

Please cite the Published Version

Li, Zhen, Meng, Zhaozeng, Soutis, Constantinos, Wang, Ping and Gibson, Andrew (2022) Detection and analysis of metallic contaminants in dry foods using a microwave resonator sensor. Food Control, 133 (Part B). p. 108634. ISSN 0956-7135

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2021.108634

Publisher: Elsevier

Version: Accepted Version

Downloaded from: https://e-space.mmu.ac.uk/629853/

Usage rights: Creative Commons: Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0

Additional Information: This is an Accepted Manuscript of an article which appeared in Food Control, published by Elsevier

Enquiries:

If you have questions about this document, contact openresearch@mmu.ac.uk. Please include the URL of the record in e-space. If you believe that your, or a third party's rights have been compromised through this document please see our Take Down policy (available from https://www.mmu.ac.uk/library/using-the-library/policies-and-guidelines)

1	Detection and analysis of metallic contaminants in dry foods using a microwave resonator sensor
2	Zhen Li ^{1*} , Zhaozong Meng ² , Constantinos Soutis ³ , Ping Wang ¹ , Andrew Gibson ⁴
3	
4	¹ College of Automation Engineering, Nanjing University of Aeronautics and Astronautics,
5	Nanjing, 211106, China
6	² School of Mechanical Engineering, Hebei University of Technology, Tianjin, 300401, China
7	³ Department of Materials, The University of Manchester, Manchester, M13 9PL, UK
8	⁴ Faculty of Science and Engineering, Manchester Metropolitan University,
9	Manchester, M1 5GD, UK
10	*Corresponding author: <u>zhenli@nuaa.edu.cn</u>
11	Abstract

12 Current systems for metal detection in dry food processing are limited by relatively large foreign 13 objects and high-cost implementation. These issues are resolved here using a non-contact, cylindrical 14 microwave cavity resonator sensor where food passes through the cavity and metallic objects are 15 detected by a shift in the resonant frequency. Classic perturbation theory is applied to the basic set-16 up and numerical simulations are used to verify the design of the sensor. A cavity sensor was 17 fabricated with a quartz tube symmetrically located for dry food flow and metal detection. Good 18 performance is demonstrated for metal detection in a range of foods such as spaghetti, noodles, rice, 19 wheat flour and soy milk powder. It is shown that the resonance frequency shift becomes larger 20 when the foreign body gets closer to the cavity centre. The frequency variation is directly related to 21 the volume of the object, and it is estimated that the minimum diameter of a detectable ball can be 22 lower than 2 mm. For completeness it is also demonstrated that the set-up can be used to detect 23 dielectric objects. A graphical user interface is developed for practical applications. This approach is 24 low-cost, convenient, scalable and complementary to other metal contaminant detection approaches. 25

Keywords: Dry foods; foreign objects; microwave technique; resonance frequency; cavity
 perturbation

29 1 Introduction

30 Foreign objects can be introduced into food products during harvesting, processing and final 31 packing. Among all the contaminants, metallic objects (e.g., screws, bolts, nuts, small fragments 32 from equipment in the production line or cleaning tools) cause the most concern for manufacturers if they are undetected and become embedded in final products, posing a severe threat to human health. 33 34 A brand can be severely affected by such incidents. In addition, metal contamination may potentially damage the machinery, leading to unwanted downtime. Hence, from the economic point of view, it is 35 36 of great importance to detect metal objects in food. Many non-invasive techniques have been developed. However, each has its advantages and limitations, and only one technique cannot serve 37 38 all the needs of the industry. For example, the X-ray (Einarsdóttir et al., 2016; Morita, Ogawa, Thai, 39 & Tanaka, 2003) and nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR) instruments are expensive and need high 40 power usage. For the conventional liquid-coupled ultrasonics (Zhao, Basir, & Mittal, 2003), waves 41 cannot propagate well in the air, and this can be overcome if the food is immersed in water. This 42 special arrangement is not desirable for some food types, especially dry foods. Instead, air-coupled 43 ultrasonics can be applied, while the point scanning feature impedes fast inspection. Terahertz 44 inspection needs intricate instrumentation (Wang, Zhou, Huang, Xie, & Ying, 2019) and it has a low 45 signal-to-noise ratio (Kim et al., 2012). Near-infrared (NIR) spectroscopy, thermal imaging and 46 optical techniques cannot readily examine subsurface foreign bodies. Three types of widely used 47 low-frequency electromagnetic detection systems are pulse technology, ferrous in foil detection, and 48 the balanced three coil system (Craig, 2004). The pulse technology is limited to finding relatively 49 large pieces of metals, like nails and cans. Ferrous in foil detectors are more suited to ferrous metal 50 contamination. In a balanced three coil system, a transmitter and two receiver coils are used, and 51 complicated signal processing is involved. Therefore, there is continued search for efficient 52 identification of metallic objects.

53 In recent years, microwaves-based detection techniques have received increased attention. The 54 microwave frequencies range from 300 MHz (wavelength of ~1 m) to 300 GHz (wavelength of ~1 55 mm). In the analysis of the interaction with dielectrics, the complex permittivity (also called dielectric properties) is involved, and it can be characterised by $\varepsilon_0\varepsilon_r = \varepsilon_0(\varepsilon'_r - j\varepsilon''_r)$. ε_0 is the electric 56 permittivity of free space (i.e., 8.854×10⁻¹² F/m), and ε_r is the relative permittivity. ε'_r and ε''_r are the 57 real and imaginary parts of ε_r , respectively. ε'_r (commonly called dielectric constant) is related to the 58 ability of energy storage. ε_r'' accounts for the energy dissipation. The microwave methods have 59 60 several distinctive characteristics, such as low signal power consumption (few milliwatts), non61 contact inspection, ease of experimental setup, good repeatability and no-ionising radiation. They 62 have been successfully applied for material characterisation (Brinker, Dvorsky, Al Qaseer, & 63 Zoughi, 2020; Cuenca, Slocombe, & Porch, 2017; Li, Haigh, Soutis, & Gibson, 2019), damage 64 evaluation (Li, Haigh, Soutis, & Gibson, 2018; Li, Wang, Haigh, Soutis, & Gibson, 2021) and food 65 analysis (Li, Haigh, Soutis, Gibson, & Sloan, 2017; Li, Meng, Haigh, Wang, & Gibson, 2021; Li, Haigh, Wang, Soutis, & Gibson, 2021b, 2021a; Sosa-Morales, Valerio-Junco, López-Malo, & 66 67 García, 2010). However, for contamination monitoring, little research can be found in the literature. 68 Urbinati et al. (2020) developed a microwave system where six monopole antennas were arranged 69 above packaged jars. Machine learning was incorporated to interpret the 6×6 matrix of scattering 70 parameters. It was found that a metal sphere with a diameter of 10 mm was accurately detected by 71 the multilayer perceptron classifier. In this approach, complicated signal post-processing was 72 involved, impeding its wide application.

73 The primary objective of this study is to offer a novel approach for the detection of metals in food 74 using microwave resonance. Dry foods are the food type of interest in the present work. The 75 microwave energy is easily absorbed in moist samples and the resonance can be severely degraded. In comparison, in dry foods relating to a small ε_r'' value, lower energy is absorbed and consequently 76 77 the signal penetration is deeper. It is noted that microwaves have very low penetration in metals, 78 which behave more like reflectors and little electromagnetic energy is absorbed (Thostenson & 79 Chou, 1999). By the insertion of a metallic object, a perturbation in the shape of a resonant cavity 80 can be produced. Hence, here a low-cost cylindrical cavity resonator sensor is developed. The detection principle is described in detail, where the change of the resonance frequency is chosen as 81 the primary indicator. Numerical simulation and experiments are carried out for verification. In the 82 test, metallic objects in spaghetti are analysed first as an example, where the effects of the position, 83 84 volume, quantity and shape of the object on the signal magnitude are thoroughly investigated. 85 Finally, the detection performance for other dry foods including noodles, rice, wheat flour and soy 86 milk powder is examined. The applicability of the sensor for dielectric contaminants is also studied.

87 2 Materials and methods

88 2.1 Samples under test

89 Five types of dry food samples bought from a local supermarket were measured, i.e., spaghetti,

90 noodles, rice, wheat flour and soy milk powder. The diameter and length of the spaghetti strand were

91 approximately 1.70 mm and 264 mm, respectively. Each noodle strand had a square cross section of

92 approximately 1 mm×1 mm and a length of 184 mm. Metallic balls and wires, dielectric rods were

used as foreign bodies, material types and dimensions of which are listed in Table 1. Some reference
permittivity data of the samples are presented in Table 2. The sizes were measured with a digital
calliper (Pro's Kit Co. Ltd., Shanghai, China), which had an accuracy of 0.01 mm.

96 2.2 Microwave resonator sensor

104

117

97 The resonant cavity sensor was made of aluminium, which has a high electrical conductivity and is 98 reasonably priced. Its fabrication cost was around US\$ 75. As illustrated in Figure 1, the sensor 99 consists of a cylindrical wall and an endplate, which are mechanically connected by eight bolts and 100 nuts. The radius of the cavity (*a*) is 47.5 mm, and the height (*d*) is 40 mm. Two SubMiniature 101 version A (SMA) connectors are mounted on the endplate, and at the end of each connector a 102 coupling loop is made for the excitation of the resonant mode designated, i.e., TE₀₁₁ mode. For the 103 air-filled cavity designed, the resonance frequency can be computed by

$$f_r = \frac{c}{2\pi} \sqrt{\left(\frac{p_{01}'}{a}\right)^2 + \left(\frac{\pi}{d}\right)^2} \tag{1}$$

105 where *c* is the speed of light in free space. p'_{01} =3.832 is the first root of the derivative of J_0 , which is 106 the Bessel function of first kind. Hence, by substituting the values of *a* and *d* into Equation (1), the 107 theoretical f_r value is approximately 5.3721 GHz.

108 The TE_{011} mode has a degenerate mode (i.e., the TM_{111} mode) that shares the same frequency but 109 exhibits different field distributions. To remove the mode interference, a hole with a diameter of 26 110 mm was drilled axially. The recess can be viewed as a short circular waveguide, and the cutoff 111 frequency of the dominant mode (approximately 6.76 GHz) is higher than the resonance frequency. 112 Thus, the electromagnetic energy can still be confined within the cavity.

113 **2.3** Cavity perturbation caused by dielectrics and metals

- 114 When a dielectric sample like food is inserted into a resonant cavity, material perturbation is
- 115 introduced. The fractional change in the resonant frequency can be estimated by (Collin, 2000)

116
$$\frac{\omega_2 - \omega_1}{\omega_1} \Box \frac{-\int_{V_c} \left(\Delta \varepsilon \left|\overline{E}_1\right|^2 + \Delta \mu \left|\overline{H}_1\right|^2\right) dv}{\int_{V_c} \left(\varepsilon \left|\overline{E}_1\right|^2 + \mu \left|\overline{H}_1\right|^2\right) dv}$$
(2a)

$$\omega_{\rm l} = 2\pi f_{\rm l} + \frac{j\pi f_{\rm l}}{Q_{\rm l}} \tag{2b}$$

118
$$\omega_2 = 2\pi f_2 + \frac{j\pi f_2}{Q_2}$$
(2c)

- 119 where ω_1, f_1 and Q_1 are the complex angular frequency, resonance frequency and quality factor
- before the perturbation, respectively. ω_2 , f_2 and Q_2 are the complex angular frequency, resonance
- 121 frequency and quality factor after the perturbation, respectively. ε and μ are the electric permittivity
- 122 and magnetic permeability of the medium in the unperturbed cavity, respectively. In the present case,
- 123 ε and μ are equal to ε_0 and magnetic permeability of free space $\mu_0 = 4\pi \times 10^{-7}$ H/m, respectively. $\Delta \varepsilon$ and
- 124 $\Delta \mu$ are the permittivity and permeability changes introduced by the sample, respectively. Thus, $\Delta \varepsilon$
- 125 can be expressed as $\varepsilon_0[(\varepsilon'_r 1) j \varepsilon''_r]$. The dielectrics are generally non-magnetic, so $\Delta \mu$ is equivalent to 126 zero. \overline{E}_1 and \overline{H}_1 are the original electric and magnetic fields, respectively. V_c is the volume of the 127 cavity. For the original cavity, at resonance the electric energy stored in the cavity volume is equal to
- 128 the magnetic energy stored, i.e.,

129
$$\int_{V_c} \varepsilon \left| \overline{E}_1 \right|^2 dv \approx \int_{V_c} \mu \left| \overline{H}_1 \right|^2 dv$$
(3)

130 Hence, the resonance frequency $\Delta f_r = f_2 - f_1$ can be given by

131
$$\Delta f_r \Box - \frac{\left(\varepsilon_r' - 1\right) f_1}{2} \frac{\int_{V_d} \left|\overline{E}_1\right|^2 dv}{\int_{V_c} \left|\overline{E}_1\right|^2 dv}$$
(4)

132 where V_d is the volume of the dielectric object. It is indicated that a lower resonance frequency can 133 be produced by the food, and the frequency change is larger for a higher dielectric constant.

134 When the food contains a metallic object, the volume of the cavity is slightly reduced, causing

additional shape perturbation. The resultant resonance frequency change can be approximated by(Pozar, 2012)

137
$$\frac{\Delta f_r}{f_1} \Box \frac{\int_{V_m} \left(\mu \left|\overline{H}_1\right|^2 - \varepsilon \left|\overline{E}_1\right|^2\right) dv}{\int_{V_c} \left(\mu \left|\overline{H}_1\right|^2 + \varepsilon \left|\overline{E}_1\right|^2\right) dv}$$
(5)

where V_m is the volume of the metallic object. Resonance frequencies f_1 and f_2 correspond to food without and with a metallic object inside, respectively. For the TE₀₁₁ mode, as the electric field intensity around the axis is relatively low, the magnetic field is more affected. Therefore, the resonance frequency would be increased when a metallic object appears. Considering the extreme case where the contribution by \overline{E}_1 is ignored, the expression for Δf_r can be simplified as

143
$$\Delta f_r \approx \frac{V_m f_1}{2} \frac{\left|\overline{H}_{1,\text{avg}}\right|^2}{\int_{V_c} \left|\overline{H}_1\right|^2 dv}$$
(6)

144 where $|\overline{H}_{1,avg}|$ is the average magnetic field intensity in the metallic object region. Δf_r is directly

- 145 proportional to V_m , suggesting that the detection is more sensitive to a larger object.
- 146 Using the shape perturbation theory, the resonant mode can be checked with a metallic wire
- 147 positioned along the cavity axis. The wire has a small radius r and a length longer than the cavity
- 148 height. r can be estimated from the resonant frequency shift by substituting the expressions of the
- 149 electric and magnetic fields of the desired resonant mode into Equation (5). For the TE_{011} mode, r
- 150 can be given by

151

$$r \square a_{\sqrt{2\zeta \frac{\Delta f_r}{f_1}}} \tag{7}$$

152 where the coefficient ζ is expressed as

153
$$\zeta = \left[1 + \left(\frac{\pi a}{dp'_{01}}\right)^2\right] J_0^2(p'_{01})$$
(8)

154 If the *r* value calculated is close to the real value, the resonant mode can be confirmed.

155 2.4 Experimental setup

- 156 The setup for the food examination using the microwave resonator sensor is shown in Figure 2. The
- 157 sensor was connected to a portable N9951A Fieldfox microwave analyser (Keysight Technologies,
- 158 Penang, Malaysia) by two coaxial cables. A LAN cable was used to link the analyser to a personal
- 159 computer (PC). As a two-port measurement, the transmission coefficient (S_{21}) data were extracted. In
- 160 the test, the default signal power (i.e., 0.032 mW) was adopted.
- 161 A frequency span of 20 MHz with 401 points was used, so that the frequency resolution was 0.05
- 162 MHz. The intermediate frequency bandwidth (IFBW) was set to 100 Hz to reduce the noise floor and
- accurately measure the non-resonance region. The analyser setting produced a long sweep time of
- around 10.3 s. To shorten the time for rapid online monitoring, the number of points can be set lower
- 165 and/or IFBW value can be set higher without significantly decreasing the detection accuracy, as only
- 166 the resonance frequency value is needed and the peak signal is orders of magnitude larger than the
- 167 non-resonance region. For a frequency range of 5.324-5.334 GHz with 101 points (the corresponding
- 168 frequency resolution was 0.10 MHz, which was still enough for discrimination) and an IFBW value
- 169 of 10 kHz, the sweep time was approximately 66 ms.
- 170 For easy positioning of the sample, a 160 mm long quartz tube with an inner diameter of 12 mm and
- 171 an outer diameter of 14 mm was used. The food sample was filled into the tube and inserted into the
- 172 resonant cavity through two cuboid-shaped tube holders. Each tube holder had a central hole with a
- 173 diameter of 14 mm and was attached to the top and bottom surfaces of the cavity.

174

175 **3** Results and discussion

176 **3.1 Electromagnetic simulation**

177 $CST^{\$}$ software is employed for the feasibility study. The cavity model built is given in Figure 3 (a), 178 and the electric and magnetic field distributions are presented in Figure 3 (b-d), where the patterns 179 produced match those of the ideal TE_{011} mode, validating the cavity design. The magnetic field 180 intensity is the highest at the cavity centre, where the presence of a metallic object can cause a 181 relatively large perturbation. It is also shown that the magnetic field intensity is high around the axis, 182 but the electric field intensity is relatively low. Hence, a perturbation can be more easily generated 183 by a metal than a dielectric.

184 Three representative cases are considered, i.e., an empty cavity, insertion of a quartz tube and a copper sphere. The relative permittivity data of fused quartz, $3.75 - i 1.5 \times 10^{-3}$, is from the built-in 185 186 material library. The resonance frequency of the empty cavity simulated is 5.3634 GHz, which is in 187 good agreement with the theoretical value (an error of 0.2%). As seen in Figure 4 (a), with the 188 introduction of a quartz tube, the resonance frequency is shifted to 5.3432 GHz due to material 189 perturbation. A copper sphere is further created at the cavity centre, and the resonance peak shifts upwards with increasing sphere diameter (D=1, 2, 3, 4, 5 mm). The perturbation of the magnetic 190 191 field around the sphere is shown in Figure 4 (b) and (c), where only the field lines close to the sphere 192 surface are distorted and the small perturbation condition is satisfied. The effect of the diameter on 193 the resonance frequency shift is plotted in Figure 4 (d), where a linear correlation with a high coefficient of determination $R^2=0.999$ is given and the intercept of the fitted equation obtained is 194 195 small compared with the dynamic range of the frequency shift. The findings agree well with the 196 theoretical analysis (i.e., Equation (6)).

197 **3.2 Experimental results**

198 3.2.1 Examination of the resonant mode

The resonant mode was checked with the LWb wire, and another similar tube holder with a central hole of the same diameter as the wire was made. For the empty cavity, one resonance peak was observed over 5.34-5.38 GHz, and the resonance frequency measured was 5.35362 GHz (only 0.4%lower than the theoretical value). When the wire was inserted, the peak shifted to 5.36264 GHz. Using the cavity dimensions and resonance frequencies measured, the radius computed was 1.55 mm, and the resultant error was well within 5%, demonstrating that the resonance frequency measured corresponded to the TE₀₁₁ mode and the degenerate mode was successfully suppressed.

206 3.2.2 Characterisation of a metallic ball in spaghetti

- The quartz tube was partially filled with 17 spaghetti strands to mimic the real scenario where the food shall freely flow in the production line. The height of the spaghetti was around 6 mm (i.e., the radius of the tube). First, a BD5 ball was placed below the spaghetti at a position just outside the cavity, i.e., P0 as illustrated in Figure 5 (a). After the measurement at this position, the tube together with the spaghetti and ball was moved to the other ten positions (denoted by P1-P10). The distance between the adjacent positions was 5mm. Starting from P3, the ball entered the cavity. At P7 the ball was located closest to the cavity centre. During the movement, the length of the spaghetti part in the
- 214 cavity was always equal to the cavity height.
- 215 The resonant responses for all the positions are given in Figure 5 (b). The frequency decreased when
- the spaghetti was placed into the empty cavity. The frequency changes with respect to P0 are
- 217 computed and presented in Figure 5 (c). Three consecutive measurements were done for each case,
- 218 while the resonance frequency extracted remained the same due to the low IFBW value used,
- 219 demonstrating good repeatability of the sensor. Therefore, error bars are not plotted in the figure. The
- highest frequency shift Δf_r was seen at P7 as would be expected. For comparison, the spaghetti
- without the presence of the ball were measured at the eleven positions as well, and the maximumdifference between the frequencies was 0.15 MHz, indicating a relatively low noise.
- 223 The P0 case is different from the spaghetti-only case, as there is a resonance frequency difference of
- 224 1.75 MHz. At P0 the ball did not affect the magnetic field distribution in the cavity, but the spaghetti
- 225 were lifted upwards due to the relatively high stiffness of the spaghetti. As indicated by the
- simulation, when the centre of the material is closer to the cavity axis, the electric field intensity
- inside becomes smaller. Therefore, according to the material perturbation theory, the frequency
- becomes higher than that of the spaghetti-only case. Hence, it is suggested that the sensor can detect
- the presence of a metal when it is close to but still not in the cavity.
- As shown in Figure 5 (c), smaller balls (i.e., BD2, BD3 and BD4) are also detected. A smaller object
- 231 produces a lower Δf_r , which agrees well with Equation (6). A similar linear relationship is found
- between the maximum Δf_r at P7 and the cube of the diameter D, i.e., $\Delta f_r = 0.0421D^3 0.1223$ with
- 233 $R^2=0.9909$. Considering the signal noise, the minimum diameter of a ball that can be detected in the
- spaghetti is around 1.86 mm.

235 3.2.3 Effect of the ball quantity on the signal responses

- Taking the BD3 ball as an example, the effect of the ball quantity was studied. The balls were in
- 237 contact and aligned in parallel to the cavity axis. Initially, the centre of the balls was at P0. The
- 238 differences between the resonance frequencies at P0 and P7 are listed in Table 3, where the

- 239 placement of more balls leads to a greater frequency shift. The responses for a large number of balls
- 240 were evaluated using the LWa and LWb wires, where the latter had the same diameter as the BD3
- ball. The frequency shift caused was higher than any of the ball cases as expected. In comparison, the
- LWa wire had a smaller diameter, and a lower Δf_r was obtained.

243 3.2.4 Detection of a short wire in spaghetti

Same as the balls, short wires were measured at P0 and P7. The corresponding resonance frequency differences are presented in Table 4, where lower responses are seen for smaller dimensions. In the test, the wire was parallel to the magnetic field, and the cross-sectional area was smaller than the diameter of a ball of the same volume (e.g., SWb2 and BD4), thereby inducing weaker perturbation. Thus, it is indicated that ball-shaped objects can be more easily identified than stick-shaped objects.

249 **3.3 Discussion**

250 3.3.1 Detection of a metallic object in other dry foods

251 Same as the setup in the spaghetti cases, the sensor performance for the other dry food samples was 252 examined. For each sample, the two cases with food only and with a BD3 ball at P7 were considered. 253 The resonant responses obtained are presented in Figure 6, where the Δf_r values for noodles, rice, 254 wheat flour and soy milk powder are 2.75 MHz, 3.68 MHz, 2.93 MHz and 2.03 MHz, respectively. 255 Thus, the ball can be readily detected in these foods as well. For the noodles, the effect of the ball 256 size was also studied at P0 and P7, and the Δf_r values for BD2, BD3, BD4 and BD5 were 0.20 MHz, 257 0.95 MHz, 2.75 MHz and 5.85 MHz, respectively. For the same ball, the value of Δf_r is slightly 258 higher than that in the spaghetti case, indicating better detection sensitivity. The trend of the 259 frequency shift with respect to the ball size (the relationship between Δf_r and D^3 is $\Delta f_r = 0.0487 D^3$ -0.2922 with R^2 =0.9987) is consistent with that for spaghetti. 260

261 3.3.2 Examination of a dielectric object in spaghetti

262 The sensitivity to a dielectric object was investigated using short Plexiglas rods. The Δf_r values 263 computed at P1-P10 for four rods with varied lengths are presented in Figure 7, where the frequency decreases as the rod is closer to the cavity centre. This trend of the frequency variation is opposite to 264 265 that for a metallic object, facilitating the differentiation of metallic and dielectric objects. The 266 primary reason is due to the fact that here material perturbation is involved. Compared with the 267 results of the metallic balls given in Figure 5 (c), the signal magnitudes for the rods are five times 268 lower, though the volumes are comparable. Therefore, it is suggested that the Plexiglas material is 269 less detectable.

270 3.3.3 Development of foreign object detection software

As shown in Figure 8, MATLAB GUI-based software is programmed for easier identification of a
foreign body. First, six parameter values are input for analyser setting and analyser-computer
communication, i.e., IEEE GPIB address, start frequency, stop frequency, number of points, IFBW
value and signal power. S₂₁ data from a reference case (e.g., a foreign body-free case) are taken.
Continuous scanning is then performed until the current resonance frequency shift is over the
detection threshold defined. A warning message box pops up when a foreign object is found, and the
specific object type (metal or dielectric) is also provided.

278 4 Concluding remarks

279 A new microwave resonant system has been introduced for the detection of metals in dry foods. The 280 low-cost sensor requires very low signal power and is sensitive to both ferrous and non-ferrous 281 containments. The presence of a metallic object perturbs the magnetic field in the TE_{011} mode 282 resonant cavity and causes an increase in the resonance frequency. In the evaluation of metallic balls 283 in spaghetti, it has been revealed that the frequency shift is proportional to the volume of the ball, 284 which is in good agreement with the theoretical analysis and numerical simulation. The minimum 285 diameter of a detectable ball can be lower than 2 mm. For the same volume, an object with a larger 286 cross-sectional area can be identified more easily due to the stronger perturbation. Good detection 287 performance has also been shown for other types of dry foods. The sensor can also be applied for the 288 detection of dielectric containments. For the low electric field intensity around the axis and small 289 difference of the permittivity between the dry food and the foreign object, the detection signal is 290 relatively low compared with a metal of the same volume. A GUI-based programme has been 291 developed for convenient implementation. The comparison between the proposed sensor and the 292 existing research for foreign body detection in dry foods is presented in Table 5.

In future work, the speed of the moving food on the effectiveness of the sensor system is to be tested. Methods like gold plating on the inner surface of the cavity, use of more frequency points and minimisation of the recess size will be adopted to improve the sensor performance. In addition, bespoke low-cost sensor electronics will be developed for industrial use. For a real production line, the cavity can be scaled up to ensure high throughput, and the technique can be combined with other non-invasive sensors for enhanced performance.

- 299
- 300
- 301
- 302

303 Acknowledgements

- 304 This work was financially supported by the Natural Science Foundation of Jiangsu Province (Grant
- No. BK20200427), the Shuangchuang Project of Jiangsu Province (Grant No. KFR20020), the
- 306 Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (Grant No. NS2020019) and the National
- 307 Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant No. 52105552). The first author gratefully
- 308 acknowledges Dr.Changcheng Wu and Dr. Fei Fei for assistance in the experiments.
- 309

310 References

- A. Prasad, & P. N. Singh. (2007). A New Approach to Predicting the Complex Permittivity of Rice.
 Transactions of the ASABE, 50(2), 573–582. https://doi.org/10.13031/2013.22645
- 313 Brinker, K., Dvorsky, M., Al Qaseer, M. T., & Zoughi, R. (2020). Review of advances in microwave
- and millimetre-wave NDT&E: principles and applications. *Philosophical Transactions of*
- *the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences, 378*(2182), 20190585.
- 316 https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2019.0585
- 317 Collin, R. E. (2000). Foundations for Microwave Engineering (2nd ed.). Wiley-IEEE Press.
- Craig, J. P. (2004). Metal detection. In M. Edwards (Ed.), *Detecting Foreign Bodies in Food* (p.
 306). Cambridge, England: CRC Press.
- Cuenca, J. A., Slocombe, D. R., & Porch, A. (2017). Temperature Correction for Cylindrical Cavity
 Perturbation Measurements. *IEEE Transactions on Microwave Theory and Techniques*, 65(6),
 2153–2161. https://doi.org/10.1109/TMTT.2017.2652462
- Einarsdóttir, H., Emerson, M. J., Clemmensen, L. H., Scherer, K., Willer, K., Bech, M., ... Pfeiffer,
 F. (2016). Novelty detection of foreign objects in food using multi-modal X-ray imaging. *Food Control*, 67, 39–47. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2016.02.023
- 326 Ginesu, G., Giusto, D. D., Margner, V., & Meinlschmidt, P. (2004). Detection of foreign bodies in
- food by thermal image processing. *IEEE Transactions on Industrial Electronics*, 51(2), 480–
 490. https://doi.org/10.1109/TIE.2004.825286
- Hippel, A. R. Von. (1995). *Dielectric materials and applications* (2nd ed.). New York: Artech
 House. Retrieved from http://cds.cern.ch/record/270934
- Kim, G.-J., Kim, J.-I., Jeon, S.-G., Kim, J., Park, K.-K., & Oh, C.-H. (2012). Enhanced Continuous Wave Terahertz Imaging with a Horn Antenna for Food Inspection. *Journal of Infrared*,
- 333 *Millimeter, and Terahertz Waves*, *33*(6), 657–664. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10762-012-9902-1
- Kwon, J.-S., Lee, J.-M., & Kim, W.-Y. (2008). Real-time detection of foreign objects using X-ray
- imaging for dry food manufacturing line. In 2008 IEEE International Symposium on Consumer

- 336 *Electronics* (pp. 1–4). IEEE. https://doi.org/10.1109/ISCE.2008.4559552
- Li, Z., Haigh, A., Soutis, C., & Gibson, A. (2018). Principles and Applications of Microwave Testing
 for Woven and Non-Woven Carbon Fibre-Reinforced Polymer Composites: a Topical Review.
- 339 *Applied Composite Materials*, 25(4), 965–982. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10443-018-9733-x
- Li, Z., Haigh, A., Soutis, C., & Gibson, A. (2019). X-band microwave characterisation and analysis
 of carbon fibre-reinforced polymer composites. *Composite Structures*, *208*, 224–232.
- 342 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compstruct.2018.09.099
- Li, Z., Haigh, A., Soutis, C., Gibson, A., & Sloan, R. (2017). Evaluation of water content in honey
 using microwave transmission line technique. *Journal of Food Engineering*, *215*, 113–125.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2017.07.009
- Li, Z., Haigh, A., Wang, P., Soutis, C., & Gibson, A. (2021a). Characterisation and analysis of
 alcohol in baijiu with a microwave cavity resonator. *LWT*, *141*, 110849.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2021.110849
- Li, Z., Haigh, A., Wang, P., Soutis, C., & Gibson, A. (2021b). Dielectric spectroscopy of Baijiu over
 2–20 GHz using an open-ended coaxial probe. *Journal of Food Science*, *86*(6), 2513–2524.
 https://doi.org/10.1111/1750-3841.15738
- Li, Z., Meng, Z., Haigh, A., Wang, P., & Gibson, A. (2021). Characterisation of water in honey using
 a microwave cylindrical cavity resonator sensor. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 292, 110373.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2020.110373
- Li, Z., Wang, P., Haigh, A., Soutis, C., & Gibson, A. (2021). Review of microwave techniques used
 in the manufacture and fault detection of aircraft composites. *The Aeronautical Journal*, *125*(1283), 151–179. https://doi.org/10.1017/aer.2020.91
- Mason, P. R., Hasted, J. B., & Moore, L. (1974). The use of statistical theory in fitting equations to
 dielectric dispersion data. *Advances in Molecular Relaxation Processes*, 6(3), 217–232.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/0001-8716(74)80003-9
- Morita, K., Ogawa, Y., Thai, C. N., & Tanaka, F. (2003). Soft X-Ray Image Analysis to Detect
 Foreign Materials in Foods. *Food Science and Technology Research*, 9(2), 137–141.
 https://doi.org/10.3136/fstr.9.137
- Nelson, S. O. (1984). Density Dependence of the Dielectric Properties of Wheat and Whole-Wheat
 Flour. *Journal of Microwave Power*, 19(1), 55–64.
- 366 https://doi.org/10.1080/16070658.1984.11689350
- Ok, G., Kim, H. J., Chun, H. S., & Choi, S.-W. (2014). Foreign-body detection in dry food using
 continuous sub-terahertz wave imaging. *Food Control*, 42, 284–289.

- 369 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2014.02.021
- Pallav, P., Hutchins, D. A., & Gan, T. (2009). Air-coupled ultrasonic evaluation of food materials. *Ultrasonics*, 49(2), 244–253. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ultras.2008.09.002
- Pozar, D. M. (2012). *Microwave Engineering. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.* (Fourth edi). New York: John
 Wiley & Sons. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13398-014-0173-7.2
- 374 Sosa-Morales, M. E., Valerio-Junco, L., López-Malo, A., & García, H. S. (2010). Dielectric
- 375 properties of foods: Reported data in the 21st Century and their potential applications. *LWT* -
- 376 *Food Science and Technology*, *43*(8), 1169–1179. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lwt.2010.03.017
- Stuart O. Nelson, & Tian-su You. (1989). Microwave Dielectric Properties of Corn and Wheat
 Kernels and Soybeans. *Transactions of the ASAE*, 32(1), 0242–0249.
- 379 https://doi.org/10.13031/2013.30990
- Thostenson, E. T., & Chou, T. W. (1999). Microwave processing: fundamentals and applications.
 Composites Part A: Applied Science and Manufacturing, *30*(9), 1055–1071.
- 382 https://doi.org/10.1016/S1359-835X(99)00020-2
- Urbinati, L., Ricci, M., Turvani, G., Vasquez, J. A. T., Vipiana, F., & Casu, M. R. (2020). A
 Machine-Learning Based Microwave Sensing Approach to Food Contaminant Detection. In
 2020 IEEE International Symposium on Circuits and Systems (ISCAS) (pp. 1–5). IEEE.
 https://doi.org/10.1109/ISCAS45731.2020.9181293
- Wang, C., Zhou, R., Huang, Y., Xie, L., & Ying, Y. (2019). Terahertz spectroscopic imaging with
 discriminant analysis for detecting foreign materials among sausages. *Food Control*, *97*, 100–
 104. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2018.10.024
- Yin, J., Hameed, S., Xie, L., & Ying, Y. (2021). Non-destructive detection of foreign contaminants
 in toast bread with near infrared spectroscopy and computer vision techniques. *Journal of Food*
- 392 *Measurement and Characterization*, 15(1), 189–198. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11694-020 393 00627-6
- Zhao, B., Basir, O. A., & Mittal, G. S. (2003). Detection of metal, glass and plastic pieces in bottled
 beverages using ultrasound. *Food Research International*, *36*(5), 513–521.
- 396 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0963-9969(02)00201-6
- 397

398 Tables

Table 1 Details of the foreign objects used in this study

		B	all		Long	wire			Shor	t wire				Sho	rt rods	
Material		Q235	steel		Cop	oper			Cop	oper				Plex	iglass	
Diameter (mm)	2.00	3.00	3.98	5.02	1.70	2.97	2.66	2.66	2.18	2.18	1.70	1.70		3	.12	
Length (mm)	-	-	-	-	201.00	201.00	20.03	10.16	20.20	10.04	20.10	10.16	4.06	6.20	7.90	20.25
Code	BD2	BD3	BD4	BD5	LWa	LWb	SWa1	SWa2	SWb1	SWb2	SWc1	SWc2	PRa	PRb	PRc	PRd

Table 2 Reference permittivity data of the food samples and dielectric rod under investigation

Material	Rice	Wheat flour	Ground soybean	Plexiglas	Water
Dafaranaa	(A. Prasad & P. N.	(Nalson 1094)	(Stuart O. Nelson &	(Hinnel 1005)	(Mason, Hasted, &
Kelelelice	Singh, 2007)	(Neison, 1984)	Tian-su You, 1989)	(Hippel, 1995)	Moore, 1974)
				2.60-j0.01	
	2.32-j0.34	3.35- <i>j</i> 0.34	4.02-j0.22	(3 GHz)	73.40 <i>-j</i> 18.16
ε _r	(2.45 GHz)	(11.67 GHz)	(11.5 GHz)	2.59-j0.02	(5 GHz)
				(10 GHz)	
Temperature (°C)	24	22	24	27	25
Moisture content (%)	11	8.5	7.5	N/A	N/A

404 Table 3 Effect of the object quantity on the resonance frequency difference between P0 and P7

	I We						
	2	3	4	5	6	Lwa	LWD
f_r at P0 (GHz)	5.32395	5.32395	5.32395	5.32390	5.32390	5.32445	5.32460
f_r at P7 (GHz)	5.32685	5.32820	5.32915	5.32995	5.33045	5.32800	5.33220
$\Delta f_r (\mathrm{MHz})$	2.90	4.25	5.20	6.05	6.55	3.55	7.60

406 Table 4 Resonance frequency shifts caused by the insertion of short copper wires in spaghetti

	SWa1	SWa2	SWb1	SWb2	SWc1	SWc2
Volume (mm ³)	111.31	56.46	75.40	37.47	45.62	23.06
f_r at P0 (GHz)	5.32645	5.32645	5.32630	5.32560	5.32560	5.32545
f_r at P7 (GHz)	5.33040	5.32810	5.32880	5.32670	5.32675	5.32620
Δf_r (MHz)	3.95	1.65	2.50	1.10	1.15	0.75

412 Table 5 Comparison between the proposed methodology and the existing detection methods

Non-invasive method	Food products	Foreign bodies	Advantages	Limitations
X-ray (Kwon, Lee, & Kim, 2008)	Instant ramen, macaroni and spaghetti	Balls made of stainless steel, Teflon, aluminium, rubber, glass and ceramic	High image resolutionGood penetration	High costHigh power usageIonising radiation
Air-coupled ultrasonics (Pallav, Hutchins, & Gan, 2009)	Chocolate	Hazelnut, mint	• Non-contact inspection	Raster scanning requiredLow signal-to-noise ratio
Terahertz (Ok, Kim, Chun, & Choi, 2014)	Milk powder	Steel nuts and washers, square and circular polymer samples, insects	 Reasonable penetration Non-contact inspection 	 Intricate experimental set Low signal-to-noise ratio Raster scanning required
Near-infrared spectroscopy (Yin, Hameed, Xie, & Ying, 2021)	Toast bread	metal, plastic and hair	 Full-field imaging Reasonable image resolution 	 Image processing require for better interpretation Poor penetration
Thermal imaging (Ginesu, Giusto, Margner, & Meinlschmidt, 2004)	Raisins, almonds and nuts	Wooden sticks, stone, metal chips and cardboard pieces	• Full-field imaging	Relatively high power usage Poor penetration
Present work	Spaghetti, noodles, rice, wheat flour and soy milk powder	Metallic balls and wires, dielectric rods	 Low power consumption Easy signal interpretation Low cost Volumetric sensing 	• Limited penetration for high-moisture materials

415 Figure captions

- 416
- Figure 1 Cross section of the microwave resonator sensor developed for food examination (not to scale)
- Figure 2 Schematic diagram of the experimental setup for the detection of metallic contamination indry foods using microwave resonance
- 421 Figure 3 Numerical simulation of the electric and magnetic fields in the microwave sensor at
- 422 resonance: (a) cross-sectional view of the empty cavity model; (b) electric fields in the transverse
- 423 plane; (c) electric fields in the *y*-*z* plane (pointing out of the paper on the left-hand side and pointing
- 424 to the paper on the right-hand side); (d) magnetic fields in the *y-z* plane
- Figure 4 Effect of a metallic sphere on the microwave resonance studied by simulation: (a) signal
- 426 responses for the cavity with and without a sphere; (b) magnetic field distribution in the presence of
- 427 the sphere; (c) close-up view of the magnetic field around the sphere; (d) variation of the resonance
- 428 frequency shift with respect to the diameter (D) of the sphere
- 429 Figure 5 Evaluation of a metallic ball in spaghetti using the microwave resonator sensor: (a)
- 430 schematic diagram of the eleven positions along the axis for the study of the position effect; (b)
- 431 resonant responses for the BD5 ball; (c) resonance frequency shift due to the movement of the ball
- 432 from the original position into the cavity
- 433 Figure 6 Resonant responses for other dry foods with and without a metallic ball placed at P7
- 434 Figure 7 Resonance frequency shifts caused by dielectric rods at varied positions in the cavity
- 435 Figure 8 Self-developed GUI-based software for easy online detection of a foreign object in dry food
- 436 (here a BD3 ball is placed in spaghetti)