 2002–14. See p. iii: List of submitted publications.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> John Wallace, seven-keyed bugle in Eb by Wigglesworth, Otley (mid-nineteenth century); John Miller, cornet in Bb, Courtois Levy model (1872–76); Paul Gardham, piston horn in F by Adolphe Sax (1853); Simon Gunton, Bb slide trombone by Adolphe Sax (1873); Anthony George, eleven-keyed ophicleide in C by Gautrot (c. 1845).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Raymond Lapie, *Jean-François-Victor Bellon: 1795–1869* (Vaumarens: Bim, 2000), 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Jean-François-Victor Bellon, *Quintettes de Cuivres nos. 1–12* (1848–50), ed. Raymond Lapie (Vuarmarens: Bim, 1999–2001).

formation is over-homogenous and overwhelmed by the modern tuba, based on my judgement of student performances. A logical alternative is to recreate Bellon's concept of timbral individuality, comparable to his teacher Reicha's wind quintets: for example, Eb trumpet; Bb cornet or flugelhorn; french horn; trombone; euphonium. In Britain the euphonium superseded the ophicleide in amateur brass bands and can fulfil both tenor and bass roles.<sup>58</sup>

Quintets nos. 5–11 was captured in a series of rehearse-record sessions in September-October 2020 in the Macpherson Recital Room, Laidlaw Music Centre in the University of St Andrews.<sup>59</sup> Following a public appeal in a streamed Historic Brass Society concert from St Cecilia's Hall, Edinburgh on 26<sup>th</sup> May 26 2021, Dutch musicologist Eric Roefs discovered the missing *Tema con variazione* finale of no. 12, held in the Newberry Library, Chicago; an opportune recording on 27<sup>th</sup> June in St Andrews completed the cycle.<sup>60</sup>

For this and subsequent projects TWC adopted pitch standard A4 = 435 Hz, the *diapason normal* that became law in France in 1859, widely known then as 'French pitch'. Instruments were chosen for musical compatibility rather than

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Players may wish to experiment with other instrumentations, for example petit bugle plus trumpet, or even using soprano or alto saxophone as a brass chamber instruments. I recall experiencing artistic fulfilment through playing a brass sextet of Oskar Böhme, including two saxophones in the ensemble.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> TWC developed an active relationship with the University of St Andrews in 2014 and was designated an ensemble-in-residence in 2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Origin of the Species Revisited: Bellon Complete Edition vol. 2 (CD, 2021) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2021-001]. The Wallace Collection. Jean-Françoise Bellon: Quintette no.4 in D major; Quintette no.5 in A minor; Quintette no.6 in D major; Quintette no.7 in F major. See p. iv: List of submitted publications.

*Origin of the Species Revisited: Bellon Complete Edition vol. 3.* (CD, 2021) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2021-002]. The Wallace Collection. Jean-Françoise Bellon: Quintette no.8 in Bb major; Quintette no.9 in G major; Quintette no.10 in Eb major; Quintette no.11 in B major; Quintette no.12 in F major, 'Tema con variazione'. See p. iv: List of submitted publications.

historical precision, and some are later models of nineteenth-century designs.<sup>61</sup> The sessions were conducted during and after a Covid epidemic lockdown period, and I was able to prepare for six months exclusively on a borrowed Köhler 'Bayley's Acoustic Model' Bb cornet with Berlin valves, 1862, and an *embouchure rayée* [mouthpiece with a grooved throat] by E. Guilbaut, patented in 1899.

Throughout the twelve quintets, Bellon's structures are broadly similar: first movements are usually in sonata form, with brief but harmonically daring development sections; second movements are invariably minuet or scherzo and trio; third movements are generally broad and expressive; finales often rondos or related types. Bellon's initial approach is Classical but progressively becomes eclectic, with ventures into operatic, programmatic, and popular idioms; in this regard the rehearse-record sessions of quintet four and beyond were an extensive exploration of mid-nineteenth-century Parisian musical life.

Understanding and interpreting the genres that Bellon incorporated into his chamber music was refreshingly engaging, moving from a 'pure' Classical chamber music style to Romantic, popular and operatic idioms. The 'Andante con espressione' of no. 4 is based in A major with accompanied solos for cornet, *petit bugle*, and ophicleide; a harmonically intricate central section passes through F major (horn solo), Ab major (trombone solo), F major (horn solo) and Ab major (ophicleide solo) before the reprise (Bellon Complete Edition vol. 2 [CD, 2021], track 3). The first movement of no. 6, dedicated to Reicha, bears resemblance to passages in Wagner's *Lohengrin*, premiered in Weimar in 1850 (Bellon vol. 2, track 9). The finale of no. 7 is programmatic: a barcarolle depicts a matinée in Naples, followed by a matelots' song, a storm scene, the return to port, and an invitation to the dance, a final tarantella (Bellon vol. 2, track 15). The minuet of no. 8 is in a fanciful 5/4 meter, set off against a trio featuring scholarly two-part counterpoint for horn and cornet,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> John Wallace, Couesnon *petit bugle* (Eb flugelhorn) c. 1923; John Miller, Köhler 'Bayley's Acoustic Model' Bb cornet with Berlin valves, 1862; Fergus Kerr, W. Brown & Sons piston horn, c. 1890; Paul Stone, F. Besson & Co. Bb trombone, c. 1897; Anthony George, eleven-keyed ophicleide in C by Gautrot, c. 1845.

then trombone and ophicleide (Bellon Complete Edition vol. 3 [CD, 2021], track 2).<sup>62</sup> Most remarkably, the introduction of no. 10's finale comprises recitatives for cornet and *petit bugle* that lead to a transcendental moment (Bellon vol. 3, track 11, at 0'47") (movement 3, bars 18–23), akin to the introduction to the finale of Beethoven's Ninth (1824). On the other hand, a comical facet of the ophicleide befits the *Danse Hongroise* that concludes no. 9 (Bellon vol. 3, track 8); the *Bolero* finale of no. 5 (Bellon vol. 2, track 8) and the *Rondo Polacca* of no. 11 (Bellon vol. 3, track 15) would not be out of place in Arban's *Grande Méthode*.

It is fundamental to this chapter that Jean-François Bellon combined these and further elements into a bespoke and substantial body of work, essentially inventing a new branch of chamber music. Adolphe Sax was never far from the heart of activity. Music critic Léon Kreutzer reported on a *Soirée de musique d'harmonie chez M. Sax* on 19<sup>th</sup> May 1850, that Sax "judiciously thought that, at the point of perfection to which his brass instruments have arrived, it was possible to entrust to them works of a greater harmonic complication ... M. Sax, in short, wanted to create chamber music for brass instruments ..."<sup>63</sup>

The emergence of this chamber music was closely related to, if not caused by the Paris Conservatoire. Under the direction of Cherubini, the Ministry of Education appointed distinguished brass professors in the 1830s who guided the core principles of performance practice and types of instruments used in various contexts throughout all of France: Joseph-Émile Meifred (1791-1867) taught valved horn 1833–64 in parallel with Louis-François Dauprat and Jacques-François Gallay who taught natural horn, the preferred orchestral instrument. Trumpeter François

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Reicha was appointed professor of counterpoint and fugue at the Conservatoire in 1818 and maintained a rigorous approach to counterpoint in his subsequent more general teaching. s.v. Antoine (-Joseph) Reicha. New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians, ed. Stanley Sadie (London: Macmillan, 1980).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Léon Kreutzer in *Revue et gazette musicale de Paris,* 19 May 1850. Sandy Coffin. 2024. "Sounds of Change: Brass chamber music in 1850s Paris." Paper presented at the Historic Brass Society Conference, New York, 10–13 July 2024.

Dauverné (1799–1874) taught 1833–69; his *Méthode pour la trompette* (1856) concentrates on natural trumpet but embraces sections for French slide trumpet and valved trumpet. Antoine Dieppo (1808–78) taught (slide) trombone from 1836. His *Méthode complète pour le trombone* (1837) provides key information on midnineteenth century practices, for example precise instruction in *portamento, portato,* and principles of nuanced phrasing.<sup>64</sup>

In this era the French and Prussian states simultaneously elevated their military bands into symbols of national and international standing. In 1845 the military adopted Sax's proposed formation that included valved cornets, valved trumpets, a family of fifteen saxhorns and two saxophones; this was preceded by Wieprecht's proposal for the Prussian Infantry in 1838.<sup>65</sup> The French Ministry of War supported training in the *Gymnase Musique Militaire*, and competitions were held to appoint professors of Sax's instruments in 1864.<sup>66</sup> A former trumpet pupil of Dauverné, Jean-Baptiste Arban (1825–89) was appointed professor of contralto saxhorn. He compiled a *Grande méthode complète de cornet à pistons et de saxhorn* (1859),<sup>67</sup> transcribed *L'art de phraser sur le cornet à pistons et le saxhorn: cent melodies classiques et populaires* (1866) and sustained a cornet class at the Conservatoire 1869–74 and from 1880. Dieppo taught trombone and saxhorn at the *Gymnase* 1836–56. The appointment of three saxhorn professors completed the faculty: MM Banneux, *saxotromba*; Lecomte, four-valved *saxhorn basse* in 9-ft Bb;

<sup>67</sup> Jean-Baptiste Arban, Grande méthode complète de cornet à pistons et de saxhorn (Paris, 1859).
Bibliotèque nationale de France. <u>https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k9625068z#</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Antoine Dieppo, *Méthode complète pour le trombone* (Paris, 1837). Bibliotèque nationale de France < <u>http://ark.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/cb42954596j></u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> See Trevor Herbert, "Military Band." In *The Cambridge Encyclopedia of Brass Instruments,* edited by Trevor Herbert, Arnold Myers, and John Wallace.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Ellis states that 1857[?]–70 the French Ministry of War supported *harmonie* and *fanfare* activity. In addition, the Roubaix Conservatoire, linked to the town's *harmonie*, admitted students of tuba, saxhorn, bugle (flugelhorn), and cornet 1849–70. Katherine Ellis, *French Musical Life: Local Dynamics in the Century to World War II* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2022), 59, 61.

and Dantonnet, contrabass in 13-ft Eb (bombardon).<sup>68</sup> This military development was contemporaneous with but not connected to the establishment of the (Royal) Military School of Music at Kneller Hall in 1857.<sup>69</sup>

The *Gymnase* was annexed to the Conservatoire in 1856 and offered tuition in ophicleide 1856–70. The Conservatoire eschewed the ophicleide's successor, the late-nineteenth century six-valved French tuba in 8-ft C until 1944.<sup>70</sup> Nonetheless, in the fertile Parisian environment of the mid-nineteenth century, art music, popular music, and military music inter-related, and the coming together benefitted composers and players keen to harness the promise of their instruments. Military musician Auguste Mimart (1828–68) studied valved horn with Meifred and went on to become a *chef de musique* in the French navy and wrote brass quintets and septets c. 1854–58.<sup>71</sup> These can be considered well-structured and cultured works, reflecting military and civilian musical needs and wider Parisian musical fashions.<sup>72</sup>

By late 2020 music by Bellon and Mimart was regular concert repertoire of TWC, and its execution and interpretation came largely instinctively. Four members of the quintet originated in the Scottish brass band culture, where Arban's *Méthode* remains widely regarded as unsurpassed. Its technical and musical approach matches the needs of this repertoire. In addition, an aural tradition of amateur

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Personal meeting Sandy Coffin. Glasgow, 16 April 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> See Trevor Herbert and Helen Barlow, *Music & the British Military in the Long Nineteenth Century* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), 140–46.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Note the tuition of *saxhorn basse* and bombardon at the Gymnase. It seems strange that the French tuba was eschewed by the Paris Conservatoire in 1944, but in many cases, tuba was the responsibility of the trombone teacher. Tuba was not taught at the Royal Academy of Music, London, from Harry Barlow's tenure (1931–32) until the advent of John Fletcher in 1965.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> See Sandy Coffin, "Auguste Mimart and his Chamber Music in 1850s Paris," *Historic Brass Society Journal* 34 (2022): 69-89.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Origin of the Species Evolution (CD, 2022) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2022-001]. The Wallace Collection. Auguste Mimart: Quintettes nos. 1–6 and Septuors 1–6.

learning and teaching existed in central Scotland at least into the 1970s and remains considerably influential. In 2000 Herbert and Wallace pointed out:

[British] Brass bands nurtured techniques which were, in some respects, more advanced than those required in the canonical orchestral repertoire. They also nurtured a form of playing which is based on instinct and intuition rather than study and contemplation. This is doubtless a result of the pre-eminence of aurality and imitation in processes of learning in the brass band world.<sup>73</sup>

Selections of Bellon and Mimart have been subsequently performed by TWC, streamed from international events: an Edinburgh concert during a Historic Brass Society conference, "Pond Life: Crosscurrents over the Atlantic" held 24–26 May 2021, sponsored jointly by New York State Council on the Arts, Edinburgh University, and St Cecilia's Hall, Edinburgh; "Global Trumpets Festival" held in September 2021 at Folkwang University of the Arts, Essen, Germany.

## Julien Tollot's transcriptions of Haydn string quartets for valved brass

Alongside Jean-François-Victor Bellon and Auguste Mimart, Julien Tollot (1825–96) completes a triumvirate. Music critic Léon Kreutzer, mentioned above, prophesied that the works of Bellon could be supplemented by transcriptions, that "a few andantes, a few scherzi, quartets of Haydn and Mozart, ingeniously translated for an equal number of [Sax's] new instruments, would predict a very interesting result."<sup>74</sup> His foresight in 1850 bore fruit; Tollot, a polymath who played cornet and clavicor, who designed the last contrabass ophicleide in 1858, correspondingly transcribed twenty-three of Joseph Haydn's string quartets for valved brass quintet c. 1858–68. This type of repertoire has precedent. For example,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> See Trevor Herbert and John Wallace, "Aspects of Performance Practices: The Brass Band and its Influence on Other Brass-Playing Styles," in *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History*, ed. Trevor Herbert (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 278–305, at 305.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Léon Kreutzer in *Revue et gazette musicale de Paris,* 19 May 1850. Sandy Coffin. 2024. "Sounds of Change: Brass chamber music in 1850s Paris." Paper presented at the Historic Brass Society Conference, New York, 10–13 July 2024.

Josef Triebensee (1772–1846), active in Vienna at the turn of the nineteenth century, published notable collections of arrangements for *Harmonie*, and he was well-known as a composer-arranger in his day.<sup>75</sup> But Tollot's transformation of Haydn for brass quintet is a story of qualified success; from a projected series, only titles nos. 1–6 was published in part sets by Lafleur, Paris, and the remainder remained annotated manuscript scores prepared for the typesetters. From the surviving published materials, the title page of no. 5 is representative:

Collection des Quatuors d'Haydn /arrangés pour Cinq Instruments de Cuivre. / Cornet, Bugle, Ténor, Baryton et Basse / Par / Tollot / A L'ALLIANCE MUSICALE / Paris, Lafleur fils ainé.

Researcher Sandy Coffin discovered the extant published sets and manuscript scores on-line in 2021 in the Bibliotèque Nationale de France's digital library, followed by a subsequent in-person examination in Paris. The manuscript scores are now digitised.<sup>76</sup> Moreover, from the six published quartets, nos. 1–3 are missing, and their source material remains unknown. The cornet part of no. 5 is missing but was reconstructed by Coffin (with my collaboration before and during the recording session) from existing cues in Tollot's printed parts and from Haydn's text. Fig. 12 (below) lists Tollot's Haydn transcriptions in their surviving forms: Overall, the manuscripts show extensive emendations–crossed out bars (usually shortening passages) and reassessments of scoring–they are professional working copies. In addition, several extra *basse* parts are added in alternative notations,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> *Harmonien Sammlung* (1803), *Miscellanées de musique* (32 volumes, 1808–13).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Bibliothèque Nationale de France, département Musique, VMA MS-523 (1-16)."[...] Collection des quatuors d'Haydn [Van Hob. III 46, XX 1 B, III 78, 72, 73, 76, 48, 77, 31, 45, 69, 32, 33, ?, 71, 75], arrangés pour cinq instruments de cuivre [...] par Tollot" <u>http://catalogue.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/cb43042037j</u>

pinpointing Tollot's expertise and practicality. On the manuscript title pages Tollot occasionally pencils summary comments: No. 7 is marked *'facile'*; No. 19 is marked *'difficile'*. The commentary to No. 16 is more telling—a hurried scribble reads *'Ce quatuor très mediocre a été refait plusieurs fois et défiguré ...* [This very middling quartet has been redone several times and messed up ...].' It is tantalizing to consider Tollot's critical faculty, whether he felt free to note an opinion of the work, or simply struggled to make this transcription work

| Tollot:<br>publication or<br>manuscript<br>number | Haydn: opus<br>number                                | Lafleur<br>publication<br>date                      | Instrumentation  |
|---|--|---|--|
| Publications<br>Nos.1–3                           | Missing<br>Source material<br>unknown                |   | not known  |
| No. 4<br>Parts only                               | op. 33, no.4   | 1866  | soprano cornet in Eb; cornet in Bb; <i>ténor</i><br>[saxhorn] in F; <i>baryton</i> [saxhorn] in 9-ft Bb;<br>[saxhorn] <i>basse</i> in 9-ft Bb (notated in bass<br>clef Bb).  |
| No. 5<br>Parts only                               | op. 74, no. 3<br>'The Rider'                         | 1868  | cornet in Bb (part missing); bugle<br>(flugelhorn) in Bb, ténor [saxhorn] in Eb;<br>baryton [saxhorn]in Bb, basse [saxhorn] in<br>Bb (in bass clef Bb) or alternative basse<br>[saxhorn] in C (in bass clef, concert pitch). |
| No. 6<br>Parts only                               | op. 33, no. 3<br>'The Bird'                          | 1880  | soprano [cornet] in Eb, <i>piston</i> (cornet) in Bb,<br><i>ténor</i> [saxhorn] in Eb, <i>baryton</i> [saxhorn] in<br>Bb (in treble clef), <i>basse</i> [saxhorn] in Bb (in<br>bass clef Bb).                                |
| Manuscripts<br>(scores only)                      |  | Hereafter<br>the                                    | cornet in Bb; <i>bugle</i> (flugelhorn) in Bb; <i>ténor</i><br>[saxhorn] in Eb; <i>baryton</i> [saxhorn] in Bb;  |
| No. 7<br>No. 8                                    | op. 50, no.3<br>op. 51.<br>'The Seven Last<br>Words' | projected<br>order of<br>publications<br>not known. | basse [saxhorn] in Bb.   |
| No. 9   | op.76, no. 4<br>'Sunrise'                            |   |  |
| No. 10  | op.74, no. 1   |   |  |
| No. 11<br>No. 12                                  | op.74, no. 2<br>missing                              |   | not known  |
| No. 13  | op. 76, no. 2<br>'Fifths'                            |   | soprano cornet in Eb; cornet in Bb; <i>ténor</i><br>[saxhorn] in Eb; <i>baryton</i> [saxhorn] in Bb;   |
| No. 14  | op. 50, no. 5  |   | basse [saxhorn] in Bb.   |

**Fig. 12.** Table listing Julien Tollot's transcriptions of Haydn string quartets for brass quintet, held at the Bibliothèque Nationale de France. Courtesy of Sandy Coffin.

|        | II: 'A Dream' |  |
|--------|---------------|--|
| No. 15 | op. 76, no. 3 |  |
|        | 'Emperor'     |  |
| No. 16 | op. 20, no. 1 |  |
| No. 17 | op. 50, no. 2 |  |
| No. 18 | op. 71, no. 1 |  |
| No. 19 | op. 20, no. 2 |  |
| No. 20 | op. 20, no. 3 |  |
| No. 21 | op. 71, no. 2 |  |
| No. 22 | op. 71, no. 3 |  |
| No. 23 | op. 76, no. 1 |  |

From manuscript score no. 7 onwards, materials were transcribed collaboratively by members of TWC from the digitised sources into interim performing sets for recording purposes, copy-edited by Coffin into a uniform format. These emerged in tandem with an extended rehearse-record schedule held over numerous weekends February 2022–October 2023 at Govan and Linthouse Parish Church and Studio A, RCS. This recording schedule captured performances of all nineteen surviving transcriptions.<sup>77</sup>

In the recording process, our intention was to record one quartet each working day, and a steady methodology prevailed. The sessions embraced live critical appraisal by all five players, in conjunction with Coffin who cross-referenced the working parts with Pleyel (1801) and other sources. Recording producerengineer Bob Whitney moderated technical and musical decisions. Although some musical outcomes were spontaneous and even unexpected, points of reference were consulted in advance of and during rehearse-record sessions to clarify artistic decisions: (1) Coffin consulted Haydn's text (Pleyel and more familiar editions); (2) We monitored the implication of Tollot's tempo terms (for example 'Minuetto allegro'), consulting for example Czerny's nineteenth century arrangements of Haydn's 'Salomon' symphonies for four hands at one piano. These often inferred mood in addition to pulse; (3) We applied rubato on a 'borrowed' rather than a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Haydn Transformed: Seven CD set of nineteenth-century Parisian brass transcriptions. See pp. iii–v: List of submitted publications.

'stolen' principle; explicitly, if the music demanded, speed could fluctuate within a steady tactus to enhance expression.<sup>78</sup> (4) We checked nineteenth-century conventions of ornamentation and articulation with the *Grand Method for the Cornet-à-Pistons* (c. 1870) by Louis Saint-Jacome (1830–98), a house arranger for Lafleur in 1870.<sup>79</sup> See Fig. 13 which illustrates some basic principles:



Fig. 13. Selected fundamental articulations for cornet from St Jacome's Grand Method.

St Jacome writes that in Ex. 1 the tongue should be "pressed against the lips so that in drawing it back a fresh sound is produced …" Ex. 2: The *sons filé* is articulated slightly softer, and in the method this foundation graduates to upward slurs and portamento. Ex. 3: St Jacome explains that the following notation "shows that the notes must be separated but in one stroke of the bow [sic]."<sup>80</sup> In practice, the notion of applying *sons plein* proved impractical, out of line with current conventions and tastes. On the other hand, the *sons filé* resonated with sostenuto phrases in slow movements. The *portato* technique, explained clearly by St Jacome in string

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> See Manuel García, *Nouveau Traité de l'Art de Chant*, 5th ed. (Paris, 1863), 62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Louis Saint-Jacome, *Grand Method for the Cornet-À-Pistons* (London: Lafleur (Alliance Musicale), c. 1870).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Louis Saint-Jacome, *Grand Method*, 2,3, Article XV (in preface). Saint-Jacome studied trumpet at the Paris Conservatoire with Dauverné, earning a 2<sup>ème</sup> prix in 1856 and 1<sup>er</sup> prix in 1858. He served as a cornetist and conductor with the *musique militaire* of the Garde nationale and was a prominent cornet soloist in Paris. He moved to London circa 1869, where he continued performing, composing and conducting.

terminology, is a notation often unfamiliar and misunderstood by modern players. This specific subject area is worthy of performance research in depth, building from study of the keyed trumpet at the turn of the nineteenth century and progressively complementing the scholarship of Clive Brown, Edward Tarr, and no doubt other performer-scholars (see page 26).

# The methodology of Tollot's transcription

Tollot's methods in transcribing individual quartets are logical and precise, although technical challenge and instrumentation vary amongst transcriptions, and the sequence of surviving manuscripts shows no clear progression. The following three musical examples (notated at sounding pitch) illustrate basic principles:

Firstly, Fig. 14 illustrates Tollot's practice of transposing complete movements into 'brass-friendly' keys and registers, such as in op. 33, no. 3, 'The Bird' (Haydn Transformed, vol. 1: The Bird, The Emperor and The Dream [CD, 2023], track 4).





Secondly, time signatures and rhythms are frequently adapted to simpler notations, for example to eradicate sub-divisions in slow music. Shown in Fig. 15, Tollot applies this to the slow movement of op. 33, no. 3 'The Bird':

**Fig. 15.** Haydn, op. 33, no. 3: Lafleur publication no. 6: Haydn's third movement, bars 1–4 becomes Tollot's second movement, bars 1–11.



This above (Fig. 15) signifies a radical shift in performance practice since the original composition of the piece some seventy-five years earlier (Haydn Transformed vol. 1, track 2). The movement order is also switched, probably to help ease players' stamina.

Finally, with the same objective of practicality, Tollot often shares out lengthy phrases into segments and simplifies tricky slurs. In 'A Dream', the second movement of op. 50, no. 5, the soprano cornet soloist enters in the second half of the first phrase (Fig. 16) (Haydn Transformed vol. 1, track 10):

Fig. 16. Haydn, op. 50, no. 5: Tollot manuscript no. 14, movement 2, bars 1–4.



In some instances, however, Tollot's simplifications did not suit the performance practice and tastes of TWC. In the minuet of op. 50, no. 5 (Fig. 17), Haydn's turns are omitted in Tollot's transcription. In the recording session the musical result was felt too plain by the players, and signalled one of many impromptu reinstatements to Haydn's text (Haydn Transformed vol. 1, track 11):



Fig. 17. Haydn, op. 50, no. 5: Tollot manuscript no. 14, movement 3, bars 1–5.

Conversely, Tollot's transcriptions fitted a carefully picked formation of valved brass designed to work as a family (note the absence of trombone); rapid and intricate dovetailed passages (for example Fig. 18, below) were able to be executed in the recording studio by TWC at h = c. 96 (Haydn Transformed vol. 1, track 8, at 3'30"):

Fig. 18. Haydn, op. 76, no. 3 'Emperor': Tollot manuscript no. 15, movement 4, bars 101–106.



Overall, Tollot's transcriptions show an expectation of players of mixed levels of instrumental ability, for example in amateur, military, or other professional circles. Nonetheless, his feel for instrumentation and idiom invariably seems intuitive and skilled; for example, in the second movement of the 'Emperor' quartet, Tollot alternates phrases between Eb tenor [saxhorn] and Bb cornet (Fig. 19). These parts always seem to fit each instrument naturally:

**Ex. 19.** Haydn, op. 76, no. 3: Tollot manuscript no. 15, movement 2, variation 2, bars 41–48. The melodic line is continued by Bb cornet.



But in many cases, Tollot's scoring for Bb cornet and soprano Eb cornet indicate an expectation of virtuosity from his players (Fig. 20). This understanding

has parallels in the bespoke mid-nineteenth century repertoire of the Cyfarthfa Band, Wales, where certain parts are clearly targeted at exceptional individuals.<sup>81</sup>

**Fig. 20.** Haydn, op. 76, no. 3 'Emperor'. Tollot manuscript no. 15, movement 4, bars 101–106. Here two cornetists amalgamate phrases into a perpetuum mobile.



Saint-Jacome's *Grand Method* (c. 1870) (see page 39) is interesting regarding the degree that it extends beyond the technical parameters of Arban's method and makes a more direct comparison with Julius Kosleck's *Grosse Schule für Cornet à piston und Trompete* (Leipzig, 1872). Like Kosleck, St Jacome works the cornet range systematically upwards to Eb6 and includes use of open pedal C3 throughout his method, notably as an *ossia* for second cornetist at the final cadence of no. 7 of his third series of duets (See Figs. 21, 22, below).<sup>82</sup>

Fig. 21. The culmination of St Jacome's high register training for cornet.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Herbert and Wallace, "Aspects of Performance Practices," 283–84, 286.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Saint-Jacome, *Grand method*, 81, 291



Fig. 22. St Jacome's second cornet flourish (stems down ossia notes in the final two bars).



St Jacome's cornet method sheds light on aspects of French cornet playing towards the end of the nineteenth century and contextualises Tollot's most daring transcription. By comparison, the trumpet class at the Paris Conservatoire remained conservative, eclipsed by the cornet class until the twentieth century. Conversely, Merri Franquin (1848–1934) drove a steady and sustained evolution of the trumpet class from 1894 that matured in the early twentieth century.<sup>83</sup>

The publication of Lafleur's Haydn transcriptions ceased in 1868 on the brink of the Franco-Prussian war 1870–71. Ellis attests that whereas Haydn was regarded in Paris as the pre-eminent canonical composer up to this point, fashions changed. Performances and reviews of French instrumental music increased drastically from 1870, and by 1880 Haydn was out of fashion.<sup>84</sup> This all certainly contributed to Tollot's projected series halting at issue no. 6.

Tollot's transcriptions 1–5 was advertised c. 1870 by Lafleur & Sons, London, targeted at the British brass band market alongside Mimart's music. Lafleur's listing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Geoffrey Shamu, "Inventing the warm-up: Merri Franquin's 'Principles of Study'," *Historic Brass Society Journal* 24 (2012): 129–57.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Katherine Ellis, *Music Criticism in Nineteenth-Century France* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 77–80.

states "these celebrated Quatuors [arranged for Five Brass Instruments, Solo Cornet, First Cornet, E flat Tenor, Trombone or Euphonium, and Bass] would be quite an acquisition to those members of Bands who would wish to familiarise themselves with a very superior class of music." It is unclear to me, however, whether this laid foundations for a British brass band quartet tradition that grew rapidly from the 1880s.<sup>85</sup> Nonetheless, Tollot's series of transcribed Haydn string quartets is the first known substantial body of canonical Western art music transcribed for brass, in this case string quartets transcribed for a valved brass quintet.

Selections from this series have been publicly performed by TWC: for example, excerpts from title no. 4 (Op. 33, no. 3 'The Bird') were presented at an illustrated talk at the symposium: Romantic Brass in Context in Bern, Switzerland, on 21<sup>st</sup> April 2023; the reconstructed no. 5 (Op. 74, no. 3 'The Rider') was given at St Cecilia's Hall, University of Edinburgh on 7<sup>th</sup> April 2023.

A subsequent Sunday afternoon chamber recital at St Cecilia's Hall, Edinburgh on 1<sup>st</sup> October 2023 was a milestone: 'The Rider', 'The Emperor', and 'The Dream' were given in one recital. This idea was repeated and expanded by TWC at the Macpherson Recital Room, University of St Andrews on 30<sup>th</sup> March 2025. The University's policy of including participation of current students led me to expand the programme with bespoke transcriptions: *March for the Prince of Wales* (1792) and *Two Marches for Sir Henry Harpur* (1795) were adapted from Haydn's *Harmonie* scorings and these framed the event. Four undergraduate students played on borrowed period valved instruments, and it was fitting to include one-off parts for keyed trumpet (Miller) and serpent (George). A transcription of Haydn's arrangement of *The blue bell of Scotland* (Hob. XXXIa: 176, 1801/02) for violin, voice, pianoforte and cello balanced the three transcribed quartets and transferred neatly into Tollot's quintet format, transposed into C major for ease of playing. Transcription of earlier-period works for historical brass was not new to me; for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Sandy Coffin. 2024. "Sounds of Change: Brass chamber music in 1850s Paris." Paper presented at the Historic Brass Society Conference, New York, 10–13 July 2024.

TWC's Victorian Christmas (CD, 1996) I arranged W. H. Montgomery's Christmas Tree Quadrilles for nineteenth-century brass.<sup>86</sup>

In his DMus dissertation (2021) Robert Percival discusses historical transcription in depth, analysing the historical, artistic and procedural factors influencing his arrangements for Boxwood & Brass, a historical harmonie of two clarinets, hand horns and bassoons.<sup>87</sup> Tollot's model of brass quintet bears some similarity to this ensemble in regard of being an intimate wind chamber ensemble, but by comparison scoring for the *harmonie* is far more complex. The idioms of historical clarinet, hand horn and bassoon pose intricate questions in regard of balancing individual instrument-related characteristics that diverge in different playing registers, and Percival analyses these complexities in detail. Focusing this topic on later nineteenth century wind repertoire, discussion of the Wind Quintet after Haydn by composer-hornist Martin Joseph Mengal (1784–1851) is more pertinent to my argument. Mengal studied with Antoine Reicha at the Paris Conservatoire, and one wonders whether he is a link in a chain leading to Jean-François Bellon's brass quintets. Mengal's reworking of Haydn's piano trios and a keyboard sonata is instrumentally led, freely implementing several nineteenthcentury woodwind clichés: for example, flute and clarinet leading the quintet in solo passages; clarinet playing Alberti-style accompaniments ('woodles'), bassoon providing both a bass line and a rhythmic foundation, typically in quaver octave jumps imitating the left-hand of a pianist.<sup>88</sup> Tollot's transcriptions are text-based, but

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> The Wallace Collection's Victorian Christmas (CD, 1996) [Victor, Tokyo. JVC -2025 -2]. The Trinity Boys Choir, The Britten Singers, The Wallace Collection. Cond. Simon Wright. Transcriptions by T. Herbert, L. Longden and J. Miller. Recorded at Abbey Road Studio 2 in May 1996. Produced by Shigekazu Tanaka.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Robert Percival, "Top B, or Not Top B, and Is That the Question? Creating a new repertoire of idiomatic and challenging arrangements for historical wind instruments" (DMus diss., Guildhall School of Music and Drama, 2021).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> See Martin Joseph Mengal, *Wind Quintet after Haydn* (Lancaster: Phylloscopus Publications, c. 1990). The four consecutive movements are reworked from movements in Haydn's chamber works: Piano Trio in Bb major. Hob. XV: 20; Piano Trio in A major. Hob. XV: 18; Keyboard Sonata in G major. Hob. XVI: 35; Piano Trio in A major. Hob. XV:18.

follow similar conventions: the first violin part is often split between the two upper parts, for example Eb soprano and Bb cornet; the *saxhorn basse* is frequently agile, providing a rhythmic pulse in octave patterns like the cello (or by inference bassoon); parts two and three, or three and four generally play off-beat accompaniments; the lowest three parts form an effective choir for harmonised passages. Alberti-type passages are evident and generally correspond to types of passageworks bountifully displayed in Arban's saxhorn method. The above, and particularly Percival's skilful arrangements, provokes serious notions of expanding the repertory of TWC's historical brass quintet.

## Original brass chamber music in other locations

In the subsequent decades of the long nineteenth century, the repertory of Scandinavian and Russian brass quartets includes original works evoking the string quartet. The miniatures by Ludwig Maurer (1789–1878) in Moscow and Antoine Simon (1850–1916) in St Petersburg are worthy of mention in regard of polish and charm, and the six four-movement quartets by Wilhelm Ramsöe (1837–95) stand out through their progression and originality.<sup>89</sup> I believe, however, that Tollot's brass model to refashion the Classical string quartet with five rather than four brass instruments surpasses the above because of simple efficacy. It optimises musical capability; players can breathe freely rather than play incessantly, thus developing an expansive timbre and style, in addition to adding one more dash of colour.

Perhaps for this straightforward reason the above works are overshadowed by three turn-of-the-century Romantic quintets for conical valved brass by Victor Ewald (1860–1935), sixteen years the cellist in the string quartet of Mitrofan Petrovich Belyayev (d.1904). His Brass Quintet in Bb minor, op. 5 was long considered by many brass players to be the earliest manifestation of a 'modern

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Miller, Modern Brass Ensemble, 22. For more information see Edward H. Tarr, East Meets West: The Russian trumpet tradition from the time of Peter the Great to the October revolution, with a lexicon of trumpeters active in Russia from the seventeenth century to the twentieth (Hillsdale: Pendragon Press, 2003), 176.

brass quintet' until Anthony George's discovery of the brass music of Bellon in 1997. I have contemplated that Ewald took to playing tuba in chamber music after the death of Belyayev and conceived his own music as if from his cellist's chair.<sup>90</sup>

My hypothesis applies equally to the emergence and development of the brass quintet following World War II. The two following examples of transcribing string quartets for brass, captured on gramophone records led to limited progress:

Foden's Champion Quartet's performance of a transcription of the scherzo of César Franck's Quartet in D (1952); the Chicago Symphony Brass Ensemble's account of the finale of Beethoven's op. 18, no. 2 (1954).<sup>91</sup> These rare examples, by an amateur and a professional ensemble, demonstrate exploration rather than set trends. I consider that a similar quandary applied to the PJBE, that strove to develop a brass quartet performance practice from its foundation in 1951, but didn't flourish until the mid '60s, boosted by the advent of a charismatic tubist.<sup>92</sup> It is ironic that Eugène Bozza's *Sonatine*, published in Jones's foundation year, is the very work that triggered the artistic development of the New York Brass Quintet (fl. 1954–84), that in turn convinced Jones to expand from a quartet to a quintet. The *Sonatine* undoubtedly showcased the brilliance of the quintet of the Garde Républicaine, enabled partly by the French tuba in 8-ft C, with six valves and a wide bore to favour the low notes. This succeeded the ophicleide in France and remained the preferred

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Ibid., 22–25, 138–40. I also refer to *Baltic Brass* (CD, 2001) [Deux-Elles. DXL 1042]. The Wallace Collection. Music by Sibelius and Ewald. John Wallace, Bayley's New Acoustic cornet by Kohler, London, 1862; John Miller, Courtois cornet, Paris, c. 1872–6; Paul Gardham, althorn in Eb, W. Wolf, Frauenfeld, late nineteenth century; Simon Gunton, baritone saxhorn in Bb, Daniel Meinl, Vienna, 1849–62; Robin Haggart, compensating tuba in F, Boosey & Co., London, n.d.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Foden's Champion Quartet (10-inch disc, 1952) [Paxton PR578]. Edrich Siebert, Merriment; César Franck arranged by Siebert, Scherzo from String Quartet in D. E. Gray and F. Thomas (cornets), Arthur Webb (tenor horn), D. Morris (euphonium), directed by Harry Mortimer.

*Concert with the Chicago Symphony Brass Ensemble* (LP, 1954 [Audiophile AP21]. Adolph Herseth (trumpet), Renold Schilke (trumpet), Hugh Cowden (horn,) Frank Crisafulli (trombone), Arnold Jacobs (tuba).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 56–60.

national instrument until the 1960s; the relative facility of playing this instrument in its high register led Ravel to score for tuba in 'Bydlo', in his 1942 orchestration of Mussorgsky's *Pictures*.

The similarity between Bozza's *Sonatine* and Jean-François Bellon's quintets a hundred years earlier is pertinent; both phenomena point to innovation as a key attribute. The American musicologist Mary Rasmussen picked up on this ten years later regarding the New York Brass Quintet's premiere of Gunther Schuller's Music for brass quintet (1961) at Washington's Library of Congress. She reasoned that this piece could unshackle brass chamber music of its dependence on a "pseudo-string-quartet/ woodwind quintet idiom" and contemplated 'pre-Schuller' and 'post-Schuller' eras.<sup>93</sup> The succeeding decades of the twentieth century proved her view persuasive in respect of a select and intense strand of progressive brass chamber music. Elliott Carter's Brass Quintet (1974, rev. 1993), premiered in London in 1974 by the American Brass Quintet, was produced within a culture receptive to radical ideas.<sup>94</sup> Carter wrote:

All of the contrasting characters and their related musical materials form a multilayered piece planned along the following pattern: Every third (that is, the first, forth, seventh, etc.) of its overlapping 19 short sections is a brief five-part quodlibet in which the instruments oppose each other with contrasting parts of their individual repertories. Between these is a duo preceded or followed by a trio in which two or three instruments join in music of similar character. Each duo and trio have a different instrumentation.<sup>95</sup>

The American premiere, held at the Alice Tully Hall, New York, on 15<sup>th</sup> November 1974 is enlightening. The Carter premiere was preceded by three canzoni by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Mary Rasmussen, 'Review: Gunther Schuller, Music for Brass Quintet (New York: Associated Music Publishers, 1962)', Brass Quarterly 7, no. 3 (1964), 139–40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 75, 75, n. 40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Elliott Carter's programme note (undated but post-1993). https://www.elliottcarter.com/compositions/brass-quintet/

Giovanni Gabrieli. After the intermission, the chamber concert changed course to comprise chamber music for piano and strings by Chopin, Schubert and Schumann.<sup>96</sup> The programme demonstrates a promoter's caution, on this occasion awkwardly embedding the new amongst the familiar.

The American Brass Quintet, however, presented self-promotional events of brass chamber music that were less equivocal. Its ambitious debut was held at the Carnegie Recital Room in 1962, and further Carnegie recitals in the '70s embraced Ewald's quintets and Carter's *A Fantasy About Purcell's Fantasia Upon One Note* (1974), once more mixing innovation with more familiar brass music. This corresponded to contemporaneous activities of the PJBE in Britain and in concerts and tours overseas.<sup>97</sup>

Peter Maxwell Davies's Brass Quintet, op. 100 (1981) was commissioned by American trumpeter Rolf Smedvig and his fellow members of Empire Brass. The group was founded in 1971 and prompted Smedvig to sacrifice his position in the Boston Symphony Orchestra to pursue interests as a soloist and chamber music player. Davies is explicit about the challenges of both performance and reception of the work:

My Brass Quintet was written in September and October of 1981, to a commission from Rolf Smedvig and the Empire Brass Quintet, with funds from the Harvard Musical Association. It attempts to provide the repertory with a work of real chamber music, insofar as the players are involved in the intimate kind of music-making associated with a string quartet, requiring exactly the same kind of responsibility and musical intelligence. This goes beyond the obvious extreme virtuosity of playing – all of which makes this perhaps the most demanding brass quintet to date, bearing in mind that it requires over half-an-hour's extreme concentration on the part of players and listeners alike.<sup>98</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> John Rockwell, "Carter's Brass Quintet Has Premiere," New York Times, 17 November 1974, 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 90–91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> Wise Music Classical / Chester Music (World). Composers note: https://www.wisemusicclassical.com/work/11048/Brass-Quintet--Peter-Maxwell-Davies/

This work was given its premiere at the Morse Auditorium, Boston on 20<sup>th</sup> March 1982 by the Empire Brass Quintet. The British premiere was given by the Albany Brass Quintet at St John's Smith Square, London on 17<sup>th</sup> December 1982, followed by a first British broadcast performance in July 1983. I participated in TWC's performance of the quintets of Carter and Maxwell Davies at the Purcell Room, London on 4<sup>th</sup> April 1992, an extraordinary challenge. Similarly, recording Carter's quintet in 1991 and the complete brass music of Maxwell Davies in 1999, including the premiere recording of the quintet (Peter Maxwell Davies: Music for Brass [CD, 2015], tracks 13-15), were rare personal opportunities.<sup>99</sup>

I believe that the two works by Carter and Maxwell Davies achieved prominence not by evoking the string quartet, but like Schuller in 1961, by eschewing tradition. Both works dynamically push aspects of technique to the limits, in particular Maxwell Davies's writing for horn and tuba.<sup>100</sup> Both works are conceived on a large scale with sophisticated structures and content, towards the limits of a paradigm of brass chamber music. Very few major art-music composers have written more than one major work for an all-brass ensemble; Philip Jones amassed an impressive record of commissions but, despite his efforts could not elicit a brass quintet or dectet from Benjamin Britten, and only just drew a miniature but outstanding work from Witold Lutosławski.<sup>101</sup>

#### The British brass band quartet tradition

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 100, 116, n. 47.

*Peter Maxwell Davies: Music for Brass* (CD, 2015) [Nimbus. NI 5936]. The Wallace Collection. Recorded in the presence of the composer. Tracks 13–15: Brass Quintet (1981). See p. iii: List of submitted publications.

*The Wallace Collection* (CD, 1991) [Collins Classics. 12292]. The Wallace Collection. Track 2: Elliott Carter, Brass Quintet (1974).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Peter Maxwell Davies, Brass Quintet (London: Chester, 1981). In the second movement, the horn part extends range up to a stopped F6, sounding Bb5, between letters E and F. The tuba part extends the range up to Db5 between letters D and E, and repeatedly to Bb4 before letter H.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> See Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 74, 92.

This separate strand of amateur activity is not included in *The Modern Brass Ensemble*, but amateur brass band quartets made gramophone records from 1913, and selected groups broadcast on emerging BBC local radio networks from 1925. This music-making appears to have emerged in Liverpool in the 1880s and rapidly spread throughout Britain. The most common instrumentation—two cornets, tenor horn, and euphonium—resembles the string quartet, but did not follow the brass band model advocated by Lafleur c. 1870 (see page 46). This subject is underresearched, and I presented on this subject c. 1885–1936 at the 'Romantic Brass in Context' symposium in Bern in 2023.<sup>102</sup>

There are few substantial examples of art-music for this medium, but Arthur Butterworth (1923–2014) who studied trumpet, composition and conducting at the Royal Manchester College of Music 1947–49 maintained collaborations with the amateur brass band movement and wrote brass band quartets in 1956 and 1991. In related typescripts to the latter unpublished work, Quartet for brass instruments, op. 91, the composer is characteristically clear in his views:

The saxhorn family of brass: a legacy from nineteenth century France, is [like the string quartet] endowed with a pure tone colour, so that the combination of two cornets, a tenor horn and euphonium – all of them true saxhorns – preserves a satisfying homogeneity of tone amongst themselves. But the true nature of the quartet, whether strings or brass, is to exhibit and explore music as an abstract art form rather than stretch its slender limitations towards the expression of dramatic or pictorial purposes for which it is not at all suited.<sup>103</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> John Miller. 2023. "Amateur brass chamber music in Britain c. 1885 – 1936: The brass band quartet tradition." Presentation at the Sixth International Romantic Brass Symposium, Bern, 20–23 April 2023. Conference Proceedings pending.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> GB 1179 ABW/1/63. Arthur Butterworth, Quartet for brass instruments, op. 91. Unpublished. Composer's manuscript score and parts. Accompanied by a typed programme note, and additional typed advice. Completed 27 May 1991. The four movements are Allegro, molto moderato; Poco vivace, quasi presto; Poco adagio; Allegro molto (Toccata molto perpetuo can fuoco).

Over thirty years before Tollot's transcriptions were uncovered and re-created by TWC, Butterworth's notes comment that "it is surprising that earlier brass band arrangers did not turn more to the more appropriate examples of true originally-designed quartets of the classical period: especially Haydn." Whether the Liverpool-based specialist publisher Wright & Round was aware of Lafleur's enterprise in the late nineteenth century is a matter for speculation.

This branch of amateur music-making remains under-researched, and I consider a heritage largely overlooked by the brass band movement. My current research on the amateur British brass band quartet from World War II until the present day is in progress.

### 4. Giovanni Gabrieli's Sonata pian e forte: A contextual case study

Since the late nineteenth century, transcription of instrumental music of the High Renaissance has been integral to the development of brass ensembles rather than the focus of ephemeral events. Although the early music revival debunked any notion of a continuum of all-brass music from Gabrieli to the present day, the custom of performing transcriptions of High Renaissance instrumental music has prevailed.

Stemming from scholarly attention and musical performances in 1870s and 80s Germany, ensembles of trumpets, trombones and other modern brass initiated this practice, with focus on the music of Giovanni Gabrieli and his contemporaries. Within this context, Gabrieli's *Sonata pian e forte* from *Sacrae symphoniae* (1597) is an exemplar that was recurrently transcribed and performed from the late nineteenth century through to the millennium. Examining the piece's context and characteristics and tracing transcriptions and audio recordings over this period sheds light on trends and developments in regard of performance practice, musical taste, scholarship, and reception. Fig. 23 (below) presents a selection of published editions and recordings of *Sonata pian e forte* relating to this study, set out in the sequence of the narrative. This list is not comprehensive but focuses on events that show points of change or special significance.

Fig. 23. Table of selective published editions and audio records of Giovanni Gabrieli's Sonata pian e forte

| Published Edition  | Notation   | Instrumentation of <i>Sonata</i><br>pian e forte (for two choirs)     |
|--|--|---|
| Wasielewski, Wilhelm Joseph von, ed.<br>Instrumentalsätz vom Ende des XVI. bis Ende<br>des XVII. Jahrhunderts. Berlin, 1874. No. 4,<br>Sonata pian e forte. Alla Quarta Bassa. | Derived from<br>sixteenth-<br>century<br>notation.<br>See Fig. 24. | Original instrumentation<br>1: cornetto; 3 trbn<br>2: violino; 3 trbn |

| Г  | 1   | 1   |
|--|---|---|
| Kosleck, Julius, ed. <i>Instrumentalsätze Älterer</i><br><i>Zeit</i> [early instrumental music]. Vol. 3 of<br>"Trompeten-Musik." Berlin, 1889.   | Set in alla breve<br>time (田) with<br>transposing<br>parts. Langsam<br>und feirlich. Die h<br>mässig,<br>langsam. | 1: cnt in Bb; tpt in 6½ ft. Eb;<br>tenor[horn] in 9-ft. Bb,<br>baryton in 9-ft. Bb<br>2: cnt in 6½ ft. Eb;<br>tenor[horn]; bass I (tuba);<br>bass II (tuba) |
| Benvenuti, Giacomo, ed. Andrea e Giovanni<br>Gabrieli e la Musica Strumentale in San Marco.<br>Vol. 2 of Istituzioni e Monumenti dell' Arte<br>Musicale Italiana. Milan: Ricordi, 1932. No. 6,<br>Sonata Pian & Forte. A 8. Alla Quarta Bassa. | Derived from<br>sixteenth-<br>century<br>notation.<br>See Fig. 25   | 1: (cantus) cornetto; (altus)<br>trbn; (tenor) trbn; (sextus)<br>trbn<br>2: (septimus) violino;<br>(quintus) trbn; (octavus)<br>trbn; (bassus) trbn         |
| Gabrieli, Giovanni. Sonata Pian e Forte: aus<br>den "Sacrae Symphoniae" (Venedig, 1597).<br>Edited by Fritz Stein. Leipzig: Peters, 1932.  | common time,<br>modern<br>notation.<br><i>Feierlich, aber</i><br><i>nicht zu langsam</i><br>(Q = 66–72)           | 1: 2 tpt in Bb; 2 hn in F<br>2: 4 trbn; tuba  |
| Gabrieli, Giovanni. <i>Sonata pian' e forte</i> . Edited<br>by Robert King. North Easton: Robert King,<br>1958. * Note spelling of the title.  | common time,<br>modern<br>notation.<br>For "eight-part<br>brass choir."   | 1: tpt 1; tpt 2 (hn); hn (trbn);<br>trbn or [American] bar hn.<br>2: trbn 1 (horn) (viola); trbn<br>2 (hn); trbn 3 (hn); bar hn or<br>trbn (tuba)           |
| Gabrieli, Giovanni. <i>Sonata pian e forte</i> . Vol. 6<br>of <i>Sacrae symphoniae</i> (1597), edited by Robert<br>Paul Block. London: Musica Rara, 1972.  | common time,<br>modern<br>notation  | 1: 2 tpt: 2 trbn.<br>2: 4 trbn.<br>[flexible instrumentation]   |
| Gabrieli, Giovanni. <i>Sonata pian e forte. Eric</i><br><i>Crees performing edition</i> [The complete<br>instrumental ensemble music]. Edited by Eric<br>Crees. 43 vols. Oakham: Brass Wind<br>Publications, 1996.                             | common time,<br>modern<br>notation  | 1: 2 tpt; 2 trbn<br>2: 4 trbn<br>[flexible instrumentation]   |
| Table continued below<br>Audio recording   | Туре  | Instrumentation   |
| Giovanni Gabrieli, Sonata pian e forte<br>L'Anthologie Sonore AS58]. Ensemble of<br>[valved]cornets, trombones, and violas,<br>directed by Curt Sachs.   | 78rpm 30cm<br>mono disc, 1935   | 1: cnt, 3 trbn<br>2: violas, 3 trbn   |
| Seven Canzonas of Giovanni Gabrieli<br>[Counterpoint S-2401-5503]. New York Brass<br>Ensemble, conducted by Samuel Baron.<br>Side 2, track 3.  | Vinyl LP mono<br>record, 1953   | 1: vln, 3 trbn<br>2: 4 trbn<br>Aural analysis   |
| <i>The London Gabrieli Brass Ensemble</i> [Pye<br>Golden Guinea Collector series. GSGC 14072].<br>Side 2, track 1.   | Vinyl LP record,<br>1966.   | 1: 2 tpt; 2 trbn<br>2: 4 trbn   |

| Antiphonal Music of Gabrieli: Canzonas for<br>Brass (Vinyl LP record, 1969) [CBS, 72729].<br>Philadelphia Brass Ensemble, Cleveland Brass<br>Ensemble, Chicago Brass Ensemble.<br>Side 2, track 3. | Vinyl LP record,<br>1969. | 1: 2 tpt; hn; trbn<br>2: hn; 2 trbn; euph.; tuba |
|--|---------------------------|--|
| A Venetian Coronation 1595 (CD, 1990) [Virgin<br>Classics. VC791110-2]. Gabrieli Consort &<br>Players, directed by Paul McCreesh.  | CD, 1990                  | <i>Sonata pian e forte</i> not<br>included.      |
| Gabrieli & St Mark's: Venetian Brass Music<br>[Nimbus. NI 5236]. The Wallace Collection,<br>conducted by Simon Wright.<br>Track 2.   | CD, 1990                  | 1: 3 tpt; trbn<br>2: flug.; 3 trbn               |
| Gabrieli in Venice [Teldec. 4509-90856-2].<br>London Brass, conducted by Philip Pickett.<br>Track 3.   | CD, 1994                  | Not known  |
| Giovanni Gabrieli: Music for brass (3 CDs,<br>1997–2000) [Naxos, 8.553609, 8.553873,<br>8.554129]. London Symphony Brass,<br>conducted by Eric Crees.  | CD, 1997                  | 1: 2 tpt, 2 trbn<br>2: 4 trbn                    |

Gabrieli's *Sacrae symphoniae* is one of the earliest collections of music that, in part, assigns specific instruments to monophonic parts; sixteen instrumental pieces are published alongside forty-five vocal works. The *Sonata pian e forte* specifies two instrumental choirs: cornett and three trombones; 'violone' and three trombones. Musicologist David Fallows pointed out that in this work "the introduction of [the] *forte* [dynamic marking} ... was the model for the manner of its use over the next century: *piano* was primarily an echo effect, and in the great majority of its early uses *forte* was merely an instruction to return to the normal dynamic."<sup>104</sup>

The Sonata pian e forte was known in Germany at least as early as 1874; violinist, author and composer Wilhelm Joseph von Wasielewski (1822–96) wrote a history of the violin in the seventeenth century and the beginnings of instrumental music, with a supplement (subsequently published separately)–an anthology of instrumental music from the end of the sixteenth century to the end of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> David Fallows. "Forte." *Grove Music Online*. 2001;

https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/om o-9781561592630-e-0000010014.

seventeenth century. This comprises almost entirely of Italian music, with numerous examples of string works, but none for keyboard or lute.<sup>105</sup> The edition indicates the main sources as the library of the Liceo Musicale di Bologna, the Royal Library of Belgium, and the Berlin State Library. From this anthology, four of Wasielewski's choices found popularity a hundred years later in performances by modern brass ensembles.<sup>106</sup>

**Fig. 24:** Wasielewski's edition of *Sonata pian e forte,* bars 1–4. \*The *musica ficta* in stave three, bar three are incorrect.



<sup>106</sup> No. 3, Giovanni Gabrieli's *Canzon per sonar Primi Toni* [à 8, 1597]; No. 4, Giovanni Gabrieli's *Sonata pian e forte. Alla quarta bassa* [à 8, 1597], No. 5, Adriano Banchieri's *Fantasia in Eco* (also with forte and piano dynamics) [à 4, 1596/R1803]; No. 8, Giovanni Gabrieli's Canzon à 6 [1615].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Wilhelm Joseph von Wasielewski, *Die Violien im XVII Jahrhundert und die Anfänge der Instrumental composition [The violin in the 17th century and the beginnings of instrumental* composition] (Bonn, 1874), and its companion volume: Wilhelm Joseph von Wasielewski, ed. Instrumentalsätz vom Ende des XVI bis Ende des XVII Jahrhunderts [Instrumental pieces from the end of the 16<sup>th</sup> Century to the end of the 17<sup>th</sup> century] (Bonn, 1874).

In figure 24 the symbol method predates the establishment of modern timesignatures and originates from sixteenth-century mensural notation. In this case it can be considered to equate to a modern key signature of 2/1 with a *tactus* (beat) of semibreve = c. 60 per minute.<sup>107</sup> The drawing up of this piece into a score was a later custom: in the sixteenth century this and similar music was stored in and performed from part-books. Musicologist George Houle is explicit in regard of modern editions:

As far as was possible, the older notation was maintained by many seventeenth-century theorists and musicians writing conservative compositions. ... Editions that make changes in the notation to make it more easily read should still make it possible to reconstruct the original note values, tempos, and proportions so that the performer is aware of these aids to interpretation.<sup>108</sup>

Carl Riedel (1827–88) directed a concert of Gabrieli's *Sonata pian e forte* and Schütz's *Sieben Worte* at the Thomaskirche, Leipzig on 3<sup>rd</sup> May 1883, and evidence points to this standing as the earliest known performance of music by Giovanni Gabrieli involving brass instruments in modern times. Riedel, president of Allgemeiner Deutscher Musikverein from 1868, adapted Schütz's *Sieben Worte* for modern performance in 1872, contemporaneous with Wasielewski's anthology.<sup>109</sup> A concert review in *Musikalisches Centralblatt* (Leipzig) pinpoints the unfamiliar polychoral formation of Gabrieli's sonata: the replacement of cornett by modern trumpet, and the upper voice of the second choir played by multiple stringed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> For an overall explanation of this topic see George Houle, "Meter and Tempo," in *A Performer's Guide to Seventeenth-Century Music*, ed. Stewart Carter, rev. Jeffery Kite-Powell (Bloomington & Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2012), 347–67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Houle, "Meter and tempo,", 351.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Heinrich Schütz, *Die sieben Worte Jesu Christi am Kreuz*, arr. Carl Riedel (Leipzig: Fritzsch, 1873). For 5 vocal soloists, organ, and continuo. https://www.digitalesammlungen.de/de/details/bsb11140604

instruments. The performance is noted for its magnificent effect in the Thomaskirche, and the beauty of such simple music. The pairing of Gabrieli and Schütz is crucial; Schütz studied with Giovanni Gabrieli in Venice for the last three years of his teacher's life and regarded him as his greatest stimulus.<sup>110</sup> Moreover, the interest in performance of instrumental music of the High Renaissance alongside vocal music of that era broke new ground.

Published in 1889, an anthology of transcriptions for brass edited by Julius Kosleck (1825–1905) is the earliest known source that sheds light on late nineteenth century brass understanding and re-creation of 'early music.'<sup>111</sup> The *Sonata pian e forte* is tailored to Kosleck's requirements, using military band instruments of this time.<sup>112</sup> The instrumental fusion suits the initial flowing phrases and overall homogeneity; the expression mark '*weich*' is significant, frequently seen in the orchestral brass writing of Richard Strauss.<sup>113</sup> Similarly, Kosleck's concluding fortissimo and strong reiterated accents over moving parts exemplifies a complementary facet of late Romantic brass writing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> See "Die Tonkünstlerversammlung des Allgemeinendeutchen Musikvereins in Leipzig 3–6 May 1883," review of concert in Thomaskirche at 1pm on 3 May, *Musikalisches Centralblatt* (Leipzig), vol. 3 no. 20, 17 May 1883, 1. This predates a performance mentioned in Edward H. Tarr, "Ferdinand Weinschenk (1831–1910), Pivotal Figure in German Trumpet History," *Historic Brass Society Journal* 11 (1999): 10–36. <u>https://doi.org/10.2153/0120190011003</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Julius Kosleck, ed. *Instrumentalsätze Älterer Zeit* [early instrumental music]. Vol. 3 of 'Trompeten-Musik.' (Berlin, 1889). See Hofmeister catalogue, February 1889, 53, <a href="http://www.hofmeister.rhul.ac.uk/2008/content/monatshefte/1889\_02.html">http://www.hofmeister.rhul.ac.uk/2008/content/monatshefte/1889\_02.html</a> Contents: 1. Gottfried Reiche, Quatricinia; 2. Florentio Maschera, Canzona no. 1; 3. Giovanni Gabrieli, Sonata [pian e forte]; 4. Florentio Maschera, Canzona no. 2; 5. Hymn, Heil dir im Siegerkranz; Chorale, Ein' feste Burg ist unser Gott; Chorale, Nun danket alle Gott. Vol. 1 comprises aufzüge, fanfares and marches for "mittelalteriche trompeten" (natural trumpets), and drums, and vol. 2 comprises historical army and parade marches, orchestrated by Kosleck for modern brass.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Quartet 1: cornet in Bb; trumpet in 6½-ft. Eb; tenor[horn] in 9-ft. Bb, as used by Mahler at the start of his Seventh Symphony; wide-bore baryton in 9-ft. Bb. Quartet 2: bell-to-front alto cornet in 6½-ft. Eb; tenor[horn]; bass I (unspecified tuba); bass II (unspecified tuba).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> See Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 20–22, 125. This includes an image of the first six bars of Kosleck's arrangement of the *Sonata pian e forte*. The instruction 'weich' is important, perhaps synonymous with *dolce*, essentially pertaining to the way brass players can blend with the strings in the symphony orchestra.

At this time Kosleck was a long-serving principal trumpet in the Berlin Köningliche Kapelle. He was highly influential for the last four decades of the nineteenth century, including his playing in Bach's Mass in B minor at the Royal Albert Hall in 1885, and his tours of Germany, Russia and North America with his 'Kaiser-Cornet-Quartett'.<sup>114</sup> He formed the *Kosleck'sche Bläserbund* in 1890, a flexible and prestigious ensemble that performed frequently at formal events, and after his death the ensemble premiered Richard Strauss's *Feierlicher Einzug* (1909), conducted by Ludwig Plass.<sup>115</sup> Kosleck's transcription of *Sonata Pian e Forte* did not establish a standardised instrumentation, but rather provides a fascinating glimpse of a repertory that resonated with an influential sector of Prussian society.

In addition to the development of state military bands in Prussia and France from the mid-nineteenth century, national agendas around Europe led to the historicization of national musical cultures as artistic pinnacles. The 1885 initiation of a collected edition of the music of Heinrich Schütz (1585–1675) is pertinent, mentioned above in connection with Riedel's performance of the *Sonata pian e forte* two years earlier.

Giacomo Benvenuti (1885–1943) initiated Istituzioni e Monumenti dell' Arte Musicale Italiana in 1931 with two volumes of music by Andrea and Giovanni Gabrieli and contemporaries, and this edition triggered other events.<sup>116</sup> This collection is interesting in that whereas the Denkmäler deutscher Tonkunst was explicit in its practice of modernising editions to stimulate performances, some Italian editions around the 1930s appear to revise conceivable errors of late-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Ibid., 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> See Edward H. Tarr, *East Meets West: The Russian Trumpet Tradition from the Time of Peter the Great to the October Revolution, With a Lexicon of Trumpeters Active in Russia from the Seventeenth Century to the Twentieth*, (Hillsdale: Pendragon Press, 2003), 321–5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Giacomo Benvenuti, ed. *Andrea e Giovanni Gabrieli e la Musica Strumentale in San Marco*. Vols. 1 and 2 of *Istituzioni e Monumenti dell' Arte Musicale Italiana* (Milan: Ricordi, 1931–). See vol. 2, part 2, 64–74. The critical commentary of the prefaces to these volumes is by Gaetano Cesari (1870–1934).

nineteenth-century editions. As shown in figure 25, Benvenuti's edition of the *Sonata pian e forte* resembles Wasielewski's 1874 edition but is more precise:



Fig. 25. Benvenuti's edition of Sonata pian e forte, bars 1-4

In contrast to Benvenuti's approach, German musicologist Fritz [Friedrich Wilhelm] Stein (1879–1961) transcribed *Sonata pian e forte* in a modern and practical manner for orchestral brass, published by Peters Edition in 1931. His preface to the edition is particularly detailed and instructive:

This adaptation in no way attempts to emulate the sound-effects of the original score; it should, moreover, be fairly obvious that it is hardly possible nowadays to realize such historical colour-effects or to reproduce their style, as the old-fashioned Zink Cornet is now extinct and the modern trombone in no way reproduces the sound of its predecessor.... An "explosive" tone production should at all costs be avoided, and it is of importance that the short notes should be blown with discretion. The bar lines, which were not in use during the sixteenth century, must not be taken to suggest any punctuation of the beat and players are advised to ignore bar lines in general, except for purposes of orientation, and to stress only those important beats of the thematic development without considering their position in the bar.... There is a decided dearth of orchestral material suitable for the introduction of serious concerts or for purposes of festive or gala occasions, - G. Gabrieli's instrumental Sonatas provide a wealth of the most noble material for such purposes. We conclude by expressing the hope that this adaptation may enrich our musical experience and pleasure and

that it may help to bring to light the inexhaustible treasures of the great Venetian master, which have lain fallow for so long a period.<sup>117</sup>

Stein was the musical director of the church of St Nikolai, Kiel 1925–33, and a review in the *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* of the 18<sup>th</sup> German Bach Festival in Kiel held 4–6 October 1930 (organised by Stein) includes an orchestral concert of the music of J. S. Bach, with the *Sonata pian e forte* as an opener, like Riedel in 1883.<sup>118</sup> His edition was taken up by British conductor Adrian Boult, for example in a concert at Harvard University given by the Boston Symphony Orchestra in January 1935, and this and similar transcriptions functioned as overtures to prominent British orchestral concerts of the '30s.<sup>119</sup>

Whereas Stein's transcription was conceived for twentieth-century use, musicologist Curt Sachs (1881–1959) investigated how the music may have sounded to the composer. Sachs directed the Staatliche Instrumentensammlung in Berlin from 1919, restoring many instruments to playing condition so they could be heard, and from 1928 became professor at the university. Being a Jew, he was obliged to leave Germany following the removal of his teaching positions by the Nazi regime in 1933. Moving first to Paris he inaugurated *L' Anthologie Sonore* in 1934, historical recordings that include *Sonata pian e forte*.<sup>120</sup> Sachs conducts an ensemble of valved cornets, violas, and trombones, and my analysis of the recording lists welldefined attributes: timbre and balance are finely considered, and the rhythm prioritises precision. Soft-sounding cornets and customary narrow-bore French trombones are played without vibrato. The 'violone' part is balanced up and evened

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Giovanni Gabrieli, *Sonata Pian e Forte* [transcribed for two trumpets, two horns, four trombones, tuba], ed. Fritz Stein (Leipzig: Peters, 1932). Foreword trans. J. Pauer, London.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Otto Schröder, review in *Zeitschrift für Musikwissenschaft* (Leipzig) issue no. 2, 1 November 1930, 91–97. Stein is also known for his edition of Hummel's Trumpet Concerto (Leipzig: Hofmeister, 1957).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 126.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> *Giovanni Gabrieli, Sonata pian e forte* (78rpm 30cm disc, 1935) [L'Anthologie Sonore AS58]. Cornets, trombones, and violas, dir. Curt Sachs.
out through multiple modern violas playing in unison. The tempo, Q = ca. 80 is generally deliberate; Sachs takes great care over dotted rhythms in bars 66–67 and steadies the final five bars for clarity. This recording is historically significant, and very much the antithesis of Kosleck's Romantic account, combining modernism with re-creation of the past.

Sachs emigrated to the United States in 1937, and in 1953, around the start of his tenure as Adjunct Professor at Columbia University, wrote a liner note for Counterpoint Records in connection with a record made by the New York Brass Ensemble (fl. c. 1948–53), a group of emerging professionals founded at the Juilliard School.<sup>121</sup> In the liner note Sachs discussed the context of Gabrieli's instrumental music and described him as "the father of orchestration" in respect of "a deliberate art of contrasting and mixing his hues." In addition, another writer (almost certainly conductor Samuel Baron) documents the recording process; two brass choirs are placed 100 ft. apart to replicate the *cori spezzati* of San Marco. Although the recording precedes the establishment of commercial stereo sound pioneered by RCA, Decca, and others in 1958, this long-playing microgroove record was awarded a *Grand Prix du Disque*.<sup>122</sup>

Indeed, after World War II scholarly interest in brass-related music of the High Renaissance picked up on both sides of the Atlantic. The foundation of the Galpin Society in 1946 reflected the inception of the 'early music revival' that became widespread by the mid-1970s. Anthony Baines's transcription of Matthew Locke's *Music for His Majesty's Sackbuts and Cornetts* (1951), Musica Rara's publication of ricercars by Andrea Gabrieli (1957), and Thurston Dart's transcription of Purcell's *March and Canzona for the Funeral of Queen Mary* (1958) provided a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Seven Canzonas of Giovanni Gabrieli (Vinyl LP record, 1953) [Counterpoint S-2401-5503]. New York Brass Ensemble, cond. Samuel Baron. 'Sonata pian e forte': side 2, track 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 161–63. Appendix 2: Selective Discography. Recordings of music for brass ensembles of this idiom are rare until 1966, when a record directed by Joshua Rifkin and the debut record of The London Gabrieli Brass Ensemble were issued. The record made by Samuel Baron and the New York Brass Ensemble in 1953 broke new ground, meriting the *Grand Prix du Disque*.

new repertoire for student and profession players of modern instruments. *Brass Quarterly* journal published in New Hampshire, USA 1957–65 reflected in part the activities of the New York Brass Ensemble as well as reporting on music of the High Renaissance.<sup>123</sup>

From the '60s the activities of professional orchestral-style brass ensembles proliferated in Britain and USA and benefitted from a boom in the recording industry. In concerts, performing editions, and records of this era, however, scholarship was not yet a driver of radical change in performance practice. In Britain the London Gabrieli Brass Ensemble issued an eponymous LP record in 1966, with a liner note that explained the nature of the cornett and early trombone. This is performed on modern instruments, an irony when the early music revival just begins to find traction.<sup>124</sup>

In addition, in 1968 the PJBE played its first Henry Wood Promenade Concert at the Royal Albert Hall, music of Andrea and Giovanni Gabrieli on modern instruments. Stanley Sadie commented in *The Times*, that "Denis Stevens, who edited (and conducted) the music, had to settle for modern equivalents [of the instruments] ... although to my ears the present day trumpet (however finely played) sounds out of place with the music – too sharp and shallow to serve for the throaty cornett."<sup>125</sup> One notable occurrence of advancing scholarship, albeit still with modern instruments, is a 1966 album made by The London Brass Players, directed by Joshua Rifkin, meticulously curated with continuo and vocal soloists, an expanded Philip Jones Brass Ensemble in all but name.<sup>126</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 126–27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> *The London Gabrieli Brass Ensemble* (Vinyl LP record, 1966) [Pye Golden Guinea Collector series. GSGC 14072]. 'Sonata pian e forte': side 2, track 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Stanley Sadie, review, "Splendid Sounds from Venice," *The Times* (London), 14 August 1968, The Arts section, 6. Cited in Miller, "The Philip Jones Brass Ensemble," 56–57.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Baroque Fanfares and Sonatas for Brass (Vinyl LP record, 1966) [Nonesuch. H-71145]. The London Brass Players, dir. Joshua Rifkin.

Despite the use of period instruments lagging behind scholarship, the reception of brass music as a chamber music entity was elevated internationally through a record of transcriptions of music of the High Renaissance made by the brass sections of the Philadelphia, Cleveland and Chicago orchestras who flew in from their respective cities for one day's recording in 1969: Antiphonal Music of Gabrieli: Canzonas for Brass (LP, 1969).<sup>127</sup> This received the Grammy award for chamber performance in 1970, picked from an exceptional list of nominees.<sup>128</sup> Whereas in 1953 the members of the New York Brass Ensemble were emerging professionals, this record was produced by an elite of seasoned professionals, who assembled without an evident conductor. Their unified national playing style is striking, and the joy from the music-making instantaneous. The thirteen recorded works employ editions by Robert King (1914–99), who established a specialist publishing firm in 1940 at North Easton, Massachusetts that later realised a worldwide circulation. Although many of King's publications include historical forewords by musicologist Mary Rasmussen (1930–2008) they are essentially midtwentieth century performing editions for orchestral brass. The Sonata pian e forte includes practical instructions of articulation and phrasing, and options to include viola, horns, and baritone (American euphonium), with a tuba part that doubles the bass of the second choir at the lower octave in forte passages.<sup>129</sup> Besides the album's acclaim, it is widely considered pivotal for its widespread influence in stimulating enthusiasm for brass chamber music amongst amateur and professional players, and a wide musical public.

Soon thereafter, Musica Rara editions, founded in London in 1950, responded to a growing market demand through publishing specialised

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Antiphonal Music of Gabrieli: Canzonas for Brass (Vinyl LP record, 1969) [CBS, 72729]. Philadelphia Brass Ensemble, Cleveland Brass Ensemble, Chicago Brass Ensemble. 'Sonata pian e forte': side 2, track 3 is performed by: Choir 1 (Chicago), two trumpets, horn and tenor trombone; Choir 2 (Philadelphia), horn, two trombones, baritone and tuba.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 66, n. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Giovanni Gabrieli, Sonata pian' e forte, ed. Robert King (North Easton: Robert King, 1958).

transcriptions of Italian and German instrumental music of the High Renaissance for modern brass. In 1972 twenty volumes of Giovanni Gabrieli's Canzoni et Sonate (1615) edited by Bernard Thomas and sixteen volumes of *Sacrae Symphoniae* edited by Robert Paul Block were added to the catalogue. The Musica Rara catalogue was an essential resource for brass players in the '70s, introducing Venetian 'brass' music, a collected performing edition of five-part instrumental music by Johann Pezel, and a miscellany of transcriptions including the sinfonias 'La Bergamasca' and 'La Padovana' by Ludovico Viadana (Venice, 1610). I value Robert Paul Block's edition of Sonata pian e forte for its accuracy and practicality, essentially a combined scholarly and performance edition: note values are halved from the original to conform with modern usage; *musica ficta* are added in superscript, carefully evaluated; incipits set out information of original clefs and instrumentation; part names (for example *cantus, altus, tenor, octavus* and *bassus*) and the initial few notes of each part in original notation; an introductory note includes precise information on the sources, including the Sacrae Symphoniae (1597).130

The crucial driver of change, however, was the revival of the cornett (Fr. *Cornet-à-bouquin*; Ger. *Zink*; It. *Cornetto*: Sp. *Corneta*), pioneered in Germany by Otto Steinkopf (1904–80) and in Britain by Christopher Monk (1921–91). Monk was the first to demonstrate the cornett on British radio in 1958 and worked tirelessly towards producing reliable facsimile instruments. Cornettist Bruce Dickey (b. 1949, Indiana) is extensively regarded as the leading global influence: firstly, through his performances with the Taverner Players, Hesperion XX, and Concerto Palatino; his long association as a teacher at the with the Schola Cantorem Basiliensis; his musicological writings, including a dedicated chapter in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments* (1997) and a source book in collaboration with Edward Tarr, *Articulation in Early Wind Music* (2007). He points out that cornetto articulation in the Italian school of the High Renaissance was sophisticated: in moving passages up

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Giovanni Gabrieli, *Sonata pian e forte* [transcribed for two trumpets and six trombones], vol. 6 of *Sacrae symphoniae* (1597), ed. Robert Paul Block (London: Musica Rara, 1972).

to quaver speed single tonguing is employed (te-te-te-te) and notes are normally tongued, other than trills and certain cadential embellishments; more rapid passages use fluid techniques such as 'te-re-le-re' and alternatives designed to steady tempo; the customary multiple tonguing technique of flutes and trumpets at that time (te-che-te-che) was considered unrefined, perhaps pertaining to fieldtrumpeters' practice.<sup>131</sup>

Reflecting this development, in Britain the foundation of 'His Majesty's Sagbutts and Cornetts' in 1982 reflected advances in the music college sector that were increasingly influential. In fact, Taruskin describes this widespread phenomenon (henceforth in British terminology)–historically informed performance (HIP)–as a sub-discipline derived from academic musicology and conservatoire curricula.<sup>132</sup> In regard of brass playing (henceforth including cornett) the pioneering institution in Britain was the Guildhall School of Music in the '70s, followed by the Royal College of Music and others, prompting ensuing interactions with academia.<sup>133</sup> This was an international development, nonetheless, with the Schola Cantorum Basiliensis a leading influence.

Paul McCreesh (b. 1960) graduated from Manchester University in 1981 and pursued his combined interests in music performance and musicology through forming the Gabrieli Consort & Players in London. His 1990 speculative reconstruction of the music at the Venetian coronation of Marino Grimani, 89th Doge of Venice (held on 26<sup>th</sup> April 1595), was a milestone of scholarship-in-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Anthony C. Baines, and Bruce Dickey, "Cornett," *Grove Music Online* 2001; https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/om o-9781561592630-e-0000006516.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> Richard Taruskin, *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance* (New York & Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), 51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> See Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 128–30.

performance in the UK.<sup>134</sup> This placed choral and instrumental music within the framework of a Renaissance mass, rather than a concert sequence. In this case the core music, by Andrea and Giovanni Gabrieli, was supplemented by toccatas for trumpets and drums by Magnus Thomsen (ca. 1600) and Cesare Bendinelli (ca. 1614). There is no extant music of this type from Venice, so selected pan-European examples were arranged for twelve natural trumpeters and four drummers. Whereas these are assertive, outward-facing signals that heralded proceedings to the congregation or the Piazza San Marco, McCreesh makes a cogent case that the music integral to the liturgical rituals, including the *cori spezzati*, may have been more intimate, directed towards the focal point of the ceremony and the dignitaries, even at times sotto voce, simultaneous with moments of the spoken service. Therefore, this and other subsequent projects led by McCreesh have major implications on performance practice of instrumental music of the High Renaissance.

In addition, by 1990 an understanding of the design and manufacture of historical brass instruments and facsimiles had matured. In addition to the revival of the cornett discussed above, Herbert discusses the use of pre-classical trombones in HIP and how makeshift examples in the 1950s were superseded by sophisticated facsimiles in subsequent decades, such as the models by Egger, Switzerland, using historical manufacturing methods and meticulously considered designs.<sup>135</sup>

My discography in *The Modern Brass Ensemble* shows a growing pool of versatile British brass players who had skills and inclination to cross over from modern performance to period performance and vice versa. Trumpeters Michael Laird and Mark Bennett, trombonists Susan Addison and David Purser led a growing

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> A Venetian Coronation 1595 (CD, 1990) [Virgin Classics. VC791110-2]. Gabrieli Consort & Players.
 Paul McCreesh. Recorded in Brinkburn Priory. Liner notes by Paul McCreesh.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Trevor Herbert, *The Trombone* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006), 306–7.

trend that became a frequent aspect of professional freelance life.<sup>136</sup> This musical versatility stands out in London Brass's 1994 record, *Gabrieli in Venice* in respect of applying 'early music' performance practice to modern brass.<sup>137</sup> Members of London Brass, including Bennett and Purser, are directed by Philip Pickett, and jointly apply concepts of phrasing, articulation, and ornamentation, such as that of Pickett's New London Consort, a landmark event.<sup>138</sup>

Conversely, transcriptions for and performances of this music by modern brass continued to be popular. TWC's Gabrieli & St Mark's: Venetian Brass Music (CD, 1990) demonstrates daring and imaginative interpretations, evoking the transcendental and the brilliant. As one of my submitted publications this warrants fresh analysis thirty-six years after the event.<sup>139</sup> In Canzon Duodecimi Toni (track 1) the rapid trumpet scalic passages are played with intensity by Wallace and Miller, the antithesis of Bruce Dickey's cornetto approach (see page 68), and this type of playing recurs throughout the album (for example track 1, at 3'50"). Similarly, several pieces are set at curiously fast tempi: Canzon VII (track 6) in a quirky 6/8, q. = c. 136; Andrea Gabrieli's Ricercare del Duodecimo Tuono (track 7), h and h. = c. 84; a triple meter episode in Canzon XV (track 12 at 2'20"). Thirdly, several glimpses of the transcendental in this reading seem over-emphasised, for example in Canzon Duodecimo Toni and Canzon X (track 1, at 2'45"; track 10, at 1'49"). On the other hand, Sonata pian e forte (track 2) and La Spiritata (track 8) follow convention, producing respectively sombre and highly delicate playing. On reflection, this album can be considered a postmodernist expression of musical personalities, intellectually informed but positively shunning dogma.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> See Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 169–74.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> *Gabrieli in Venice* (CD, 1994) [Teldec. 4509-90856-2]. London Brass, cond. Philip Pickett. 'Sonata pian e forte': track 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Miller, *Modern Brass Ensemble*, 108–9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Gabrieli & St Mark's: Venetian Brass Music (CD, 1990) [Nimbus. NI 5236]. The Wallace Collection, cond. Simon Wright. See p. iii: List of submitted publications,

In 1996 Eric Crees (b. 1952) produced a complete performing edition of the instrumental works of *Sacrae symphoniae* (1597), *Canzoni e sonate* (1615), plus several miscellaneous works, in flexible instrumentation and including minute details of dynamics, tempi, phrasing, and articulation.<sup>140</sup> Crees and London Symphony Brass recorded three CDs for Naxos 1997–2000.<sup>141</sup> His edition has two objectives: to provide a guide for amateur and student players; to achieve prompt and coherent results from professional players accustomed to minimal rehearsal time.

In conclusion, many modern brass ensembles established identity and legacy in part through re-creating instrumental music of the High Renaissance. This ranges in size from Andrea Gabrieli's *Ricercar del Duodecimo Tuono* to Giovanni Gabrieli's Sonata XX for five choirs, and the custom canonises a particular repertoire and reinforces a concert culture for brass ensemble as well as brass and choir. As a creative anachronism, this demonstrates a continuity from the late nineteenth century to the early twenty-first, that has lasted through changes in instrumentation, musical taste, and evolving scholarship-in-performance. This study of *Sonata pian e forte* leads me to consider future practice, whether with period or modern brass, or with mixed ensembles; Houle's study of meter and tempo has clarified some important parameters.

The popularity of polychoral brass endures, for example Joan Tower's *Fanfare for the Uncommon Woman no.3* (1991). In my former capacity of leading brass activity at RNCM 1999–2017 I instigated and conducted the premieres of two works of this type: Jonathan Dove's *Across the Walls* (2004) commissioned by the brass faculties of six British music colleges and performed at a 'Brass Explosion' inter-collegiate event in Birmingham on 21 March 2004; Adam Gorb's *Ommagio a* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Giovanni Gabrieli, *Eric Crees performing edition*, ed. Eric Crees, 43 vols. (Oakham, Brass Wind Publications, 1996).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Giovanni Gabrieli: Music for brass (3 CDs, 1997–2000) [Naxos, 8.553609, 8.553873, 8.554129]. London Symphony Brass, cond. Eric Crees.

*Giovanni* (2012) was performed by RNCM students in the RNCM Festival of Brass on 27<sup>th</sup> January 2013.

As part of the wider repertory of all-brass orchestral ensembles that emerged following World War II, exacting transcriptions of other genres of Western art music continue to be consequential. In their day, Elgar Howarth's transcription of Mussorgsky's *Pictures at an Exhibition* (1977) and Christopher Mowat's transcription of J. S. Bach's *Brandenburg Concerto No. 3* (1988) attracted wide interest and critical acclaim.

## **Concluding remarks**

Whereas art music for brass continues to be a peripheral component in the context of Britain's most prominent concert calendars, there are several environments in which it thrives. The brass band movement, that arguably surpasses all other British amateur music making through its abundant activities, has received significant scholarly attention in regard of its important historical and social functions in society.

The corresponding activities of professional ensembles experienced considerable resistance to inclusion in many prestigious musical events from 1951 onwards, but by the millennium achieved significant and wide interest through the dedication and passion of its key participants. In current times, the London-based Septura brass septet enjoys artistic success through its impressive performing level and impressive transcriptions of familiar art music. Conversely, the Austrian Mnozil Brass is renowned for its two-hour shows performed without sheet music. The latter is twenty-first century virtuosity, combined with dark humour and flawless presentation, playing phantasmic transcriptions of art music or singing Queen's *Bohemian Rhapsody*. From the 1830s brass music has been essentially eclectic.

The music college and University sector is particularly fertile in regard of adventurous performance and an interaction between performance and scholarship; this has been a *theme varié* throughout this thesis. A most recent privilege has been to part-lead a collaborative educational project of Victorian brass band music with Scottish and Finnish music students held at the RCS 25–28 November 2024. This concluded with a webcast that demonstrates a combination of education, performance, and scholarship.<sup>142</sup> In conclusion, this event epitomised the importance of maintaining dialogue between performance and scholarship, set out at the very outset of this thesis.

## Bibliography

- Anzenberger, Friedrich. "Method Books for Keyed Trumpet in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century: An Annotated Bibliography." *Historic Brass Society Journal* 6 (1994): 1–10.
- Apple, Robert Warren. "The Music Composed for the Keyed Trumpet." PhD diss., University of Memphis, 2022. vii–viii, <u>https://digitalcommons.memphis.edu/etd/3402.</u>
- Arban, Jean-Baptiste. *Grande méthode complète de cornet à pistons et de saxhorn.* Paris, 1859. Bibliotèque nationale de France; Accessed 17 May 2024. <u>https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k9625068z#</u>
- Baines, Anthony C., and Bruce Dickey. "Cornett." *Grove Music Online*. 2001; Accessed 2 May 2024. <u>https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/97815</u> <u>61592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000006516</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Webcast. RCS Sibelius Academy Victorian Brass Band. Stevenson Hall, RCS, 28 November 2024. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RCJxknXcHIM

- Beethoven, Ludwig van. Symphony no. 6, (Pastoral). Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, n.d.
- Bellon, Jean-François-Victor. *Quintettes de Cuivres nos. 1–12* (1848–50). Edited by Raymond Lapie. Vuarmarens: Bim, 1999–2001.
- Benvenuti, Giacomo, ed. Andrea e Giovanni Gabrieli e la Musica Strumentale in San Marco. Vols. 1 and 2 of Istituzioni e Monumenti dell' Arte Musicale Italiana. Milan: Ricordi, 1931–.
- Brown, Clive. *Classical & Romantic Performance Practice 1750–1900.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Butterworth, Arthur. Quartet for brass instruments, op. 91. 1991. Unpublished composer's manuscript score, parts and typescripts. GB 1179 ABW/1/63.
- Campbell, Murray, Joël Gilbert, and Arnold Myers. *The Science of Brass Instruments*. n.p.: ASA Press, 2021.
- Cherubini, Luigi. *Les deux journées*. Paris, c. 1800. Digitised score, IMSLP; Accessed 21 Nov. 2024. <u>https://ks15.imslp.org/files/imglnks/usimg/3/3c/IMSLP21652-PMLP49827-LES\_DEUX\_JOURNEES.pdf</u>
- Coffin, Sandy. "Auguste Mimart and his Chamber Music in 1850s Paris." *Historic Brass Society Journal* 34 (2022): 69-89.
- Dalqvist, Reine. *The Keyed Trumpet and its Greatest Virtuoso, Anton Weidinger*. Nashville: The Brass Press, 1975.
- Dieppo, Antoine. *Méthode complète pour le trombone.* Paris, 1837. Bibliotèque nationale de France; Accessed 17 May 2924. <<u>http://ark.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/cb42954596j></u>
- Ellis, Katherine. *Music Criticism in Nineteenth-Century France.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- ———. French Musical Life: Local Dynamics in the Century to World War II. New York: Oxford University Press, 2022.

Fallows, David. "Forte." *Grove Music Online.* 2001; Accessed 27 Apr. 2024. <u>https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/97815</u> <u>61592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000010014</u>.

- Gabrieli, Giovanni. *Sonata Pian e Forte* [transcribed for two trumpets, two horns, four trombones, tuba]. Edited by Fritz Stein. Leipzig: Peters, 1932.
- ———. *Sonata pian' e forte* [flexible instrumentation]. Edited by Robert King. North Easton: Robert King, 1958.
- — . Sonata pian e forte [transcribed for two trumpets and six trombones]. Vol. 6 of Sacrae symphoniae (1597). Edited by Robert Paul Block. London: Musica Rara, 1972.
- — . Eric Crees performing edition [The complete instrumental ensemble music.
  Flexible instrumentation]. Edited by Eric Crees. 43 vols. Oakham: Brass Wind Publications, 1996.
- García, Manuel. Nouveau Traité de l'Art de Chant, 5th ed. Paris, 1863.
- Haydn, Joseph. Concerto in Eb major for Trumpet and Orchestra. Urtext study score from "Joseph Haydn Werke." Edited by Makoto Ohmiya and Sonja Gerlach. Munich: Henle, 1985.
- ———. Symphony no. 100 (Military). Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, n.d.
- ———. *Trumpet Concerto.* Edited by Edward Tarr and H. C. Robbins Landon. Vienna: Universal, 1982.
- Herbert, Trevor. The Trombone. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006.
- Herbert, Trevor, ed. *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Herbert, Trevor. "Military Band." In *The Cambridge Encyclopedia of Brass Instruments.* Edited by Trevor Herbert, Arnold Myers, and John Wallace. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.

- Herbert, Trevor and Helen Barlow. *Music & the British Military in the Long Nineteenth Century*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Herbert, Trevor and John Wallace. "Aspects of Performance Practices: The Brass Band and its Influence on Other Brass-Playing Styles." In *The British Brass Band: A Musical and Social History.* Edited by Trevor Herbert. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
- ———. "Brass ensemble." In *The Cambridge Encyclopedia of Brass*. Edited by Trevor Herbert, Arnold Myers & John Wallace. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.
- Hummel, Johann. *Concerto a Tromba Principale, 1803*. Manuscript facsimile. Vaumarens: The Brass Press/Bim, 2011.
- Klaus, Sabine Katharina. "The Keyed Trumpet." In *Ways to Expand the Harmonic Series*, vol. 2, *Trumpets and other High Brass*. Vermillion: National Music Museum, 2013.
- Koehler, Elisa. "Brass Chamber Music." In *Fanfares and Finesse: A Performer's Guide* to Trumpet History and Literature, 165-75. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2014.
- Kosleck, Julius. Grosse Schule für Cornet à piston und Trompete. Leipzig, 1872.
- Kosleck, Julius, ed. Instrumentalsätze Älterer Zeit [early instrumental music]. Vol. 3 of 'Trompeten-Musik.' Berlin, 1889. See Hofmeister catalogue, February 1889, 53,
  <u>http://www.hofmeister.rhul.ac.uk/2008/content/monatshefte/1889\_02.htm</u>
  <u>Accessed 11 Jan. 2019.</u>

Lapie, Raymond. *Jean-François-Victor Bellon: 1795–1869*. Vaumarens: Bim, 2000.

Lorenz, Michael. "Six More Unknown Godchildren of Joseph Haydn." Musicological Trifles and Biographical Paralipomena (blog), 1 Mar. 2015. Accessed 1 Nov. 2024. <u>http://michaelorenz.blogspot.com/2015/03/six-more-unknown-godchildren-of-joseph.html,2</u>. Neukomm, Sigmund von. Vor- und Zwischenspiele: nebst e. Trauermarsch für d. Weidingersche Inventionstrompete, 4 Hörner u. 3 Posaunen zu d. Vocal-Requiem. Leipzig: Peters, 1817. Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Münchener Digitalisierungs Zentrum; Accessed 10 May 2024. <u>https://www.digitalesammlungen.de/en/details/bsb11307041.</u>

Maxwell Davies, Peter. Brass Quintet, op. 100. London: Chester, 1981.

———. Brass Quintet. Composer's note. Wise Music Classical / Chester Music (World). Accessed 7 Nov. 2024. <u>https://www.wisemusicclassical.com/work/11048/Brass-Quintet—Peter-Maxwell-Davies/</u>

McDonald, Donna. The Odyssey of the Philip Jones Brass Ensemble. Bulle: Bim, 1986.

- Miller, John. *The Modern Brass Ensemble in Twentieth-Century Britain.* Woodbridge: Boydell, 2022.
- ———. "The Philip Jones Brass Ensemble, 1951–1986." *Historic Brass Society Journal* 31 (2019): 51–76.

Nemetz, Andreas. Allgemeine Trompeten-Schule. Vienna, 1827.

- Neukomm, Sigismund von. Vor- und Zwischenspiele: nebst e. Trauermarsch für d. Weidingersche Inventionstrompete, 4 Hörner u. 3 Posaunen zu d. Vocal-Requiem. Leipzig, 1817. Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Münchener Digitalisierungs Zentrum. <u>https://www.digitale-</u> <u>sammlungen.de/en/details/bsb11307041. Accessed 10 May 2024</u>.
- Proksch, Bryan. "Reassessing Haydn's Friendship with Anton Weidinger." *Historic* Brass Society Journal 26 (2014): 1-11.
- Rice, John A. "The Musical Bee: References to Mozart and Cherubini in Hummel's 'New Years' Concerto." *Music & Letters* 77, no. 3 (August 1996): 414–22.
- Rouček, Jaroslav. "Chromatizace Žesťových Hudebních Nástrojů v 1. Pol. 19. St., Nástroje Opatřené Klapkovým Mechanismem." PhD diss., Academy of Performing Arts in Prague, 2012.

Roy, Eugène. Méthode de Trompette. Mainz, 1824.

- Saint-Jacome, Louis. Grand Method for the Cornet-À-Pistons. London: Lafleur (Alliance Musicale), c. 1870.
- Shamu, Geoffrey. "Inventing the warm-up: Merri Franquin's 'Principles of Study'." Historic Brass Society Journal 24 (2012): 129–57.
- Tarr, Edward H. East Meets West: The Russian trumpet tradition from the time of Peter the Great to the October revolution, with a lexicon of trumpeters active in Russia from the seventeenth century to the twentieth. Hillsdale: Pendragon Press, 2003.
- ———. "Ferdinand Weinschenk (1831–1910), Pivotal Figure in German Trumpet History." *Historic Brass Society Journal* 11 (1999): 10–36. <u>https://doi.org/10.2153/0120190011003</u>.
- Taruskin, Richard. *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Tollot, Julien. "[...] Collection des quatuors d'Haydn [Van Hob. III 46, XX 1 B, III 78, 72, 73, 76, 48, 77, 31, 45, 69, 32, 33, ?, 71, 75], 78rranges pour cinq instruments de cuivre [...] par Tollot." Bibliothèque nationale de France, département Musique, VMA MS-523 (1–16). Accessed 8 Oct. 2024. <u>http://catalogue.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/cb43042037j</u>
- Wasielewski, Wilhelm Joseph von. Ed. Instrumentalsätz vom Ende des XVI. bis Ende des XVII. Jahrhunderts [Instrumental pieces from the end of the 16<sup>th</sup> century until the end of the 17<sup>th</sup> century]. Bonn, 1874. Bibliotèque nationale de France, <u>https://gallica</u>.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b10076312b?rk=21459;2. Accessed 10 May 2024.
- Wallace, John. "Brass solo and chamber music from 1800." In *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments,* edited by Trevor Herbert & John Wallace, 236–54. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.

Wallace, John and Alexander McGrattan. *The Trumpet*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2011.

## Discography, listed by date

*Giovanni Gabrieli, Sonata pian e forte* (78rpm 30cm disc, 1935) [L'Anthologie Sonore AS58]. Ensemble of cornets, trombones, and violas, dir. Curt Sachs.

Foden's Champion Quartet, (10-inch disc, 1952) [Paxton PR578]. Edrich Siebert, Merriment; César Franck arr. Siebert, Scherzo from String Quartet in D.

Seven Canzonas of Giovanni Gabrieli (Vinyl LP record, 1953) [Counterpoint S-2401-5503]. New York Brass Ensemble, cond. Samuel Baron.

Concert with the Chicago Symphony Brass Ensemble, (LP, 1954 [Audiophile AP21].

Baroque Fanfares and Sonatas for Brass (Vinyl LP record, 1966) [Nonesuch. H-71145]. The London Brass Players, dir. Joshua Rifkin.

- *The London Gabrieli Brass Ensemble* (Vinyl LP record, 1966) [Pye Golden Guinea Collector series. GSGC 14072].
- Antiphonal Music of Gabrieli: Canzonas for Brass (Vinyl LP record, 1969) [CBS, 72729]. Philadelphia Brass Ensemble, Cleveland Brass Ensemble, Chicago Brass Ensemble.
- Ovation (CD, 1991) [Decca. BIEM/Sterma. 425.022-2]. Philip Jones Brass Ensemble, cond. Elgar Howarth. Mussorgsky arr. Howarth, *Pictures at an Exhibition*.
- *Richard Strauss:* [Complete] *Music for Symphonic Brass* (Vinyl LP record, 1979) [Chandos. ABR1002]. Locke Brass Consort, cond. James Stobart.
- A Venetian Coronation 1595 (CD, 1990) [Virgin Classics. VC791110-2]. Gabrieli Consort & Players, dir. Paul McCreesh.
- Gabrieli & St Mark's: Venetian Brass Music (CD, 1990) [Nimbus. NI 5236]. The Wallace Collection, cond. Simon Wright.
- The Wallace Collection (CD, 1991) [Collins Classics. 12292]. The Wallace Collection. (Track 2: Elliott Carter, Brass Quintet).
- Gabrieli in Venice (CD, 1994) [Teldec. 4509-90856-2]. London Brass, cond. Philip Pickett.
- *The Origin of the Species: Virtuoso Victorian Brass Music from Cyfarthfa Castle.* (CD, 1996) [Nimbus. NI 5470]. The Wallace Collection, cond. Simon Wright.
- *Giovanni Gabrieli: Music for brass* (3 CDs, 1997–2000) [Naxos, 8.553609, 8.553873, 8.554129]. London Symphony Brass, cond. Eric Crees.
- *Baltic Brass* (CD, 2001) [Deux-Elles. DXL 1042]. The Wallace Collection. Brass music by Jean Sibelius and Victor Ewald.
- *Peter Maxwell Davies: Music for Brass* (CD, 2015) [Nimbus. NI 5936]. The Wallace Collection. Recorded in the presence of the composer.

- Resonances of Waterloo (CD, 2018) [Sanctiandree. SAND0007]. St Salvator's Chapel Choir, University of St Andrews, cond. Tom Wilkinson. The Wallace Collection, John Miller, solo keyed trumpet.
- Origin of the Species Revisited (CD, 2020) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2020-001]. The Wallace Collection. Bellon: Quintets nos. 1–3, 12.
- Origin of the Species Revisited: Bellon Complete Edition vol. 2 (CD, 2021) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2021-001]. The Wallace Collection. Bellon: Quintets nos. 4–7.
- Origin of the Species Revisited: Bellon Complete Edition vol. 3. (CD, 2021) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2021-002]. The Wallace Collection. Bellon: Quintets nos. 8–11, no.12 finale 'Tema con variazione'.
- Origin of the Species Evolution (CD, 2022) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-FR2022-001]. The Wallace Collection. Auguste Mimart: Quintets nos. 1–6 and Septets 1–6.
- Haydn Transformed vol. 1: The Bird, The Emperor and The Dream (CD, 2023) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-SR2023-001]. The Wallace Collection. Joseph Haydn arr. Tollot. Quartet Hob.III: 39 (op.33, no. 3) 'The Bird'; Quartet Hob.III: 77 (op.76, no. 3) 'The Emperor'; Quartet Hob.III: 48 (op.50, no. 5) mvt. 2 'The Dream'.
- Haydn Transformed vol. 6: For Count and Concert Hall (CD, 2023) [The Wallace Collection. TWC-SR2023-001]. The Wallace Collection. Joseph Haydn arr. Tollot. Quartet Hob.III: 72 (op. 74, no. 1); Quartet Hob.III: 73 (op.74, no. 2); Quartet Hob.III: 74 (op.74, no. 3) 'The Rider'.