

Please cite the Published Version

Segniagbeto, GH, Agbodji, KT, Leuteritz, TEJ, Dendi, D, Fa, JE and Luiselli, L (2022) Insights into the illegal ivory trade and status of elephants in Togo, West Africa. African Journal of Ecology, 60 (2). pp. 289-297. ISSN 0141-6707

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/aje.12748

Publisher: Wiley

Version: Accepted Version

Downloaded from: https://e-space.mmu.ac.uk/626540/

Usage rights: O In Copyright

Additional Information: This is an Author Accepted Manuscript of a paper accepted for publication in African Journal of Ecology, published by and copyright Wiley.

Enquiries:

If you have questions about this document, contact openresearch@mmu.ac.uk. Please include the URL of the record in e-space. If you believe that your, or a third party's rights have been compromised through this document please see our Take Down policy (available from https://www.mmu.ac.uk/library/using-the-library/policies-and-guidelines)

1 <u>Original art</u>	icle
-----------------------	------

Insights into the illegal ivory trade and status of elephants in Togo, West Africa

4

5 Gabriel Hoinsoudé Segniagbeto ^{1,4} Kossi Thomas Agbodji ² Thomas E.J. Leuterit	itz ³
---	------------------

6 Daniele Dendi^{1,4,5} | John E. Fa^{6,7} | Luca Luiselli^{1,4,5}

- 7
- 8 ¹Département de Zoologie et Biologie Animale, Faculté des Sciences, Université de Lomé, BP
- 9 1515, Lomé, Togo
- 10 ²Direction des Ressources Forestières, Ministère de l'Environnement et des Ressources
- 11 Forestières, Togo
- ³Embassy of the United States of America Lomé, 4332 Boulevard Eyadema, B.P. 852 Lomé,
- 13 Togo
- ⁴ Institute for Development, Ecology, Conservation and Cooperation (IDECC), via G. Tomasi di
- 15 Lampedusa 33, I-00144 Rome, Italy
- ⁵Department of Applied & Environmental Biology, Rivers State University of Science &
- 17 Technology, P.M.B 5080, Port Harcourt, Rivers State, Nigeria
- ⁶Division of Biology and Conservation Ecology, School of Science and the Environment,
- 19 Manchester Metropolitan University, Manchester M1 5GD UK
- ⁷Center for International Forestry Research (CIFOR), CIFOR Headquarters, Bogor 16115,
 Indonesia
- 22

- 24 Luca Luiselli, Institute for Development, Ecology, Conservation and Cooperation (IDECC), via G. Tomasi di
- 25 Lampedusa 33, I-00144 Rome, Italy. Emails: <u>l.luiselli@ideccngo.org</u>; <u>lucamlu@tin.it</u>
- 26

²³ Correspondence

27 Abstract

In Togo, the illegal trade of African elephant (Loxodonta africana) ivory is widespread despite efforts 28 29 made by the government to curtail these activities. By using data gathered from CITES institutions and 30 natural resource management authorities in the country we investigated the extent of ivory trafficking in 31 Togo. We also conducted surveys in villages around protected areas, which still contain elephant populations to assess the species' current status in the country. Our surveys indirectly corroborated that 32 33 there are probably no more than 150 elephants collectively within the country's protected areas, most of them in the Fazao-Malfakassa National Park. We also estimated that a minimum of 41.65 tons of ivory 34 35 (elephant tusks and carved objects) was intercepted in Togo between 2008-2018. Despite the fact that presently illegal elephant hunting is unlikely in Togo, we show that this country is the entry point for 36 37 ivory from Central Africa (Cameroon and Gabon). We maintain that Togo's position as an intermediary country in the illegal ivory trade is a tangible threat to elephants throughout their range countries, and is 38 39 also likely to affect the dwindling population of these animals in the country if adequate enforcement is not implemented. 40

41

42 **Keywords** Ivory trade; elephant population size; protected areas; Togo; West Africa

44 1 | INTRODUCTION

West African populations of elephants (*Loxodonta (africana) africana* and *Loxodonta (africana) cyclotis*) declined during the 20th century as a result of poaching. During the late 1800s and early
1900s, significant populations of elephants still remained in some West African countries (Benin,
Togo, Ghana, Nigeria, and Cameroon) (Mallon et al., 2015). Currently, wildlife populations in
the West African region are restricted to isolated pockets that face massive habitat loss as well as
illegal hunting (Henschel et al., 2014; Amori et al., 2016).

Across the region, the trade (both legal and illegal) in wild animals is noteworthy 51 (Segniagbeto, 2009; Segniagbeto et al., 2011, 2015; Aulyia et al., 2016; Luiselli et al., 2016) 52 making the region one of the most important in the world for the export of wildlife (Harwood, 53 2003; Auliya et al., 2016). Though a number of drivers are responsible for this trade, the 54 development of air and sea transport over the past three decades has facilitated the movement of 55 animals and their products out of their region of origin (Roe et al., 2002; Auliya et al., 2016). In 56 57 particular, the deep-water container port in Lomé, one of the largest in volume in West Africa (MERF 2014; RBS EMEA, 2017), makes Togo an important transit country for wildlife 58 (Eurostat, 2015; Luiselli et al., 2016; CITES, 2018). Whilst undoubtedly trade volumes are very 59 high in southern Africa because these species are more abundant and trade is both legal and 60 illegal, nonetheless, for the remaining West African (and central African) wildlife, trade routes 61 through West Africa are a major concern (Mallon et al., 2015). 62 Available information on the illegal trade of animal products in West Africa shows this 63 activity is widespread and largely uncontrolled (Merem et al. 2018). In particular, ivory 64 65 trafficking in this region (and in other elephant range states) has increased so dramatically that Africa's overall elephant population has declined severely in the past ten years, mainly due to 66

67 poaching (Thouless et al., 2016). As a result, many West African elephant populations were lost

during the 20th century (Roth and Douglas-Hamilton, 1991). Currently, elephant populations
have recently recovered in a few West African countries (for instance Burkina Faso; Hema et al.,
2010a, 2010b, 2018) while in others elephant numbers have declined sharply (Mallon et al.,
2015).. The largest West African elephant population (around 9000 individuals or about 80% of
the entire West African elephant population) is found in the "W"-Arli-Pendjari (WAP complex),
a transboundary Natural UNESCO World Heritage Site in Benin, Burkina Faso and Niger
(Thouless et al., 2016).

In Togo, elephants occur in scattered populations in which both taxa (L. (africana) 75 africana and L. (africana) cyclotis) are present (Amori et al., 2016). Since over 50 years ago, the 76 killing of elephants and trafficking of their ivory is illegal in the country under Togolese law 77 governing the conservation of biological resources and protection of threatened species 78 (Ordinance No. 4 of 16 January 1968). Under the provisions of Article 3 of this Ordinance, all 79 wildlife belongs to the State. Fully protected wild species (i.e. hunting forbidden without any 80 81 exception) are listed in Annex I Class A and partially protected species in Annex I Class B. The African elephant is included in this list as a fully protected species listed in Annex I Class A. 82 Togo has a population of about 7.6 million people and has had a long history of political 83 84 instability. In recent times, the country's economic wealth (annual GDP growth has averaged 5.5% in the last 10 years, higher than most Sub-Saharan economies) and democracy have 85 86 dramatically improved (World Bank, 2017). Despite these positive trends, the country remains a 87 hub for ivory smuggling, essentially because Lomé is the largest port in the region and because of its much-improved transportation networks. Additionally, the lack of effective policies allows 88 wildlife and wildlife products smuggling to continue unabated (MERF, 2014). 89

In this paper, we (i) quantify the volume of ivory seized in the country, (ii) review
available information on the geographic origin of the ivory traded in, and in transit through,
Togo, (iii) determine by interviews with local communities whether illegal hunting of elephants
continues, and (iv) assess the current status of the elephant population in the country by using
field surveys data and interviews with local hunters.

95

96 2 | METHODS

97 This study is based on: 1) information on ivory trafficking obtained from the main wildlife
98 management institutions in the country (2012-2016), and from within communities bordering
99 protected areas known to contain elephant populations (2017), and 2) opportunistic field surveys
100 to assess the population status of elephants in protected areas where the species is known to
101 occur (2015-2017).

102

103 Illicit ivory trafficking data

104 We obtained quantitative data on cases of illegal seizures of elephant ivory from: (i) the

105 Togolese Office Centrale de Répression du Trafic Illicite des Drogues et du Blanchissement

106 (OCRTIDB), (ii) from the Togolese police operating at the Lomé port and at the Lomé

107 international airport (data also from MERF 2013), and (iii) from civil society organizations such

as the ANCE Togo ONG and AGBO-ZEGUE ONG. All these datasets were collected by the

109 Togo police during their investigations and included the following pieces of information: 1) date

- of the operation; 2) name of the alleged trafficker/s; 3) offense details; 4) profile of alleged
- 111 trafficker/s; 5) nationality of alleged trafficker/s; 6) country of destination of confiscated
- products, and 7) weight or quantity of seized ivory. For security reasons, police authorities did

not release details of how these operations were carried out. Moreover, we could not exclude that
the illegal ivory operations reported by the police were not biased towards the more easily
detectable ones. Nonetheless, the competent authorities have not reported this information to us.
By pooling the data from the different sources, shown above, we calculated the total volume of
ivory resulting from all seizures to provide a current estimate of the minimum amounts moved
through Togo during the research period.

119

120 Surveys within communities bordering protected areas

121 We carried out a number of structured interviews with local actors involved directly or indirectly in the management or use of natural resources in the Oti-Keran and Oti-Mandouri Complex 122 (OKM), Fazao-Malfakassa National Park (FMNP), Djamdé Wildlife Reserve and Abdoulaye 123 Wildlife Reserve (Figure 1). These areas were selected because they were the only four protected 124 areas where wild elephants are presently known to occur within Togo (Amori et al., 2016). We 125 interviewed a total of 410 persons in the 20 localities bordering the four protected areas in the 126 country where elephants are known to be present (Table 1, Supplementary materials). We 127 targeted individuals within traditional chiefdoms and local communities but also forest resource 128 129 managers (checkpoint officers, prefectural and regional natural resources directors, national parks managers, ecoguards and trackers). In selected villages, we organised public consultation 130 131 forums after receiving permission from the chief of each locality. These forums included hunters, 132 farmers and other village members; no minors, younger than 21 years were involved. Prior to the start of each meeting, participants were informed of the aims of our discussions. Although 133 names, age and occupation of all participants were recorded, we reassured them that their 134 135 identities would not be revealed. We followed the ethical guidelines developed by the British

Sociological Association (British Sociological Association 2017). Acknowledging that 136 information on illegal elephant killing obtained from the villagers can be biased because of fear 137 of prosecution, we were careful how we introduced the topic. In any case, because the main aim 138 of this study was broad, we did not concentrate on determining levels of poaching. In our study 139 we did not attempt to establish the veracity of the answers given by interviewees. To uncover 140 141 false information coming from some interviewees, we would have had to use a method such as unmatched count, or item count (Hinsley et al., 2019). This is a technique to improve, through 142 anonymity, the number of true answers to possibly embarrassing or self-incriminating questions. 143 Our research was undertaken on behalf of, and approved by, the Government of Togo 144 through its Direction des Ressources Forestières, Ministère de l'Environnement et des 145 Ressources Forestières in Lomé. We also had the full cooperation of the Togo Police. During 146 our forums we asked subjects about: 1) presence of elephants in the protected areas; 2) seasonal 147 movements; 3) periodicity of observations; 4) number of individual elephants regularly observed, 148 as well as 5) information on known illegal hunting events, if any. GPS coordinates were taken 149 for each locality (Appendix 1). 150

151

152 Field surveys

153 During both the dry season (Nov. – Mar.) and the wet season (Apr. – Sep.) in 2015-2017, we

154 made opportunistic observations of elephants during the course of our research on other

vertebrates within Togolese protected areas (see Segniagbeto et al., 2015, 2017, 2018). These

- surveys included transects walked in forest and savannah habitats e.g. a total of 255.1 km in
- 157 Togodo National Park (for details of these transects, see Segniagbeto et al., 2018). Specifically,
- the field team was composed of three people (G. H. Segniagbeto and two students), supported by

two trackers (local hunters, usually two hunters for each exit). The survey consisted of a vehicle 159 moving at a speed of 1 or 2 km/h to reduce the potential noise disturbances to the animals. This 160 traveling speed also made it possible to search for elephant dung. Field surveys started very early 161 in the morning (04–11 h) and/or in the late afternoon (15–19 h. We decided upon morning and 162 afternoon surveys to increase the probability of encountering elephants. Survey start and end 163 164 times were recorded to calculate observation effort. When an elephant was encountered, the following information was noted: time, GPS location, group size (i.e. number of individuals) and 165 structure (males, females, subadults), behaviour (feeding, moving, eating, etc.), and the type of 166 167 habitat. Since surveys were repeated multiple times in the same protected area, with the potential of pseudoreplication of individual elephant observations, in this paper we only refer to group 168 sizes (and not the total number of observed individuals) of elephants. 169

170

171 3 | RESULTS

172 Evidence of poaching of elephants in Togo

Data from OCRTIDB and other institutions involved in the fight against the illegal ivory trade (Appendix 2) in Togo were classified as large (>100kg), medium (10-100kg) or small (\leq 10 kg) seizures. Overall, ivory seizures were small (57.1%) 10.8% were medium, and 32.1% were large seizures (see Appendix 2). We estimated that around 15.4 tons of ivory were seized between January 2013 and August 2016 (Appendix 2). China was clearly the main destination country for the illegal ivory (Figure 2).

Medium-sized seizures were reported in only a few cases, with ivory destined for Ghanabased on the shipping label. Given the often multi-country and complex routes involved in the

ivory trade, it is possible that Togo was only the intermediary destination. Perpertrators were
Togolese, Burkinabè, Ivorian and Guinean nationals (Figure 3).

183 Small ivory seizures involved small traders who kept the product in their shops either in 184 the raw form, but mostly as carved items (source: Togo police). Most traders claimed to be 185 unaware of the illegal status of ivory items. In most cases, the police would release them after 186 investigations were carried out to determine the severity of the crime (volume of ivory held) and 187 their complicity in trafficking operations. We were not able to obtain any information on the 188 destination of these products.

In addition, we obtained data on ivory objects originating from both Lomé port or airport (data from MERF 2013 and from Togolese police) amounting to: 1) 24 tonnes of ivory from 1,500 objects seized by the CITES management authorities on 11 December 2012 in Malaysia on a ship from Togo; 2) 70.5 kg of raw ivory, coming from Lomé and found on 12 September 2014 on board flight ET 608 at Hong Kong International Airport to Vietnam; and 3) 2,183.2 kg of ivory pieces confiscated at the same airport on 22 July 2013. The total of ivory resulting from all seizures was estimated at 41,651.5 kg of ivory during 2012-2016.

Although it is impossible to exclude the occurrence of other incidents, for all surveyed protected areas in this study we only found evidence of one recent elephant poaching event (Table 1). This was a solitary elephant that was illegally killed in 2014 in the Oti-Keran Park, (Figure 4(B)). There was only one other known case of elephant killing in which a "problem" animal (a very old individual no longer possessing tusks) was culled by the authorities, on 08 February 2017, in the village of Nangbani near Bassar (FMNP).

202

203 Presence and phenology of elephants in Togo

The presence of elephants was confirmed in the four protected areas by interviews and in 204 three by field surveys. Group sizes of elephants directly observed in surveys were similar to that 205 reported by interviewees within the same study areas (Table 1). However, in three parks (FMNP, 206 Djamdé and Abdoulaye), interviewees reported group sizes of between 2 and 17 individuals. 207 These numbers refer to individuals seen simultaneously by interviewees. Given that, in at least 208 209 some protected areas, the number of elephants is much higher than 17. For instance, in Fazao Malfakassa National park, where during our surveys we encountered two individual elephants at 210 the Bounako checkpoint (00 ° 53'37.7"E, 09 ° 09'49.8"N; Figure 4 (A)), up to at least 50 211 212 individuals are consistently reported by interviewees. Elephant observations in most surveyed localities were regular, occurring at least on a monthly basis, and, in some cases even on a daily 213 basis (Table 1). During fieldwork, we were informed that the most recent elephant sightings (2-3) 214 215 individuals, including an adult female, an adult male and a young adult or a female with her calf) at Osacré in the Oti-Keran National Park occurred in October and December 2016. Every year, at 216 least a group of two or three individuals can be found for some weeks around the Naboulgou 217 Barracks checkpoint in the Oti-Kéran National Park. 218

219

220 Interviews on poaching of elephants in Togo

All our interviewees (n = 410) in the twenty surveyed localities (Appendix 1) reported that poaching did not occur anymore in the surroundings of their villages, although often referring about recurrent cases of human-elephant conflict, especially in the buffer zones of FMNP (see details in Atsri et al., 2019). 322 interviewees reported that elephant poaching is not ongoing anymore because the tradition of using elephant parts has been totally lost in local medicine.

227

228

4 | DISCUSSION

230 Presence and recent history of elephants in Togo

Overall, about 9000 elephants are present in West Africa (Chase et al., 2016). According to the
last census (1991), a total of 200 savanna elephants were estimated in Togo, remaining in the
Fosse aux Lions, Oti-Keran and FMNP (MERF, 1996).

Based on interviewees from different villages, elephant poaching was currently perceived 234 as a rare event in Togo, independently of the surveyed region or protected area. Indeed, because 235 236 elephant population numbers are very low, poaching from outside the country is currently not viable (too difficult to find animals for an adequate economic return). Confirmed information on 237 elephant illegal hunting dates back to the 1990s during the socio-political turmoil in Togo, 238 239 particularly in Oti-Kéran, Oti-Mandouri, Fosse aux Lions, and the Doungh Reserve. After this period, there has been no confirmed elephant illegal hunting. In addition, despite the tradition of 240 using elephant parts in medicine, there is consensus that these practices are not used anymore. 241 None of the 410 people interviewed in the targeted villages had any knowledge of the 242 poaching of elephants. Nonetheless, in some local villages such as Takpapieni (Oti-Keran) and 243 Mandouri (Oti-Mandouri), villagers acknowledged that in the past other elephant parts, such as 244 245 bones and droppings, were used for traditional pharmacopoeia. These parts were used to treat

246 diseases such as measles, serious wounds, etc.

Habitats in the Fosse aux Lions, Oti-Keran and FMNP, have been affected by excessive grazing, accentuated by the phenomenon of transhumance. This practice has accelerated the degradation of these ecosystems and of their wildlife potential (Okoumassou et al. 2004, Bouché et al. 2004; PNUD, 2012; Atsri et al., 2019). Also, some migratory corridors have now
disappeared (Fosse aux Lions and Doungh) due to human settlements and heavy deforestation,
with the consequent reduction of elephant habitat.

The Fosse aux Lions, a park located at the entrance to the town of Dapaong, had the highest concentration of elephant despite its relative small size (1,650 hectares) in 1991 (MERF, 1996). However, elephants were systematically killed during the 1970s and 1980s, with a peak of at least 14 illegally killed elephants in the 1990s (data from the former Regional Director for the Environment and Forest Resources of the then Savannahs, the late Azote Hodabalo) and the near total dispersal of the remainder to Ghana and Burkina Faso, including migration of those of the Oti-Keran area to Burkina Faso (Hema et al., 2018).

The OKM, due to its strategic position, serves as a migration corridor for large mammals traveling annually between the national parks "W" (Niger), Arly (Burkina Faso) and Pendjari (Benin), and Ghana through the Fosse aux Lions and the Galangashie Reserve (Okoumassou et al., 1998, 2004; Segniagbeto et al., 2014; Amori et al., 2016), as is typical for elephants elsewhere (Douglas-Hamilton et al., 2005).. This complex of Togolese protected areas no longer contains resident elephant populations, since these were extirpated due to intense illegal hunting in the 1990s.

Although the International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN) actually only recognises one species (*Loxodonta africana*), on the ground two species or subspecies are widely recognized, thus we present data on the two taxa here. In the FMNP, there are still populations of the two recognized subspecies of African elephants: *L. a. africana* and *L. a. cyclotis* (Atsri et al., 2013; Amori et al., 2016). The coexistence of these taxa can be explained by the proximity of this park to Kyabobo in Ghana, with the Koué River serving as a migration corridor for most

large mammals, including forest elephant. According to local residents, elephant herds 273 (comprised of 2-50 individuals) can be found along the buffer zone and even within the protected 274 area. However, there is no history of seasonal movements in this park with only very limited 275 local movements just to the outskirts of the park often in search of mangoes in the rainy season. 276 According to Thouless et al. (2016), there were about 600 elephants in FMNP in 2002, so the 277 278 population has dramatically declined in the last 15 years. However, the elephant-human conflicts increased remarkably within the FMNP buffer zones during the last ten years (Atsri et al., 2019). 279 In the Abdoulaye Wildlife Reserve, a protected area of about 30,000 ha, there is a small 280 population of savannah elephants (4 individuals according to Thouless et al., 2016). During 281 fieldwork, the local people reported the presence of 3-5 individuals in the protected area that 282 mirrors Thouless et al.'s (2016) estimate. These animals were frequently seen by locals, even on 283 a monthly basis (Table 1). 284

Djamdè Wildlife Reserve is the smallest among the four surveyed protected areas (8 000 ha), situated close to FMNP in its northern part. Populations of savanna elephants move seasonally in and outside the protected area. However, there is a group of three individuals who are permanent in the reserve. Local communities observed these three individuals daily.

289

290 Importance of Togo in the illicit ivory trafficking

Our results concur with Milliken's et al. (2016) findings that Togo, alongside Malawi, Malaysia and Singapore, are among the foremost countries involved in ivory trafficking i.e. where seized quantities of ivory were in excess of 1000 kg between 2012 and 2016. These amounts are likely to be underestimates. Nonetheless, our study confirms that Togo (and more specifically, the international port of Lomé) is a clear exit point for ivory in West Africa, perhaps due to weaklaw enforcement.

297

298 Origin of ivory traded in Togo

The relatively small population of elephants remaining in Togo, coupled with the evidence that 299 300 these animals are not, at least according to our surveys, subjected to intensive illegal hunting in the country, lead us to believe that most of the seized ivory is not derived from Togolese 301 elephants. Under the authorization of the Togolese Government, a sample of 700.4 kg of tusk 302 303 ivory (seized from 06 August 2013) was genetically analysed and the results indicated that it orginated from several Central African countries, especially Cameroon and Gabon, that are two 304 of the countries hardest hit by the elephant poaching (Roca et al., 2015; Wasser et al., 2015). 305 However, radioisotope method analyses performed by Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory 306 in California (USA) on ivory from additional stocks showed that these included samples from a 307 few elephants killed in Togo. These elephants were certainly taken after 1990, and possibly as 308 recently as 2010. Thus, despite our field evidence, some illegal hunting may have been ongoing 309 up until recently in the country. 310

The apparent low intensity of illegal hunting of elephants in Togo is likely to have resulted from the governmental political tools used to fight poaching, as well as the fact that elephant numbers are so low that poaching from outside the country is currently not viable. One of these tools is the control organized by the forestry services in collaboration with the security services and which made it possible to seize several ivory objects from the company "Rose ivoire" which specialized in the manufacture and sale of ivory art.

318 Conclusions

Our results suggest that the total population of elephants in Togo remains about 150 individuals.
Thouless et al. (2016) estimated that in 2006 there were 61 animals in Togo, and in 2015 between
74-114.

Our data has highlighted that currently Togo is a conduit for illegal ivory from West and Central Africa to China as the main destination. The impact of the trade upon the Togo elephant population appears to be limited at present. Nonetheless, we highlight the fact that even a very limited offtake from the currently small population (especially if adults are targeted) can lead to the extinction of the species in the country (Woodroffe & Ginsberg, 1998). This will have considerable consequences on the functioning of the savannah habitats (Hema et al., 2017c) and

in turn affect the human communities (Gandwa et al., 2013; Challander & MacMillan, 2014).

329

330 **Acknowledgements.** This study was carried out in the framework of the master's studies of an author (K.A.) at the University of Andalusia (Spain) on the management and conservation of 331 species subject to international trade (CITES). GHS was supported by funds from AGBO 332 ZEGUE ONG, and DD and LL by funds from IDECC (project 02/2016: 'dynamics of savannah 333 334 large mammals in West Africa'). This research project complied with the ethical guidelines developed by the British Sociological Association, and was carried out under the support of the 335 Government of Togo through the 'Direction des Ressources Forestières, Ministère de 336 l'Environnement et des Ressources Forestières, Lomé', and with the cooperation of the Togo 337 338 Police. Five anonymous referees substantially improved the submitted draft. 339

340 CONFLICT OF INTEREST

341 The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

342

343 DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The data that supports the findings of this study are available on request from the correspondingauthor. The data are not publicly available due to privacy or ethical restrictions.

347	References
348	AMORI, G., SEGNIAGBETO, G. H., ASSOU, D., DECHER, J., GIPPOLITI, S. & LUISELLI, L. (2016) Non-
349	marine mammals of Togo (West Africa): an annotated checklist. Zoosystema, 38, 201 – 244.
350	ATSRI, K.H., ABOTSI, K.E., KOKOU, K., DENDI, D., SEGNIAGBETO, G.H., FA, J.E. & LUISELLI, L.
351	(2019) Ecological challenges for the buffer zone management of a West African National
352	Park, Journal of Environmental Planning and Management, DOI:
353	10.1080/09640568.2019.1603844.
354	ATSRI, H., ADJOSSOU, K., TAGBI, K., TCHANI, W., SEGLA, K., TEBONOU, G., ADJ ONOU, K., ABOUDOU,
355	M., KOUDANOU, M., AGBETI, M., BANLA, T. & KOMBATE, Y. (2013) Inventaire faunique et
356	forestier, étude écologique et caractéristique du parc national de Fazao Malfakassa.
357	Rapport FFW/MERF Togo, 96 p.
358	AULIYA, M., ALTHERR, S., ARIANO-SANCHEZ, D., BAARD, E.H., BROWN, C., BROWN, R.M.,
359	CANTU, J.C., GENTILE, G., GILDENHUYS, P., HENNINGHEIM, E., et al. (2016) Trade in live
360	reptiles, its impact on wild populations, and the role of the European market. Biological
361	Conservation. Doi http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.
362	BARNES, R.F.W. (1993) Indirect methods for counting elephants in forest. <i>Pachyderm</i> 16, 24–30.
363	BARNES, R.F.W. (1996) Estimating forest elephant abundance by dung counts. In: Studying
364	Elephants (Ed. K. Kangwana). African Wildlife Foundation, Nairobi, Kenya.
365	BARNES, R.F.W. (2002) The problem of precision and trend detection posed by small elephant
366	populations in West Africa. Afr. J. Ecol. 40, 179–185.

367	BOUCHÉ, P., LUNGREN, C. G., HIEN, B. & OMONDI, P. (2004) Recensement aérien total de
368	l'Ecosystème "W"-Arli-Pendjari-Oti-Mandouri-Kéran (WAPOK), rapport définitif.
369	MIKE, Paris, 115 p.
370	BOUCHÉ, P., DOUGLAS-HAMILTON, I., WITTEMYER, G., NIANOGO, A.J., DOUCET, J.L. & LEJEUNE,
371	P. (2011) Will elephants soon disappear from West African savannahs? PLoS One 36,6,
372	e20619.
373	BRITISH SOCIOLOGICAL ASSOCIATION (2017). BSA Statement of Ethical Practice. Available at
374	https://www.britsoc.co.uk/media/24310/bsa_statement_of_ethical_practice.pdf.
375	Challander, W. S. & MacMillan, D.C. (2014) Poaching is more than an enforcement problem.
376	Conservation Letters, 7, 484–494.
377	CHASE, M.J., SCHLOSSBERG, S., GRIFFIN, C.R., BOUCHÉ, P.J.C., DJENE, S.W., ELKAN, P.W.,
378	Ferreira, S., Grossman, F., Kohi, E.M., Landen, K., Omondi, P., Peltier, A., Selier,
379	S.A.J., SUTCLIFFE, R. (2016) Continent-wide survey reveals massive decline in African
380	savannah elephants. PeerJ. 4, e2354 https://doi.org/10.7717/peerj.2354.
381	CITES (2018) < https://www.cites.org/eng/prog/mike_etis.php>, last accessed 07 March 2018).
382	DOUGLAS-HAMILTON, I., KRINK, T. & VOLLRATH, F. (2005) Movements and corridors of African
383	elephants in relation to protected areas. Naturwissenschaften, 92, 158-163.
384	EUROSTAT (2015) Import data for live reptiles (commodity group number 0106 20 00) to EU
385	member states, period 2004–2014.
386	http://epp.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/portal/page/portal/statistics/search_database.

- 387 GANDIWA, E., HEITKÖNIG, I. M. A., LOKHORST, A. M., PRINS, H. H. T. & LEEUWIS, C. (2013)
- 388 Illegal hunting and law enforcement during a period of economic decline in Zimbabwe: A

- case study of northern Gonarezhou National Park and adjacent areas. *Journal for Nature Conservation* 21, 133-142.
- 391 HARWOOD, J. (2003) West African Reptiles : species status and management guidelines for
- 392 *Reptiles in international trade from Benin and Togo.* Report to the European Commission
- 393 prepared for the European Commission, Directorate General E Environment, ENV E.3 -
- 394 Development and Environment, January 2003, UNEP-WCMC: i-v + 1-51.
- HEMA, M.E., BARNES, R.F.W., DI VITTORIO, M., LUISELLI, L. & GUENDA, W. (2017c) Selective
- disturbance by elephants (*Loxodonta africana*) on eight tree species in a West African
 savannah. *Ecological Research*, 32, 205-214..
- 398 HEMA, M.E., BARNES, R.F.W. & GUENDA, W. (2010a) Distribution of savannah elephants
- 399 (*Loxodonta africana africana* Blumenbach 1797) within Nazinga game ranch, southern
 400 Burkina Faso. *African Journal of Ecology*, 49, 141–149.
- 401 HEMA, M.E., BARNES, R.F.W. & GUENDA, W. (2010b) The seasonal distribution of savana
- 402 elephants (*Loxodonta africana africana* Blumenbach 1797) in Nazinga Game Ranch,
 403 southern Burkina Faso. *Pachyderm*, 48, 33–40.
- 404 HEMA, E.M., DI VITTORIO, M., BARNES, R.F.W., GUENDA, W. & LUISELLI, L. (2017a) Detection
- 405 of interannual population trends in seven herbivores from a West African savannah: a
 406 comparison between dung counts and direct counts of individuals. *African Journal of*407 *Ecology*, 55, 609-617..
- 408 HEMA, E.M., DI VITTORIO, M., PETROZZI, F., LUISELLI, L. & GUENDA, W. (2017b) First
- 409 assessment of age and sex structures of elephants by using dung size analysis in a West
- 410 African savannah. *European Journal of Ecology*, 3, 1-8.

411	HEMA, E.M., SIRIMA, D., NIAGABARÉ, B., NAMA, N., PETROZZI, F., DI VITTORIO, M., GUENDA, W.
412	& LUISELLI, L. (2018) Raiding or not raiding: a study of the ecological correlates of
413	human-elephant conflict at Nazinga Game Ranch (Burkina Faso). Revue d'Ecologie
414	(<i>Terre et Vie</i>), 73, 3-11.
415	HENSCHEL, P., COAD, L., BURTON, C., CHATAIGNER, B., DUNN, A., MACDONALD, D., SAIDU, Y.
416	& HUNTER, L.T.B. (2014) The Lion in West Africa Is Critically Endangered. PLoS One
417	9:e83500. 10.1371/journal.pone.0083500.
418	HINSLEY, A., KEANE, A., ST. JOHN, F.A.V., IBBETT, H. & NUNO A. (2019) Asking sensitive
419	questions using the unmatched count technique: Applications and guidelines for
420	conservation. Methods in Ecology and Evolution, 10, 308-319.
421	HUNTER, N., MARTIN, E. & MILLIKEN, T. (2004) Determining the number of elephants required
422	to supply current unregulated ivory markets in Africa and Asia. Pachyderm 36, 116-128.
423	JACHMANN, H. & BELL, R.H.V. (1984) The use of éléphant droppings in assessing numbers,
424	occupance and âge structure: a refinement of the method. African Journal of Ecology 22,
425	127–141.
426	LUISELLI, L., STARITA, A., CARPANETO, G.M., SEGNIAGBETO, G.H. & AMORI, G. (2016) A short
427	review of the international trade of wild tortoises and freshwater turtles across the world
428	and throughout two decades, Chelonian Conservation and Biology 15, 167-172.
429	Mallon, D.P., Hoffmann, M., Grainger, M.J., Hibert, F., van Vliet, N. & McGowan, P.J.K.
430	(2015) Analyse de situation de l'UICN concernant la faune terrestre et d'eau douce en
431	Afrique centrale et de l'Ouest. Document occasionnel de la Commission de la sauvegarde

432	des espèces de l'UICN nº 54. Gland, Suisse et Cambridge, Royaume-Uni : UICN. x +
433	162 pp.

434 MEREM, E. C., TWUMASI, Y., WESLEY, J., ISOKPEHI, P., FAGEIR, S., CRISLER, M., ROMORNO, C.,

- HINES, A. OCHAI, G. S., LEGGETT, S., NWAGBOSO, E. (2018). Assessing the menace of
 illegal wildlife trade in the Sub Saharan African Region. Advances in Life Sciences 8: 125.
- MERF (Ministère de l'Environnement et des Ressources Forestières) (1996) Premier rapport
 national de la Convention des Nations unies sur la Diversité Biologique. Government
 Press, Lomé, Togo.
- MERF (Ministère de l'Environnement et des Ressources Forestières) (2014) *Cinquième rapport national de la Convention des Nations unies sur la Diversité Biologique*. Government
 Press, Lomé, Togo.

444 MILLIKEN, T. BURN, R.W., UNDERWOOD F.M. & SANGALAKULA, L. (2013) ETIS Report of

- 445 *TRAFFIC (CITES Document No. COP16 Doc. 53.2.2 (Rev))*. Geneva. CoP16 Doc. 53.2.2
 446 (Rev. 1). 30p.
- MILLIKEN, T., UNDERWOOD, F.M., BURN, R.W. & SANGALAKULA, L. (2016) *The Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS) and the Illicit Trade in Ivory: A report to the 17th meeting of*
- the Conference of the Parties to CITES. CoP17 Doc. 57.6 (Rev. 1) Annex. 29 p.
- 450 OKOUMASSOU, K., BARNES, R.F.W & SAM, M. (1998) The distribution of elephants in north-estern of
- 451 Ghana and north of Togo. *Pachyderm*, 26, 52-60.

452	OKOUMASSOU, K., DURLOT, S., AKPAMOU, K. & SEGNIAGBETO, H. (2004) Impacts humains sur
453	les aires de distributions et couloirs de migration des éléphants au Togo. Pachyderm 36,
454	69-79.

- 455 PNUD (2012) Renforcement du rôle de conservation du système national d'aires protégées (AP)
 456 du Togo. PIMS PNUD FEM n° 4220, 62 p.
- 457 PFEFFER, P. (1996) *Pourquoi toutes les populations d'éléphants d'Afrique doivent rester en*458 *annexe 1 de la CITES ?*. Ministère Français de l'Environnement, Paris-France.
- 459 RBS EMEA (2017) Lomé Container Terminal in Togo. <u>Http://www.rbs-emea.com/success-</u>
- 460 <u>stories/lome-container-terminal-in-togo/</u> [accessed 16 August 2017]
- 461 ROCA, A.L., ISHIDA, Y., BRANDT, A.L., BENJAMIN, N.R., ZHAO, K. & GEORGIADIS, N.J. (2015)
- 462 Elephant natural history: a genomic perspective. *Annual Review of Animal Biosciences* 3,
 463 139-167.
- ROTH, H.H. & DOUGLAS-HAMILTON, I. (1991) Distribution and status of elephants in West
 Africa. *Mammalia* 55, 489-527.
- 466 SEGNIAGBETO, G. H. (2009) Herpétofaune du Togo: Taxinomie, Biogéographie. Thèse de
- 467 doctorat. Univ. Lomé (Togo) & MNHN Paris (France). Tome I : 1-172 & Tome II : 1 468 192.
- 469 SEGNIAGBETO, G. H. (2014) *Diagnostic sur la chasse et le prélèvement des gibiers dans les*
- 470 zones périphériques rétrocédées du parc national Oti-Kéran. Projet TC / IUCN-PACO,
- 471 Lomé, Togo.

472	SEGNIAGBETO, G. H., TRAPE, J-F., DAVID, P., OHLER, A-M, DUBOIS, A & GLITHO, I. A. (2011)
473	The snake fauna of Togo: systematics, distribution, and biogeography, with remarks on
474	selected taxonomic problems. Zoosystema, 33, 325-360.
475	SÉGNIAGBETO, G. H., ASSOU, D. & KODA, K. (2015). — Evaluation du potentiel de mammifères dans le
476	Parc national de Togodo, la forêt sacrée de Godjinmé et les 5 mares d'Afito. Projet N°: 13.9003.8
477	de la GIZ-Togo, Lomé, Togo, 65pp.
478	SEGNIAGBETO, G. H., TRAPE, J-F., AFIADEMANYO, K, ROEDEL M-O., OHLER, A., DUBOIS, A.,
479	DAVID, P., MEIRTE, D., GLITHO, A., PETROZZI, F. & LUISELLI, L. A. (2015) Checklist of
480	the lizards of Togo, (West Africa), with comments on systematics, distribution, ecology,
481	and conservation. Zoosystema 37, 381 – 402.
482	SÉGNIAGBETO, G. H., ASSOU, D., KODA, K. D. AGBESSI, E. K. G., DENDI, D., LUISELLI, L., DECHER, J. &
483	MITTERMEIER, R. A. (2017) Survey of the status and distribution of primates in Togo (West
484	Africa). <i>Biodiversity</i> doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/14888386.2017.1404930.
485	SEGNIAGBETO, G.H., ATSRI, K.H., DELAGNON, A., ELIKPLIM, A.K., GBETEY, A.K., AMORI, G.,
486	DENDI, D., DECHER, J. & LUISELLI, L. (2018) Local distribution and density estimates of
487	primates in the Transboundary Reserve of the Mono river, Togo (West Africa). Revue
488	d'Ecologie (Terre et Vie), in press.
489	THOULESS, C. R., DUBLIN, H. T., BLANC, J. J., SKINNER, D. P., DANIEL, T. E., TAYLOR, R. D.,
490	MAISELS, F., FREDERICK, H. L. & BOUCHÉ, P. (2016) African Elephant Status Report
491	2016: an update from the African Elephant Database. Occasional Paper Series of the
492	IUCN Species Survival Commission, No. 60 IUCN / SSC Africa Elephant Specialist

- 493 Group. IUCN, Gland, Switzerland.

- 494 TOGO (MINISTERE DE L'ENVIRONNEMENT ET DES RESSOURCES FORESTIERES) & USA (US FISH
- 495 AND WILDLIFE SERVICE) (2003) *Strategie pour conservation des populations d'elephants*
- 496 *au Togo*. IUCN, Gland, Switzerland. Available at:
- 497 https://cmsdata.iucn.org/downloads/str_wtg0305_fr.pdf
- 498 WASSER, S. K., BROWN, L., MAILAND, C., MONDOL, S., CLARK, W., LAURIE, C. & WEIR, B.S.
- 499 (2015) Genetic assignment of large seizures of elephant ivory reveals Africa's major
 500 poaching hotspots. *Research Reports*, 349 (6243), 83 87.
- 501 WOODROFFE, R. & GINSBERG, J.R. (1998) Edge effects and the extinction of populations inside
- 502 protected areas. *Science*, 280, 2126-2128.
- 503 WORLD BANK (2017) data available at : <
- 504 http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/togo/overview>; last accessed : 30 december 2017

- Table 1: Results of field surveys (performed during 2015-2017) and interview surveys
- 507 (performed during 2017) on the presence of elephants in Togo's protected areas. Number of
- individual elephants and groups that were recorded directly in surveys are given in parentheses.
- 509 All other data were obtained from interviews. Annual = once per year.

Protected area	Area (ha)	No. persons interviewe	Elephant presence	Seasonal displacements	Observation period	No. Individuals/grou	Poaching
		d	-	-		р	
Oti-Kéran &	170						
Oti-	179 000	140	Yes	Yes	Annual	2-3 (2)	No
Mandouri							
Fazao-	192 000	100	\$7	37	N.C. (11 / 1 ⁻ 1	2-17(2)	No
Malfakassa		190	Yes	Yes	Monthly/daily		
Djamdé	8 000	48	Yes	Yes	Daily	3 (3)	No
Abdoulaye	30 000	32	Yes	Yes	1-2 months per year	3-5	No

512 FIGURE LEGENDS

513

Figure 1. Distribution of study sites in relation to the main road network and to the protectedareas in Togo.

516

Figure 2. Quantity of seized ivory in Togo, by country of destination, 2013-2016. Source of data:
Togo police.

519

520 Figure 3. Nationality of traffickers in relation to the amount of seized ivory (years 2013-2016).

521 Note that Togolese, or joint ventures between Togolese and other nationals (for instance,

522 Chinese, Vietnamese, Beninese, etc), dominate in the illegal trafficking arena. Source of data:

523 Togo police. Abbreviations: CI = Côte d'Ivoire; Gu = Guinea; Bu = Burkina Faso.

524

525 Figure 4: (A) elephant seen in the Fazao-Malfakassa National Park (Bounako, photo Agbodji);

526 (B) elephant hunted in the Oti-Kéran National Park, year 2014 (photo Agbo-Zegue).