### Please cite the Published Version

Oates, Rosamund and Purdy, Jessica (2022) Introduction: Communities of Print. In: Communities of Print: Books and Their Readers in Early Modern Europe. Library of the Written Word, 99. Brill, pp. 1-14. ISBN 9789004448919 (hardback); 9789004470439 (ebook);

**DOI:** https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004470439\_002

Publisher: Brill

Version: Accepted Version

Downloaded from: https://e-space.mmu.ac.uk/628574/

Usage rights: O In Copyright

Additional Information: This is an Accepted Manuscript of a chapter which appeared in Com-

munities of Print: Books and Their Readers in Early Modern Europe, published by Brill

### **Enquiries:**

If you have questions about this document, contact openresearch@mmu.ac.uk. Please include the URL of the record in e-space. If you believe that your, or a third party's rights have been compromised through this document please see our Take Down policy (available from <a href="https://www.mmu.ac.uk/library/using-the-library/policies-and-guidelines">https://www.mmu.ac.uk/library/using-the-library/policies-and-guidelines</a>)

# Communities of Print: Readers and their Books in Early Modern Europe

Communities of Print situates the experiences of individual readers within the communities of writers, readers, and publishers who shaped the consumption of print in early modern Europe. This collection of essays has come out of the Communities of Print project, which was developed in conjunction with Manchester Metropolitan University, John Rylands Library and Chetham's Library in Manchester, to explore diverse approaches to book and reader history. In a series of conferences, lectures, and blog posts from 2016 to 2019, rare book specialists, librarians, and academics from History and English literature analysed the connections fostered by the reading, writing and publishing of printed books in early modern Europe. They then asked how these developments affected the consumption of books and printed material. The materiality of texts was a constant theme throughout the project, with contributors using the physicality of printed texts as a way to connect reader history with larger economic, social, and cultural developments. The results of some of those conversations are collected here, with particular emphasis on the work being done by a younger generation of academics.

This collection of essays uses the term 'communities of print' to link reader and producer, bookseller and collector. Writing in 2003, Kevin Sharpe and Stephen N. Zwicker called for a book history that explored the 'continuous transactions between producers and consumers' as a series of negotiations between a 'myriad of authors, texts and readers'. This collection of essays embraces that challenge, analysing readers' interactions with their books in a broader cultural and economic setting. How people read shaped the production and dissemination of books, which in turn determined how readers could identify, acquire and consume books. Even if a book was consumed by a solitary reader (often not the case in early modern Europe), then the production and selection of the text, as well as the intellectual framework of the reader, were the result of multiple, connected forces rooted in a reader's social and cultural hinterland. In this volume authors have addressed that dynamic, asking how writers and readers perceived themselves as part of a larger community of producers and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Essays, blogs and details of the project may be found here <a href="https://communitiesofprint.wordpress.com">https://communitiesofprint.wordpress.com</a>. The Communities of Print project also led to an exhibition of different annotated copies of the Nuremberg Chronicle from the UK, Russia and New Zealand (2019-2020) <a href="https://nurembergchronicle.co.uk">https://nurembergchronicle.co.uk</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Kevin Sharpe and Stephen N. Zwicker, *Reading, Society and Politics in Early Modern England* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2003), p.3. A series of essays looking at the social contexts of reading and writing is Jennifer Andersen and Elizabeth Sauer (eds), *Books and Readers in Early Modern England: Material Studies*, (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania, 2001).

consumers of books – however dispersed – and analysing some of the changes that occurred over the period from 1500 to 1800.

This collection has three main strands, teasing out those connections through a series of case studies exploring the production and consumption of printed texts over the period from 1500 to 1800. The first strand explores networks of production, analysing the publication and dissemination of printed material in this period. The second strand looks at how print created communities of readers, brought together by common reading material and shared reading practices. The third strand explores different readings of the same texts through annotations and publication strategies, highlighting changes and continuities in reading practices over the period.

Using the idea of 'communities' to analyse print culture allows us to shift our gaze from the individual reader to focus instead on the complex network of relationships and influences surrounding book consumption and production in this period. However, both the word and the concept of 'community' raises interpretive challenges. As Peter Burke has noted, although the term 'community' is 'indispensable' when writing about early modern cultures, it is also 'dangerous' in its ambiguity.<sup>3</sup> In their introduction to Communities in Early Modern England, Alexandra Shepherd and Phil Withington demonstrate that the 'conceptual vagueness' and the 'rhetorical warmth' of the term 'community' has seen it co-opted by diverse political groups, historians, and social commentators from the seventeenth century onwards. The concept of 'community' has been used variously to describe highly-politicised plebian cultures in sixteenth and seventeenth-century Europe; as a way of critiquing the emergence of a stratified society in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries; and to explain complex social processes of conflict and resolution in early modern Europe. When the term is used in these different settings, it can accrue layers of implied meanings that can be hard for historians to ignore.<sup>4</sup> However, despite these drawbacks, 'community' is still a useful term of analysis, capturing some of the myriad ways in which early modern people saw themselves interacting with each other. In fact, Shepherd and Withington argue that it is the malleability of the term that makes it a powerful tool of analysis, claiming that the 'polyvalence, appropriability, and capacity for synonymy' of 'community' reflects the complexity of early modern society. 5 Certainly, its use throughout this collection reflects the multiplicity of ways in which communities could be constructed and constituted, as well as the diverse experiences of belonging (and exclusion) that communities entailed.

One of the dangers of using the term 'community' is that it is has often been used to imply some degree of unity or homogeneity, particularly in those communities that are imagined rather than real. However, the authors in this collection have followed the example of those historical works that stress that in early modern Europe, communities could be porous, multifaceted, and were often overlapping. Recent urban histories, for example, have drawn on the 'spatial turn' to show that early modern people conceived of themselves as being part of multiple communities, even when those communities might appear incompatible. Early modern actors simultaneously belonged to religious, linguistic,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Peter Burke, *Languages and Communities in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), p. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Alexandra Shepherd and Phil Withington (eds), *Communities in Early Modern England: Networks, Place and Rhetoric* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2000), pp. 2-5; Beat Kümin, *The Communal Age in Western Europe c. 1100-1800* (Palgrave MacMillan, 2013); Alan Everitt, 'The Local Community and the Great Rebellion' in R. C. Richardson (ed.), *The English Civil Wars: Local Aspects* (Stroud: Sutton Publishing, 1998), pp. 15-36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Shepherd and Withington, Communities in Early Modern England, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> For example, see the discussions in Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and the Spread of Nationalism* (London, Verso, revised edn. 2006); Michael J. Halverson and Karen E Spierling (eds), *Defining Community in Early Modern Europe* (Aldershot, Ashgate, 2008), pp. 22-24.

occupational, and neighbourhood communities, perhaps foregrounding one identity or community in different settings.<sup>7</sup> Print played an important role in both constructing these communities and providing pathways between them. Rosa Salzberg's work on renaissance Venice, for example, demonstrated how the production and consumption of print connected divergent groups in the city, crossing social, political, and religious structures to create unexpected and fluid connections and groupings.<sup>8</sup> In this volume, communities of print have been conceived as sometimes intersecting, sometimes close-knit, and almost always permeable.

Communities could take many different forms, and the authors in this volume have addressed some of these different manifestations in their work. Some explore an 'imagined community' of readers, as in the work of Kathryn Hurlock and Nina Adamova on early modern annotations, or in Catherine Evans' discussion of George Herbert's poetry and proverbs. Others address the constantly changing communities of readers brought together by shared access to books, for example Jessica Purdy and Michael Smith's discussions of reading practices in Manchester and beyond from 1600 to 1800. Still others explore communities of commerce and the complex network of trade that facilitated and ultimately shaped publication practices, as in Julianne Simpson's discussion of Christopher Plantin. Throughout the volume, micro-histories shed new light on how print facilitated the emergence of communities, and the ways in which interactions between communities of consumers and producers shaped the consumption of print.

Histories of production link consumer, printer and writer, and analyses of the dissemination of printed material in this period have highlighted the dominance of certain towns and cities in the intellectual life of Europe. By looking at networks of print distribution through the lens of a relationship between the centre and periphery, Andrew Pettegree foregrounded an important dynamic in the early modern book trade. Trade routes established to facilitate manuscript production were developed by printers, cementing networks of dissemination that crossed Europe, while printing itself was often centred in a few major towns. Those towns or cities were also central to the intellectual life of early modern Europe, with close connections between the writers and the presses that published their works. Contemporaries recognised this, and some used it to their advantage: as Drew Thomas demonstrates in this volume, printers in sixteenth-century Augsburg used false imprints when they printed Lutheran material, claiming they were printed in Wittenberg.

Bookselling also tended to be concentrated in a few major towns and cities. London dominated the Tudor and Stuart print trade, for example, as both the source of printed material and as a conduit for imported books. Recent work on early modern Spain, France, and England, however, has shown the importance of small towns in the dissemination of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Burke, *Language and Communities*, p. 6. Chris Kyle and Jason Peacey, *Connecting Centre and Locality: Political Communication in Early Modern England* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2020), pp. 2-3; Robin Briggs, *Communities of Beliefs: Cultural and Social Tensions in Early Modern France* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1995), pp. 3-4;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Rosa Salzburg, *Ephemeral City: Cheap Print and Urban Culture in Renaissance Venice* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2015); Roger J Crum and John T Paoletti, *Renaissance Florence: A Social History* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2006).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Andrew Pettegree, 'Centre and Periphery in the European Book World', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 18 (2008), pp. 101-128.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Pettegree, 'Centre and Periphery', p. 109; Joad Raymond, 'The Development of the Book Trade in Britain' in Joad Raymond (ed.), *The Oxford History of Popular Print Culture: Volume One: Cheap Print in Britain and Ireland to 1660* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), p. 67; Jennifer Andersen and Elizabeth Sauer, 'Current Trends in the History of Reading', in *Books and Readers* p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Alan B. Farmer, 'Cosmopolitanism and Foreign Books in Early Modern England', *Shakespeare Studies*, 35 (2007), pp. 58-59; James Raven, *The Business of Books: Booksellers and the English Book Trade*, 1450-1850, (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2007), p. 7.

printed material, adding nuances to our perception of the print trade as largely a process of distribution from the centre to the peripheries. Historians have shown that the book trade provided a network of distribution that might connect consumers and producers horizontally as well as vertically. 12 Sixteenth-century readers in provincial France sometimes by-passed the local bookseller and his distribution network, and bought directly from Paris, while local presses emerged to print ephemeral texts for a local audience. <sup>13</sup> By contrast, in early modern England, the second-hand book trade allowed buyers and sellers to circumvent the London market, dealing directly through local bookshops. Furthermore, as Rosamund Oates shows in this volume, the catalogues produced by big European book producers (most notably the Frankfurt Book Fair) encouraged readers in Europe's provinces to interact directly with each other. Jane Stevenson has recently highlighted those interactions, showing how some English and Scottish authors dealt directly with publishers in continental Europe. Stevenson reminds us that an overreliance on the English Short Title Catalogue means that it is all too easy to focus on domestic printing of English-language authors, and points to the influence of writers like Lewis Bayly and William Perkins who were translated into several different languages and sold abroad. This work not only modifies our accounts of London as the centre of the book trade, but also – along with nearby Oxford and Cambridge – as the intellectual heart of early modern England. 14

A recurring theme throughout this volume is the extent to which communities were constituted by printed texts, whether through the production, dissemination or consumption of books (and indeed, sometimes by all three). Historians of early modern Europe have highlighted the role of printing in sustaining and creating communities, particularly marginal or oppressed groups. Books and printed pamphlets underpinned a shared discourse, whether they were produced by English Royalists in exile or by secret Catholic presses in the sixteenth century. The circulation of these texts, as much as their content, helped to keep alive 'virtual communities'. In Antwerp, the first leader of the local Reformed Conventicle, Gaspar van der Heyden ordered from Emden, distributing them clandestinely to fellow believers. The arrival of French printer, Pierre de Vingle, in the city of Neuchâtel, in XX, for example, provided French exiles influenced by the Swiss Reformation an opportunity to successfully disseminate their works in France. <sup>15</sup>Acquiring, sharing, and distributing these texts relied on networks of dissent, and work on Catholic recusants in early modern England for example, has shown the importance of print in sustaining the community when they faced the toughest persecution. In these accounts the dissemination of print, as much as the content of those books, was a significant binder of the recusant community. 16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Benito Rial Costas (ed.) *Print Culture and Peripheries in Early Modern Europe: A Contribution to the History of Printing and the Book Trade in Small European and Spanish Cities*, (Leiden: Brill, 2012). Malcolm Walsby, *Booksellers and Printers in Provincial France* (Leiden, Brill, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Malcolm Walsby, 'The Vanishing Press: printing in Provincial France in the Early Sixteenth Century', in Malcolm Walsby and Gaeme Kemp (eds.), *The Book Triumphant: print in Transition in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries* (Leiden: Brill, 2011), p. 105.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Rosamund Oates, *Moderate Radical: Tobie Matthew and the English Reformation* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), pp. 163-166; Jane Stevenson, 'Centres and Peripheries: Early-Modern British Writers in a European Context', *The Library* ser., 7, 21:2 (2020), pp. 156-191; Ian Maclean, *Learning and the Market Place: Essays in the History of the Early Modern Book* (Leiden, Brill, 2009), pp. 316-317; John Barnard and Maureen Bell, 'The English Provinces' in *The Cambridge History of the Book in Britain IV: 1557-1685*, ed. John Barnard and D. F. McKenzie (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 665-686.
 <sup>15</sup> Andrew Pettegree, *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), p. 167. Christopher Elwood, *The Body Broken: The Calvinist Doctrine of the Eucharist and the Symbolization of Power in Sixteenth-century France* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1999), pp. 31-34.
 <sup>16</sup> Alexandra Walsham, 'Preaching without Speaking: script, print and religious duties' in Alexandra Walsham and Julia C. Crick (eds), *The Uses of Script and Print, 1300-1700* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 211-34; Alexander Stoetaert, 'Catholic refuge and the printing press: Catholic exiles from England,

In the early modern period, the materiality of the text could be as significant as its content. Differing attitudes towards books could mark out different communities as surely as their response to the text itself. Protestantism in particular encouraged an intense relationship with the text that sometimes imbued the object of the book with spiritual and emotional significance. Seventeenth-century Puritans sometimes marked themselves out through their relationship with the physical object of the book: in England, for example, it was claimed Puritans could be identified by the habit of carrying a bible on their belts. <sup>17</sup> It was not only Protestants, however, who appreciated both the physical object of the book as well as the information inside it. The inscription 'et amicorum' (examined by Flavia Bruni in this volume) highlights the importance that contemporaries placed on particular copies of books that were read and shared by friends. The ownership, and often marginal notes, transformed the printed text from one of many into a unique – and especially meaningful – item. Natalie Zemon Davies has further shown the significance of the materiality of books in her account of books as gifts in sixteenth-century France. 18 Contemporaries appreciated both the object and the act of giving or acquiring that lay behind the gift. Relationships were maintained and built through the shared consumption of books, many of which bear the marks of their acquisition. Recent work on the Winthrop family, for example, has shown how collecting, sharing and reading of books sustained a network of family members and friends that crisscrossed the Atlantic, England and Ireland in this period.<sup>19</sup>

Reading was often a communal endeavour in this period, creating new relationships, re-affirming existing bonds or an opportunity to share thoughts and experiences. The inscription 'et amicorum' referred to reading, as well as the physical sharing of books, reflecting humanist ideas of friendship and intellectual exchange.<sup>20</sup> There were many different manifestations of communal reading. Anthony Grafton and Lisa Jardine showed that Gabriel Harvey read his Livy with friends including Sir Philip Sidney, arguing that marginal notes of men like Harvey often record the 'social circles they inhabited' as much as their responses to the text.<sup>21</sup> Reading could also be a way of constituting communities: Andrew Cambers, for example, has argued that the collective Bible-reading of English Puritans was a 'ritual of separation'.<sup>22</sup> Shared reading was often a feature of communal living. Heidi Brayman Hackel, for example, has demonstrated how women often read aloud to a

.

France and the Low Countries in the ecclesiastical province of Cambrai', *British Catholic History*, 34:4 (2019), pp. 532-561; Mark R. F. Williams, 'The Devotional Landscape of the Royalist Exile, 1649-1660 *Journal of British Studies* 53: 4 (2014), pp. 909-933; Margaret Sena, 'William Blundell and the networks of Catholic dissent in post-Reformation England' in Shepherd and Withington (eds) *Communities in Early Modern England*, pp.54-75.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Alec Ryrie, *Being Protestant in Reformation England* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), pp. 293-5; Andrew Cambers, 'Demonic Possession, Literacy and "Superstition" in Early Modern England', *Past and Present*, 202 (2009), pp. 3-35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> William H. Sherman, *Used Books: Marking Readers in Renaissance England* (Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), p. 18; Natalie Zemon Davies, *The Gift in Sixteenth Century France* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), pp. 76-81.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Richard Calis, Frederic Clark, Christian Flow, Anthony Grafton, Madeline McMahon, Jennifer M Rampling, 'Passing The Book: Cultures of Reading in the Winthrop Family, 1580–1730', *Past & Present*, 241 (2018) pp. 69–141.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Geoffrey D. Hobson, 'Et amicorum'. *The Library*, 5<sup>th</sup> ser., 4 (1949), pp. 87-99. For a recent attempt to capture transnational intellectual exchange in this period, see 'Mapping the Republic of Letters' <a href="http://republicofletters.stanford.edu">http://republicofletters.stanford.edu</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Lisa Jardine and Anthony Grafton, "Studied for Action": How Gabriel Harvey Read His Livy', *Past & Present*, 129 (1990), pp. 30-78; Anthony Grafton, 'John Dee reads books of Magic' in Sabrina Alcorn Baron, Elizabeth Walsh and Susan Scola (eds.), *The Reader Revealed* (Washington: University of Washington Press, 2002), p. 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Andrew Cambers, *Godly Reading: Print, Manuscript and Puritanism in England 1580-1720* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2011), p. 24.

household, while Georgianna Ziegler has shown that Lady Anne Clifford directed others to read to her.<sup>23</sup> Hearing, as well as seeing the word, was a form of reading, creating shared experiences. Jennifer Richards has recently demonstrated that oral reading was part of the training of highly literate men, who were expected to think of writing as a potential oral performance from a young age. Therefore, men as well as women engaged in vocalising and listening to texts as a form of reading that supported family, household or friendship communities. The seventeenth-century minister, John Rastrick, for example, read aloud in order to bring together his family, and 'godly servants, borders, and visitors in his household'. Eighteenth-century French priests recorded that rural households still gathered together (but only on winter evenings) to listen someone in the family reading aloud from saints' lives, the bible, or other religious boks. <sup>24</sup>

Histories of reading and work on marginalia tend to privilege the individual reader and his (or more rarely, her) engagement with the text. Sometimes these are remarkable readers, like Gabriel Harvey or John Dee; sometimes they are remarkable texts, like Philip Sidney's Arcadia. 25 Even within these single reader/annotator engagements, however, it is possible to identify a larger intellectual community that a reader speaks to when he or she makes notes in their texts. The literary critic Stanley Fish argued that it was 'interpretive communities, rather than either the text or reader that produce meanings'. And while his model of 'interpretive communities' has been refined and challenged, his work reminds us of the importance of seeing individual readers in the context of their friendships and their wider cultural and social concerns.<sup>26</sup> As Kathryn Hurlock and Jessica Purdy argue in their chapters, annotators are trying to establish dialogue with future readers, with marginal notes intended to shape later reading experiences. Sometimes the imagined reader was an older version of the annotator, returning to the text with different experiences or determined to focus on one or two passages. Sometimes, those readers were unknown abstracts, but nevertheless it was an engagement that shaped the reading and annotating of books.<sup>27</sup> Occasionally, annotators spoke directly to their imagined audience. In this volume, for example, Nina Adamova shows how in Elizabethan Lancashire, Thomas Gudlawe repeatedly addressed a 'gentle reader' as he and his secretary wrote annotations in the *Nuremberg Chronicle*.

Perhaps one of the more obvious manifestations of communities of print in this period is the library, whether the quasi-public libraries of the parish church, or the semi-private libraries of clerics, gentlemen and noble families.<sup>28</sup> Increasingly in Early Modern Europe,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Heidi Brayman Hackel, *Reading Material in Early Modern England: Print, Gender and Literacy* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2005); Georgianna Ziegler, 'Lady Anne Clifford reads John Selden' in Katherine Acheson (ed.), *Early Modern English Marginalia* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2019), pp. 134-154; Julie Crawford, 'Reconsidering Early Modern Women's Reading, or, How Margaret Hoby Read Her de Mornay', *Huntington Library Quarterly*, 73 (2010), p. 194.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Jennifer Richards, *Voices and Books in the English Renaissance: A New History of Reading* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019); Andrew Cambers and Michelle Wolfe, 'Reading, Family Religion, and Evangelical Identity in Late Stuart England', *The Historical Journal*, 47 (2004), p. 894. Roger Chartier, *The Cultural Uses of Print in Early Modern France* Trans. Lydia G. Cochrane (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987), p. 226.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> William H. Sherman, *John Dee: The Politics of Reading and Writing in the English Renaissance* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1995); Fred Schurink, "Like a Hand in the Margine of a Booke": William Blount's Marginalia and the Politics of Sidney's *Arcadia*', *Review of English Studies*, 69:238 (2009), pp. 1-24. Stanley Fish, *Is There a Text in this Class? The authority of interpretive communities* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1982), p. 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> H. J. Jackson, *Marginalia: Readers Writing in Books* (London: Yale University Press, 2000), p. 87
<sup>28</sup> Mark Towsey, 'Book use and Sociability in Lost Libraries of the Eighteenth Century: Towards a Union Catalogue' in Flavia Bruni and Andrew Pettegree (eds.), *Lost Books: Reconstructing the Print World of Pre-Industrial Europe* (Leiden: Brill, 2016), pp. 414-438; Roger Chartier, 'Libraries without Walls', *Representations*, 42 (1993), pp. 38-40.

collections of books were seen to have a coherent identity, one which rested in their dual claims to be complete repositories of knowledge and the relationship that the books were expected to have to each other. Collectors celebrated their libraries through comprehensive catalogues. Konrad Peutinger, a humanist, jurist and counsellor of Maximillian I, had around 6,000 printed items in his Augsburg library (along with many manuscripts) and prepared and wrote at least two catalogues. Increasingly, in the early moder period, private collections and libraries were used to signal the owner's breadth of knowledge and depth of perception. The Jacobean cleric, John Favour, for example, praised another Protestant cleric as being a 'library of learning' and when the dean of Canterbury Cathedral, John Boys, died in 1625, his monument portrayed him at work in his library. <sup>29</sup> And those libraries had an integral identity that resulted from the curatorial skills of its owner. Another seventeenth cleric, William Crashawe, had a book collection that he claimed was 'one of the most complete libraries in Europe'. Though valued at over £2000, he refused several offers from booksellers who intended on breaking up the collection, making plans for it to stay together after his death.<sup>30</sup> One of the most significant features of a library was that it facilitated conversations between texts. Books were not meant to be read in intellectual isolation, and readers expected to use different books to inform and shape their readings of multiple texts. The Ramellian book wheel – allowing several books to be consulted at once – has become an icon of early modern reading, and while few owned such an item, many read multiple books at the same time.<sup>31</sup> Marginal notes illustrate the results of those encounters, highlighting how even solitary reading engages in larger conversations. Anthony Grafton and William Sherman, for example, have shown how two renowned Hellenists – Thomas Smith and Isaac Casaubon – read their copies of Flavius Josephus very differently, drawing on different works to critique and interpret the text.<sup>32</sup> In early Stuart England, the Archbishop of York, Tobie Matthew, wrote notes on an Edwardian defence of clerical marriage from a seemingly unconnected series of texts, including polemical attacks on Cardinal Bellarmine. The reception and dissemination of texts was grounded in the wider social, intellectual and cultural life of the reader.33

These are just some of the different 'communities' that shaped the production and consumption of books and printed material in this period. Throughout the collection, the term 'communities of print' is deliberately open to interpretation, designed to shift the focus from the individual reader or writer to the complex networks of influence that surrounded them. The history of reading foregrounds the reader's interaction with the text, and by locating this interaction in a wider community of print, it is possible to de-centre book history, and address the many different interactions between producer and consumer, writer and reader that sustained print culture in early modern Europe.

This volume is divided into three parts to reflect its three thematic strands. In the first part, the networks of the printers, sellers and consumers who sustained the early modern book trade are explored. Drew B. Thomas examines the consequences of the desire for authenticity in Martin Luther's works by readers in early modern Augsburg. Thomas demonstrates that in order to achieve this sense of authenticity, almost a dozen of Augsburg's printers resorted to producing counterfeit texts, thus highlighting the early importance of branding in the

<sup>33</sup> Oates, *Moderate Radical*, p. 185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> John Favour, *Antiquitie triumphing over Noveltie* (London, 1619), p. 235. Hans-Jörg Künast, 'Augsburg's Role in the German Book Trade in the First Half od the Sixteenth Cnetury' in *The Book Triumphant*, p. 322. *The* tomb of Dean John Boys (1571-1625) is on the south wall of the Dean's chapel in Canterbury Cathedral.

<sup>30</sup> David Pearson, 'The English Private Library in the Seventeenth Century', *The Library*, 7<sup>th</sup> ser., 13:4 (2012) pp. 379-99

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> John Considine, 'The Ramellian Bookwheel', *Erudition and the Republic of Letters*, 1:4 (2016), pp. 381-411. <sup>32</sup> Anthony Grafton and William Sherman, 'In the Margins of Josephus: Two Ways of Reading', *International Journal of the Classical Tradition* 23: 3(2016), pp. 213-238.

publishing world. Thomas documents the processes through which many of Augsburg's printers produced these counterfeits, examining the false imprints, false colophons and numerous copied title page borders that suggest a network of counterfeit activity. Julianne Simpson makes use of Christopher Plantin's account books to illustrate the complex web of circulation, distribution and printing that covered much of Europe in the sixteenth century. In this chapter, Simpson explores the day-to-day realities and difficulties that Plantin faced in developing and sustaining his networks as he attempted to meet the demands of the market and the requirements of his sponsor. Simpson also successfully highlights Plantin's achievements in treading the fine lines between economic necessity and survival by foregrounding them against the backdrop of the religious conflicts and political upheavals that rocked France and the Netherlands in this period. Rosamund Oates examines the provincial book trade in early modern England, focussing on early modern Yorkshire to explore how readers in Yorkshire acquired their books. Oates demonstrates that readers in early modern Yorkshire purchased books locally, bought them from London, and employed agents to buy from the Frankfurt Book Fair. In doing so, Oates shows that provincial readers in Yorkshire were not passive consumers of a print culture emanating from London, but that they were fully engaged in an international community of print in which local clerics knowledgably and successfully responded to Italian and French polemicists. In the final chapter of part one, Jessica G. Purdy recovers some of the reading done by the 'middling' sorts of people in early modern England, namely people with limited means to buy books who instead relied on the parish libraries established in England throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Purdy's examination of the Gorton Chest parish library, a chained library from the 1650s that survives in its original chest, asks how readers approached the theologies, sermons and works of practical divinity that were chosen for the library. In order to answer these questions, Purdy examines the surviving marginalia and others marks of readership in numerous volumes from the collection to demonstrate readers' interest in topics such as the importance of Scripture, godly living and preparation for death and salvation.

Part Two of this volume looks at how readers came together to read their books and created these 'communities' that were formed out of common reading material and interests. Flavia Bruni demonstrates that despite an injunction against book ownership, mendicant friars in sixteenth-century Italy not only owned books, but bequeathed them to their colleagues and even, on occasion, shared books with friends outside the cloister. Bruni analyses inscriptions inside some of the mendicants' books, particularly the familiar 'et amicorum', and argues that marks of ownership could tie a book to both its present and future owners. In her examination of the books owned by these mendicant friars, Bruni demonstrates that the practices employed by the friars were not vastly dissimilar to those employed by the contemporary humanists from whom the mendicants sought to distance themselves. In his chapter, Forrest C. Strickland explores the sharing, sale and use of books in another spiritual community – that of the Dutch Reformed ministers of the seventeenth century. Using some of the surviving catalogues of ministerial libraries, Strickland shows the predominance of patristic texts in clerical libraries in this period and links this possession to the robust knowledge of the teaching of Church Fathers attained by Dutch ministers. Strickland further demonstrates how these ministers employed this knowledge in pastoral teaching and counsel, in sermons, in devotional and prayer books, and in polemics within the Dutch Church. In the third and final chapter of part two of this volume, Michael A. L. Smith combines scholarship on early modern friendship, material culture and the history of emotions to examine the impact of printed material upon the interior emotional lives of late seventeenth and early eighteenth century English Protestants. To do so, Smith compares the reading activities of two men from very different confessional backgrounds in seventeenthcentury Lancashire: one a nonconformist, the other a High Churchman. Despite their

differences, and the unease of the Anglican Church over informal reading groups, Smith demonstrates that both men's social lives revolved around reading and sharing devotional texts with like-minded friends.

The third and final section of this volume uses publication strategies, reading practices and annotations to explore how different people read the same text, prolonging the afterlives of the written word through adaptation and copying. Nina Adamova looks at the rich afterlife of a copy of the Nuremberg Chronicle, now in Chetham's Library in Manchester. Adamova examines one owner's prodigious annotations, exploring their reading practices and the ways in which their marginalia interacted with the printed text it surrounded. Adamova also demonstrates how the annotations reflect the changing religious politics of Elizabethan Lancashire to offer some insights into the fluctuations of local confessional identities. Many of these annotations were addressed to a 'gentle reader', and Adamova asks who the imagined reader may have been. Kathryn Hurlock examines the readership of another seminal work, David Powel's History of Cambria (1584), the first printed history of Wales which, significantly, was printed in English. Hurlock compares different readings of Powel's text, showing how the Welsh origins of Henry Tudor prompted an interest in Welsh genealogy among the English gentry and nobility. One famous reader of this text was Edmund Spenser, who drew on Powel's History when he was writing the Faerie Queene, mining the history for Welsh historical figures to populate his epic poem. Catherine Evans, in the penultimate chapter of this volume, seeks to restore the negative reputation of two of George Herbert's poems, Sunday and The Church Porch. In so doing, Evans explores different readings of both of these works, in addition to some of Herbert's proverbs. Evans demonstrates that by Herbert's use of common-placing techniques, he was able to provide his audience with guidance through his poetry and proverbs that readers could apply to their everyday lives. In her close examination of the afterlife of Sunday, Evans argues that later readers and editors transformed the work from a critical discussion of a fractured parish into a depiction of a pastoral idyll. In the final chapter of this volume, Tim Somers analyses early modern micrography as evidence of a different type of response to the intensification of print culture in later Stuart Britain. He shows how the trend of micrography towards the end of the seventeenth century and into the eighteenth provided a new way of reading at a glance. He also explores the relationship between image and text in popular micrographic versions of the Lord's Prayer and the Book of Common Prayer.

## Michael Powell

This book is dedicated to Michael Powell, whose death from cancer towards the end of this project was a great loss both personally and professionally. From 1984, Michael was the Librarian of Chetham's Library in Manchester, the oldest free public library in the English-speaking world. It was Michael's enthusiasm for the Chetham's copy of the *Liber Chronicarum* that led to the project on readers of the Chronicle, undertaken by Nina Adamova and Rosamund Oates and supported by the British Academy. Michael was an integral part of the *Communities of Print* network, and all our meetings and conferences have been held at Chetham's with the support of both Michael Powell and Fergus Wilde (currently acting Librarian). Michael was a friend and colleague, and he was also co-supervisor of Jessica Purdy's PhD. Before he died, we were able to tell Michael that we were planning to dedicate this volume to him, and so it is with much gratitude, affection and some sadness that we do so now.

### Acknowledgements

The editors of this volume owe a great debt of thanks to many different people who have supported this project throughout its lifetime. Firstly, thanks go to the Faculty of Arts and

Humanities at Manchester Metropolitan University, which sponsored the *Communities of Print* conferences in 2016 and 2017. The Faculty of Arts and Humanities at Manchester Metropolitan also co-sponsored a collaborative doctoral project between the History department at Manchester Metropolitan University and Chetham's Library, leading to Jessica Purdy's PhD project. Successive conferences from 2015 to 2019 were also supported by the Bibliographical Society, which allowed postgraduate students to play a significant part in the conferences and so in this volume. The Bibliographical Society also assisted with some of the research expenses of the articles in this volume.

The British Academy has assisted this project in two ways. An International Fellowship awarded to Nina Adamova in 2018 allowed her to work from Manchester Metropolitan University on annotated copies of the *Nuremberg Chronicle* in the UK. A British Academy grant in 2019 supported the dissemination of our research, including talks in Russia and the UK; a conference at Chetham's Library called 'Reading the Reformation'; and an online exhibition of different readings of the Nuremberg Chronicle from around the world, https://nurembergchronicle.co.uk. The fruits of this research may be seen in Nina Adamova's chapter, and also in the wider discussions that frame this volume about reading, sharing and consuming books.

The *Communities of Print* network was established to explore the life of books as material objects, and draws on the expertise of historians, book historians, English scholars and librarians. The network runs a blog at https://communitiesofprint.wordpress.com and particularly encourages blog posts by PhD students and Early Career Researchers. This present volume has tried to reflect our commitment to academics in the early stages of their careers, and our interest in gathering together a diverse set of perspectives on the history of print and reading.

Thanks are due to all the contributors to the volume, all of whom have provided engaging and stimulating discussions about the use and production of books in this period. Thanks go to the librarians who have been involved in this project, with particular thanks for Julianne Simpson (Rare Books and Maps Manager at John Rylands Library) and Fergus Wilde and Michael Powell of Chetham's Library. Thanks too to Andrew Pettegree, who has provided support and advice throughout the compilation of this volume.

Rosamund Oates would particularly like to thank her family (Ralf, Eloise, and Freya Boddington) for their constant love and support. And thanks too to Jessica Purdy for all her assistance and hard work on this volume, her editorial eye is unerring and always perceptive.

Jessica Purdy would like to thank her parents, Ian and Jill, and her sisters, Molly and Sophie, for their unwavering love and support throughout the editing of this volume and all of her projects. Jessica would also like to thank her co-editor, Rosamund Oates, for her invaluable expertise and unfailing encouragement.