Soans, Sonia (2016) *Gendered narratives of alcohol/drug consumption and violent nationalism in India*. Doctoral thesis (PhD), Manchester Metropolitan University.

Downloaded from: [http://e-space.mmu.ac.uk/618224/](http://e-space.mmu.ac.uk/618224/)

**Usage rights:** Creative Commons: Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 4.0

Please cite the published version
GENDERED NARRATIVES
OF ALCOHOL/DRUG
CONSUMPTION AND
VIOLENT NATIONALISM
IN INDIA

S SOANS

PhD 2016
GENDERED NARRATIVES OF ALCOHOL/DRUG CONSUMPTION AND VIOLENT NATIONALISM IN INDIA

SONIA SOANS

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the Manchester Metropolitan University for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Research Institute of Health & Social Change the Manchester Metropolitan University

July 2016
Dedication

This PhD is dedicated to all the scholars who have not been able to finish their degrees. To those who have had to give up half way, your hard work is not forgotten. I would like to share this degree with you. To the women who have resisted and braved all odds to educate themselves. Those pathbreakers who have acted on conviction and not convention. To all the people who encouraged me every day to write this thesis and helped make me feel at home in Manchester and the United Kingdom. Your kindness makes this degree all the more valuable.
Table of Contents

Acknowledgements........................................................................................................ 17
Abstract....................................................................................................................... 19

PART I - Introduction and Method............................................................................... 21

1. Introduction........................................................................................................... 23
   1.1. Background..................................................................................................... 23
   1.2. Women’s sexuality....................................................................................... 28
   1.3. Why use cinema.......................................................................................... 30
   1.4. The power of mental illness.......................................................................... 31
   1.5. Social expression of the ‘disease’.................................................................. 31
   1.6. Chapter overview......................................................................................... 32
   1.7. Manchester connection................................................................................ 34
   1.8. Conclusion.................................................................................................... 35

2. Methodology.......................................................................................................... 37
   2.1. Introduction to methodology......................................................................... 37
   2.2. Eclectic methodology.................................................................................... 41
       2.2.1 Methodological resistance....................................................................... 43
   2.3. Why visual methods..................................................................................... 44
       2.3.1 Bollywood centricism............................................................................. 45
   2.4. Feminist methodology.................................................................................. 46
       2.4.1 Subversion of power............................................................................... 47
       2.4.2 The female gaze.................................................................................... 48
       2.4.3 Necessity of a feminist methodology.................................................... 50
   2.5. Intersectionality............................................................................................ 53
4.4.2 What happens when women party hard?.................................................. 118

Figure 3: Guardian comments - Gujarat alcohol ban..................................... 121

4.5. Addiction in the present day................................................................. 121
4.5.1 Classification of addiction................................................................. 121
4.5.2 Models of addiction.......................................................................... 124
4.5.3 The language of addiction................................................................. 129
4.5.4 Work Hard Party Harder................................................................. 131
4.5.5 Resisting biological explanations..................................................... 134

4.6. Changing nature of substances......................................................... 135

4.7. Conclusion......................................................................................... 137
4.7.1 Postscript......................................................................................... 137

PART II - The Bollywood Connection......................................................... 139

5. Indian Cinema...................................................................................... 141
5.1. History of Indian cinema and its impact............................................ 141
5.1.1 Early origins of Indian cinema, Indian/Hindi size, influence........... 142
5.1.2 The use of Hindi in cinema............................................................ 144
5.1.3 Features of Hindi films.................................................................. 144
5.1.4 Technological changes................................................................. 145
5.1.5 Market for Bollywood cinema (India and the rest of the world)...... 146
5.1.6 Parallel cinema and alternatives to popular cinema ..................... 148

5.2. Cinema and the nation................................................................. 149
5.2.1 Birth of the nation...................................................................... 150
5.2.2 Decadence and the nation............................................................ 151
5.2.3 Visual mythology....................................................................... 153
5.2.4 Medium of instruction............................................................... 155
5.3. Gender sexuality and cinema................................................................. 156
  5.3.1 Subversive Eroticisation..................................................................... 156
  5.3.2 Pseudo morality.............................................................................. 159
  5.3.3 Segregated clothing and the nation.................................................. 160
  5.3.4 Hidden from plain sight................................................................. 162
  5.3.5 The othering of minorities and their women................................. 163
5.4. Change in the nation and its cinema................................................... 165
5.5. Cinema and television......................................................................... 166
5.6. Violence in cinema and real life.......................................................... 168
  5.6.1 History and crime............................................................................ 170
5.7. Diaspora and the motherland............................................................... 171
5.8. Women’s bodies and cinema............................................................... 173
5.9. Inventing Indian culture...................................................................... 173
5.10. Image of male alcoholics and alcohol dependency in Bollywood........ 175
5.11. Conclusion.......................................................................................... 176

6. Film Analysis........................................................................................... 179
  6.1. Introduction.......................................................................................... 179
    6.1.1 Films examined.............................................................................. 181
    6.1.2 Rationale for using the films.......................................................... 181
    6.1.3 Themes for discussion................................................................. 184
  6.2. Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam...................................................................... 186
    6.2.1 Synopsis......................................................................................... 187
    6.2.2 Analysis......................................................................................... 188
    6.2.3 Meena Kumari.............................................................................. 191

Figure 4: Posters of the film Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam.............................. 193
6.3. Purab aur Paschim................................................................. 193

6.3.1 Synopsis.............................................................................. 193

Figure 5: And now our people are going abroad......................... 195

Figure 6: But you love your country more than me....................... 196

Figure 7: Modesty is a precious ornament.................................. 197

Figure 8: Redemption - becoming the ideal Indian woman........... 197

6.3.2 Analysis............................................................................... 197

Figure 9: YouTube comments - nationalistic hate speech............ 198

Figure 10: Film poster - immodest representation of females........ 200

6.4. Hare Rama Hare Krishna..................................................... 200

6.4.1 Synopsis.............................................................................. 201

Figure 11: ...and having lost their inner peace............................ 201

Figure 12: .Their religion is opium, cocaine................................. 202

Figure 13: Jasbir is dead............................................................... 204

6.4.2 Analysis............................................................................... 204

6.4.3 A bitter end......................................................................... 206

6.5. Julie....................................................................................... 207

6.5.1 Synopsis.............................................................................. 207

6.5.2 Analysis............................................................................... 209

Figure 14: Film poster for Julie.................................................... 211

6.6. ChaalBaaz.......................................................................... 211

6.6.1 Synopsis.............................................................................. 211

6.6.2 Analysis............................................................................... 213

Figure 15: Film poster for ChaalBaaz......................................... 214

6.7. Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge.............................................. 214

6.7.1 Synopsis.............................................................................. 215
6.7.2 Analysis........................................................................................................... 216

Figure 16: Film poster for Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge....................................... 219

6.8. Fashion............................................................................................................. 219

6.8.1 Synopsis......................................................................................................... 220

6.8.2 Analysis......................................................................................................... 221

Figure 17: Film poster for Fashion........................................................................ 224

6.9. Tanu weds Manu............................................................................................ 224

6.9.1 Synopsis......................................................................................................... 225

6.9.2 Analysis......................................................................................................... 226

Figure 18: Film poster for Tanu weds Manu.......................................................... 228

6.10. Discussion and further analysis of themes..................................................... 228

6.10.1 The nation in the film................................................................................ 229

6.10.2 Westernisation vs Modernisation............................................................... 229

6.10.3 Indian culture and its morals..................................................................... 232

6.10.4 Nostalgia for the past................................................................................ 234

6.10.5 Diaspora and loss of self............................................................................ 235

6.10.6 Land of redemption.................................................................................... 237

6.10.7 Nation and its minorities.......................................................................... 237

Figure 19: Comment made about article on Anglo Indian communities.............. 238

Figure 20: Online comment - Anglo Indians considered to be arrogant............. 240

6.11. Gender in film............................................................................................... 242

6.11.1 Interrogating heteronormativity................................................................. 243

6.11.2 Home is where the hearth is.................................................................... 245

6.11.3 Female bodies and exploitation................................................................ 246

6.11.4 Women’s pseudo liberation..................................................................... 247

Figure 21: Image of the real life Silk Smitha.......................................................... 249
6.12. Disorder in films.................................................................................................................. 250
6.12.1 Agency and consumption................................................................................................. 251
6.12.2 Bollywood and madness.................................................................................................. 252
6.12.3 On-screen death................................................................................................................. 252
6.13. Conclusion............................................................................................................................ 253

7. Gender violence and Nationalism......................................................................................... 257
7.1. Introduction.......................................................................................................................... 257
7.2. Link between on screen and off screen violence................................................................. 258
7.3. Custodians of Indian culture............................................................................................... 261
Figure 22: Social media poster, pink chuddi campaign............................................................ 266
7.4. The stuff of Myths and Legends........................................................................................... 267
7.5. Limits of Indian identity........................................................................................................ 269
Figure 23: Cartoon by Syam (Sundar, no date)......................................................................... 270
7.5.1 A question of honour........................................................................................................... 271
7.6. Reclaim the past.................................................................................................................... 276
7.7. Indian women and violence.................................................................................................. 278
7.7.1 Recent crime not historical................................................................................................. 279
7.8. History repeats itself.............................................................................................................. 280
7.8.1 The female body as a site of ‘corrective violence’............................................................. 283
7.9. The dangers of orientalism................................................................................................... 286
7.9.1 The romance of the orient.................................................................................................. 288
7.9.2 Resisting Bollywood.......................................................................................................... 288
7.10. Post 2012............................................................................................................................. 290
Figure 24: Twitter image by TARSHI....................................................................................... 292
7.11. Conclusion........................................................................................................................... 292
PART III - Reflexivity and Conclusions

8. Reflexivity

8.1. Emotional landscapes

8.2. Impact of reflexivity

8.3. Post colonialism - a symptom of casteism

8.4. Decolonisation and other fanactisms

8.5. Internationalism and Nationalism

8.6. Querying Indian culture

8.7. When is it only a thesis?

8.8. Conclusion

Figure 25: NHS poster “Know Your Limits” campaign

Figure 26: Modified “Know Your Limits” poster

8.9. Conclusion

9. Conclusions

9.1. The problem with Bollywood

9.2. The problem with culture

9.3. The problem with postcolonialism

9.4. Chapter summary

PART IV - References and Appendices

References

Filmography

Appendix A - Crime timeline

Appendix B - The Bechdel test

Appendix C - Political map of India

Figure 27: Image excerpted from “The Rule”
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my professors and all the staff at MMU for their support over the last few years. I would like to thank all the people of Manchester and especially the clergy and parishioners of Manchester Cathedral whose practical support helped me complete this PhD.

Sonia.
Abstract

Alcoholism and drug addiction have come to be regarded as psychological and social disorders in recent times. The international diagnostic system ICD (International Classification of Diseases) provides a diagnosis for severe cases of alcoholism/addiction that meet clinical standards. However, the consumption of these substances even recreationally has been challenged. In the case of India the problem of alcohol and drug consumption is tied to nationalism and is gendered. My work in a rehabilitation clinic in India introduced me to learning about the non-clinical side of the condition. While literature from around the world supports the idea that female alcoholics and addicts in recovery are treated differently by medical staff, it does not look at how some of these narratives about the addict are sometimes tied to the prejudice against the substances themselves. This leads to the research question - How are gendered narratives of alcohol and drug consumption represented in Indian society in general, and Bollywood movies in particular. The thesis also explores to what extent, if any, such representations relate to the rise of violent nationalism within Indian society.

Tracing the history back to the disease model that has come to dominate our understanding of the condition, one can observe that these diagnostic criteria have been evolving, as has the social milieu that creates these breaches in normality. I am not looking at the clinical diagnosis itself but at the fears that surround addiction narratives. These narratives are to be found in everyday life, in cinema, in policy, in crime. The ‘addict’ is not only a clinical being but tells a different story which varies according to the identity that they embody. Women in India who transgress
boundaries of ‘culture’ are often at risk of being sexualised even by their recreational use of psychoactive substances. These narratives are present everywhere, especially in cinema.

The work of postcolonial theorists such as Ashis Nandy and Partha Chatterjee is used to trace a nationalistic discourse, that in recent years has turned violent, providing a critique of the modern Indian state. Writing by black feminists such as Audre Lorde, bell hooks and Gloria Anzaldúa provide another critique and that is of gender and race in opposition to culture. The methodology used (ecclectic, feminist and discourse analysis) positions me as a researcher not a neutral bystander, but entrenched in and participating in the production of knowledge that makes me question my privilege.

Bollywood films have been used to trace these gendered, nationalistic and violent narratives. I show how a popular form of entertainment is also used as a means of propaganda. Cinema in India is an important medium of communication that permeates most aspects of our lives. Widely imitated for its fashion, dialogues and ideology too are imitated. Similar to cinema around the world, Bollywood uses tropes, westernised women who consume drugs and alcohol is one such trope. Reading the discourse that runs through these films reveals there is subversion in the way in which women’s bodies are exploited on screen yet a guise of decency is maintained.

The discourse that runs on screen through films is similar to incidents of violence against women in everyday life. Nationalism runs through these narratives, as does gendered violence.
PART I - Introduction and Method
CHAPTER 1

1 Introduction

‘The present was so bleak that the past became golden’

M. N Srinivas

1.1 Background

This study puts into writing events and ideas that have shaped my understanding of addiction. My work at a rehabilitation centre in India, working with women recovering from addiction to legal and illegal substances, gave me an insight into the gendered nature of the field of addiction. The clients of this centre were mostly upper middle class or middle class. It was located in a wealthy neighbourhood, with trendy cafes, restaurants and clubs; home to film stars and politicians this was a typical elite area of town. This was my first permanent job after my Masters degree.

After completing my Masters and finding this job, I decided to get an M. Phil and work in a University. The challenges presented in the rehabilitation facility found their way into writing a thesis and teaching psychology. Psychology as a discipline is a tool of the elite, it is heavily influenced by American ideology and speaks of phenomena more identifiable by the affluent urban classes. In its clinical form psychology operates in clinics that are often not available to those that cannot afford its services. Often indigenous or cultural differences are ignored (Girishwar, 2011). I do not separate myself from these power structures, but identify my own role in creating this version of psychology and propagating it. As a researcher I am aware of my privilege and how that privilege has helped shape my worldview. I attempt to provide context by my position.
My M.Phil was a means of quantifying the narratives of patients in the rehab centre. I searched and found a few women who were willing to talk to me about their experience of addiction. Some would talk to help me understand their struggles, but only on condition that I did not write about them, as they feared being identified through their narratives in a city where there were so few of them. Concerns about bringing shame on their families by talking about their pasts played a role in how they perceived the world around them. In those few months of data collection I was openly welcomed by them into Alcoholics Anonymous (AA) and its other members also talked freely of their recovery on condition of secrecy. One could sense that they wanted to raise awareness about their struggles yet faced stigma if their identities were revealed. Some members were more open to be named and share their stories, if it were to help individuals recover. Talking to the people in the group, where men outnumbered the women, I became aware of how it was women who were pathologised for taking a single drink, as opposed to men who would not be labelled as ‘drunks’ even if they had stumbled to the ground or passed out. This was not all that there was to it, people mentioned how they saw alcoholism and addiction in films and advertisements and how, whilst in recovery, they found such portrayals to be misrepresentative and even offensive. Women I spoke to mentioned how Indian women were not expected to drink and how it was a double-edged sword. Women of lower classes were excused on the basis of class and suffering, finding an eventual release through alcohol or drugs. Women of the upper classes were thought of as spoilt, and their drinking or drug habits were seen as part of the corruption brought about by money and power. There was a sense that popular culture was a source of education about serious issues; the possibility that the information presented did more to harm than educate was not something that was discussed. Feminists and social activists in India have protested such issues but their arguments were seen as
the ramblings of angry killjoys easily dismissed and violently crushed by the state (Zaidi, 2013; BBC News, 2014 (India police fire water cannon)). I have never much cared about popular media in India but I have been aware of the influence it had on people. I have often used it in conversations, and I have been acutely aware of how potent it is in shaping public consciousness.

Women addicts, like their male counterparts, face stigma except in the former’s case they also have to contend with ideas of sexual promiscuity. Often during therapy sessions prejudiced opinions of women addicts were expressed despite evidence to the contrary. What would have been seen as neutral or normal behaviour outside the rehab was turned into symptoms of addiction and ‘addictive personality’. Wearing bright coloured clothing or makeup, or taking care of one’s appearance, were seen as signs of sexual promiscuity brought on by addiction. The equivalent behaviour in men was interpreted as signs of recovery. Apart from that, the use of violence and sexual violence to bring these women into sobriety were seen as justified. While sexuality played a role in how these women were treated, their nationality too played a role in their treatment. Ideas of western culture polluting the minds of Indian women were a common topic of discussion. Somehow the same western culture was not a problem when men spoke about their addiction, it was expected that they would drink or use substances. In the Rehab we would weekly watch a Hollywood film on addiction or a documentary on the subject (English was preferred as being a neutral language, favouring one regional language over another could cause antagonism). Films regarding female addicts tended to conflate the idea of addiction and sexual promiscuity, further feeding into an existing prejudice. Some of the scenes were uncomfortable to watch in a room full of men.

Three main issues come into focus in this thesis - Gender, alcohol and drug
consumption, and nation. The interaction of these three issues forms the crux of the thesis. It is from these three issues the research question is formed: How are gendered narratives of alcohol and drug consumption represented in Indian society in general, and Bollywood movies in particular. The thesis also explores to what extent, if any, such representations relate to the rise of violent nationalism within Indian society.

Alcohol and drug consumption are embedded within social structures where interactions occur with gender and national identity. A more appropriate term to describe these interactions would be intersectionality. Coined by Crenshaw (1989) the idea is that one occupies multiple identities some of which disadvantage an individual more than others. This idea is not new to black feminism it has been used by black feminists prior to the term being coined. Based primarily in the activism and writing of black lesbian feminists who in one way or another were excluded from both mainstream feminism and anti racist struggles of their era, the idea came from addressing all aspects of one’s identity thereby addressing several facets of social injustice. Audre Lorde articulates her personal struggle of being an outsider in different groups:

I was born Black and a woman. I am trying to become the strongest person I can become to live the life I have been given and to help effect change toward a livable future for this earth and for my children. As a Black, lesbian, feminist, socialist, poet, mother of two including one boy and member of an interracial couple, I usually find myself part of some group in which the majority defines me as deviant, difficult, inferior or just plain "wrong”. From my membership in all of these groups I have learned that oppression and the intolerance of difference come in all shapes and sizes and colors and
sexualities; and that among those of us who share the goals of liberation and a workable future for our children, there can be no hierarchies of oppression.

(Lorde, 1983:9)

Sexism, racism and homophobia as pointed out though an intersectional analysis were not issues that were being discussed by mainstream movements.

The concept of intersectionality provided a conceptual language for recognising that everybody is simultaneously positioned within social categories, such as gender, social class, sexuality and ‘race’. So even when focusing particularly on one social category (such as ‘race’, gender or social class), intersectionality reminds us that we cannot understand that category in isolation.

(Phoenix, 2006:22)

Intersectionality does not dilute but makes for stronger social and political movements. In the case of feminism it broadens the scope and reach of the movement including women who do not fit into either their own society or in mainstream resistance movements. McCall (2005) points out that feminism has benefited with the incorporation of intersectionality which has added another dimension of critique and methodology.

Despite the utility presented by an intersectional feminist approach there are assumptions about intersectionality that have lead to it being thought of as exclusive to black feminism, however it is a far cry from that. Carbado (2013) points out some of the assumptions:

1. Intersectionality is only or largely about Black women, or only about race
and gender.

2. Intersectionality is an identitarian framework.

3. Intersectionality is a static theory that does not capture the dynamic and contingent processes of identity formation.

4. Intersectionality is overly invested in subjects.

5. Intersectionality has traveled as far as it can go, or there is nothing more the theory can teach us.

6. Intersectionality should be replaced by or at least applied in conjunction with (fill in the blank)

(Carbado, 2013:3)

While women addicts have been studied before it is important to contextualise the conditions in which addiction is pathologised, similarly its ties to nationalism and the perception of these multiple identities is pertinent in understanding the everyday stigma women face. Bowleg (2008) theorises that intersectionality is not a process whereby oppression is added onto oppression but one whereby several aspects of identity merge. These identities are complex, while one aspect can provide social status another can form a barrier. Indian women who consume alcohol and drugs are at the juncture of multiple oppressions. Being women in a nation that is deeply patriarchal and violent towards women exposes them to dangers from birth. In addition to this, alcohol and drug consumption makes them more vulnerable in a nation that views them as a sexualised other. A purely clinical standpoint does not take into account the lived experience that women in such a situation face.

1.2. **Women’s sexuality**

In group therapy sessions at the rehab centre women would regularly bring up issues
of sexual abuse and coercion to use substances, which were often ignored or thought of as fabricated narratives. When presented clinically, addiction is often treated either as a moral problem or as a disease. This thesis attempts to examine discourse around addiction in cinema and crime against women, further examining similarities in the way these discourses seem to mirror each other. Though classified as a mental illness, the idea of substance use and its ties to social problems also classifies it as a crime, doubling the negative impact on the individual. In rehabilitation we would often talk about addiction as we would any medical illness and not a mental illness; the AA program tends to perpetuate the idea that alcoholism and addiction are diseases like any other and not a problem of weak will power.

The complexities of physical addiction or drug and alcohol use will not be discussed in length, nor the effects of those substances on the body, but rather my focus is on the perception of those substances in present times. While the distinction between different drugs will not be made I have chosen to classify both alcohol and drugs (legal and illegal) in terms of their social perception rather than their physiological and psychological effect.

Mental illness has the effect of prejudicing all behaviours of a patient to be taken as signs of psychopathology. This phenomena has been documented and written about extensively for over a century. Journalist Nellie Bly carefully documented her stay in a ‘madhouse’, which was to become the inspiration for the Rosenhan Experiment decades later (Bly, no date; Rosenhan, 1973). Feigning the symptoms of ‘madness’ Bly was held in at the Women's Lunatic Asylum on Blackwell's Island in New York. Experiencing poor living conditions, abuse from the staff and torture, she wrote about the powerlessness that comes with the diagnosis of mental illness and the cruelty that is justified on the basis that it is to help the patient:
What, excepting torture, would produce insanity quicker than this treatment? Here is a class of women sent to be cured. I would like the expert physicians who are condemning me for my action, which has proven their ability, to take a perfectly sane and healthy woman, shut her up and make her sit from 6 a.m. until 8 p.m. on straight-back benches, do not allow her to talk or move during these hours, give her no reading and let her know nothing of the world or its doings, give her bad food and harsh treatment, and see how long it will take to make her insane. Two months would make her a mental and physical wreck.

(Bly, no date)

Both incursions of the sane into the insane asylum demonstrate how an inmate’s behaviour is viewed with suspicion and as symptoms of pathology by the medical professionals. Requests for basic necessities are often termed as manipulations or ignored as signs of a disordered mind. The situation was no different in the rehabilitation centre where I worked, women were judged before they even checked in. Their demands, no matter how reasonable, were seen as manipulations of a sick mind. In a situation such as this, the counsellors’ predictions of relapse almost always came true.

1.3. Why use cinema

This study attempts to connect discourse around addiction, which is currently classified as a mental illness, to addiction seen as a social problem and its portrayal in Indian cinema, and to link how discourse on screen is similar to discourse off screen. Indian cinema, Bollywood films in particular, has captured the imagination of Indians and people across the world like no other medium. Discourse in films is powerful, often informing public opinion. One can see the influence of Bollywood in
the way trends or songs on screen find their way into everyday life.

The social perception of drink and drugs and the gendered discourse it follows in India will be explored. Growing right wing groups in India are affecting women’s safety as their perceived social deviance is treated with violence. While the state does not overtly condone these acts it is complicit in the maltreatment of women.

1.4. **The power of mental illness**

Mental health/illness has come to dominate the way we think of the human condition, it tends to universalise social problems into neat categories through medical taxonomies. This reduces suffering into carefully constructed words, negating differences in individuals and their reactions to the world. Mental illness in India has come to be dominated by two ideas, one of biological and neurological imbalances and the other looking inwards to find a historically valid psychology. The drive towards quantifying and measuring psychological phenomena remain central to this psychology. To present these ideas as a western conspiracy would deny agency on the part of individuals who have come to accept these ideals for the good of society. My experiences made me realise that this psychology was not neutral or just, it operated on a system of oppression formed by prejudice. In the common rooms or the staff rooms we had the power to laugh at people’s suffering or to find a deeper pathology in those we had come to see as less sane than us.

1.5. **Social expression of the ‘disease’**

Biological and psychological explanations of why addiction occurs attempt to remove stigma and bring about a greater understanding, however they can be interpreted differently (Corrigan and Watson, 2004; Corrigan and O'Shaughnessy,
Stigma attached to the condition, explanations notwithstanding, do not help to reduce how a pathologised individual is viewed. The social perception of addiction remains tied to negative images of crime, poverty, and lack of sexual morality. Mental illness does not occur in isolation but is a product of crime, economic policy, social conditions, nationalism and gender politics. In an era of universalisation, mental illness holds the position of endangering individuals who are already marginalised. In the case of India this universalisation has meant those on the margins now have another stigma to contend with. While it would be easy to categorise India and its prejudices as backwards one must remember social norms in most cases outweigh the law of the land which tends to be (pseudo) neutral.

1.6. **Chapter overview**

- The second chapter discusses the methodological framework which forms the theoretical basis of the thesis. Setting the groundwork of the thesis it explores why those methods were originally chosen and why they have been modified. Drawing upon different traditions the aim is to broaden the understanding of how gender, nationalism and social problems intersect to produce phenomena we have come to think of as pathologies. Bollywood films are used as tools to pick out these discourses and the role of visual culture on the formation of identity and ideology.

- Chapter three traces out the social and historical ideas of India. Indian nationalism shares many features with other nationalisms, however to appear as a unique nation it creates its own brand of nationalism. Mapping out the psychological limits it sets itself in terms of understanding minorities and its construction of gender and communities historical points of reference are used. India as a nation was formed in 1947 yet its history is often used to justify the need for homogeneity and a return
to the past. The past is often used as a means of perpetrating violence against minorities. Tapping into Dalit perspectives helps challenge upper caste notions of secularism and unity.

- The fourth chapter looks at how alcoholism and addiction came to be classified as diseases. In this chapter I try and point out it is not the substance itself but the attributions of loss of control and intoxication we ascribe to it that partly make up the experience of intoxication. Social categorisation and attribution are discussed here.

- The fifth chapter traces the history of Bollywood and the impact it has had on the Indian audience. From pre-independence India to the present day it has found audiences in India and around the world, sometimes replacing Hollywood as the most popular source of entertainment. Its impact on national identity and reproducing national ideals makes it an important medium worth studying. The numerous contradictions in the presentation of women and sexuality are characteristic of how Indian people as a society deal with these issues.

- The sixth chapter takes an in-depth look at a few specific Bollywood films chosen from different decades. Depicting women who are in various states of inebriation, these films grapple with the idea of how such women are to be treated on screen. On screen anxieties are quelled by othering these women, their characters portrayed as foreign to ‘Indian culture’. However this association has not been a continuous one, there are contradictions in this narrative. Also, the assumption that a fast growing economy and affluence would help us shed some of those inhibitions around culture are proved wrong. A steady nationalisation can be seen on screen with identity and culture becoming a point of focus.
• The seventh chapter traces how violence against women is a growing problem in India. Perpetrators often justify their actions as being for the greater good, as being necessary to protect Indian society and women in particular. These crimes are public reminders of how powerful patriarchal forces can dominate the Indian mindset. Visible reminders of these crimes serve to keep women in check and control them. While on paper the Indian law and constitution are neutral, treating all the country's citizens equally, social norms often are more dominant. Looking at incidents of gendered violence that were committed to protect women from the evils of drinking I connect how this discourse is seen in films and replicated in real life. Issues of region, religion and affluence intersect in these debates which have pointed out how divided Indian society can be, and how its diversity can also be a cause for violence.

• The eighth chapter is a reflexive exercise to trace the flexibility and learning that went into creating the previous chapters. It questions my previous stance and looks at how there has been a shift in knowledge production and construction over three years of writing.

• The last chapter is a conclusion summarising the key findings of the thesis.

• I have attached what I call a crime timeline (see Appendix A). This is a record of crimes against women in the three years I have been writing my PhD. Some of these are incidents that have happened to me, others are incidents that have caught the attention of world media. In each of these cases I have felt fear as these closely mirror issues I am writing about.

1.7. Manchester connection

While writing this thesis in Manchester, I have come to question my own role in
writing this work away from home. Anonymity in a foreign country has influenced the way I approach and write about women and nationalism. During these three years a number of violent incidents against women, both in India and Manchester, have had a deep impact on me. My reactions have ranged from anger to sadness, and above all fear for my personal safety. I have had to question my own stance on alcohol and drugs as a non-user. In the UK I have experienced social policing against the very act of picking up a wine glass from individuals who point out my nationality and culture as barriers to drinking. As I was writing a part of the chapter on violence against women I received a text message from a friend who was shocked by the Delhi gang rape case on December 16th 2012. His concern and that of many friends was very touching at that time. My hope is that in some way, however small, this thesis and the numerous discussions with friends over the last three years will help change perceptions about Indian women and bring awareness about our current condition.

1.8. Conclusion

Concepts presented in the preceding chapters are borrowed from different disciplines and academic traditions.

As I write this I am aware of my own position - of being in self-imposed exile, not fitting into my own society but finding acceptance in Manchester, a relatively safe space to express my ideas without fear of being silenced. Chance meetings with fellow Indians who share my predicament have found freedom of self-expression in this city. Meeting young Indian women like myself who are able to have a drink or walk back home at night, travel alone, dress as they like, sit in cafes alone, makes me sad at the way we have become targets of violence in our own nation.

Being aware of how this thesis speaks for a marginalised group of women in India, I
am writing from a position of privilege but also for an India that has changed in these three years. Chow (1993) is critical of the way in which minority discourse is invoked by former imperial nations such as China and Iran. India is in a similar position to China as Chow describes it, caught between two worlds, the legacy of colonialism in the past and coping with globalisation in the present. This condition is felt by Indians living in India and by diasporans vacillating between valorisation of the past and living with wounds inflicted by colonialism. Reviving culture through the means of propaganda and invention helps soothe the psyche of the nation and the individual. The burden of maintaining authenticity and culture rests on women whose bodies have become sites of this contest for nationalists. Globalised feminine identity is contested by those on the right and left, one using the language of tradition and the other of exploitation.

While I critique the mistreatment of addiction and point out how our perception of certain substances has changed, I am cognizant that in the present time governments are concerned about excessive alcohol and drug consumption. Living amongst students in a university environment and seeing the effects of excessive consumption I am aware of the problems people face. I am not suggesting an end to treatment but a more humane form of treatment and safer environments for people, especially women.

My M.Phil work focused on finding women addicts in recovery as authentic sources of information. This current work goes into greater depth looking at the issue historically and through the eyes of a changing Indian society, and at how those changes are reflected in film. Film in this context is both a used as tool for understanding addiction and also the object of that understanding.
CHAPTER 2

2 Methodology

‘Jewish holocaust was more a pathology of human rationality than of irrationality’

Ashis Nandy

2.1. Introduction to methodology

The objective of this chapter is to discuss in depth the theoretical and methodological resources which will be employed throughout this thesis. Establishing the trajectory of the discussions, this chapter will ground the discussions in the following chapters within an epistemological framework. Contextual validation as well as historical backgrounds are necessary to the understanding of ideas presented in the discussions that will follow.

In the previous chapter the necessity of intersectionality was highlighted, this chapter will look at how the theoretical standpoints chosen for analysis are also informed by an intersectional approach. Feminism, post-colonialism and anti racism form the bedrock of this thesis.

Keeping the diverse nature of subjects and methodologies in mind the methodology also takes into account the intersectional nature of the theoretical frameworks being presented.

Feminism and post colonialism are both methods that challenge power relations by pointing out the nature of power and the structures that enable it to pervade everyday life.

Intersectionality reflects a commitment neither to subjects nor to identities per
se but, rather, to marking and mapping the production and contingency of both. Nor is the theory an effort to identify, in the abstract, an exhaustive list of intersectional social categories and to add them up to determine - once and for all - the different intersectional configurations those categories can form.

(Carbado, 2013:6)

The women discussed in this thesis embody multiple identities each one gaining and losing prominence in different social functions.

Christensen and Jensen (2012) define intersectional approaches in research as a point of departure.

To us, intersectionality is an analytical concept that is useful for analysing and understanding differences and multiple inequalities in contemporary societies at both the macro- and the micro-level. But the method of practising intersectionality must be related to power relations, in particular locations and contexts. In other words, there is more than one way of doing intersectional analysis.

(Christensen & Jensen, 2012:121)

Theorists whose work spans different disciplinary frameworks will be used to pick out patterns and contradictions in the data. Bollywood films are the primary source of data in this thesis and a methodological tool. Themes from these films and the common discourse that runs through them will then be analysed by looking at incidents of gendered violence in Indian society. This is not to suggest that viewing of these films has caused violence but that a similar thread runs through the narratives of films and these incidents. The growing level of intolerance towards minorities and selected political ideas in Indian society has been an issue of concern.
through the preceding decade. Spoken about but suppressed, it is a reaction to the rapid changes taking place in Indian society.

As a nation that until the middle of the twentieth century was under colonial rule by the British, French and Portugese\(^1\), India has been shaped by these experiences in both positive and negative ways (Chatterjee, 1993). This however was not the first time foreign powers had ruled the country. Many monarchies with various religious backgrounds\(^2\) over the past centuries have had their presence, shaping the culture we now know today. Colonisation was a complex process and its selective acceptance and rejection a matter of serious debate through to the present time. A nation once known as ‘The jewel in the crown’\(^3\), it has gained a new identity post independence. Considering itself as the next superpower it presents numerous contradictions in the way it negotiates native and foreign influences. Power struggles and the collusion of colonial forces with dominant groups have shaped the way we still view these groups and construct our identity. These identities are not fixed but in constant flux, neither are they homogenous. The various images which have led to common stereotypes have a certain element of truth in them.

The images of glaring poverty or limitless wealth, of exoticism, are all true and exist in parallel however they are constantly being challenged. No one of them is any more

---

\(^1\) While the British colonisation of India is widely known, the French and the Portuguese have also had a colonial presence. British ruled India gained independence in August 1947, Portuguese run Goa only got its independence in 1961.

\(^2\) A fact often never mentioned by Hindu nationalists who present themselves as the true inhabitants of India. Muslim kings are often presented as foreign invaders who converted the population to Islam. Constantly used by different political parties to manipulate public thought as a point of contention.

\(^3\) A phrase perhaps now most widely known due to the popular 1980’s TV series based upon the ‘Raj Quartet’ novels by author Paul Scott, but originally coined by British prime minister Benjamin Disraeli in 1874 when speaking about the Suez Canal securing the route to India, “the jewel in the Crown” of the British Empire (Laybourn, 2001:106).
authentic than any other. Conflicts arise when one image is favoured above others (Adichie, 2009). These various identities are in constant struggle to establish superiority over each other. If these points of contrast indicate the diverse nature of the nation, they also become points of unity when they come into contact with the greater outsider, the West. From a former colony to an aspiring superpower, India’s point of contention with foreign nations has changed. No longer looking towards Britain it is now looking at its neighbours in the region and the United States of America, from where it accepts and rejects economic and cultural intervention. This new globalised nation has its own set of problems. The journey from being a former colony to a nation that is rapidly becoming globalised has created different issues relating to gender and mental illness. The way these issues are presented has evolved, however the oppressions have not gone away.

The idea is not to romanticise the past or make it seem bleak in comparison to the present but to see the changes in post independence India in context and the way it conceptualises the problem of alcohol and drug consumption with regard to women. Contradictions in these narratives and the way they are viewed today is of importance. The silences in academic literature on this issue sheds as much light as do the numerous articles (Varma et al, 1980; Mohan et al, 2001).

In all these changes the idea of an ‘authentic and purifying Indian culture’ remains. In present years there has been a growing nationalistic move to assert the superiority of ‘Indian culture’ (Sen, 1993). It is to be carried by women who will bear its honour and keep it pure. Conflicts arising out of social change are treated as a threat to this culture or ascribed to a foreign influence. Indian culture is constructed as a state of purity which when embraced can negate the harmful influence of foreign problems. Chatterjee (1989; 1997) argues that the Indian reaction to colonisation was a
carefully chosen one and this trend continues today. What Chatterjee (1993, 1997) and Nandy (1996) describe as India’s assertion of cultural superiority can be traced to the present. Globalised India still grapples with these distinctions, it is willing to accept western hegemony in science but not in the spiritual realm. These hegemonies are gendered and even given a class. The popular image of the rich spoilt girl drinking and doing drugs is seen as a corruption of culture but the same is not wholly true for her male counterpart. If alcohol consumption is linked to manliness, a woman doing the same is losing her culture.

The position of alcoholism/addiction in Indian society is a precarious one. Commonly regarded as a social problem whose origins are western it is rarely regarded as a mental disorder except by those who treat it. While women can drink it is socially unacceptable in certain circles to do so. Legal drugs while sold are still off limits, especially to women. An unwritten rule is present about this gender divide (Pidd, 2012). Indian woman who drink or take drugs are assumed to have done so due to exposure to western culture. Their loss of sexual control under the influence is to be deplored but is also taken advantage of (Mountian, 2004). The contradictions in these arguments is obvious but usually glossed over. Similarly what constitutes Indian culture is never explained, it is an ambiguous term which almost never needs explanation. It is used to describe people, ideas and anything it would like to claim as its own (Van der Veer, 1994).

2.2. **Eclectic methodology**

Some of the issues discussed in this thesis range from mental illness to the intersections it makes between gender, nationality, violence and representation. These matters have been studied independently of each other and in conjunction with other
issues. A few of these problems are unique to the Indian context and its history. While it could be argued that alcoholism and its effect on women is universal, its social expression and construction is dependent on culture and history. This history is under constant reconstruction, evolving under different social, political and economic circumstances. Often this history presents contradictions and exceptions to socially constructed rules.

The subject matter of this thesis cuts across multiple disciplines and ideas therefore it is pertinent for the methodology to reflect this. Since the issues presented are intersectional, the methodology chosen attempts to capture a constant flux (Crenshaw, 1989). Theorists from various disciplines whose work I borrow from have deployed similar tactics in addressing social issues. The attempt is to use different methods to capture the nuances of each of these intersections and interactions.

To understand phenomena such as alcoholism and addiction the cultural conditions that produce addiction as a psychological problem must be understood in regard to nationality, gender and the wider culture in which it exists. Popular culture is a reflection of society and its patterns of consumption. Common ideas are reduced in a form that is comprehensible to a wider audience (Buhgra, 2006). Often simplifying social phenomena and reducing it to tropes, it communicates important ideas in a simplistic manner.

Elements of different methodologies will be used to negotiate through the discourse I am attempting to write about. Concepts will be explained through different methodologies which will contextualise the issues presented. Viewing the same problem through more than one stance is an attempt to see the various ways in which
the same problem is approached and the many interpretations it can take on. Sources of data (Bollywood films and violent incidents) and the rationale for choosing them will be explained in detail. Bollywood films will be used as data in order to read gendered expressions of alcohol and drug use and as data to track these changes.

2.2.1 Methodological resistance

The lack of one single methodology is not a drawback but has lead to my own resistance to using one methodology alone. The methodology is pragmatic in nature and linked to the incorporation of different ideologies to strengthen the overall analysis. While the dominant perspective is feminist it is not representative of all kinds of feminism. It is a feminism that is intersectional, addressing issues that affect Indian women and shaped by my own experiences articulated in the UK. I would resist labeling my standpoint as progressive or radical, as what constitutes these two positions is not fixed in time or place. Over the years different ideologies and their particular strains have been accepted or rejected to develop a personal ethical and methodological stance. This selective use of ideology has come about through personal experience and observations of my environment, which is constantly shifting and changing; however some core ideas have been static. The focus of feminist methodology is not to exclude men but to include them and yet see these issues from the point of social justice (Ramazanoglu, 1992).

While the theoretical framework is feminist I have also attempted to utilise the work of Indian theorists, such as Ashis Nandy, Partha Chatterjee and Kancha Ilaiah. This is a deliberate attempt to understand a history and position that is often not considered in India, let alone in the west. Revisionist history sponsored by state apparatus has made it impossible to access Indian history in India (Kumar, 1989; Gottlob, 1968).
However as this thesis attempts to dismantle nationalism and cultural specificity some of the theorists are neither Indian nor female.

2.3. *Why visual methods*

Reavey (2012) argues that the visual is not merely a naive issue but of importance. Visual documentation is not new to the social sciences or to psychology. Images have been used to capture important moments in history and also as a means of understanding society. Cameras capturing static and moving images surround us. Photography is no longer reserved to the select few, but is now available to almost anyone across the world due to the incorporation of cheap cameras within mobile phones, laptops and other computer devices. The proliferation of cameras and the development of social media has grown to cater to these needs.  

Documenting through visual means, especially via cameras, is considered an accurate tool which documents phenomena without being corrupted by an unreliable memory. However, there are patterns in what is captured through the visual documentation process. Visual documentation is not a neutral process (Curtis, 2012, 2014). Some images are never captured on screen and transmitted, the omission of these is just as telling. While the camera is neutral the person operating it is not and the biases of the operator are reflected in the images we get to see. Films are one such non-neutral medium. National cinema is anything but neutral, it embodies the social preoccupations of a nation. Visual themes map out the ideological boundaries of a nation.

Creating emotional responses to familiar tropes on screen, a movie creates for the

---

4 During the course of this thesis I have used several social networking websites to share ideas and network with fellow researchers.
audience a narrative that is easily understood and resolved by the end of the film. Bollywood films are easily dismissed as being too dramatic and having no connection to Indian social reality. While this view might have some credibility it has not always been the case. It is a widely watched medium, to dismiss it on those grounds of intellectualism alone would do it injustice. It is a point of social and cultural reference. As an economic entity, it is source of employment and revenue. To compare it to Hollywood would not be right as Bollywood is different. Its cultural impact can be seen in the way film songs play on the radio. Independent pop music is relatively new in India. Most popular music is film based and made for films unlike Hollywood, which might incorporate popular music into films (Manuel, 1988). Comparing the impact of Bollywood to Hollywood would make it look like a regional imitation. Bollywood might be inspired by other world cinema but to study it, it needs to be the centre and not the periphery. Hollywood is assumed to be the centre of cinema production and world cinema a smaller regional venture (Arnes, 1987). In the case of Bollywood the opposite is true. Though both have existed in India, Hollywood is not the cinema of the masses (Hoad, 2012).

2.3.1 Bollywood centricism

The hold of Bollywood and in recent years satellite television on Indian culture makes it a useful means of understanding the hold it has on people and how it shapes public opinion. Its everyday dissemination and reproduction show it is tied into the fabric of society.

Imitation and reproduction would be one way of measuring the impact of Bollywood, looking at the subtext of films is also a good indicator of the social values of the era they were made in. While the artistic element can be dismissed the content and the
manner in which Bollywood positions itself in Indian society calls for it to be questioned. Common tropes adopted in films find their way into everyday jokes and conversations.

While it has been argued that films are not neutral and the trajectory of the documentary is not neutral (Chow, 2013), the presentation of facts is still embedded in ideas of modernity, scientific rationality and more importantly neutrality. It presents tension and its resolution. Indian documentaries have been accused of being just as biased as popular films. Given the rise of social journalism/activism\(^5\) Talbot’s (2007) idea about the participatory process in media and representation is now a reality. The idea that the production of media is one sided is untrue. Production of films has been a two way process, it has become more transparent and easy to make in recent years.

Using material available to me was an act of resistance. Resisting the standard narrative of reducing a phenomena to numbers also helped me see where people got their information from. While academic writing makes its way into society, gradually popular culture subverts that route, it is more pervasive and reaches people faster. It is accessible and is imitated by people. It is not uncommon to hear catchphrases from television adverts or film dialogues being repeated until they become common phrases.

2.4. **Feminist methodology**

That academia and its ventures into society are fraught with elitism is not surprising. Its structure and endeavours base themselves on very selective values - patriarchy,

\(^5\) Known as citizen journalism in India, this is a very popular way of engaging viewers of news channels to send in images and films from their phones to contribute to the news and become activists.
class and power are some of them (Walker, 1998). Indian academia is based in power structures occupied by those in upper caste positions. It has been challenged on grounds of exclusion and making groups of people invisible in its writing (Somwanshi, 2015). However, in the case of India there is another source of academic power, the new emerging American dominance.

Psychology as a discipline has been known to collude and even operate as a tool of oppressive forces. It constantly produces knowledge that reinforces pre-existing prejudices by scientifically validating them (Parker, 2007; Davar, 2008). However the critiques of psychology and particularly psychology in India are not limited to its frequent deliberate ignoring of feminist issues, but also to issues of class, caste and sexuality.

Positivist views of science make their way into social sciences, and psychology is one of them. To legitimise itself psychology often takes the quantitative route. While this method has its benefits it is not neutral or representative. Critiques of this are usually positioned as ‘unscientific’ (Faulconer and Williams, 1985). The sharp divide between the qualitative and quantitative strands of research has made it difficult to understand social phenomena without first being asked to define one’s position.

2.4.1 Subversion of power

Women’s bodies occupy a politically charged space. As will be discussed in the next few chapters, women’s bodies form the basis of economical, social and national identity. Contentious issues are almost always played out in the way women’s bodies are spoken about. The pseudo neutrality of psychology attempts to quantify women’s experiences as does nationalism which constantly reinvents the ideal woman.
Butler (1990) provides the metaphor of performing gender. I take this further and suggest a script for the performance; Indian society as the scriptwriter, invisible yet pervasive, a carefully written script that can even be seen in the way women are mistreated. Deviance from this script is followed by punishment. Legal punishment would be the last step in how punishment is acted out, social stigma and social sanctions sometimes work in a more pervasive manner than a legal state appointed framework. Madness, attacks on character and person are part of social control, of a script that requires following.

2.4.2 The female gaze

Feminism has many facets, activism is one of the prominent ones. However feminism has an intellectual engagement too in terms of challenging the epistemological practices present in academic research. Feminism is not a movement that is in agreement with itself either historically or theoretically, however all waves and kinds of feminism have some core values. Questioning unequal social norms, and tackling patriarchal domination, harmful social norms and gender inequality are some of the main issues feminism has been addressing (Pankhurst, 1913; Mackay, 2015). While different feminists may not agree on the causal factors or what constitutes gender, particularly the female gender, it does offer challenges to social inequality. The aim of a feminist methodology is not to claim power but to decentre it and resist it. This is a constant struggle and is an ongoing strategy, which is why there is no fixed feminist agenda. The issues of Indian women are in some cases maybe dissimilar to women elsewhere, however the challenge to patriarchy remains

---

6 A common myth about feminism is that women are trying to become more powerful than men or trying to deny them power. This has often led people to assume feminism is dangerous to hetronormative structures (Saunders, 2011).
the same, only the inequalities differ. However cultural relativism should not be used as a means of protecting oppression or being beyond critique (Chibber, 2014).

As described by Letherby (2003), feminist psychology takes the stance of the activist and situates the researched subject at par with the researcher. This methodology then not only challenges the production of knowledge but also the stance of the researcher who produces it. In the course of this thesis I have referred to myself several times in the first person to situate myself within these discourses. I have not been neutral in this process. I have been aware of what Gunaratnam and Lewis (2001) term as ‘emotional labour’ while writing. This labour in writing has been produced by experiences of anger, fear and shame. All of these emotions are corrosive as pointed out by Lorde (1984). These emotions have been learnt through histories of abuse and suppression. These emotions have been deployed in my writing, they are a part of an epistemology that has been created for me and my resistance to it. To dismiss feminism and its influence in writing as purely emotional would be a mistake. In present times, femininity has been relegated to the emotional sphere and masculinity elevated to a position of rationality (Conway, 2000). This devaluing of emotions can be observed in the way subalterns are written about as the hysterical other. Images of women and women of colour are often negatively tied to emotionality, their protests a sign of their pathology (Childs, 2005).

Unlike a quantitative method that is validated through constant repetition, a feminist methodology is aware of shifting power bases constantly redefining its own boundaries. As defined by Weir (2008) feminism attacks moving targets, it is not a static force but constantly challenging patriarchy, realising that the changes asked for (by feminists) do not necessarily imply that patriarchal oppression will simply disappear. In the case of this thesis, this is clear in the way language has been
assimilated and made into a weapon to be used against women.

2.4.3  \textit{Necessity of a feminist methodology}

This thesis is focused on women; a feminist methodology can help in exploring where the discontents lie. The aim of grounding the analysis in feminism is to challenge existing power differentials and write from the view of those at the margins. Issues rarely written or spoken about need to be brought into public attention. Women are not a minority numerically speaking, however they are a minority when it comes to participation and representation. This is an issue that has been highlighted by feminist scholars and women in various fields in and out of academia. Injustices committed against women make them vulnerable and can keep them from participating in social situations (Hacker, 1951). From the major issues like crimes against women to everyday micro-aggressions, women face the issue of marginalisation (Pankhurst, 1913; LeGates, 2012; Capodilupo et al, 2010).

It is necessary to remember these injustices are not pervasive or limiting. These oppressions need to be understood in cultural contexts and also with regard to societal liberation (Gupta, 1997). Decentring academia is important and especially psychology has been critiqued for being centred around white Anglo American males (Doucet and Mauthener, 2006). The power imbalance affects the way the discipline views the subaltern by leaving an entire demographic on the margins. The challenge does not end with indigenising psychology alone. Indian psychology for instance is still centred around the upper class/ caste subject. The aim is to bring issues seldom mentioned other than in passing to the forefront. Writers such as Nandy and Chatterjee have courted controversy in the last few years for speaking for the subalterns while not belonging to that class (Chibber, 2014).
The lack of representation and silence from one quarter implies as much inequality as does writing about the subject. It is easy to think of Indian women as constantly oppressed with no context to culture and history. Even within these silences there are protests which refuse to go away. Indian women are not all passive or all oppressed to think of that way gives in to patriarchal notions of femininity. Easily dismissed as a mere cultural phenomena or as an other, the plight of Indian women is no different from women elsewhere. It must also be remembered that Indian women are not invisible, the backlash in some cases comes out of women asserting themselves and challenging patriarchy. The rise of social activism in subaltern and urban India has led to the dominant classes/castes reacting to the change of power (Stephen, 2013).

A feminist methodology implies an equal participation of the subaltern written from the perspective of those on the margins pointing out structural inequality. Feminism and a feminist methodology are not about women alone but about challenging patriarchal oppressions and how they affect both genders in relation to social systems. This applies to films too, which are a reflection and reproduction of society. While women are portrayed on screen, visibility alone is not the goal. As Chow (2013) pointed out, visibility can be a trap. This can be observed in neoliberal arguments about choice and increased participation. However participation alone is not an answer, as pointed out by the Bechdel test which attempts to challenge the way women are portrayed on screen. The same holds true for Bollywood which does

---

7 Introduced in 1985 in the comic strip *Dykes to Watch Out For* (strip titled *The Rule*) by Alison Bechdel. An unnamed female character says that she only watches a movie if it satisfies the following requirements: 1 - It has to have at least two women in it, 2 - who talk to each other and, 3 - About something besides a man. The test in no way is an indicator of feminist content. However very few Hollywood films pass this test. It would be interesting to note how this test could be applied to non Anglo American cinema. (See Appendix B - The Bechdel test)
have women characters and as background dancers but they are characterised by their silence or lack of action. The issue is not of greater participation or the actors’ choice in participation but in colluding and reinforcing patriarchal notions of femininity. hooks (2014) argues this idea of visibility with regard to the exercise of one’s choice resulting in the collusion with ongoing oppressive forces. Her example of Beyonce on the cover of Time Magazine⁸ is sexualised and opens up questions about race and gender oppressions, leading to Foucauldian arguments of power and how entrenched the subject of the gaze can be in their own oppression. In the case of Bollywood films, the same language (empowerment and choice) is used by actresses who play roles that call for sexualisation. Patriarchy is not a power concentrated in men alone but in institutions and systems, its agents are also its victims.

Anzaldúa (1999) uses culture to point out how patriarchal dominance works its way into everyday life and also as a system of social dominance. The term culture and what it symbolises will be critiqued in subsequent chapters:

Culture forms our beliefs. We perceive the version of reality that it communicates. Dominant paradigms, predefined concepts that exist as unquestionable, unchallengeable, are transmitted to us through the culture. Culture is made by those in power - men. Males make the rules and laws; women transmit them. How many times have I heard mothers and mothers-in-law tell their sons to beat their wives for not obeying them, for being hocicomas (big mouths), for being callajeras (going to visit and gossip with

---

⁸ Popular singer Beyonce appeared on the cover of Time magazine (May 2014) in her underwear. This was a subject of bell hook’s discussion ‘Are You Still a Slave?: Liberating the Black Female Body’ (2014). This discussion was promptly critiqued on social media and lead to heated discussions about being able to use one’s sexuality to one’s advantage and of how black women’s sexuality is represented.
neighbors), for expecting their husbands to help with the rearing of children and the housework, for wanting to be something other than housewives?

(Anzaldúa, 1999:16)

Neoliberal feminism is a success in this respect as it makes women believe they are participating in liberation, all the while colluding with patriarchy of their own accord (Walter, 2010). It relies on the idea that everybody has a choice to make and those choices are free from social and political entanglements.

2.5. Intersectionality

In the previous chapter the necessity of intersectionality was highlighted; this chapter will look at how the theoretical standpoints chosen for analysis are also informed by an intersectional approach. Feminism, post-colonialism and anti racism form the bedrock of this thesis. Keeping the diverse nature of subjects and methodologies in mind the methodology also takes into account the intersectional nature of the theoretical frameworks being presented. Feminism and post colonialism are both stances that challenge power relations by pointing out the nature of power and the structures that enable it to pervade everyday life.

Intersectionality reflects a commitment neither to subjects nor to identities per se but, rather, to marking and mapping the production and contingency of both. Nor is the theory an effort to identify, in the abstract, an exhaustive list of intersectional social categories and to add them up to determine—once and for all—the different intersectional configurations those categories can form.

(Carbado, 2013:6)

The women I met in the rehabilitation centre and the ones discussed in this thesis
embody multiple identities each one gaining and losing prominence in different social functions. Nayak (2014) speaks of a psychology as a tool of normalising and even erasing marginalised voices. Speaking of black women’s experiences she examines the dominant forces that exclude and eventually label dissent as madness. Intersectionality then becomes a method of excavating the origins of powerful structures that weigh down on marginalised groups unearthing layers of social discrimination. Christensen and Jensen (2012) define intersectional approaches in research as a point of departure.

To us, intersectionality is an analytical concept that is useful for analysing and understanding differences and multiple inequalities in contemporary societies at both the macro- and the micro-level. But the method of practising intersectionality must be related to power relations, in particular locations and contexts. In other words, there is more than one way of doing intersectional analysis.

(Christensen and Jensen, 2012:121)

Speaking of Indian women in the present era entails contextualising their struggles within their history. Indian women who use psychoactive substances are subjected to violence that is tied to ideas of femininity, national identity and modernity. It is a combination of these issues that will be spoken about in the chapters that will follow.

One of the key issues in this thesis is to examine the interaction between several factors that create social advantage and disadvantage. Identity is complex, often made up of several facets. Some aspects of identity put an individual at a social disadvantage; a combination of marginalised identities put individuals at further risk of exclusion. An example in recent history is the way that the feminist and anti racist
movement historically excluded women of colour from their agenda (Lorde, 1985; Phoenix and Pattynama, 2006). Both movements spoke from a position of relative power for individuals who were powerless, yet they never cut across boundaries of class, race, sexuality or disability. Lorde points out the dilemmas:

I was born Black and a woman. I am trying to become the strongest person I can become to live the life I have been given and to help effect change toward a livable future for this earth and for my children. As a Black, lesbian, feminist, socialist, poet, mother of two including one boy and member of an interracial couple, I usually find myself part of some group in which the majority defines me as deviant, difficult, inferior or just plain "wrong".

From my membership in all of these groups I have learned that oppression and the intolerance of difference come in all shapes and sizes and colors and sexualities; and that among those of us who share the goals of liberation and a workable future for our children, there can be no hierarchies of oppression.

(Lorde, 1983:9)

Reducing marginality to a single issue forces an individual to choose allegiances and also undermines the nature of the struggle against dominant forces. The term ‘intersectionality’ was coined by Crenshaw in 1989, in response to issues black women in the USA faced when it came to employment (Crenshaw, 1989, 1991). Despite the term only coming into common usage in the late 1980s, the issue was noted earlier by black feminists who faced exclusion from mainstream feminism on grounds of race. Yuval-Davis (2006) points out that the idea of multilayered oppression was not alien to black feminist struggles prior to the naming of the theory. The invisibility of black women was felt in many feminist and Marxist circles in Britain, with a need for acknowledging multiple oppressive forces acting on
Intersectionality responds to the demands put forward by those who cannot disassociate themselves from multiple identities, which when combined cause a series of multi-dimensional oppressions. However, Davis points out that intersectionality is a vague term that resists definition: ‘Some suggest that intersectionality is a theory, others regard it as a concept or heuristic device, and still others see it as a reading strategy for doing feminist analysis.’ (Davis, 2008:68). It is this precise ambiguity that gives intersectionality the power to become transformative and allows for it to be used in a variety of ways.

While the concept was born out of black feminist struggles it finds a use in different types of feminism. Dalit feminists would employ a similar methodology to point out their subaltern position in Indian society. In the case of this thesis, three distinct identities are interrogated - ideal womanhood, addict identity and Indian identity. Addicts are diagnosed on several social criteria - race, class, gender, affluence, ethnicity, religious identity and sexuality. Gender excludes women from accessing services designed for men; it also pathologises them on the basis of their gender identity. Nationality plays a part in the way in which national identity is attributed to drugs and alcohol used in political manoeuvring. As we will see in the following chapters, women in India are expected to conform to certain gender roles; their class, caste, ethnicity and religious identity create causes for violence. Violence is enacted on all these aspects of identity. To merely speak for a unified feminist action would undermine the specific demands of women which may appear contradictory to the aims of feminism. Taking for example the issue of coercive abortions, while feminism advocates reproductive autonomy, in many parts of India those rights are not available to women who would take a pro-life stance (Sudha and Rajan, 1999).
Sex selective abortion remains a grim reality in India and maternal choices are limited (Arnold et al, 2002). In this case class, location, caste and social status then influence the feminist stance. Intersectionality does not reduce the subject to abject marginality alone but allows for multiple narratives to develop. Nash (2008) argues for a more nuanced notion of intersectional issues to be taken into consideration, to provide a space for reclaiming power. Given this information on intersectionality, interrogating social oppression based on several facets of identity becomes essential in challenging systems that use division as a means of social control.

2.6. **Indian psychology**

It is inevitable that the discipline of psychology is imbued with these forces of dominance. Psychology and American psychology in particular has been criticised for being dominated by white male values (Shefer et al, 1997). This is the same psychology that is widely exported globally. Psychology in India is influenced greatly by American psychology (Kumar, 2006). While the critiques of such psychology have led to the development of indigenous psychology, both of them fail to capture the present and local narratives. Both these bodies of knowledge are based in power and are elitist (Kumar, 2006). With a constant need to medicalise, Indian psychology is not far from its western counterparts. While the presentations might differ, the need to pathologise remains the same. Indigenous psychology which presents itself as an alternative to a western understanding of the mind makes an arbitrary inference about who is indigenous (Bhatia, 2010).

If women feature in these narratives at all, it is as powerless subjects. Studies on women and addiction in India focus on women of marginalised positions (Grover et al, 2005; Kumar et al, 2008). Their class used against them, these women are written
about as the powerless other. Urban middle class women are missing from this narrative. One can interpret this as an act of collusion whereby women of means are ignored in order to protect them, or as a way of not acknowledging their non-conformity. Either way the silence in academia is met by a ferocious noise about women violating Indian culture on the streets. In the public sphere women are unsafe, their position in academia is tied to the domestic sphere a challenge the women’s movement is attempting to combat (Patel, 1998).

Views about Bollywood have been changing from being tied to socialist values with a didactic message, to a producer of popular films with very little challenging content, to a cultural landmark which produces glossy images of present day India (Ahmed, 2015). The exploitation of women on screen has changed too. The idea of coercion has now been turned, women on screen are using their own volition to generate these images. As McRobbie (2009) points out, these images are thought of as being created for the pleasure of the female subject herself. Sublimated and assimilated into acceptable form, ideas of feminism have been incorporated into how women’s choices are thought to be neutral and emerging from within the individual as opposed to society.

A critique of Bollywood must question the distortion of power. The use of the concepts of empowerment and economic freedom are often cited by female actors as a reason for the work they do. Exploitation is no longer a part of the narrative, however choice is. Lorde (1984) questions these pseudo freedoms given by the oppressor:

In order to perpetuate itself, every oppression must corrupt or distort those various sources of power within the culture of the oppressed that can provide
energy for change.

(Lorde, 1984:53)

She goes on to speak of the suppressing of the erotic in women in favour of the pornographic. This crude understanding of feminity and feminine sexuality is one that is routinely criticised by feminists. The pinning down of sexuality as a sensation without emotion, as Lorde terms it, is used against women to prove their inferiority. This is clearly the case given that the public and male attitude towards women in India is far from satisfactory:

We have been taught to suspect this resource, vilified, abused, and devalued within western society. On the one hand, the superficially erotic has been encouraged as a sign of female inferiority; on the other hand, women have been made to suffer and to feel both contemptible and suspect by virtue of its existence. It is a short step from there to the false belief that only by the suppression of the erotic within our lives and consciousness can women be truly strong. But that strength is illusory, for it is fashioned within the context of male models of power.

(Lorde, 1984:53)

2.7. Discourse analysis

Language is not only descriptive, but also an active method of constructing the world around us. It is instrumental in giving birth to ideas and also maintaining order. It is perhaps the most ubiquitous source of analysis available. Language is tied to power and identity which is perhaps why it is constantly being (re) constructed. Parker (2005) argues that language takes on multiple roles and that what is stated is just as important as what is not stated. I think that the other way round is more telling. Not
following a straight trajectory, there are contradictions in the way it is formed and used.

For example, a discourse of heterosexuality defines what is deviant, a medical discourse defines what is sick and a dominant patriotic discourse defines what is alien. Within each discourse there are, of course, contradictions, and the way the discourse is constructed in specific texts will mean that it functions in favour of certain power relations, or perhaps against them.

(Parker, 2005:90)

History plays a vital role in these constructions of language and categories. However as Shivji (2003: online) points out ‘The contemporary neo-liberal discourse has one fundamental blind spot. It treats the present as if the present has had no history.’ Erasing history is also fundamentally altering how we see ourselves, it also has the power of neutralising debate. Anzaldúa (1999) compares the suppression of language as an act of terrorism against people. She terms these phenomena as ‘linguistic terrorism’. This suppression can be seen in how we speak of women who use alcohol or drugs. They are written about in a manner that distances them from middle class India, either as poor Dalit women who live in isolated villages or as affluent women who are cut off by their wealth (Rajoria, 2013).

If the act of speaking a certain kind of language is to be analysed, so is the language used to describe it. To use a neo liberal term ‘choices’ must be analysed, why a certain number of choices have come into existence must be interrogated. The consequences of those choices and whom they benefit must be interrogated. Creating identity and ascribing characteristics to those individuals or groups categorises them in relation to the norm. The Spanish speaking Anzaldúa becomes an aberration to a
Discourse analysis goes beyond the basic text, examining it in context, looking at the several meanings that can be attributed to it. Context is essential in understanding the construction of the text and also how it helps produce a context. Text that is analysed using this method is varied ranging from advertisements to books to popular songs (Georgakopoulou, and Dionysis, 1997). This analysis can be taken further and entities such as nations and national identities could be read through discourse produced on the subject (Wodak, 2015).

Parker (2013) has traced out eight different approaches to discourse analysis.

1. **Conversation Analysis.** As the name suggests this approach is concerned with the form of talk as opposed to content. It is limited in its approach however it is a valuable method for studying the trajectories of conversation.

2. **Ethnomethodology.** The term was first coined by Garfinkel (1967), who claimed it was not intended to be a corrective method, instead the intent was to reveal how privilege worked within social groups. The term refers to the systematic description of the methods and practises used by particular socio-cultural groups within their everyday activities.

3. **Narrative Analysis.** This method of discourse analysis attempts to develop a sequence of events and a linear pattern to life stories. The temporal aspects of a narrative are acknowledged as is the subjective nature. Linking it to narrative therapy, narrative analysis becomes an extension allowing for the active participation of research subjects.

4. **Thematic Analysis.** Unlike narrative analysis where a linear pattern is
established thematic analysis focuses on linking similar data together to build on common patterns. Data is grouped under commonly occurring patterns, analysis is based on the reoccurrence of those patterns.

5. **Critical Discourse Analysis.** Described as being ‘within linguistics’ the position of the researcher is called into question. Taking into account the researchers’ interpretation and political allegiances this approach can be assumed to provide radical explanations of social oppression.

6. **Foucauldian Discourse Analysis.** As the name suggests this method of analysis owes its foundation to Michel Foucault. Situating an argument in history this method traces how power and ideology operate in different social systems. Using the work of Foucault as a theoretical basis discourse is analysed.

7. **Semiotic Analysis.** Semiotics is considered to be a science of signs (Danesi, 2004). Often used to decode images this form of analysis is not limited to visual material alone. This method has a strong association with Psychoanalysis.

8. **Political Discourse Theory.** As stated in the description this approach attends to the text through the deployment of political theories. It attempts to bring the political such as Marxism and the subjective such as Psychoanalysis together.

Using these approaches as guidelines to build upon and develop methodologies the emphasis is on acknowledging subjectivity. Discourse analysis as theorised by Parker (2013) as flexible in its approach and open to newer social innovations. In the case of this thesis, films and everyday violence will be analysed. Borrowing from each of the
approaches mentioned above issues of gender, power, politics, nation and pathology will be examined.

Bollywood cinema has been written of as formulaic and surreal. The addition of songs and dance in the film is often thought of as a bizarre method of storytelling. However theorists such as Dwyer, Kakar and Nandy see this formula as deeply embedded in the Indian mindset. To the average Bollywood fan, they argue, this style is a language of its own decoded by the viewer. Discourse about cinema and Indian cinema is not a new endeavour, neither is it exhaustive. The use of language and visual tropes lends itself to the subject of discourse analysis, as it is a deliberate employment of knowledge, culture, power and ideology to convey meaning (Foucault, 1977, 1981, 2006).

Powers (2001) argues that discourse analysis is a not only a post-modern methodology but also a feminist one. The use of discourse analysis in discussion about gender and feminism has been noted by other theorists such as Burman (2003).

Pointing out how contradictions and political ramifications of a text are analysed, Powers, like Parker, calls for flexibility whilst using this method. Taking this flexibility further Van Dijk (2006) points out that discourse analysis is not limited to one particular discipline or one method. Section 2.8 outlines the chief form of analysis used in this study.

2.8. Thematic analysis

One of the chief methods of analysis of the data in this thesis is thematic. This involves identifying patterns or themes that reoccur in the data. Aronson (1995:1) describes thematic analysis as a ‘focus on identifiable themes and patterns of living
and/or behavior’.

Going further four steps are identified by Aronson in the process of conducting thematic analysis-

- Collecting data.
- Identifying data that relates to classified patterns.
- Combining and cataloguing related patterns into sub-themes.
- Building an argument for choosing the themes.

While the process might appear simple it involves a close reading of the text with a purpose in mind requires noticing patterns and building up categories. The method is not strictly defined and is flexible in its approach, which Holloway and Todres (2003) suggested does not affect the coherence of the material being analysed. Citing methodolatory (Janesick, 2000) as a drawback they argue methodology should be made to fit around the data and moves between the micro and macro. Going a step further Braun and Clarke (2006) argue that thematic analysis should be seen as foundational to qualitative analysis as it is a building block for other kinds of qualitative analysis. Discourse analysis is also used in this thesis which aims to compliment the thematic analysis and not provide a separate analysis.

Thematic analysis had been described as ‘... a poorly demarcated, rarely-acknowledged, yet widely-used qualitative analytic method within psychology’ (Braun and Clarke, 2006:2). Despite this ambiguity, Braun and Clarke go on to describe the stages of how this analysis should occur:

- Familiarising yourself with your data.
- Generating initial codes.
• Searching for themes.
• Reviewing themes.
• Defining and naming themes.
• Producing the report.

It would be wrong to assume that the lack of definition would make this method less rigorous. While on the one hand the method is flexible, the method for coding and drawing themes requires a rigorous approach to the data (Tuckett, 2005; Fereday and Muir-Cochrane, 2008).

In chapter six a detailed look is taken at a number of Indian films that span a fifty year period. It could be argued that the films all differ in terms of style, plot and content; made in different eras, each is grounded within its own time period. However, despite the overt differences in plots, the films share similarities when it comes to depicting certain issues. These issues may not be immediately apparent to the casual viewer who merely watches the films for entertainment. To the critical eye though, viewing and reviewing these films with the aim of studying social problems makes apparent issues often ignored or taken to be artistic licence. Viewing cinema allows the observer to understand a series of images which have come to imply ideas, even if only obliquely hinted at.

Bollywood, like any other cinematic style, has developed patterns that are common and which help give the genre its distinctiveness. When viewed for a specific purpose, common themes emerge from the films. This satisfies one of the key requirements of thematic analysis, the identification of reoccuring patterns within data (Aronson, 1994).
Themes are general propositions that emerge from diverse and detail-rich experiences of participants and provide recurrent and unifying ideas regarding the subject of inquiry. Themes typically evolve not only from the conceptual codes and subcodes as in the case of taxonomy but also from the relationship codes, which tag data that link concepts to each other.

(Bradley et al, 2007:766)

The patterns observed within the selected films found their way into categories and sub-categories. The themes are both a priori and inductive in nature. While some of the themes were obvious in a casual viewing of the film others were written about extensively (Dudrah & Dudrah, 2012; Dwyer, 2010; Uberoi, 1998). However there are still other themes that have emerged through my reading of the films and are unique to this thesis. For example the previous literature has looked at gender in regards to the nation, I have extended this to include the consumption of alcohol and drugs. This thesis is based in feminist ideology, hence representation of gender is seen as a strong theme and one that focuses on the roles women play in Bollywood. The focus of study on alcohol and drug consumption prompted a second theme surrounding the way in which these substances found their way on screen. An important third theme concerns the influence of the nation and national identity upon the characters within the films, and how these characters consequently act as agents of the state.

The films are presented in chronological order, but they are also written about thematically. Establishing the historical sequence of the films helps contextualise them within a timeframe. However, presenting them in terms of themes helps track the progression of history and the changes in representation of social problems over the decades. The interactions between gender, nationality and alcohol/drug use
produce several themes and sub-themes. Development of these themes and establishment of their context was aided by looking at the unfolding of current events and researching within public domain data sources. This technique is not new to feminist research (Skinner, 2013).

2.9. Why representation matters

One of the primary concerns of this thesis is the issue of representation. Misrepresentation would be a more appropriate term to describe the interrogative stance employed. The issue is of importance as it relates to how groups or individuals are perceived by themselves and by others. Challenging the idea of a post feminist world, McKay (2014) questions how this could be possible, as representations of women are still embedded in patriarchy. Questioning representation requires knowledge of one’s position, as the position of the author has a role to play in the reading of subtexts (hooks, 1997). hooks is critical of narratives that are too easily defined as liberating, questioning the agency of the participants and creators of images.

It would be easy to dismiss the idea that representation does not influence attitudes. One could point out that violence on screen is not recreated immediately by the audience leaving the cinema hall. Yet the threat posed by mass media in influencing behaviour remains strong (Pennell and Browne, 1999). A strong critique of representation comes from feminism, which questions the power structures that create images where characters are sexualised and objectified. Hall (1997) stresses the importance of representation in the production of culture and in creating a shared meaning. Representation then is not a matter of simply producing images but one that is immersed in context and vested in power. The practise of representation to
Hall (2011) is one of producing images that have been normalised which Hall argues must be constantly challenged and their origin questioned. In later chapters some of these normalised images will be discussed. Keeping the research question in mind the role of representation becomes vital in understanding how images of women on screen influence the way they are mistreated off screen.

Similarly bell hooks (1997) argues against trivialising the impact of representation, claiming pop culture is deliberate in its choices of representation. That which is purported to be radical in cinema is often merely a reaffirmation of what hooks describes as ‘white-supremacist-capitalist-patriarchy’. Here lies the difference between feminist articulations of representation and social psychology. The issue is not that the grand acts of violence will be replicated, but that the subtext of dehumanising acts on screen is to legitimise violence in certain contexts. Everyday observations from cinema demonstrate that some patterns are frequently repeated. A common Hollywood trope is one where the black man dies first. Although challenged and critiqued, this trope is not far from a reality in parts of the United States where black men are regularly the target of police brutality. The same media sexualises women, their roles are often narrow and conforming to patriarchal fantasies (hooks, 1994).

Cinematic eugenics is at play in the way in which characters meet their deaths and are eliminated on screen. Supremacy is established by allowing the most socially desirable characters to live through to the end of the film, this points towards the deep prejudices that exist in society. Cinema maintains a status quo by revealing to us what most of us already believe about people. Similarly the erasure of diversity within the characters on screen is problematic. Both of these tendencies affirm the superiority of certain groups of people.
In the case of Indian cinema, the heroic characters are almost always upper caste, Hindu, male, northern, affluent and noble. The women of screen share the same characteristics, except they are also expected to be demure and open to the advances of the heroic male. Diversity in caste and ethnicity have been erased from mainstream cinema. An example would be a recent film made about the life of Boxer Mary Kom, where the lead role was played by actress Priyanka Chropa, who is from mainland India and is of a different ethnicity to Mary Kom (Bipin, 2014). Ethnicity, gender and religion make the real Mary Kom a minority. The erasure of this identity on screen reflects the way in which the people of the northeast tend to be excluded from the larger Indian society. This was the first time that a film was based upon the life of a woman from the northeast, but it failed to give complete justice to her story.

*Cultural hegemony is never about pure victory or pure domination (that's not what the term means; it is never a zero-sum cultural game; it is always about shifting the balance of power in the relations of culture; it is always about the dispositions and the configurations of cultural power, not getting out of it.\(^\text{10}\)\(^\text{10}\)*

(Tail, 1993; 106-107)

Taking Hall’s argument into consideration, the issue of representation does not end with mere screen presence alone. Hall is more optimistic about media being a transformative platform. It should be understood in a similar way to feminism, which has been described as transformational. Constantly changing sociopolitical landscapes create shifts in culture, and media tunes into these changes to create images that attempt to present new ideas. However, more often than not the attempt

---

\(^9\) Mangte Chungneijang Mary Kom, commonly known just as Mary Kom, is an accomplished Indian boxing champion who won a bronze medal at the 2012 Summer Olympics. She has been nicknamed Magnificent Mary. The 2014 film *Mary Kom* is based on her life.
results in the reaffirmation of existing prejudices.

2.10. Conclusion

This chapter examined in detail the theoretical frameworks that form the basis of this thesis. The following chapter presents the socio-political structures that shape India and trace its current form through nationalist thought emerging in the nineteenth century. Since this thesis is based on the lives of Indian women, it is necessary to contextualise the society they live in. Indian nationalism is an issue that is constantly critiqued throughout the remaining chapters following its trajectory and consequences becomes essential in furthering our understanding of how social boundaries exerted by a nation become a source of violence for women. Keeping the theoretical frameworks in mind, the other chapters will analyse the data utilized in this thesis.
CHAPTER 3

3 Mapping out India

Oh but this whole country is full of lies
You're all gonna die and die like flies
I don't trust you any more
You keep on saying "Go slow!"
"Go slow!"

But that's just the trouble
"do it slow"
Desegregation
"do it slow"
Mass participation
"do it slow"
Reunification
"do it slow"
Do things gradually
"do it slow"
But bring more tragedy
"do it slow"

Nina Simone, Mississippi Goddam

Before one looks at the discourse about India it is essential to know its history and trace out its geographic, historical and social boundaries. The nation state as we know it in the 21st century has different borders than it did a century ago. Formed by a violent partition during the last days of British rule it is still haunted by memories of that division, and over the decades this incident has been turned into nationalistic propaganda (Khan, 2007). One often thinks of partition as a loss of land, however it
was a genocide which saw the deliberate use of violence while rarely written about, partition still symbolises a loss to many Indians, it is spoken about in families quietly. My family has not been immune to this either, the loss of family and home have haunted relatives who mourned for family they knew nothing about after independence. However the generation that suffered from that division is dying, my generation is raised on nationalistic narratives that demands a reunification. The rise of a secular left wing in this turbulent time attempted to bring peace to a nation that was caught in what were to become three nations. This secularism, Nandy (2007) tells us, is dissimilar to western secularism which is atheistic. Indian secularism is still grounded in religion but a speaks of plurality and embracing difference (Bhatia, 2011). Black and white post independence cinema reflects this secularism. Challenging harmful practise in religions it maintained the loving forgiving nature of god, a revolutionary idea of religion was born, one which respected all religions. Nandy (2010) argues that the rise of right wing violence is based in western secularism and one which is internalised by fundamentalists in India who have lost their connection to a more tolerant past. Citing a feeling of inferiority as a reason for this growing nationalism and reinvention of the past, growing tension in the region is understood to be a creation of the educated, affluent classes (Nandy, 2010).

3.1. **Indian nationalism and other maladies**

Benedict Anderson (2006) in his seminal work on nationalism traces the birth of nationalism to print capitalism. Defining the sense of solidarity one feels with a group or a nation as an imagined community, Anderson defines this group as imagined as every member of the group does not agree upon the conditions that create a sense of solidarity. Community and nation are defined through its social and psychological boundaries rather than its physical boundaries. It is the idea of these
psychological communities that form the basis of his work. Tracing the origins of nationalism to print capitalism in 17th century Europe, Anderson challenges histories of nationhood. While a common national language created a sense of distinction it did not take into account the intranational narratives which contradicted the idea of the unified nation. Anderson’s work provides the basis of several critiques of nationalism. Anderson’s work while Eurocentric has inspired others to use the notion of imagined communities

A critique of Anderson’s work comes from Partha Chatterjee who explores the concept of Indian nationalism from the nineteenth century. In his essay ‘Whose Imagined Community’ Chaterjee questions the agency given to the postcolonial subject in writing their own history.

I have one central objection to Anderson’s argument. If nationalisms in the rest of the world have to choose their imagined community from certain “modular forms” already made available to them by Europe and the Americas, what do they have left to imagine? History, it would seem, has decreed that we in the postcolonial world shall only be perpetual consumers of modernity.

(Chatterjee, 1993:5)

Claims that Indian nationalism is not merely an imitation of western nationalism giving nationalists agency for their ideology are also to be found in the work of Dirks (1993) and Van Der Veer (1998), both of whom question the role of upper caste Indians in colluding with the British in creating notions of what constituted the Indian identity. Arguments raised by this critique are still valid in India today as Dalit scholars continually question notions of nationhood as proposed by upper caste scholars. Providing a nuanced idea of the origins of Indian nationalism Chatterjee
provides an extensive framework of how Indian nationalism emerged within a colonial context.

While nationalism across the world shares some common features its origins and outward manifestations differ. Van de Veer (1994) in his analysis on Indian nationalism looks at nuanced and deeply idiosyncratic nationalism that is prevalent in India. Noting the religious overtones present in Indian nationalism he analyses the way in which Indian identity and nationalism are shaped by the notion of the ‘Hindu nation’. Giving agency to Indian nationalists he claims both secular and religious nationalists construct the nation through a fixed understanding. Critiquing the idea that divisions did not exist in pre-colonial India he examines how secular nationalism denies agency to religious nationalism. The resurgence of chauvinistic ethnic and religious nationalism in the present is claimed to be a product of pre independence India which has gained momentum in the 1980s (Bhatt, 2001). Challenging the assumptions put forward by Nandy on pre colonial communal harmony Thapar (1989) presents a case of imagined religious communities tracing back the notion of what constituted the Hindu identity and how that notion has been shifting through time. Adapting to political and economic changes in what constitutes Hindu identity Thapar concludes is about extending and receding border tracing the nation through its ancient past.

Indian nationalism is unique in its emphasis of the Hindu identity as being central to the Indian identity (Swamy, 2003). A non-Hindu is often assumed to be a traitor whose history is presented as destructive to national interests. The presence of other religious and political identities can only be a threat to the one identity of the idealised Indian/Hindu. This identity comes from establishing the non-Hindu other as a foreigner who came to India to plunder or to convert. While constitutionally India
is a secular nation with an equal respect for all religions, socially this is not true. This attitude is rooted in a culture and tradition that can be traced back centuries. Using decolonisation as its basis, it attempts to reclaim ‘lost culture’ and restore it. The colonisers in this discourse are Muslims and Christians whose regional and religious identities make them outsiders and distorts their histories (Mani, 2015; Omvedt and Patankar, 2012). To Dalit scholars the presence of the colonial ruler and non-Hindu religions represent an alternative. What Nandy and Kakar would term as a loss of identity and culture is in fact Dalit liberation (Ramdas, 2015; Semmalar, 2014). Take for example the introduction of the breast cloth which covered Dalit women to put them at par with upper caste women, thereby according them the same dignity (Hardgrave, 1968; Lukose, 2005; Karthick 2015). Often written about as Western, Christian interference in India, these challenges to caste dominance have been thought of as ethnocentrisms. These so called losses of culture must be examined in context. One community’s loss can mean the emancipation of another community.

The sari must also be mentioned here. Often promoted as the national dress, the sari has come to occupy religious, ethnic and national territory. While it can be an impractical dress, the wearing of the sari is insisted upon in certain institutions as formal wear for women. Its use is often justified on the basis that it is feminine, traditional and aesthetic (Tharoor, 2007). In its present form the sari is a product of Indian nationalism (Wilton, 2012). It is also a dress that was denied to lower caste women. The aesthetic qualities of the dress is often emphasised to gently remind women to be wrapped in it. Coercion, like the sari, is wrapped up in femininity. There is a deeper explanation of this argument that is based on caste and cheap labour. Workers from the lower castes are employed in this industry to create ‘traditional’ art forms yet their labours are not paid for (Kuffir, 2013). Sari’s are a
twofold form of exploitation both of which affect women adversely.

This insistence upon a gendered national dress, Duara (1998) claims, is tied to national reconstructions of the idealised woman. Men in India are seldom expected to wear a national dress, there is little societal regulation of their clothing choice. Viewed through a larger structure of post colonialism, in positioning the sari as national dress, the history behind the dress in its present form is lost. Tied to modesty, wearing a sari is thought to afford women safety (NDTV India, 2015). Despite the propaganda the sari is not the only ‘traditional’ dress women in India wear, nor is its use limited to communities. Chatterjee (1986) is critical of both nationalism and colonisation. Nationalism he argues is a mechanism of resisting colonisation by creating a unique identity, tracing ethnocentrism within its very values terming this phenomena as national cultural regeneration. Decolonisation must be thought through carefully. While removing the psychological constraints added on by colonisation helps the nation move on, some aspects of colonisation have now become a part of India. Take for example the Anglo-Indian community, who owing to their dual heritage are discriminated against in areas of employment, religion and racially (Hedin, 1934). Future chapters will look at the precarious position this community occupies in India.

To decolonise India would amount to cutting one’s nose to spite the face. The history of these colonising groups is embedded in everyday culture as well as in the constitution of India. Attempts to decolonise and return to a pre-colonial age have led to acts of aggression and genocide. Colonial influences are present in language, dress, education and so many other systems that to remove them would cause more damage.
Decolonising is a commonly used term in academia in recent times. It attempts to erase the colonial legacy and restore pre-colonial systems. Removing colonial hegemonies is seen as necessary to reclaim what was lost. But what was lost? And how do we reclaim this without losing what we have gained with these colonial interventions? Decolonisation is often spoken about from the perspective of dominant castes, who have to contend with lower castes claiming the same rights as upper castes or attempting to bypass the caste hierarchy to achieve social mobility (Mani, 2012, 2015). History also suggests that the freedom struggle against the British was not a universal one, while nationalists would have us believe freedom implied liberation for everyone, sections of society (chiefly Dalit) allied themselves with the British (Omvedt and Patankar 2012).

Take for example the English language which is now central in all Indian communication, and attempts to remove it from the national school curriculum have led to violent protests. Hindi too is a language born out of colonialism and these are issues which are still contentious in India as hankering for a mythologised past still haunts us. To say that Indian nationalism is unique would pander to those who claim India is superior, however it shares elements common to all nationalisms, it only differs in the narratives it tells.

3.1.1 Saffronisation and its impact

The term ‘saffronisation’ is often used to denote the presence of right wing Hindu ideology in shaping or rewriting information. The colour saffron (a colour in the Indian flag and now a colour of Hindu fundamentalism) is meant to represent Hinduism, saffronisation is meant to convey a recolouring of events and history though a Hindu framework. A case in point would be the controversy surrounding
history textbooks in India.

The old socialist driven ideology that governed independent India began to give way towards the late 1980s. The 1990s saw the birth of economic liberalisation (Kohli, 2006). This liberalisation has been favoured by the two major political parties and has been accepted as being in the favour of the nation (Wadhva, 2004). It has been argued that this liberalisation is tied to the birth of a new wave Hindu nationalism (Corbridge and Harriss, 2000).

6th December 1992 saw the demolition of the Ram Janam Bhumi Babari Masjid (roughly translated as - Birthplace of Ram Masjid constructed by Barbur). The liberalising of the Indian economy was also a burgeoning time of violence in India. The destruction of the Babari Masjid is one that still haunts the Indian imagination as the conflict arising out the claims of ownership have not yet been resolved. The destruction of the Masjid, claimed both by Hindus and Muslims as a place of worship, was only the start of violence in the two communities. Amidst this carnage a new economy was taking root promising an end to national divisions envisioning a global citizenship that would showcase India as a nation on a par with any in the world (Oza, 2001) The riots that followed then and in subsequent years have not been forgotten. The idea that globalisation would erode local cultures and replace them with a uniform one has not gone unchallenged in India.

Both these movements, globalisation and right wing nationalism, should be seen as part of one process and not opposed to one another. Gopalakrishnan (2006) points out both ideologies reduce social process down to the individual and their choices. This opposition is born out of Hindutava ideology, proposed by the self confessed atheist V. D. Savarkar who coined the term and the ideology (Savarkar, 1969). So
while overtly Hindutava is anti caste it requires all converts to return to Hinduism. It asserts that Hindu culture is Indian culture which must therefore dominate over all other identities. That assertion is seen in the rewriting of textbooks and in the threats to artists\(^{10}\) who paint pictures of Hindu goddesses (Suroor, 2011). Myth is rapidly being established as fact, the rewriting of history is not a quest for reclaiming loss under colonialism but an instrument of delegitimising certain communities.

The textbooks, particularly of history, prescribed in these schools are so oriented to lend legitimacy to communal politics by stigmatising the ‘outsider’ and valourising the Hindu. In the process history is turned into myth, which tends to inculcate in the young minds a false sense of religious pride and hostility to the members of other denominations. Not only the entire cultural tradition is appropriated as Hindu, the past is represented as a saga of Hindu valour and bravery. In fact, the defeat of almost every Hindu ruler at the hands of an ‘outsider’ is reinterpreted as a victory.

(Panikkar, 2001:online)

In recent years Hindutava has been opposed, neo-liberalism has not. While on the one hand Hindutava is opposed to supposed ‘foreign individuals’ it is not opposed to foreign trade. There is a distinction between internal foreigners and external ones, between the material and the spiritual, between the domestic and the public. This often contradicts one’s image of India as a third world nation and as an emerging economy, the world’s largest democracy and growing censorship, between women working in space research and stories of brutality against women. The gendered

\(^{10}\) The reknowned Indian painter M F Husain (1915-2011) had criminal complaints filed against him, his artwork was vandalised and threats of bodily harm were made by right-wing Hindu fundamentalist groups (Lahiri, 2011).
aspect of these ideologies is not to be underestimated. Nandy (2010) sees the rise of these two movements as an inevitable consequence of the secular India of the past:

Secularism as an ideology can thrive only in a society that is predominantly non-secular. Once a society begins to get secularised or once the people begin to feel that their society is getting cleansed of religion and ideas of transcendence the political status of secularism changes.

(Nandy, 1998:284)

Elaborating further, Nandy goes on to examine the role modernity plays in the feelings of disenfranchisement that have emerged after independence:

For in the Indianness of Indians who are getting empowered lies, according to many learned scholars, the root cause of all the major problems of the country. ... It is the rage of Indians who have decultured themselves, seduced by the promises of modernity, and who now feel abandoned. With the demise of imperialism, Indian modernism - especially that subcategory of it which goes by the name of development - has failed to keep these promises.

(Nandy, 1998:293-294)

Nandy’s attribution of violence in south Asia has always maintained the loss of identity and culture at the heart of these ideologies. One can see the idea of Indian culture and religion as being restorative powers to combat ‘modern ideology’. While he maintains a distance from both secularism and fanaticism one cannot help but see similar ideas put forth by him on restorative Indian culture being used in nationalist discourse. While Nandy would argue for a more sophisticated notion of what Indian culture is, the nationalist would argue for a more anachronistic and comodified one. Like other theorists on this issue Nandy does not observe the gendered effects of this
movement or how women’s bodies are (ab)used by these ideologies. A reading of these narratives will let the reader assume that there are only two religions in India, only one of which is radicalised. Diversity in religious beliefs or lack of is paid scant attention.

3.1.2 Apartheid in the Northeast

The north east of India comprising of eight states (Arunachal Pradesh, Assam, Manipur, Meghalaya, Mizoram, Nagaland, Sikkim and Tripura) has been largely ignored by main India since independence (Nag, 2002). The region is spatially cut off from the rest of India (see Appendix C) which has also resulted in it being cut off economically and culturally (Das, 2007). It is rare to see the news from this region or see it represented in popular media. Occasional news from this region refers to insurgency or the drug trade (Goswami, 2014). Situated in the ‘Golden Triangle’, a region known for its opium trade, the association with drugs in this region is very strong leading to the stereotyping of individuals. To a majority of Indians living in the mainland there is a lack of awareness of the northeast’s socio political history and it is not uncommon for racist language to be used to describe people of this region (Bhattarai, 2014; Thounaojam, 2012). Derogatory terms such as ‘Chinky’ are often used to describe the people of this region as are other racial slurs. It was only in 2012 that the Ministry of Home Affairs ruled against the use of such derogatory language, with its use potentially leading to imprisonment up to five years (Sharma, 2012). Language used against the people of Northeast India is not only racist but also gendered, women from the North east are sexually harassed and often thought of as ‘easy’ in the rest of India (Golmei, 2013). This discrimination finds its way into everyday harassment and also into institutionalised neglect.
While Indian women (i.e. upper caste Hindu women) are presented as bearers of their culture, women from the northeast are presented as savages, promiscuous and servile at best (Gohain, 2014; Menon, 2010; Jilangamba, 2012). While society in the northeast region does allow women more autonomy it should also be remembered that most of their societies are matriarchal, matrilineal or at least less patriarchal than mainland India. The Indian state maintains a strong grip on the people of this region though punitive laws which affect women adversely. One such contentious law is The Armed Forces (Special Powers) Act (AFSPA) of 1958, an Act of Indian Parliament that grants the Indian Armed Forces powers in ‘disturbed areas’ of the county (Kamboj, 2004). Some of the powers given to the army by this act are listed below (Francis, 2011):

- Fire upon or otherwise use force, even to the causing of death, against any person who is acting in contravention of any law, against assembly of five or more persons, or possession of deadly weapons.

- To arrest without a warrant and with the use of "necessary" force anyone who has committed certain offenses or is suspected of having done so.

- To enter and search any premise in order to make such arrests.

- No legal consequences will be met by these officers who act under the law.

- For an area to be declared disturbed there must be a deterioration of the law and order situation in the area and the governor has the power to request the help of the central government to assist the state in maintaining it. Now the power to determine a disturbed area is also vested with the central government.
Brutality perpetrated in the name of this act against civilians especially women have been noted by human rights activists and government (Nigam, 2012; Sengupta, 2012). This act functions in the Northeast and also in Kashmir, in both of which it has been constantly challenged. Despite its unpopularity the act is not repealed on grounds that it would demoralise the armed forces, amongst other reasons. Challenges have been posed in the past by the women of this region but have rarely been reported extensively or acknowledged. However, protests from this region did gain the attention of the media recently - the indefinite fast by Irom Sharmila\textsuperscript{11} and a mass protest outside an Army base\textsuperscript{12} with women stripping off their clothes screaming ‘Indian Army, rape us too...’ (Srivastava, 2006; Gaikwad, 2009). Given this state sanctioned apartheid and violence it is no surprise that the northeast demands its autonomy.

\textsuperscript{11} Irom Chanu Sharmila, also known as the Iron Lady of Manipur, is a civil rights activist, political activist, and poet from the state of Manipur. On 2 November 2000 in the wake of the Malom Massacre which took the lives of 10 people she began her hunger strike which is still continuing, having refused food and water for more than 500 weeks (she is kept alive through force feeding).

\textsuperscript{12} Thangjam Manorama was a 32 year old Manipuri woman who was picked up from her home by a paramilitary unit 17\textsuperscript{th} Assam Rifles on July 10, 2004 for her alleged association with the People’s Liberation Army. Her bullet-ridden corpse was found in a field. An autopsy suggested rape and murder. Failure to assign culpability led to widespread and extended protests in Manipur and Delhi. On 15\textsuperscript{th} July 2004, around 30 middle-aged women aged between 43 and 73 years walked naked through Imphal (state capital) to the Assam Rifles headquarters, shouting: "Indian Army, rape us too... We are all Manorama’s mothers."
3.1.3 Sanskritization

The concepts of Sanskritisation\(^{13}\) and Westernisation were first introduced in Indian sociology by M. N. Srinivas (1962) and should in the present era be read in conjunction with each other. They reflect social change though imitation and mimicry to enable social mobility. This concept is similar to that which Partha Chatterjee presents.

‘Sankritization seems to have occurred throughout Indian history and still continues to occur. Westernization on the other hand, refers to changes introduced into Indian society during British rule and which continue, in some cases with added momentum, in independent India.’

(Srinivas, 1995:1)

\(^{13}\) The term was introduced by Professor M.N Srinivas in Indian Sociology (1956). It describes how lower castes adopt the customs of the upper castes as a way to gain social mobility and power. It is to be differentiated from Brahminisation. It has been claimed that this process spread among Hindus of all castes.
He distinguishes Sanskritisation further and claims it is not the same as Bhramanisation. The process of social mobility in Hindu society is not a clearly defined case of moving up one caste rung alone, there are as many exceptions as there are rules. Srinivas does not explain how this system affects non-Hindu communities which in pre and post independence India were being affected politically by being displaced. Women of lower castes were allowed certain freedoms (such as alcohol consumption and being able to choose their partners in marriage) that their upper caste counterparts were not allowed, all of this changed when they embraced the value system of the upper castes. The upper caste Hindu woman became the idealised feminine and her spectre haunts India in much the same way white femininity haunts the black woman in the west. She is marked out by her chastity and lack of participation in non domestic work. Her skin colour is coveted for its fairness. Beteille, an authority on the caste system, points out how fair skin colour is almost always a feature of the upper castes and of northern Indians. While there are variations in this pattern, caste more than region plays a role in the manifestation of skin colour (Beteille, 1967).

In many Indian languages the words fair and beautiful are often used synonymously. The folk literature places a high value on fair skin color. The ideal bride, whose beauty and virtue are praised in the songs sung at marriages, almost always has a light complexion. A dark girl is often a liability to her family because of the difficulty of arranging a marriage for her. Marriages among educated Indians are sometimes arranged through advertisements in the news papers; even a casual examination of the matrimonial columns of such popular dailies as The Hindu, The Hindustan Times or The Hindustan Standard shows that virginity and a light skin color are among the most desirable qualities in a bride. (Beteille, 1967:451-452). Pointing out how these
differences in skin colour are not merely superficial but deeply embedded in the Indian psyche, Beteille examines phrases that warn against trusting dark skinned Brahmins or light skinned Chamar (a low caste individual). This aspect of upper caste femininity has been exploited by cosmetic industries who have successfully sold fairness creams to a large Indian population (Hammond and Prahalad, 2004; Karnani, 2007).

One of the criticisms levelled against Srinivas is that he does not delve too deeply into caste inequality or the gendered nature of these changes. Others have critiqued the idea of ‘dominant castes’ or the idea that lower castes only use the dominant castes as a point of reference (Sreebitha, 2014). Oommen (1970) challenges the seven aspects of dominance Srinivas contends are necessary for one caste to gain superiority - numerical superiority, economic status, political power, ritual status, non-traditional education, modern occupation and physical force are the hallmarks of caste that affect lower castes adversely. Power and status are beneficial to the upper castes, but destructive to lower castes who are institutionally removed from such positions. Fluidity and mobility are rare, besides the means of mobility through the Sanskritization model expects the lower class individual to rise up the caste ladder in linear manner.

In some instances his tone almost condones the system as he claims it is a system that a large majority agree upon (Srinivas, 1962). Despite mapping out the caste system in detail he does not delve too deeply upon the impact such mobility has on women and how this plays out in how women are positioned as bearers of their culture.
3.2. **Who is a minority in India?**

31st October 1984 is the date of my birth. In India it is remembered as the day India’s first female Prime Minister Indira Gandhi was assassinated. The Sikh community remember it as a day their community was massacred (Basu, 2009). Family members and family friends recall the horror of that day and the days before and after when they witnessed first hand the effect of sectarian violence in India. This was not the first incident nor has it been the last. I recall my mother’s Sikh friend speak of these events with tears in her eyes, her young son witnessed a Sikh father and son being burnt alive from their balcony. This was a moment she realised how precarious the position of Sikhs in India was. Thirty seven years before this my grandfather witnessed the riots caused during partition, the joy of freedom soon dissolved amidst the fear, anger and loss of life and property. I grew up in this India which is proud to be the world’s largest democracy, a land of spirituality, diversity and unity. Unity seemed like an empty word in the nation, akin to propaganda. Contrasts in India are glaring, this a nation that on the one hand boasts of electing the world’s first communist government\(^\text{14}\) and is simultaneously ashamed of the state of emergency that lasted 21 months. During this time Prime Minister Indira Gandhi allowed for the imprisonment of political opponents, censored the press, conducted mass sterilisations, postponed elections and changed laws (Sharma, 1975; Rajgarhia, 2014). Responding to this clampdown a satirical obituary in The Times of India read as follows:

\[\text{D'Ocracy D.E.M, beloved husband of T Ruth, loving father of L.I.Bertie, brother of Faith, Hope and Justice, expired on June 26.}\]

\(^{14}\) Elamkulam Manakkal Sankaran Namboodiripad, popularly known as EMS, was democratically elected to the Kerala Legislative Assembly in 1957.
Rarely mentioned today the impact of the emergency was far reaching in polarising communities, the effects of which can still be felt today. Under the current BJP government similar sterilisation procedures against the poor have been carried out (DeBode, 2014). Violence in India is not limited to religious identities alone, caste, gender and ethnicity play a role in the segregation and ultimately legitimised massacres we now think makes India a backward nation. The Indian State is often described as pluralistic and its various cultures thought to be unique. Its many languages, dialects art forms, customs and religions are thought to be unique entities and distinct from each other (Hardgrave, 1993). By its very definition this uniqueness creates a separation between cultures. No doubt there is uniqueness in each community but uniqueness exists in the individual. This uniqueness separates each individual from his/ her counterparts.

Uniqueness as we think of it is neither original nor bereft of influence from others. The influence of the ‘other’ shapes one’s uniqueness, which is often thought to have been formed in isolation. Maalouf (2003) points out the complexity and danger in how minority identities are formed. Different attributes of identity are often in conflict with each other at different points in time. Alienating the self and the other by its very definition is a violent act. Dhar (2004) defines this binary of ‘us’ and ‘them’ ‘self’ and ‘other’ as a force that operates on ‘maximising differences’; these he believes sustain violence. Violence not in its overt from but in more subtle and pervasive manner - in everyday life. Subtle, often ignored violence, often seen as harmless and even necessary, legitimises the cause of larger acts of violence.

“…an investigation into the strange ambivalence of the notion of identity- a
concept that arguably denotes something that most 'normally functioning' human beings could not function, or at the very least, most individuals capable of communicating with others.”

(Olivier, 2009:407)

It would be all too easy to write off Indian nationalism as an indication of backwardness. However modern India, or the modern Indian State naturalised in our imaginations, is a new creation; that is not to say the nation did not exist, but the nation as we now know it did not exist. The geography, history and political ideology, have changed since then and have been changing ever since. The idea of the modern Indian state came not from India but from nationalist leaders who modelled their demand for a modern India on a basis of western ideology. Their conviction was that a modern state would help rid the country of its ‘backwardness’ (Nandy, 1996). Given this background about the nation we now call India, questions are raised of the permanence we thought had always existed.

Fear of losing one’s identity and fear of becoming a minority have been contentious issues in the Indian state. Nandy (1996, 2006, 2010) frequently points out the fear of various groups or individuals who have felt their existence threatened by the ‘minorities’ of the state. Fearing the loss of dominance of one’s identity has been cause for many an act of violence beginning from the assassination of Gandhi to the frequent communal riots that have become part of the Indian existence. Fear of identity being diluted or being lost due to perceived minorities or foreign ideologies has resulted in repeated acts of violence. A sense of loss is felt deeply by the individual who feels he has to regain the lost identity. Doing away with the ‘other’ is a form of justifying the need to protect oneself.
What we encounter here is the paradox of the *sacrifice* in its purest: the illusion of the sacrifice is that renunciation of the object will render accessible the intact whole. In the ideological field, this paradox finds its clearest articulation in the anti-Semitic concept of the Jew: the Nazi has to sacrifice the Jew in order to be able to maintain the illusion that it is only the "Jewish plot" which prevents the establishment of the "class relationship," of society as a harmonious, organic whole.

(Žižek, 2001:89-90)

Žižek’s explanation of ‘sacrifice’ gives an idea of how violence is justified and only with its perpetration can the ‘self’ or ‘us’ gain a sense of semblance. It is only in the killing of minorities that the majority can feel secure. Who constitutes the majority is questionable; almost every group in the Indian state can claim their uniqueness and therefore minority status. A clear demarcation of minorities does not exist but neither does it exist for the majority.

The introduction of a third party influences the perception of the ‘other’, finding commonality in the familiar other in the presence of an alien other temporarily creates a sense of peace. The British colonisers provided a common enemy to Indians who though divided found a less similar person amongst their midst. Post independence the internal differences came to the foreground once again, newer enemies being defined and sought out.

The ‘other’ who continues to exist and challenge our existence has an ambivalent definition. Neill (2003) discusses this ‘other’ as one misconstrued by the self who is also misconstrued. Often decisions are made for the ‘other’ not out of malice but out of good will, a rather naïve interpretation of ‘love thy neighbour.’ Neill goes onto to
say that the language of definition is also ‘other’ to itself. The lack of knowing has not led to a search for meaning but one of definition. Arbitrarily assigned definitions of the ‘self’ and ‘other’ create a void in our knowledge of the relation we have with the ‘self’ and ‘other’. This lack of understanding has led to the ignorance of not just the foreign ‘other’ but also the Indian ‘other’. Frequent and almost regularly occurring acts of violence is not just the domain of fanatical Indians but of ordinary Indians with no visible political allegiance or agendas. Non-political, non-fanatical moderates are as caught up in the act of ethnic violence as its perpetrators. Maalouf (2003) often has to answer uncomfortable questions about his identity/allegiance, which are not to segregate him, or to perpetrate violence but define him. The very ignorance of the ‘other’ or perceived outsider in India, in this case its minorities, often bear the brunt of discrimination.

Effects of this construction have had an impact on the complex identities that are constantly restructured. Gender, pathology, cinema, national identity and culture must be understood through aspects of nationalism that have affected both India and Europe.

### 3.3. Decentralising knowledge

There is a vast amount of literature in the west by western authors on colonialism and post colonialism, most of them written using western Europe in particular as the centre (Anderson, 1983; Hobsbawm, 1990). Knowledge is still produced in the western world and disseminated outwards even when it is for those on the margins. Europe and its historical framework are used as points of comparison. This trend is also reflected in some non-European writing. Kumar (2006) points out the elitism of Indian psychology and its self collusion when it comes to construing/constructing the
discipline of psychology.

Chibber (2014) contradicts the notion that knowledge in the colonies was not produced by the natives and that knowledge is either only culture specific or universal. In the case of India a standard narrative of history, modernity and progress lies at the end of this narrative. India’s ancient past is valorised as an authentic starting point. These centres are oppressive because they do not allow themselves to be challenged, they are static. Knowledge gained from that era is considered most representative of India. The gaze on those who do not fit into this narrative is always from a privileged position, looking at the minority easily dismissed and its history reduced to easy stereotypes. Classifying the non dominant as diversity or adding to the cultural richness, while positive, still insists on difference between individuals. The minority is still not an insider, never fully authentic (Shobhana, 2013) and always failing in their imitation of the dominant community. Minorities are given one easy narrative and are seen as a homogenous group. Myths, propaganda and normalising words create for us an India that never was. Physical boundaries once defining India have changed over centuries and have changed in my own lifetime (Baruah, 1999). Boundaries and capitals have shifted changing the power base. Calcutta (now known as Kolkatta) was the capital until 1911, then the development of New Delhi changed the centre from the east to the north. However, the hegemony of the Bengali intellectual is still strong and reflected in this thesis\textsuperscript{15}.

This is a common position reflected in the way women addicts are written about - women in rural India, impoverished, always the other (Neufeld et al, 2005). These

\textsuperscript{15} Spivak, Chatterjee and Nandy are all Bengali intellectuals and from elitist backgrounds. Two Nobel Laureates, Tagore and Sen, are also from this region which maintains a hegemony over Indian intellectualism.
women are cut off by their class, geography and caste. The urban economically affluent woman is still defined as an ideal, her absence almost deliberate. This otherness persists in the way women are portrayed with alcohol and drugs on screen as other (Sahu & Rehmani, 2010). This idea persists in violent acts against women where the perpetrators need to protect women from foreign vices. The lack of positive portrayals has meant negative ones are the only images one has access to, they play on how socially important issues are treated with disdain.

Crude jokes and offensive stereotypes mark the way India visualises gender, mental illness and minority communities (Nandy, 1981). Easy dismissals on screen in public debates and policy contribute to an uneasy silencing. This is disguised behind calls to ‘unity in diversity’. Any suggestions to the contrary are perceived as threats to national unity. Recent incidents of violence at a performance of The Vagina Monologues16 and a film on Kashmir (Oceans of Tears) were met with police brutality (Concerned Citizens, 2014; jdevika, 2014; Johari, 2014).

Indian writing about India is not necessarily less centred but its preoccupations are different from the writing of those on the outside looking inwards. Its points of reference are not always the west but sometimes its own past. As Nandy (1994) points out, the ideas thought of as cornerstones of Indian culture are in fact western inventions used by nationalists. That these ideologies of rationality and difference have been co-opted should not be surprising, the tools of an oppressor are not logical or consistent. The call to national unity is ill defined, but as this is a call from dominant groups they do not need definition or resistance.

16 A play made up of a number of monologues in which women talk of various aspects of the female experience, covering matters such as sex, menstruation, orgasm, birth and common names for the female sexual organs.
The love for the past is just that, not a love for historical detail or actual facts. Chow (2013) in summing up modern Chinese cinema and historical fiction speaks of this love as fetishised versions of the past.

Kumar (2006) challenges the way psychology in India and Indian psychology has failed to connect with the subjects it is trying to research:

In the first category are researches which attempt to replicate or validate popular Western theories and researches without much emphasis or rigour shown in picking up context-relevant methodology or clear theoretical-ideological considerations which guide their research questions in the first instance.... The second category comprises of writings that have essentially propagated indigenous or Indian cultural viewpoints by virtue of arguing against the Western (Euro-American) psychological viewpoints. This viewpoint argues that are the Western theories are mainly ethnocentric and dismiss psychological variations without much articulation for ‘local’ realities or cultural sensitivities and psychological testing and methodology becomes a tool to denigrate and deny presence of culture within psychic life of the individual.

(Kumar, 2006:238-239)

Given this history of the nation and the knowledge systems it has built up to create its identity, the issue of alcohol and drug consumption takes on ideas of nationality. The following chapter will attempt to contextualise the use of substances and how nation, gender and class collide to create disorders.
4 History and the Trajectory of Addiction

Remember that we deal with alcohol--cunning, baffling, Powerful!

AA big book (chapter 5 How it works)

(Alcoholics Anonymous, 1955)

4.1. The evolving history of inebriation

Often the history of a social condition is presented as pre-existing in antiquity as a continuous state in relation to its modern counterparts (Parker, 2005). Termed by Parker (2005:3) as a ‘regime of truth’ ‘in which there is a circulation of knowledge about objects that are formed by the very practices through which they are known’. To assume history has been unchanging or all oppressive would be disingenuous of the social and historical conditions that produced it. Problems with regard to a substance in our current era may therefore only be tied to the time and are culture bound. Cronin describes this process:

Notions of free will and feeling also constitute this flow of elements that literally make up what we apprehend as a commodity: it is the accretion of these multiple elements of substance, will or agency, and feeling over time that constitute the category of the commodity. I track these relations through the historically sedimented understandings of ‘the drug’ and ‘the commodity’, arguing that the drug is a densely charged discursive category that articulates historically shifting categories of food, medicine, pathology, commodity, social order, agency and identity.

(Cronin, 2002:318)
This chapter discusses how histories of a condition such as alcoholism/addiction have changed through time. The attempt is not to suggest that these substances do not have an intoxicating effect but to point out that apart from physical intoxication, social attributions to these substances play a role in the way they are consumed. Combined with social expectation the effect of the drug in question can vary, the mental effect manipulated through the expectation of the user (Freud, 1885; Loose, 2002). The effects that follow are in part due to the chemical nature and in part due to one’s expectations. Social and political factors have had an effect in classifying some of these substances as legal or illegal. The psychological effects of these prohibitions make these substances gain a ‘special effect’. Tracing the history of ‘addiction’ in modernity and what it has come to mean in present day India will shed light on the gendered ideas society holds towards these substances.

4.1.1 Invention of the disease

One of the ideas psychology presents to us when it comes to mental illness is how it has been a long standing condition spanning several centuries, unchanged in its manifestations (Bentall, 2013; Kinderman et al, 2013; Crowley, 2012, 2014). Recent advancements in science have facilitated the development of technology that enables biological factors to be studied thoroughly. Biological explanations while informative are widely critiqued, their very basis questioned. Rather than accepting biology as an end to exploration, interrogating the culture within which biological explanations emerge can help explain why symptoms of mental illness are not consistent.

*Throughout the history of psychiatry, the idea that schizophrenia and related conditions are genetic diseases has been treated as an axiom, rather than a*
While some conditions might have existed prior to the development of modern diagnostic systems, recognising them as mental illness is a new phenomena (Crowley, 2014). When a social condition is termed a mental disorder it acquires a different status in society. Stigma is one of the primary problems arising out of this new classification. Stigma faced by people who suffer from mental illness has been well documented (Goffman, 1963; Mountian, 2004). Alcohol and drug consumption and subsequent problems by their over consumption have been stigmatised in society (Zinberg, 1984). Represented in popular art forms with a cautionary message, these images have had an impact on how we view people who transgress a fine line of social decorum.

Alcoholism and addiction have only recently been classified as a disease and subsequently as a mental disorder. Thomas Trotter, a Scottish naval physician, author and leading medical reformer was the first to describe alcoholism as a disease as opposed to a moral condition. In his 1804 book *An Essay, Medical, Philosophical, and Chemical on Drunkenness, and Its Effects on the Human Body*, Trotter describes the condition as a disease (Trotter, 1804). Emerging in response to ‘gin craze’ and growing frustration at public acts of inebriation, Trotter’s work can be seen as a medical response to a social problem (Porter, 1985). This explanation is widely used by 12 step groups¹⁷ across the world. The disease model helps take the burden of

---

¹⁷ Alcoholics Anonymous and Narcotics Anonymous are two such groups. They follow twelve basic steps to recovery and hence are so named. In the rehabilitation center where I worked this model was followed, we would explain what these steps entailed and also help the clients through the first three steps. See Appendix D - The twelve steps to recovery.
being seen as a person of no will power to that of offering a more scientific explanation of the condition. However at the time of Trotter’s writing, Britain was colonising the world. This was an age of exploring foreign nations, commerce flourished, but socially this created new problems. Addiction was one of those ‘new’ problems, and different substances have acquired the reputation of being addictive over time.

4.1.2 Changing notions of addictive substances

Take for example the consumption of tea. Whilst in the present time it is regarded as a harmless drink, it was once marked by concerns of slavery and gender non-conformity. While we associate drunken behaviour and loss of control with alcohol, tea was once considered just as dangerous (O’Connell, 2012). As an expensive beverage, its consumption by the lower classes was looked down upon:

The fact that women, supposed to maintain rigorous control of the private sphere of the home, might take to tea-drinking, was the source of considerable alarm in early nineteenth-century Ireland as it had been for More\(^\text{18}\) in England in the 1790s and for earlier commentators as well such as the mid eighteenth-century reformer, Jonas Hanway. He had warned against tea on the grounds of its Chinese origin and its supposed threat to the class structure of English society (the latter anxiety clearly felt also by Edgeworth and Leadbeater). The prospect of poor women squandering already scarce resources on fashionable commodities such as tea was, of course, a worry for obvious reasons, but also implied was that consumption was making possible an expression of freedom for poor peasant women – however unarticulated it might have been from

\(^{18}\) Hannah More (1745 - 1833), an English religious writer and philanthropist.
Tea drinking was a gendered activity, O'Connell goes on to talk about another pressing matter that went against tea drinking - slavery. As sugar was grown in plantations in exploitative conditions, abstinence from this drink was a way of distancing one from colonial oppression. A similar trend can be seen in the way fair-trade tea is now gaining popularity.

4.1.3 Pre alcoholism

Alcohol has undergone several changes in the way it has been consumed and the way it has been perceived. In 14th through 15th Century Europe for instance, wine was considered to be safer than water and also nutritious, aiding in digestion. Consumption of milk however, by adult humans, was thought to be unhealthy. Alcohol consumption was also greater in this period than it is today (Scully and Scully, 2002). However even though alcohol was not considered to be taboo, people were warned against excessive consumption. In the modern era it has moved from being a safer alternative to water or milk, to being a drink associated with relaxation and recreation. Alcohol has now gone from being an everyday mundane drink to something that is associated with leisure and pleasure giving. Addiction can then be understood as a prolonged break from work/production and a search for an elusive high. Consumption of beer/alcohol has changed however, and addiction has increased (Scully & Scully, 2002). This is not to suggest that the chemical properties of the substance have changed but the social meaning has.
4.1.4 The opium wars

Kohn (1992) describes how immigration shaped the perception of certain drugs in Britain. The birth of the Empire saw the immigration of people across the colonies. This saw the exchange of food and drug habits, opium being one of them. The concern with the Chinese immigrants was less about opium but more about the way white women would be attracted to Chinese men. One can observe the emergence of the argument that conflates addiction with gender, race and criminality. Fears of losing these socially sanctioned identities called for pathologisation or criminalisation.

4.2 History in India

4.2.1 Cultural denial

Despite the supposed neutrality of diagnostic systems, cultural variations of addiction narratives play an important role in shaping our understanding of the condition. The previous section looked at how substance taking changed in the west and in Britain in particular, the east being portrayed as the source of moral decay in those narratives. This section looks at how a similar discourse was employed in India when it came to substance use, where the west became the enemy.

Diagnostic criteria while seeming beyond reproach are not so, they are easily misinterpreted and even overused at times, as some of the criteria are vague (Wetzel, 1991). It is not always possible to distinguish between what constitutes normal and abnormal (Rosenhan, 1973). Given the forceful idea in India that women do not drink or use any psychoactive substance, it would not be hard to diagnose as abnormal any woman who uses such substances recreationally. However there is
another problem at hand here, a cultural blindness exists in India when it comes to acknowledging and diagnosing women as addicts/alcoholics. A report by the UN notes that:

It is difficult, however, to get a full picture of women’s substance use, since international, national and local studies on the prevalence of substance use and associated problems do not often address gender issues. As noted by Murthy, women with substance use problems may not show up in official statistics in some countries, such as India, because of their small numbers and subordinate position in the drug culture.

(United Nations, 2004:14)

The report goes on to talk about the demographics of substance use in India, pointing out the identity characteristics of some of the users. It is interesting to note how this group of women shares the same characteristics with the women on screen who play the role of the drunk vamp or heroine:

In the 1990s, use of opiates, especially heroin, increased among women substance users in different cities in India. The majority of female substance users were single, educated and employed, and they had started using substances quite early. Women substance users are also known to start having sexual relations at a younger age and to share injecting equipment. Those who come from non-marginalized groups are often unaware of treatment options and have not sought them. Some treatment programmes cater to women with strong religious beliefs or spiritual inclinations, taking these into account during the treatment process.

What constitutes addiction socially is debatable, it is unclear, obscured by prejudice and an air of respectability that informs the way social problems are understood in India. Substance abuse in rural areas and poor areas of cities varies, it is not uncommon to see people (especially children) sniff rags soaked in petrol (Basu et al. 2004; Mondal, 2013; TNN, 2008). While these individuals do get a ‘high’ they are also some of the poorest members of Indian society and this is their means of quelling hunger pangs. Class, location and community determine the pattern of addiction and also the substance of choice one uses. While addiction to psychoactive substances is understood to be biologically possible in India its use is often attributed to westernisation and globalisation. In an extensive study conducted by Stigler et al. (2010), tobacco use among adolescents was attributed to ‘westernisation’. This study also attributed food (burgers and pizzas), clothing (jeans and t-shirts) and spaces of socialising (shopping malls and coffee shop chains) to ‘westernisation’. Indian culture or ‘traditional’ culture was considered protective against tobacco consumption. Acculturation was associated with greater tobacco consumption in women. This study makes arbitrary inferences about both culture and tradition. It positions Indian traditional culture as superior and impervious to corruption. However this discourse is not new or limited to alcohol and drug consumption.

In recent decades substance use /abuse has been increasingly attributed to an alien western culture. A question on Yahoo answers about western culture eroding Indian culture yielded this answer:
Figure 2: Yahoo answers - western culture

The discourse of addiction is presented in moral undertones and as a foreign other. Dress, language, location are all implicated in the problems modern India faces from the west. These discourses on culture completely ignore the history of drug and alcohol use in India. The author of the comment above does not refer to clinical addiction but to lifestyle choices. His case is against the consumption of these substances recreationally. There is a deep divide that lies between sociological evidence and public opinion, it relies on one side not acknowledging the evidence but constructing its own version of reality. Sometimes this divide is met with violent protests calling for bans on books (Dasgupta, 2014). In some cases it is creating a simple narrative of good versus evil between native and foreign. There is an element of fantasy that plays into nationalistic debates, fantasies of harm and invasion, a very chauvinistic notion of damsels in distress - Mother India being the damsel in this case. Ideas of foreign drugs causing social change in values play on deep insecurities and also have the power to mobilise groups of vigilantes. While it would be easy to relegate these voices to being internet trolls or mere fundamentalists it denies their actions of agency. This comment, while not completely representative of all Internet users, is indicative of those who often post abusive or ill informed comments on
internet forums. The view is not isolated but other people who think on similar lines hold variations of it. Discontent is brewing in India, it lurks beneath the surface of unity and diversity. Ignoring the chasm between the many fragmented pieces of India has lead to a deeper polarisation and antagonism (Nandy, 1988, 1994; Mani, 2015).

While being largely blamed upon the west, there is still some attribution of alcohol and drug consumption to certain types of Indian community, communities that are non Bhrahminical Hindu, including religious and regional minorities. The north east region which is largely ignored by mainland India receives attention due to its association with drugs. Lying in the heart of the ‘golden triangle’ region this region is associated with drug trafficking and terrorism (Singh and Nunes, 2013).

While mental illness is ‘gendered’ it is also entrenched within a culture. Some mental illnesses whilst presented as characteristic of a gender are similarly also attributed to cultures (Chesler, 2005). In the case of substance use/abuse, it is now being attributed to social change and westernisation. Scientific authority is being displaced or in some cases being created by popular notions, which indicates the nature of mental illness and the way it is enforced.

To understand the present discourse around alcohol and drug consumption the history leading up to these changes needs to be put into perspective. India is often perceived as an abstaining nation, but history points to a more varied pattern of consumption and abstinence. Both Srinivas (1956) and Kakar (2013) note how psychoactive substances have been consumed by different communities through time but their pattern of consumption has not been a constant one. Bhugra and Winston (1994) go further and trace the use of alcohol medicinally in the Caraka Samhita, an Ayurvedic text (dated at 600 BC or pre-600 BC):
In modern Hinduism there is a strong taboo on the drinking of alcoholic beverages; drinking is often seen in those who are Westernized or of low caste. This moral objection to alcohol is very ancient but it became widespread only slowly. The Aryans were a turbulent people and had few of the taboos of later India. Ancient society was not an acquisitive one. The perspective of most early Indian literature is that of the affluent. Worldly wealth was looked on as morally desirable for the ordinary man and indeed essential to a full civilized life. Accounts of drinking therefore reflect the experience of the rich.

(Bhugra and Winston, 1994:348)

The notion of being a dry drug free culture is further challenged with evidence of the opium and wine trade in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries (Bhargava, 2012; Prakash, 1987). Capitalism had led to the wide distribution of these commodities now thought of as a western problem. References to these drugs and their effects are noted in literature of their times. Foreign and local observers of these practices mention the effects these substances have on their consumers (Chatterjee, 2005). Bhargava (2012) in her detailed history tells us that while this consumption of wine was legitimised by the Mughal rulers of the time, it had a gendered aspect to it in the way women were allowed to sell the commodity but not partake of it. This gender division was not without contradiction - ‘public women’ we are told, consumed opium not for pleasure but to express grief and die.

Brahmans of the Vedic period drank soma, an alcoholic drink, ate beef, and offered blood sacrifices. Both were given up in post-Vedic times. It has been suggested that this was the result of Jain and Buddhist influence.

(Srinivas, 1956:481)
Changes in economic factors and governmental restriction have contributed to the changes in the way alcohol and drugs are perceived and consumed. The earliest use of an alcoholic beverage being used is traced back to ‘Som Ras\textsuperscript{19}', mentioned in the Vedas, along with the consumption of meat and animal sacrifice (Srinivas, 1956). However over time the consumption of alcohol and tobacco changed, as did the meanings ascribed to them. Added to this list is also what Vatuk and Vatuk (1967) describe as a culturally defined form of addiction - ‘chatorpan’. They talk about excessive consumption of sweets and salty-spicy snacks, and anti-social behavior resulting from the consumption of this food. The discourse employed takes a benign view of culture and categorisation. Every society has culturally acceptable ‘addictions’ and intoxicants, India is no different in this regard. There is a relaxed and even an indulgent attitude about the consumption of indigenous drugs. For example in villages of Northern India there is the tradition of Lathmaar Holi (SCFI, no date) where bhang (a cannabis drink) flows freely and women armed with sticks beat men who are not allowed to retaliate. While this might sound like an anomaly in patriarchal India, it is an example of how culture contains contradictions.

Chatterjee (2005) notes how the perceptions of different kinds of alcoholic drinks in India have not only gained and lost public support, but also how these were used as indications of cultural superiority. Similarly, certain drugs are associated with class and social status, cocaine due to its high price is perceived as being associated with the upper classes in India (Sharma & Shukla, 1988; Matoo et al, 1997; De-AddictionStaff, 2011). This relates to the point put forth by Cronin (2002:318) about the discursive category occupied by ‘the drug’ shifting. This analysis shows how alcohol was widely consumed but the attributes given to it were constantly shifting.

\textsuperscript{19} Elixir of life
and formed contradictory narratives. Tied to a growing colonial presence these narratives began to theorise how race, ethnicity, gender and reproduction began to be understood.

Alcohol consumption in modern India is affected by a combination of social and historical factors (Benegal, 2005). Abstinence was not only a religious issue but also one of moving up the caste ladder (Sanskritisation) and one tied to Gandhi’s notion of temperance. As the freedom struggle grew so did the need for an ‘Indian’ identity, temperance was one of those issues that symbolised purity. This influence can still be seen in national holidays such as Republic Day (26th January), Independence Day (15th August) and Gandhi Jayanti (2nd October) which are dry days in India. Gujarat, Gandhi’s home state is also a ‘dry state’ and the sale of alcohol is banned. This is not the only state to have an alcohol restriction - Manipur, Mizoram, Kerala and Nagaland as well as the union territory of Lakshadweep have all banned the sale of alcohol.

Benegal (2005) goes on to note that alcohol use despite its prevalence is still stigmatised. There is an imbalance in research findings (due to a lack of funding) and public fear mongering which is used as a catalyst for public outcry:

The popular media favour lurid descriptions of alcohol related violence and

20 Celebrated on 2nd October it marks the birth anniversary of Gandhi. It is one of the three official declared national holidays of India, observed in all of its states and union territories. Gandhi Jayanti is marked by prayer services and tributes all over India, especially at Raj Ghat, Gandhi’s memorial in New Delhi where he was cremated.

21 Dry day and dry states. Prohibition of alcohol does exist in some states and on national holidays. Gujarat (a state in Western India) has a prohibition in place and is also the home state of Gandhi, however this has meant that alcohol is sold illicitly.
heroic accounts of sporadic, short-lived anti-alcohol agitations by women’s groups. These, paradoxically, serve to marginalize the issue further and detract from a balanced public discourse. …English language media extolling the health benefits of alcohol have invaded that space.

(Benegal, 2005:1053)

As discussed earlier, attributions of danger and perceived threats of a moral breakdown are not new or unique to one nation alone. However, social attribution has a large role to play in the perception of what constitutes a ‘drug’. The symbolic nature of this ‘outsider’ or ‘threat to society’ discourse should not be undervalued. It is a powerful societal force and one that has the power to mobilise individuals (Hazare, no date). Temperance in former colonial nations began as a nationalist movement which has had counterparts in the west. The object of resistance varied, however it was presented in similar terms. Rogers (1989) traces the growth of this movement to privileged natives who were excluded from the political process of their nation.

Constructions of an independent India called for the birth of a new identity, one that borrowed ideas of nationalism from the west but constructed it with its own nuances (Nandy, 1996). One of these rallying points was alcohol consumption. Tied to ritual purity, this movement played on the idea of the moral and spiritual superiority of Indians over the west (Britain in particular). This aspect of India’s national identity has come up in several instances and has been mentioned throughout this thesis. Colvard (2013) argues that this nationalist project (one that eventually led to independence) was tied to the bodies of those who drink and not just women. However this temperance movement was not approved by all sections of Indian society, some of whom depended on selling alcohol for a living. Yet this oppression
of the elite classes who advocated for temperance over the non-elite is glossed over in history and is still a reality in independent India. This process of nationalism is built upon accepting and rejecting the west at the same time, it is contradictory in what it chooses and rejects. Dissident opinion on this issue is termed as the other, a discourse that is often under represented.

Post independence India has seen several changes in the way it has utilised the process of Sanskritisation and Westernisation to create a discourse that is often fraught with gender stereotypes.

Sanskritization is no doubt an awkward term, but it was preferred to Brahminization for several reasons: Brahminization is subsumed in the wider process of Sanskritization though at some points Brahminization and Sanskritization are at variance with each other. For instance, the brahmans of the vedic period drank soma, an alcoholic drink, ate beef, and offered blood sacrifices. Both were given up in post- Vedic times. It has been suggested that this was the result of Jain and Buddhist influence. Today, Brahmans are, by and large, vegetarians; only the Saraswat, Kashmiri, and Bengali Brahmans eat non-vegetarian food. All these Brahmans are, however traditionally teetotallers. In brief, the customs and habits of the Brahmans changed after they had settled in India.

Srinivas (1956:481)

Advertising and films have both come under attack for portraying a misleading lifestyle without specifying the associated risks, for fear such behaviour would be imitated by young audiences (Bhowmik, 2008). Legislation has been introduced to control or in some cases ban the use of tobacco and alcohol. In 2012 the Ministry of
Health, Family and Welfare released new Anti-Tobacco health spots; it has now become mandatory to display disclaimers onscreen whenever smoking scenes are depicted in films, television and advertisements (Ramnath, 2013). Blue Jasmine, by director Woody Allen, ran into trouble due to its depictions of smoking, which eventually stopped the film from being released altogether (Jamkhandikar, 2013).

Surrounded in discourse around health and youth welfare, these debates play on the same old idea of western values eroding Indian values. Youth are almost always implicated in these debates and their welfare cited as a reason for creating these bans. While health and science are cited as factors for these bans the social factors that have gone into creating these prohibitions must not be underestimated.

Under a new ruling by the Supreme Court, films that depict characters smoking must carry warnings before and after the scene. Previously the Cable Television Network (Regulation) Amendment Bill (8th September 2000) prohibited cigarette and alcohol advertisements. There were already debates about banning scenes that portrayed cigarettes and alcohol. However the film industry found a way to circumvent these regulations by incorporating references in song and dance routines. An example of this is the song ‘beedi jalaile’ which translated means ‘light a beedi’.

Films are only one example of this ban. One can observe a similar discourse of banning alcohol and Sanskritisation in the 2011 Anna Hazare led movement which became a nationwide struggle dubbed as neo Gandhism. Similar to the peaceful protests put up by Gandhi and based on the principles of Satyagraha, the movement attracted national interest. Hazare had successfully banned the sale and production of

---

22 Beedi’s are handmade cigarettes filled with tobacco flake and wrapped in a tendu leaf, they are relatively inexpensive.
alcohol in his village and had asked for a similar ban to be enforced across the nation (Sivanand, 1986). Men who were caught drinking in his village were publically flogged. This action was not considered harsh in the villages of India where violence is often used as a means of social control. This aspect of his cause has come under considerable debate. The alcoholic in this case is conceptualised as male and abusive to his wife and children, while this is a reality in many parts of India it is also seen as an acceptable gender role. For women to enter into this territory equates them with a baser masculine nature. The target audience was men, as women were not considered to be drinkers. When talk turned towards banning alcohol for all, the movement began to lose ground (Datta-Ray, 2011; Times of India, 2011).

4.3. Biologised identities

Studies on alcohol or drug addiction are mostly quantitative and are conducted with a sub group in conjunction with other factors (Matoo, 1997; Basu et al, 2012; Mondal et al, 2011). Biologised understandings seek to universalise how mental illness is being thought of in terms of biology alone. Social and historical realities that have created this human suffering and brought such a condition into everyday language are being undervalued.

While studies indicate which groups are most vulnerable and what substances they use or abuse, taboos internalised by the researchers are apparent in the way these groups are written about (Mohan, 2011).

Given how modern Indian society has evolved there seems to be a lack of historical understanding of how we came to acquire such ideas about alcohol and drug consumption, which are often presented as a problem of modernity and exposure to western culture. Arguments on the subject range from nostalgic nativism to virulent
opposition of the west (Chatterjee, 1997). Presentation of Indian history often relies on one sided narratives mixed with nationalist interests (Chibber, 2014).

Psychiatry as a discipline that can help solve mental illness is only recently entering public imagination, it still holds ideas of macabre torture and ‘madness’ (bizarre behaviour) (Reddy, 2007). Despite this, psychiatry has had a long history in India and was developed in its modern form by colonial powers (Basu, 2005). Alcohol and drug consumption is attributed to a change in social values and increased westernisation.

4.4. Gendered expressions of alcohol and drug consumption

Globally as well as in Asia, women drug users have received considerably less attention, and the majority of the studies have been conducted on males. In most societies drug use is viewed at odds with expected behaviour by women and drug-using women are likely to experience even greater stigmatisation compared with their male counterparts. Frequently women drug users exchange sex for drugs or money to sustain their drug habit or livelihood for themselves and their children.

(Sarkar et al, 2003:281)

Alcohol, tobacco and drugs are consumed by all genders, however norms and narratives that surround them are gendered. Men who drink and male alcoholics are perceived and treated very differently from women who consume alcohol. Drinking is predominantly a male activity and male spaces for drinking are marked out. Men tend to consume more alcohol and also are more likely to drink then women. Estimates have shown that men are four times more likely than women to become alcoholics (Thio, 2001). Drunkenness and drinking are more socially acceptable for
men than women, as gender role socialisation teaches men that it is masculine to
drink; men who drink are considered strong and fulfilling a masculine role (Osella
and Osella, 2006; Mullen et al, 2007). Drinking is often connected with manliness,
therefore the term ‘drink like a man’. Male initiation rites often have a strong presence
of alcohol, and consumption of large quantities of alcohol by men is associated with
virility (Anderson and Hibbs, 1992).

Despite the gender and cultural differences, women do have problems associated
with alcohol. Over the years the difference in consumption has been narrowing as
more women have access to alcohol and it is considered acceptable for a woman to
drink. However, women who drink heavily sometimes fail to be diagnosed as
alcoholics; this could be due to the social expectation that alcoholism is only a
problem affecting men.

4.4.1 Limitations of diagnosis

The biologisation of mental illness has meant homogeneity being a major feature in
the conceptualisation of mental illness. However it has also been argued that mental
illness is related to systems of power. If alcoholism and drug addiction was merely a
disease that was universal, the blatant oversights in diagnosis would not be so
glaring. A case in point is the Oxford University based Bullingdon Club in the United
Kingdom; composed of elite white British men of privileged backgrounds this group
of men is known for misogyny and the destruction of property while under the
influence of alcohol and/or drugs (Atkinson, 2006). Yet none of these men have been
criminalised or sent to rehabilitation. Comprising of probably the most powerful men
in the United Kingdom, their absence from criminal or psychological institutions is
not surprising. Obvious social privilege of class, gender and race normalises their
actions. That they pay for the damages they incur during their drunken outbursts is often used to justify their actions (McBain, 2009). Economic affluence is used as explanation to justify these actions, even pardon them, which would otherwise be penalised. Pathology and criminality dwells in the realm of poverty, attributed to the most disempowered in society.

Hogarth’s famous engraving titled ‘Gin Lane’, made in 1751, depicts a scene of moral and social decay in England. Since then popular culture has used similar ideas to equate alcohol and drug consumption with social breakdown. It can be argued that these images have never left us but have evolved. Mountian (2004) examines images of advertisements and films that convey ideas of women consuming alcohol, drugs and tobacco. These images invariably invoke abjectness, poverty, criminality, hypersexualisation and irresponsibility (Goode, 2007). Using a feminist framework Ettorre (2007) explores how this discourse leans towards a view that women who use psychoactive substances are in some way polluted. Popular culture often stylistically exaggerates these images to convey an idea sexualised waywardness. These images are not restricted to popular media alone but are discourses prevalent in the news (Manning, 2007). These images of inebriated women as highly sexualised are hard to shake off. They are everywhere. On screen images of women in a drunken stupor have been in films for a long time (Mountian, 2013). Women addicts, as mentioned in the introductory chapter, had it bad in the rehabilitation centre I worked in, but this is not an isolated case or peculiar to India:

…Most women who enter treatment programs suffer greatly from depression and low self-esteem, but the problems addressed in these programs are frequently those that are likely to affect men, such as the loss of a job. Furthermore, treatment programs often use communication styles (such as the
language of dependence) that are more characteristic of men than of women. Consequently, the treatment programs in many facilities, although effective for men, actually serve to lower women’s self-esteem and to increase their depression. Also, women are far less likely than are men to receive support from their spouses and other family members when they decide to seek treatment, partially because society views substance abuse by women more negatively than it does substance abuse by men.

(Aston and Kaplan, 1994:130-131)

Aston (2009) questions how the addict is created, not through biological discourse but through medicalisation and identifying as such. Addicts are, she claims, brought into existence through a structure of languages.

While writing about women addicts in India there is also another problem, and that is women who consume drugs and alcohol recreationally. While they do not meet the clinical classification of being an addict, they face the social stigma of being one. It is still a socially uncomfortable position which often makes women vulnerable. This is not a homogenous concept, it is further stratified into class, ethnicity, religious, regional and identity divisions (Rani et al, 2003). All of the assumptions are contradictory and yet they are socially powerful in the way they shape the way Indian women are perceived in terms of good and bad.

Women addicts have few places where they can seek help in India and elsewhere. When they seek help they encounter a system that is designed for men. The language of recovery targets ones personality and behaviours and cites it as a reason for pathology (Alcoholics Anonymous, 2001). Diagnosis is established through a history that is seen as leading up to addiction. Oversimplified ideas of the role of the family
find their way into the way the addict’s family is understood as ‘co- dependents’ and ‘enablers’ (CODA, 2011). When one thinks of the ‘addicted family’ images of a heterosexual patriarchal family come up, women are often thought of as victims of an addict’s ire. Considering women are portrayed as sexual objects in advertisements of alcohol and tobacco it is not surprising then that they are thought of as morally defective and in need of harsh correction.

Finding the ‘addictive personality’ type separates the addict from so called ‘normal’ people. Benign as the 12-step model seems, the program tends to target addiction as a chronic disease for which there is no cure (Alcoholics Anonymous, 2001). It expects its members to introspect on a daily basis for character defects and to admit that their condition is both a disease and insanity.

Chunkapura (2006), an “expert” on addiction in southern India, lists the number of associated problems the addict and the addicts’ family faces, yet one cannot help but notice how the female addict is left out of this. It is almost always assumed that the addict is a male, and most ideas about female addicts are borrowed from male addicts. One can also not help but notice how addiction receives a simplified definition and treatment. The ideas put forward in Chunkapura’s books tend to be set within an American framework.

Instead of liberating the female addict these ideas threaten to oppress her more. Current ideas of mental illness focus on ideas of inheritance and biology thereby implying there cannot be a cure (Masson, 1992). Women who are already seen as biologically inferior have to contend with fatalism surrounding their existence (Fausto-Sterling, 1985). Elaine Showalter (1985:12-13) argued that the link between ‘femaleness’ and insanity goes beyond statistical overrepresentation, evidence for
female irrationality can be found in both art and literature. Men on the other hand are represented as rational. Even though this representation of women is abundant men too have been a part of this representation. Author and feminist Sylvia Plath rejected the social system that ‘primed’ her for mental illness, even the private medical system did not help, rather it controlled her benevolently without helping her distress that was caused due to social pressures.

The disorders or co-morbid conditions that are being discovered do not liberate the individual but help only to push them into a now almost inescapable condition. Women addicts are forced to contend with the idea that they are suffering from a biological condition and run the risk of producing children who will grow up to be addicts. The idea of a heterosexual family being a healthy state of existence comes through in most of these narratives.

Most treatment models ignore the social and political factors that accompany addiction (Rhodes and Johnson, 1994). The consequence of labelling the addict has a lasting impact on the way the addict is perceived and how the addict is perceived by herself (Corrigan et al, 2009; Hathaway et al, 2011). Indian women may find it difficult to find places to get sober and also to live with the stigma of being labelled an addict. The culture of silence that exists in Indian society may in some ways cause women to live in isolation. However Indian culture must not be understood as monolithic but has many cultures within which many subcultures exist. One cannot obtain a single narrative of addiction but many narratives. Indian women live in an ambivalent environment, which looks at them as goddesses and mothers or as objects of a male gaze (Bose, 2007). Given this sharp divide, women addicts hold a difficult position as outcasts. One gets the sense of how this idea is entwined deeply in our sense of nationalism, a gendered nationalism at that. Nationalism, as McClintock
Nationalism can be seen as operating in the way it perceives addiction as a threat to culture and everything deemed socially appropriate. Evidence of this can be seen in how women who use psychoactive substances are often portrayed as western or as less Indian, issues of religion also come in as most often Christians are portrayed as alcoholics on screen. Addiction implies a loss of control not just for the individual but also for society at large.

4.4.2  What happens when women party hard?

In India this culture of drinking and drug taking is stratified by class, caste, religion and regional identity. While there are no gender distinctions within the legal approval for consumption of intoxicating substances, socially there is a stigma attached to women who drink or use any other drug. An effect of this stigma is a social denial that it can be a problem for women, a reflection of which can be seen in the very restricted number of rehabilitation centres available to women (evidence can be seen in how some of these centres did not even have websites).

While Bollywood actresses are protected by their social affluence, women who have to earn their daily living by imitating these actresses do not have the same protection (Kishwar, 2013). Women bar dancers who dance to songs from Bollywood films are often viewed as no different from prostitutes, they are stigmatised and even made fun of in comedy programs. Yet the same dances when performed by affluent women are seen as acceptable entertainment, the film actresses who originally perform these song and dance numbers on screen do not face such ridicule. By being closely associated with alcohol and drug consumption (by men in this case), these women’s
identities are stigmatised. Their class and economic necessity pushes them into a position often considered as only one notch better than prostitution (Agnes, 2005; Kotiswaran, 2010; Gopal, 2012). These dancers are ascribed a hypersexuality by the patrons of these establishments, one can observe how patriarchal power creates such identities.

Women’s proximity with alcohol and drugs make them easy targets of male violence and sexualisation. The case of Jessica Lal made national headlines and highlights how Lal’s proximity to alcohol made her an easy target of violence (Biswas and Sharma, 2006). As pointed out by Bhargava (2012) earlier, women in 16th and 17th century India were allowed to sell intoxicating substances but not permitted to consume them; this idea has continued to this day. Jessica Lal was a celebrity barmaid and model in Delhi, who was shot dead in the early hours of 30 April 1999 by patrons refused further drinks after closing time. Jessica’s associations with alcohol in an elite venue have been questioned. That these parties and venues stand in stark contrast to the poverty of India has been noticed. Initially hushed up, the case came to the attention of the media which challenged the deep seated prejudices and privileges certain classes of Indian society get away with. Ram Jethmalani, the defence lawyer for Manu Sharma, the accused in this case, made statements to suggest that Jessica and her place of work were in some way tied to prostitution. Class and privilege in India help individuals to get legal and social acquittal (Arulselvan, 2016). While justice was served in this case and the story even made into a successful film, not all women in India have such public support.

While most Indians associate alcohol and tobacco with western values it positions western women in a troublesome spot - of being sexually available by association. Tied to this is a complex relationship between race, gender, sexuality and culture. An
article in The Guardian newspaper opens up these debates, titled ‘Letter from India: it's no easy matter being a woman looking for a decent drink in Delhi. Alcohol isn't banned in India, nor is it unheard of for women to drink. But buying it is a totally different matter’ (Pidd, 2012: online). This article by Helen Pidd traces her difficulties in buying alcohol in India as a white woman. While she does encounter Indians of all classes drinking alcohol, buying alcohol as a woman is frowned upon:

‘She refused to come into the shop with me and looked on in horror as I staggered back to the car with a crate of Kingfisher. Indian girls might drink alcohol, but they cannot be seen in public buying it.’

(Pidd, 2012: online)

Pidd makes an interesting observation of Indian life and how it is full of contradictions. Comments below the article point to the mundane nature of her article, to her ignorance of local culture, to pointing out how she does not understand foreign cultures. A common way of framing difficult issues in India is to locate that discourse as being foreign, the comments are an example of that. Pidd is unable to comprehend the obvious denial of situation and the glaring contradictions in how Indians react to pseudo morality. Furtive incursions into forbidden territory such as drinking are also incursions into forbidden territory, foreign transgressions. Morality is complex in India, while projecting an image of universal morality there are contradictions and even outright rejections.

These contradictions are further highlighted by a comment posted by a reader.
How India sees itself and how others see it is very different, and again there is a chasm between the observed and the narrative. Perhaps the contradictions and the denial is where the notion of the self lies. Morality is considered to be a hallmark of Indian culture, preserving it and creating narratives around it make these stories more credible, forming an identity. Narratives of Jessica Lal as asking for it, of bar dancers asking for it, quell our anxieties placing our deepest fears in women who are victims, blaming them for our violence.

4.5. **Addiction in the present day**

4.5.1 **Classification of addiction**

Clinical and social conditions that inform medical practice have changed over time as have taxonomies. In present day India the ICD-10 (International Classification of Disease, version 10) as prescribed by the WHO (World Health Organisation) is used. The F series of the taxonomy pertains to mental and behavioural disorders. This is the diagnostic taxonomy that I was taught to use during my masters program, along
with the American DSM (Diagnostic and Statistical Manual), which was given a brief mention. Given the American influence in the teaching of psychology in elite educational institutions in India it was seen as necessary to know about the DSM along with the ICD, however as the ICD was the recommended system it was used more often. The ICD has included contributions from Indian doctors working in the field, who have helped compile the current system.

Within the F series of the ICD-10 there is a further breakdown of the clinical disorders, which are grouped according to similar symptoms. F10 to F19 are classified as the sections dealing with mental and behavioural disorders due to psychoactive substance use. This is at odds with the Alcoholics Anonymous and Narcotics Anonymous definition which identifies individuals as addicts and alcoholics.

Even though the term alcoholism is used widely to describe a state of overconsumption the ICD-10 does not use the terms alcoholism or addiction rather it diagnoses the problem under the following categories:

F10  Mental and behavioural disorders due to use of alcohol
F11  Mental and behavioural disorders due to use of opioids
F12  Mental and behavioural disorders due to use of cannabinoids
F13  Mental and behavioural disorders due to use of sedatives or hypnotics
F14  Mental and behavioural disorders due to use of cocaine
F15  Mental and behavioural disorders due to use of other stimulants, including caffeine
There are certain features that characterise alcoholism/addiction and these features distinguish it from normal drinking. The 12 step programs speak about not being able to stop or consume these substances like normal people.

Identification of the psychoactive substance should be based on as many sources of information as possible. These include self-report data, analysis of blood and other body fluids, characteristic physical and psychological symptoms, clinical signs and behaviour, and other evidence such as a drug being in the patient's possession or reports from informed third parties. Many drug users take more than one type of psychoactive substance. The main diagnosis should be classified, whenever possible, according to the substance or class of substances that has caused or contributed most to the presenting clinical syndrome.

The diagnostic criteria also include:

- Harmful use
- Dependence syndrome
- Withdrawal state
• Withdrawal state with delirium
• Psychotic disorder
• Amnesic syndrome
• Residual and late-onset psychotic disorder syndrome
• Other mental and behavioural disorders
• Unspecified mental and behavioural disorder

The ICD describes alcoholism not as a disease but as a disorder that varies in severity (ICD-10). ICD-10 acknowledges the varying levels of problems caused by the consumption of psychoactive substances from uncomplicated intoxication, harmful use to psychotic disorders. Damage to an individual’s health, physical or mental, is considered in the diagnosis, however it insists that the damage must be actual. This diagnosis has a societal aspect to it, as it goes on to mention that substance use may not be approved of by the individual’s significant others. However this in itself may not be evidence of harmful use. Yet when it comes to describing dependence the ICD-10 talks about the need to consume alcohol irrespective of ‘social constraints that determine appropriate drinking behaviour’ (World Health Organisation, no year:5). Even though the ICD attempts to eliminate discrimination associated with alcoholism by defining it as dependence, the term implies a certain amount of loss of autonomy.

4.5.2 Models of addiction

Addiction has been theorised through different schools of thought, each one conceiving causal factors according to its understanding of what creates such a condition. Each of these models has had an impact on the way addicted individuals
have been conceptualised and treated. While none of these models can completely describe why addiction affects a few individuals and not everyone, or why it is maintained, they attempt to classify and codify patterns.

- **The disease model.** The disease model is widely used by the 12 step groups. It is the model that framed the treatment in the rehabilitation centre where I worked. It is based on the idea that addiction is like any other medical disorder and not a problem of will power. Classifying addiction at par with medical disorders not only reduces stigma but also interprets the symptoms as being part of disease (Gorski, 1996). One of the main advocates of this model was Jellinek (1952, 1960), who took in economic and social factors that lead to the loss of control associated with alcoholism, yet stressed the disease aspect of the condition. Addiction is theorised as a condition that causes the individual to lose control over their alcohol or drug intake, thus ‘proving’ they have a disease. This model has been heavily criticised on the grounds that it does not work and can even be harmful. Peele (1990, 2000, 2007) has heavily criticised the disease model, stressing that the idea of a disease absolves moral responsibility on the part of the addict. Making a case for mindful recovery, Peele bestows agency on the addict.

- **The biological model.** This model of addiction, as the name suggests, traces the causes of addiction internally to biology, chiefly neurochemical explanations. Attempting to universalise the process of addiction, biological explanations for the acquisition and maintenance of addiction turn their attention to the inner workings of the human body. Given the technological advances in neurological research these explanations are recent and still being refined. The brains reward system is understood to be hijacked by addictive
substances, thereby changing the structure and function of the brain and even gene expression. (Volkow and Fowler, 2000; Volkow and Li, 2005; Harvard Health Publications, 2009, 2011). This theory, similarly to other theories, attempts to remove will power as a causal factor, it attempts to provide scientific objectivity to a condition that is often thought of as a moral and legal problem. Kushner (1998, 2006) argues against technological innovations notwithstanding biological theories of addiction claiming they reiterate longstanding views of addiction in a culture where biology is the basis of understanding.

I have deliberately ignored the biological aspects of addiction in my work. My experience in the rehabilitation centre made me challenge a purely biological understanding of addiction. While I would not dismiss these explanations completely, I feel they do not take into account the social and historical factors that contribute to the creation of mental disorders or the impact medicine has on cultural understanding of diseases.

• **Psychoanalytic models.** Based in psychoanalysis addiction takes on a different form. Constructed in terms of inner motivation, defence mechanisms and enjoyment this model theorises addiction in terms of the effect drugs have on the psychic structure of the individual. Freud’s work with cocaine as an anaesthetic influenced his later work on understanding addiction and the effects a medical substance can have (Bernfeld, 1953). While all psychoanalytic theorists do not agree on the nature of addiction, they do view the taboos and pleasure derived from such substances as important in the acquisition of addiction (Verhaeghe, 1999). Ashis Nandy, whose work is based in psychoanalysis, takes a non-clinical view of pathology examining social and
psychic processes and mythologies that create suffering and disorder. Taboos, regulations and social norms play a part in the creation of the pathology which is alcoholism.

- **Biopsychosocial model** Proposed by Engel in 1977, this model seeks to rectify the disservice done by single focus models (Engel, 1997). Combining all biological, psychological and social aspects of disease, this model attempts to provide a holistic picture of why disease occurs and how it is maintained. Recognising the dehumanising nature of other models, this model attempts to reconcile how a number of factors interact with each other in both causation and treatment (Borrell-Carrió, et al, 2004). Taking this model further in the realm of addiction, it is essential to learn about the social factors that are involved in the consumption of addictive substances and how an individual continues to take them (Buchman et al. 2010). This model then attempts to develop a more open-minded approach to causation and is less reductionist in its conceptualisation of how diseases occur. While praised for not being dogmatic the model has its weaknesses. Ghaemi (2009) lists ten major limitations of the model

1. Based on a falsely narrow concept of biology
2. Conceptually inconsistent about the mind/body relationship
3. Not more beneficial than Osler's medical humanist model
4. If true, it is trivial
5. Unclear boundaries
6. Can confuse treatment versus etiology
7. Poor model to address costs and managed care
8. Presumes psychiatric superiority to other mental health disciplines
Addiction is not limited to these models alone, others have expanded on them, pointing out limitations and contributing to the understanding of the mechanisms that create and maintain the condition (Orford, 2001).

This thesis concentrates on the social and political aspects of substance use. The models of addiction used in the analysis in the subsequent chapters will focus on the psychoanalytical and bio psychosocial model of addiction. The language used to describe the addict in the disease model will also be utilised. While these models will be used in the analysis their use does not denote a complete agreement with either model but rather serves a guiding framework to keep in mind while viewing the films used in the analysis and the themes they present. The films chosen do not look for the clinical aspects of these models but use them as a salient guiding point to examine the language used in cinematic settings. While cinema loosely draws on scientific knowledge it does so with a certain amount of artistic interpretation. While the films analysed are not medical documentaries, keeping the models of addiction in mind can help understand the dissemination of medicalised knowledge and its representation in popular media (Hyler, 1988; Tsang, et al 2003). However the use of films in this thesis points to gaps in professional knowledge and public perception which these particular models of addiction do not address. Lipscomb (2016) points out how films are often a replacement for historical fact. Similarly films can also form opinion on clinical issues.

The history of addiction, like all histories, is complex and varied. The attribution of gender, class and race contribute to our constantly changing understanding of what
constitutes addiction and also of what addiction entails in terms of pathology. Classifying addiction as a disorder does not necessarily remove stigma completely. Mental illness has the power to replace commonplace knowledge with institutionalised biases that were already present in society (Moscrop, 2011).

McClellan (2004) notes how addiction was once assumed to relate to gender role confusion and even homosexuality. The promiscuous or frigid woman addict is an invention of medical history. It is important to note how apparently ‘scientific’ attributes of mental illness trickle down into common knowledge and stay in our memory influencing how we think about individuals. Keeping this in mind, examining representations, challenging models of addiction and questioning gender roles becomes vital. History can help explain the trajectory gender roles and addiction take, and how those ideas are used to create cautionary narratives.

While each model of addiction attempts to understand this pathology it invariably creates narratives that reinforce commonly held beliefs about addiction and mental disorders. Addicts are almost never spoken to, but about, their suffering decided for them, all the while ignoring the dominant forces that exist in relation to them. Damage done to the addict through intellectual frameworks needs careful consideration (Hammer et al, 2013). Perhaps as suggested by Kushner (2010) a more cultural understanding of the biological perspective of addiction discourse is needed.

4.5.3 The language of addiction

The language of addiction and the subsequent creation of discreet categories to describe the condition have brought to attention a group of people suffering from the same problem. Currently classified as a mental disorder, it is a term that has come to
describe not only the act of excessive alcohol and drug consumption but also a particular kind of suffering associated with the condition. As we have seen in previous sections of this chapter the psychoactive substance in question either acquires or loses addictive properties, and symptoms associated with it, which are a product of learning.

Voracious drinkers of the late seventeenth and early eighteenth century in Europe and North America probably had similar experiences as alcoholics 200 years later. But because the concept had not yet been discovered they could not know they were “addicted”.

(Sulkunen, 2007:544)

Another argument, put by Wessely, whose work revolves around Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD), is how cinema can affect the presentation of clinical symptoms (Jones et al, 2003). Popular media often adapts real life situations to portray conditions in an easy to understand manner. Wessley contends that these portrayals have made their way into real life PTSD sufferers who frequently complain of flashbacks, which have been used in Hollywood films as a means of representing trauma suffered in war. Symptoms of mental illness are culture bound and popular culture has a role in shaping how suffering can take on many forms and is not necessarily a biological entity alone. Biologised understandings of mental illness are not adequate enough to understand why some conditions occur. Film, a popular and pervasive cultural medium, has come to influence our understanding of apparently scientific disorders such as addiction. Visual representation can have profound ways of informing and creating stereotypes. Misrepresentations of mental illness in mainstream media do not constitute a new debate but are part of a long-standing struggle for realistic representation. Mental illness alluding to deep-seated
criminality is not a new argument either (Mulvey, 1994; Grohol, 1998). Addiction in particular has been implicated in criminality in recent years, given that the sale of many psychoactive substances is banned, or is in the process of being banned. In the process, the addict becomes the scapegoat of state sanctioned punishment. The language used to describe addiction is changing, balanced precariously on being socially accepted by a powerful majority with the power to define the other.

During my time here in Britain debates about imposing higher prices on alcohol and even keeping inebriated people in ‘drunk tanks’ have made news (BBC News, 2013). It is commonplace to see cheap drinks being advertised to students, and jokes and conversations on the subject are common place. In India, stories of rich and famous people (mostly men) crashing their cars or running over people are not uncommon. Online comments below these articles either ask for stricter punishment, responsibility on the part of the drinker or even blame society at large. The rise of social media and citizen journalism23 in India has brought to attention the everyday problems alcohol and drug use causes. A few cases have caught public attention and mobilised them into action (Jessica Lal and Salmaan Khan). There is a flipside to this as well, often such stories generate negative attention for the victim and prejudice public opinion.

4.5.4 Work Hard Party Harder

Bangalore Times Page 3 often carries pictures of people out drinking, the phrase

---
23 Citizen journalism is a term widely used in relation to a new style of reporting news stories, whereby participants report their experiences via text messages or through videos made on their phones. This is seen as a way of reaching the common man and reporting stories that were otherwise unreported. In a nation where the common person is silenced this kind of journalism helps bring awareness and in some cases justice to the victim.
‘Work hard but party harder’ is commonly used in reporting stories of revelry.

Work hard party harder means working with dedication but partying with full dedication. This concept lightens the tensions and stress which generally flows in the mind during office hours. Getting success is not just enough for a joyous life. Why do you earn? To live your life in your own way! So, don't be reserved to saving money and leading a monotonous life. Try hanging out with friends, party, booze and roam around the city to enjoy the later hours after returning from office.

(Sharma, 2011:online)

The dichotomy between work and leisure is clear-cut in this argument. Though presented as a release from work, ‘partying hard’ is not for the benefit of the worker but for the benefit of employers (Parker, 2007; Bjerg, 2008). A distracted worker who fails to make the distinction between work and leisure is to engage in a regimented form of leisure. Partying here is defined in terms of alcohol consumption and getting drunk. The Urban Dictionary (no date: online) defines the term ‘party hard’, it makes the aim of this activity explicit - drinking until one is in a deep state of intoxication:

(Definition 2) A way of describing the actions of an individual whom after the consumption of illicit substances promptly nests (i.e. creates a warm and comfortable place) and falls asleep due to intoxication. They also tend to enjoy large quantities of food before napping caused by the effect known generally as "the munchies".

(Definition 3) While at parties, just get wasted to have much fun. She likes to party hard, and last time had to get her stomach pumped afterwards.

This is a key to understanding the role of intoxicating substances and how they are
currently being used. Zinberg (1984) makes distinctions between how these substances are used, making a case for controlled recreational use. Binge drinking is the pathological aspect of ‘partying hard’. A thin line exists between partying as a social ideal and the social problem of ‘drunkenness’. Loose (2002) tries to explain this measured and administered form of ‘enjoyment’. Loose, like Freud, establishes that it is difficult to define the precise nature of how drugs work, yet contends that addiction does exist but is not necessarily tied to a substance. Addiction, he goes on to argue, is a break with social sanctions, it subverts the normal mode of finding pleasure. A society that prides itself on its work ethic would find repugnant this notion of seeking pleasure by rejecting a socially approved route. Addiction provides instant gratification by bypassing convention. It also rejects the strict work/leisure dichotomy and administered enjoyment which society expects.

It is a radical way of fulfilling the imperative of enjoyment constantly thrown at us by the contemporary ideology of consumption. The problem of drug addiction is that the extreme enjoyment achieved through use of the drug at the same time also reveals an ambiguity in the ideology of consumption and a fundamental paradox of the capitalist economy of desire

(Bjerg, 2008:1)

Losing one’s senses to a psychoactive substance in a measured manner is acceptable as long as it does not interfere with an individual’s productivity or disrupt the social order.

Addiction as a disease is a manifestation of a society that thinks of an individual in terms of productivity, the substance of choice has little to do with the nature of the problem. In his analysis of Freud and Lacan’s work, Loose (2002) unravels addiction
as a societal problem beyond a biological framework. The problem posed by the addict isn’t so much biological as it is social (criminal, unproductive, alienating). This can be evidenced from the kind of treatment offered to addicts - 12 step groups attempt to bring the addict back to society by changing them socially (12Step.Org, no date).

4.5.5 Resisting biological explanations

The construction of the addictive personality\(^{24}\) and addictive personality disorder (Harvard Health Publications, 2009) is an effective tool of social control. I first came across this concept in the rehabilitation centre where I worked. One of the counsellors, who was also a recovering addict, spoke about how he had an addictive personality which is different from a ‘normal personality’. He went onto to describe how the ‘addict brain’ was formed at birth and manifested itself in personality flaws. He claimed he could trace these back to early life and claimed to have found instances where this aspect of his personality manifested itself. He wanted the makers of the ICD and DSM to recognise these as proper personality disorders with negative consequences. This is not to mock his struggles to remain sober but to understand how the language of addiction finds its way into the way addiction is conceptualised. The idea that personal narratives were more accurate than scientific

\(^{24}\) The brain of the addict is thought to be different in the way it reacts to pleasure in wanting a high. Structural differences are implicated in how the ‘addict brain’ seeks and wants to maintain a high. Addicts are thought to be more vulnerable to the addictive substance than other people. This is thought to affect their personality which is thought to function differently to that of a ‘normal’ one. This brain is not exclusive to individuals who use psychoactive substances alone, any other indulgent and repetitive behaviour is categorised as addictive. This ranges from gambling, pornography, internet relationships, overeating, to exercise and work. The term was often used as a way of deflecting stigma or getting families to understand that their loved one was not acting out of moral depravity but was being compelled.
knowledge was one that was prevalent in rehabilitation, at the same time expert knowledge and scientific language were selectively embraced. This contradiction was not an exceptional to this centre but one that is widely held in such treatment centres (Davies, 2000). There was an idea prevalent that it was not the substance that was bad or good, but the way an addict consumed it that made them addicts (Harvard Health Publications, 2011). This aspect of the personality made people in recovery vulnerable to engage in behaviours which could lead to other addictions - gambling, food, pornography, exercise and work were some of them. Everyday conversations on the subject revealed how pre-existing prejudices were turned into disorders or indications of a hidden and therefore dangerous condition.

Personality traits presented by him and many others in the field were often contradictory and no more pathological than anyone else’s idiosyncrasies (an example of this was over thinking and under thinking). This concept has been criticised as have other concepts used to describe addicts, as they are often pathologising and contradictory. Parker et al (1995) talk about how these pathologised identities are internalised by the person they are aimed at.

4.6. Changing nature of substances

While there have been arguments for and against the legalisation of intoxicating substances, I am not arguing for either position. I have presented a history of substance use and its changing social categorisation. The biological aspect of addiction is not explored in depth here as the sociological and historical attribution of addiction is the one that provides most contradictions and shapes our understanding within cultural studies of individuals who consume these substances.

Some of the substances I have written about are no longer considered dangerous to
society, some have changed their meaning by becoming more easily available, the fear they once occupied has been transferred onto other substances. It would be anachronistic to apply our current understanding of addiction to the past, or to argue that explanations from the past must be used in current policy making. Changes occur in the way we consume these substances and the signifiers attached to them are constantly shifting. In my own lifetime the government of India has moved to ban cigarette companies from advertising their products and to force putting up statutory warnings on films and television programs that depict an actor smoking (VakilNo1, 1996; Ministry of Law and Justice, 2003). Our understanding and consumption of these substances has also changed. Restrictions on these substances and the need for intoxication are tied to one another as a means of finding ‘forbidden pleasure’. Everyday consumption of these substances has become the subject of a class and culture war in India. Under constant threat from revisionist history it has become hard to articulate a different opinion on such taboo subjects. There is a constant redrawing of boundaries when it comes to locating addiction, locating it within Indian history helps reduce the otherness that is often argued for. However being able to locate a condition alone does not help change prejudices.

Ideas about the ‘addict’ and their image in society remain controversial. The subsequent chapters will examine how social prejudice overthrows ‘academic neutrality’, even informing it in some cases. Everyday discourse which features in cinema has a cumulative effect on perceptions of gender and mental illness. Drunkenness as a trope is commonly used in films across the world. However those portrayals are different across genders. These representations can be offensive, stigmatising and a means of propaganda, very few portrayals accurately depict this issue with sensitivity without alluding to other pathologies. However these onscreen
ideas have found resonance in academic discourse and in shaping everyday opinion.

4.7. Conclusion

While this chapter examines notions of addiction and its changing features, the next chapter is going to discuss the other element in this thesis - cinema. This chapter briefly looks at the role of film in addiction narratives, the next chapter will examine Bollywood in depth though its history, impact and unique characteristics. The relationship of mental illness in cinema is one that is fraught with misrepresentation. However cinema uses particular narratives to convey meaning, creating a visual mythology for its viewers. Portrayals of addiction similarly are steeped in this mythology. As this thesis looks at the relationship between representation and consequences of those actions it is necessary to provide an account of a film industry that is very influential in India and abroad.

4.7.1 Postscript

While I have critiqued recovery models, groups and individuals caught in the crossfire, this is in no way suggesting these ideas are not useful. I have witnessed paradoxes in labelling and not labelling. One lady I spoke to in rehab said ‘I feel a relief now I know what I am going through, I am not alone’. On the other hand she expressed grief over the fact that now she was trapped within the mental health system and she was less likely to be seen as credible. The dilemma is that often without getting a diagnosis, it is impossible to access the services needed for recovery. This is a dilemma faced not just by Indian women, but by women and even men around the world. Human suffering is inevitable, however its creation and attribution to mental illness remains contentious.
As any social system, it is bound to have both success and failure. Our understanding of people and their suffering is imperfect. There are many individuals who have found the help they were looking for through these models and treatments. However, there are those who are still caught up in a system that has only pushed them deeper into pathology. The system of psychiatry and how it operates through culture must always be questioned.
PART II - The Bollywood Connection
CHAPTER 5

5 Indian Cinema

‘To the battered body of human beings inhabiting the modern Indian state, always struggling against bosses, poor pay packets and circumstances in general, the Hindi film provides a holiday from life.’

Anil Saari

5.1 History of Indian cinema and its impact

This chapter looks at the origins and impact of Indian cinema with a focus on Bollywood. Film is a powerful and popular medium of entertainment and communication, and the Bollywood film industry is second only to Hollywood in terms of output scale and global reach.

The history of cinema in India is closely tied to national identity and its public face. While cinema creates history on screen it in turn has been influenced by history. Commonly characterised by song and dance routines, colour and melodrama, Bollywood cinema takes on many forms. The history of the Indian nation can be read in what Bollywood represents on screen and also what it hides. Ideas of gender and culture can be read in the way characters are depicted on screen. Bollywood is a unique form of cinema, with its musicals and melodramatic narratives it has influenced film making around the world and in turn has been influenced by world cinema. The economic output of the film industry has made it a hugely successful business investment (Lorenzen & Täube, 2008).

Cinema, even when frivolous, is a powerful medium of communication, transmitting
ideas that help reproduce the nation. A majority of Bollywood movies are made for entertainment yet the influence of the medium is great, Bollywood songs find their way into music charts and merchandise on store shelves (Udasi, 2013). Films are discussed as part of common conversation as are songs. Films with controversial content have divided national opinion, at times seeing calls for national bans and even violent protests.

5.1.1 Early origins of Indian cinema, Indian/Hindi size, influence

Indian cinema has had an extensive influence both in India and around the world for a number of decades. The origins of Indian cinema lie in pre-independence India. Released on 18th May 191225, Bombay Pundalik (directed by R.G Torney) is considered India’s first silent film. However this position is contested, as it was shot by an English cameraman (Chakravarty, 1993). Raja Harishchandra26 (1913) by D. G ‘Dadasaheb’ Phalke is popularly regarded to be the first film made in India with complete indigenous effort. The plot of this film is based in Hindu mythology (Takhar, McLaran, Stevens, 2012). The British had already introduced the medium of film in India (Chakravarty, 1993) and cinema houses projecting silent films became a source of popular entertainment. The fact that films of that era were silent made it possible to have a universally comprehensible national cinema.

25 With its release in 1812 Chakravarty points out Indians got to watch their first film earlier than the Americans. The film is based on a Maharashtrian saint.

26 Made in 1913 India’s first (silent) film Raja Harishchandra by D. G ‘Dadasaheb’ Phalke portrayed the life of the legendary King Harishchandra, found in the Mahabharat. Phalke was inspired by The life of Christ which he viewed in 1911. With the intention of making similar films based on Indian history, Phalke’s numerous films explore Hindu mythology. Given the fact that India was still a British colony at that time, the theme of the movie could represent nascent nationalism and a need to establish a national identity. (National Film Archive).
Early Indian cinema was based in cities such as Calcutta (now known as Kolkatta) and Pune (a city in south west India close to Bombay). The language used in these films primarily was Bengali and Marathi, the official language of Maharashtra state. Other Regional centres existed too. In Post-independence, Bombay (now known as Mumbai) came to dominate the film industry and Hindi became the language of Bollywood (Bose, 2007). However other regional centres still exist and produce films in the local languages reflecting their social reality (Vasudevan, 1995). Film centres in the four southern states and other regions of the nation produce films in their respective languages. The partition of India in 1947, into India and Pakistan, also caused a split in the film industry with performers migrating to both sides of the border. This did not however reduce the regard for the contribution of these earlier performers (Anantharaman, 2008)

The term Bollywood is derived as a portmanteau of Bombay, where the industry is based, with Hollywood. However the usage was actually borrowed from the earlier term Tollywood, the film industry of West Bengal in the Tollygunge area of Kolkatta, which dates back to 1932. The name Bollywood has been criticised for imitating Hollywood (Rajghatta, 2008).

Bollywood is currently rumoured to be the second largest film industry worldwide producing over 1000 films a year. Dudrah and Dudrah (2012) claim this figure is an exaggeration, they place the total output of films at about 200 a year. Bollywood movies are popular around the world and are commonly characterised by catchy song and dance routines and exaggerated characters.

---

27 Dudrah and Dudrah explain this commonly held fallacy; they suggest that the output of regional cinema is also taken into account while talking about Bollywood. The collective output of Indian cinema might be about 1000 films, however when taking the output of each region into consideration this amounts to much less for Bollywood on its own.
5.1.2 The use of Hindi in cinema

Though often conflated, the terms Bollywood and Indian cinema are different. Bollywood films are made in Hindi (in its many dialects) and in recent years in the new hybrid dialect called ‘Hinglish’ (a combination of both Hindi and English words). Indian cinema on the other hand is a wider field, it comprises films made in various Indian regional languages, dialects and even English. Bollywood is merely the most widely known branch of Indian cinema.

The decision to use Hindi in Bollywood movies did not go unchallenged, mirroring the controversy the Hindi language has faced when its use has been made official in India. As movies based in Hindi they transmit a certain social reality. Hindi is spoken mainly in northern India, gradually being introduced in other parts of the country. The use of Hindi has been a contentious issue in a nation where more than one language is spoken and each language represents an ethnicity. Hindi cinema continues to hold a powerful dominance over cinema of other regions.

5.1.3 Features of Hindi films

Most Bollywood films run for about 3 hours. They are commonly characterised by song and dance sequences that are often just interludes between episodes of the plot (which may have no direct connection with music or dance), as opposed to being background action or an integral part of the story as might happen within Hollywood musicals. A range of styles and genres might be used in these sequences - cabaret, fantasy, elements of Indian folk tales (Pinto, 2006). These song and dance numbers are carefully choreographed and filmed, and the music distributed in the same way as pop music albums (Manuel, 1991).
This element has frequently been criticised as distracting from the plot and adding to the melodramatic element of films:

And, in effect, even the criticisms of the existence of these song and dance sequences in movies have helped it to gain greater legitimacy; academic attention has been paid by film scholars, sociologists, creative writers, as well as anthropologists, and elevated its status to a fundamental feature of Bollywood movies and also the key feature that differentiates it from World Cinema.

(Saraogi, 2013:5)

5.1.4 Technological changes

Over the decades, Bollywood has kept abreast with the changes affecting film technology by introducing both sound and colour. Sound was introduced to Hindi films in 1931 with the film Alam Ara (ornament of the world) directed by Ardeshir Irani. Similarly, colour was introduced by Moti B. Gidvani in 1937 in the film Kisan Kanya (farmer girl). Bollywood has introduced new technologies in the production of film over the decades similar to its western counterparts.

Hindi cinema has been a major point of reference for Indian culture in this century. It has shaped and expressed the changing scenarios of modern India to an extent that no preceding art form could ever achieve. Hindi cinema has influenced the way in which people perceive various aspects of their own lives.

(Bagchi, 1996)

The impact of popular films can be felt in the way in which they have become a
5.1.5 Market for Bollywood cinema (India and the rest of the world)

Bollywood films have found a place in the international market, a trend which began in the late 1940s shortly after independence (1947). In Turkey, for instance, the 1951 film Awara (vagabond) was voted as the best movie of 1955, beating Hollywood films such as Roman Holiday and Limelight (Gurata, 2010). The film had similar impact in the Soviet Union. Produced and directed by Raj Kapoor, who also had a starring role, the film has been voted among the top 100 films of the century by TIME magazine. The song Awara hoon (I am a vagabond) was popular the world over. The film explores morality and has leftist leanings. This film is not an exception in Turkey but has a fan following across the world along with other Bollywood films (Eleftheriotis and Iordanova, 2006).

Bollywood films are widely screened in Asia, Africa, the Soviet Union and Europe. They have been seen as an alternative to Hollywood’s hegemony in the international film market. Restrained sexuality in the characters, especially women, made the films from the earlier years suitable for universal viewing. Many Hollywood films on the other hand were thought of as unsuitable for viewing with family (Ebrahim, 2008; Rajadhyaksha, 2003). Over the decades this has changed though, with restrained sexuality being replaced by subtle and even blatant images of sexualised female characters.

Bollywood’s reach to nations fighting freedom struggles made it the perfect medium of propaganda and entertainment. Though most Bollywood movies have been originally made in Hindi, they have been translated into many languages (dubbed or
Indian cinema has had a reach in countries where Hollywood is perceived as too western and vulgar. The movies have also been adapted and adopted by other nations with colonial histories having similar cultural reference points (eg. Nigeria) (Adamu, 2010; Obiaya, 2011). Bollywood has been positioned as a more indigenous and more relevant form of cinema. It has also had a presence in countries that have been antagonistic to America during the cold war. The move to screen such films goes beyond their entertainment value and is also a political and economic strategy (Rajagopalan, 2006). Larkin (1997) has analysed how Bollywood cinema has become a major form of entertainment in northern Nigeria, a region very different from India:

> Indian films offer Hausa viewers a way of imaginatively engaging with forms of tradition different from their own at the same time as conceiving of a modernity that comes without the political and ideological significance of that of the West.

(Larkin, 1997:407)

Indian cinema has influenced the cinema style of other nations in terms of visual character and plot. While Indian cinema has been accepted in many nations as an alternative to Hollywood, this acceptance is not universal. Bollywood films have been criticised as overly melodramatic and even vulgar. Bangaladesh has even banned Bollywood films, a ban that has not been revoked for over four decades (Lim, 2010). Within India too, Bollywood films have have not found a universal audience and have been banned by a separatist group named Revolutionary Peoples Front (Bhaumik, 2000; F. Entertainment, 2014; Varadarajan, 2001).
5.1.6 Parallel cinema and alternatives to popular cinema

Although most Bollywood movies are made for entertainment, art house and independent cinema also exist which produce movies whose content is often more serious. Known as Parallel cinema in India, films of this genre were inspired by Italian realism (Bose, 2008). Emerging in the 1940s this genre has undergone changes and has even influenced Bollywood and been influenced by it. Directors such as Satyajit Ray, Ritwik Ghatak, Bimal Roy, Mrinal Sen, Tapan Sinha, Khwaja Ahmad Abbas, Chetan Anand, Guru Dutt and V. Shantaram have been pioneers in the field of realistic cinema. This cinema emerged as an alternative to the routine entertaining muscials of the era (Guy, 2007; Rai, 2009). These films are still an alternative to the popular entertainment aimed at the masses.

These films have helped in raising issues of social interest and highlighted existing social problems. They are characterised by realistic settings, costumes and acting; sometimes by the accurate portrayal of historical events. Parallel cinema emerged as a reaction to popular cinema which was not seen as serious.

Films in this genre have earned critical acclaim the world over and in some cases even commercial success. Some of the films in this genre are landmarks in Indian cinema and often cited as classics (Dissanayake, 1986). Despite their acclaim many of these films have not found an audience in India and have not been screened as widely as they have across the world (Majumdar, 2012).

In recent years portraying social issues that are rarely publicly discussed has led to violent protests. For instance, Deepa Mehta’s films which portrayed a homosexual relationship between two women were attacked by protesters on the basis that they would spoil Indian culture (Mankekar, 2004). These films have a niche audience, a
limited release and are often only viewed in light of the controversy. Often well researched and less glamorous than standard Bollywood films, these films are often overlooked (Krishen, 1991). While art films can be appreciated for their portrayal of reality they have not been commercial successes.

Chatterjee, in summarising Saari’s stance on art films concludes:

… The average Indian art film was a dull, boring affair either full of platitude or, worse still, philosophical ramblings leading nowhere. The market for such productions, then as now, was practically non existent. Though they did win kudos at obscure film festivals abroad, no distributor worth his weight in salt would touch them because for him the bottom line was always box-office success.

(Saari and Chatterjee, 2009:xviii)

Despite the fact that art cinema has been used as a tool for understanding history and social change and its educational merit is widely regarded, its popularity pales in comparison to Bollywood.

5.2. Cinema and the nation

Cinema tells the story of a nation and reflects national preoccupations and anxieties. This is a two way process, as cinema also tries to shape our thinking and change the way a nation thinks about social issues. Bollywood films over the years have attempted to change the way the nation thinks about social issues. Through the medium of entertainment, some films have tried to raise social awareness, either through satire or through a serious storyline. Anxieties of secularism and of losing one’s Indian identity to an indistinguishable modernity are some of the themes found
Bollywood, though not based in fact, creates what Chatterjee calls an invention of its own history. Bollywood cinema makers have come to create their own history and entered the social imagination. They have created a history that changes to suit their own agenda. Over the decades the content and representation of characters has undergone change. From an idealised secularism of post independence, post partition India the need to assert one’s identity has become important in cinema. The change in onscreen portrayal of identities is reflective of changes in the way nationalism is growing in India.

5.2.1 Birth of the nation

One can see a change in films where there is a clear emphasis on identity and religious difference being a cause of difference. The change from secularism to blatant right wing Hindu propaganda has also been noted in television shows (Mankekar, 2004). Chaudhuri (2010) contends that over the last few decades’ Indian television soaps have become more right wing in their agenda and portraying an idealised Hindu life - Hindutva. The portrayal is not restricted to religious identities alone but also to ethnic identity. Dwyer (2010) points out that Indian cinema does not overtly try to modify social thought, rather its focus is on entertainment, the message is more accidental than planned:

The power of cinema’s history is that it often replaces academic history in the public imagination. Indian cinema’s history is not about truth, nor is it an enquiry into truth. It is a presentation of the past built on images, words, and
imagination. Indian cinema tells a history of India but, like historical films made elsewhere, they often reveal as much about the time in which they were made as about history itself.

(Dwyer, 2010:386-387)

Dwyer’s argument about representing contemporary history reveals the struggle a nation faces when faced with social change. Anachronistic historical representations can be as relevant as factually correct ones. The romance or the distancing of the past can be read in relation to what the nation imagines an era to be. Since films gain a wider audience than academic authenticity, the power of popular media on the imagination is stronger.

The cinematic connection between violence and communal politics has also intensified in Hindi Cinema in recent years. Deep-seated prejudices about Muslims are rife in Indian society, burgeoning in the troubled history of the Subcontinent, with its successive invasions and the consequent pogroms of Hindus and the destruction of their temples.

(Rajgopal, 2011:238)

Changes in the way communities are represented are symptomatic of a nation trying to create its history and an identity. Films can be seen as a symptom of this struggle to create an identity, the othering of communities and social problems is essential to their cause.

5.2.2 Decadence and the nation

Over the decades the content of films has undergone many changes in the way it treats the same subjects. Social change has altered the way films portray characters,
the characters almost representing larger social norms than they have. Rey Chow asserts that the changes occurring in her film *Spring in a small town* reflect the changes in modern China (Chow, 2013). The dilemmas of the characters are also the dilemmas of the nation. She asserts the nation speaks through these characters. The remake of the same film represents a change in social attitudes over the decades. The original film was released in 1984, based on a feudal family in roughly about the same time period. Set in rural China the story revolves around a love triangle between a woman, her former lover and her husband. While the marriage has run its course, the entry of her former lover causes the characters to introspect on the nature of their lives and priorities. This version of the film is introspective and mature in its treatment of marital conflict. Remade in 2002, Chow argues the newer version is more melodramatic and evokes nostalgia for the past.

Similar films can be found in Bollywood. The characters are made more pitiable in the retelling of the story. Bollywood films reflect these changes, they represent the tensions of the nation, its anxieties portrayed by actors who represent the preoccupations of the nation. The films chosen for discussion need to be analysed in the background of the historic events that shaped them. Chow’s (2013) analysis of films looks at how the nation is the backdrop of films and how characters of films can be viewed as idealised citizens. Sympathy for a ‘glorious version of history’ combined with an emphasis on the Chinese identity the nation is exerted through popular media (Chow, 1990:143).

Nostalgia is not simply reaching toward the definite past from a definite present, but a subjective state that seeks to express itself in pictures imbued with particular memories of a certain pastness. *In film*, these subjectively pictorialized memories are there for everyone to see: nostalgia thus has a
public life as much as a purely private one.

(Chow, 2001:215)

Similar reference points can be found in Indian media which operates under similar premises.

5.2.3 Visual mythology

Historical inaccuracy creates visual myths of its own. Bollywood films have been criticised for being historically and socially inaccurate (Dwyer, 2011; Khan, 2011).

Hindi cinema interprets Indian history, telling stories about the nation – whether under threat or victorious; about sexuality and gender, looking at great figures of the past, implying a contrast with the present; and other such themes, rather than trying to represent accurately the given historical moment. The past is used then as a heterotopia, or another place, more often than a heterochronia, or different time. It is then used to tell us more about the present than the present itself can.

(Dwyer, 2010:386)

Song and dance routines punctuate the storyline, which can be a surreal experience disrupting the narrative. Over-dramatic characters, stereotypes and tropes make these films inaccurate either historically or socially. Most films (especially historical) are not well researched and portray an imagined history; liberties are taken with the costumes and sequence of events. Similarly, liberties are taken when portraying characters from minority groups. The visual mythology these films create shapes the way the nation is imagined. Common tropes and symbols of Bollywood create a visual myth. This myth making process is made up of the repository of images and
ideas that come out of those images. Nandy (1998) describes this process as self-created myths, creating nostalgia for an imagined sense of community.’ He asserts these films do not need to be accurate nor their plot linear, the emotional content overrides the factual elements of the film creating its own narrative in the process. The surrealism of songs and subplots is intended to be a part of the narrative. Elements of the Bollywood films can be read on their own but as a whole they are meant to convey ideology through tropes.

The idea put forth by Bollywood films is a longing for a lost utopia (Nandy, 1998). The nation is idealised, its past presented as a time of innocence which has been lost in cities and modernity. People and communities are often presented in an idealised manner, ‘Indian culture’ presented as curative of social ills. Adam Curtis explores the narrative of the nation through his film *It Felt Like a Kiss*. Made up of many unconnected images and music pieces it tells the story of America post war up to the attack on the twin towers. While the images and music in the film are unconnected, they are historically accurate for the time and reflect American preoccupations of the time. The film, while telling a factual tale also tells an emotional one, a phenomenon explored by Curtis in his work (Curtis, 2009; Hakko, 2011). Bollywood films follow a similar technique of creating emotional narratives. The music and images of idealised characters feed into the social imagination of the viewer and the nation. While Dwyer (2002) points out that Bollywood movies are not made to be serious but to entertain, their impact nevertheless is great.

Chow (2013) examines the way the nation is reimagined through cinema. She argues that not only is the past recreated through modern eyes but also remade with a sense of nostalgia. This recreation of history and nation is evocative and creates a sense of history dissimilar to the actual era. Images, she contends, are powerful in creating the
other. In the case of Indian cinema it presents a picture of idealised nation, gender and community. Ideas of the nation and Diaspora are a part of this creation; they invoke ideas about the other while trying to safeguard their own position. Moorti (2005) examines the way Bollywood is presented to diasporans by creating images of the nation and community. The effects of this mythology can be seen in the way it translates itself into real life situations. Ideas presented on screen often end up informing people about different communities.

While cinema of any kind does not represent society completely, it does to some extent project the desires of those involved in its production. The idealised female or despised fallen woman are both indicative of the writer/director’s own fantasy. Since one can only produce work representative of one’s time, these stories can be interpreted as typical preoccupations of the society in which one is writing. Cinema can be understood as the visual expression of a nation, expressing itself in the form of images and ideas.

5.2.4 Medium of instruction

Cinema has been utilised both as a means of instruction, national propaganda and a tool of the empire (Chowdhry, 2000; Kotkin, 2008; Rentschler, 1996; Woods, 1995). Bollywood can be read as a wider cultural project to educate and propagate. In the case of Bollywood this can be seen in the way it disseminates itself. Popular songs and characters become household names and part of conversation. Films not only entertain but also instruct and bring ideas into awareness. Bollywood reproduces on screen the standards that the nation is expected to conform to. Romantic family oriented dramas or action films reproduce ideas of gender, sexuality and acceptable behaviour.
5.3. **Gender sexuality and cinema**

The portrayal of sexuality in Bollywood can be read as subversive, hiding and exposing at the same time. The presentation of Bollywood as a family friendly medium is maintained while portraying sexuality and eroticised female bodies in the same film. Dwyer’s (2000, 2006) work examines in detail landmark films and tropes used in Hindi cinema. Her analysis focuses on popular recurring themes, including the representation of gender, the ‘male gaze’ and Indian notions of idealised womanhood. Bollywood presents idealised notions of heterosexuality and gender which can be problematic as the medium is both pervasive and influential.

In her paper titled *The erotics of the wet sari in Hindi films*, Dwyer (2000) uses dress (in this case the sari) as the focus of analysis. Saris are considered the proper dress for Indian women and are the national dress. However, ‘the wet sari’ subverts that notion of decency and female modesty that the dress is supposed to represent. The dress itself has political connotations in India. Saris are deeply tied to the national identity - a Hindu identity. It is thought to be a modest dress when compared to western clothing despite exposing some parts of the body. Dwyer’s (2000) paper examines this paradox of modesty and sexual titillation, which are experienced in the same scene.

### 5.3.1 Subversive Eroticisation

Although Bollywood is recognized for portraying traditional values, it also manages to portray sexuality in its own way. While the films may not overtly depict nudity or scenes of a sexual nature they manage to do so in veiled manner. The wet sari is one of the common tropes employed - a mode of dress that at the same time both conceals and exposes the body, a garb that is simultaneously sexual and Indian.
Women attired in this way form a paradox in Indian cinema that not only entertains families but also tantalises male audiences; Bollywood manages to do both. The images of the wet sari tantalise the audience by exposing the erotic zones of the female body while it is still being covered, albeit in tight fitting wet clothing. Eroticism in song and dance sequences is implied in an acceptable form and is therefore almost legitimised. Dwyer and Patel (2002) argue that it is not just the wet sari but also other articles of clothing which become fetishised veils.

Derné and Jadwin (2000) go one step further in their analysis of Bollywood’s depiction of female bodies on screen. In their paper titled *Male Hindi Filmgoers' Gaze: An Ethnographic Interpretation*, they point out a blurring between the sensual and pornographic in Bollywood movies. Dwyer (2000) makes a distinction between the work of different directors and their portrayals of the same scene. While the idea of a woman in wet clothing is very sexualized, Dwyer points out that some directors are able to portray the scene in a different way to make it look aesthetic and even as spontaneous fun. Sexual content is still portrayed but in a sly manner. Portraying sexual content remains contentious in Indian cinema and also has to go through the Censor Board, the way around this is using subversive tactics that hint at the sexual act. Song and dance sequences and their lyrics hint at the sexual act, the lyrics imply what cannot be shown. The wet sari is one of the many tropes that can be used to imply what cannot be shown explicitly. While obvious nudity would be taboo, the sari, by virtue of being a garment of national identity and female modesty subverts these notions. It sexualises the female body under the guise of decency and entertainment.

Between the moral authority of the state's censor board and preoccupation with women's bodies through strategic camera angles and movement is the
gratification and scopic pleasure that filmed bodies, especially those of the vamp, offer to both male and female viewers. The vamp is presented as the sexualized woman, craving men and their attention by inviting their gaze upon herself, her body, her eroticized gestures and movements. This exhibitionism, pleasurable to the audience, is simultaneously condemned as immodest, prurient, and 'bad'. Thus one can enjoy the visual pleasure, the spectacular and erotic dance numbers, while keeping intact a sense of moral indignation by condemning the woman in unison with the narrative.

(Virdi, 1999:25-26)

Female bodies are presented for display and entertainment, the sexualisation is deliberate and meant to reinforce a certain kind of heterosexual norm. There is a deliberate focus on the way female bodies are displayed and viewed by the audience. Hindi cinema tends to sexualise women. In a nation which has been described as the fourth most dangerous place in the world for women (TrustLaw, 2011), film and television are constantly showing sexualised images of women, of both Indian and western origin. Derné and Jadwin (2000) examine how the cinema hall in India is a space for men to react to images of women that have been sexualised, using gestures such as whistling or clapping. These images play an important part in the way they position women. Westernised women are perceived to be more sexual and open to exploitation whereas the Indian woman is a model of domesticity. Dwyer (2006) examines this idea of symbols of westernisation (dress) being a source of exploitation and lack of control (male control over women).

Bollywood’s subversive power lies in the manner in which it finds a way of expressing female sexuality without the use of nudity. Associations with ideas of westernisation or shots under waterfalls convey a sexually explicit message without
depicting the act of sex explicitly. These tropes are used as a means of creating a socially acceptable voyeurism through thinly disguised vulgarity. Tropes are commonly deployed in family friendly cinema where the less child friendly content passes under the radar due to the manner of presentation. Pairing neutral images with sexual undertones makes for a code that is easily unravelled by Bollywood audiences. One can then read the role of women in Bollywood as one purely of providing sexual titillation, their every action as evidence of this. These obvious hints are hidden behind notions of respectability and ideas of pseudo modesty.

5.3.2 Pseudo morality

While popular films get away with erotic content, art films or films which depict sexuality in a mature manner often court controversy. For instance the film Bandit Queen which depicts both nudity and rape has been subject to controversy despite the fact the script calls for these scenes. Yet numerous mainstream songs and films depicting prolonged rape scenes and other scopophilic material goes virtually unchallenged (Manohar and Kline, 2014). Citing cultural degeneration as a reason mature depictions of sexuality that do not provide titillation. Invoking Indian cultural values and nostalgia for the joint family, these films subvert viewer expectations and threaten to overturn nationalistic propaganda.

There can be no return to a pristine, unalloyed Indian culture. To argue that there is no pure space of Indian culture is not to argue that Indian culture does not exist. Rather, it is to argue that the production of culture is a historical

\[28\] Released in 1994 amidst a call for a ban in India, the film is based on the autobiographical account of Phoolan Devi (Mala Sen) who was gang raped by men in her village and eventually took to arms. The film, made by director Shekar Kapur, is an art film and won awards.
process that is constantly changing and altering that it is protean never stable, nor fixed. It is to argue that the shape shifting of culture and an inquiry into its construction are legitimate processes.  

(Kapur, 2000:59)

Bose (2000) would term the film Fire (made in 1996) as an act of feminist resistance, subverting gender expectations against the backdrop of the traditional Hindu middle class family. Amongst some of the concerns raised is the idea that such films portray India through western eyes which refuse to look past the savage native stereotype (Mason, 2002). Despite these misgivings it is interesting to note how mainstream cinema is not put through similar scrutiny.

5.3.3 Segregated clothing and the nation

While Dwyer’s (2000) analysis problematises the sexualisation of the female body, it does not extend to an analysis of the nationalisation of dress, or the way female dressing in India is segregated. Her analysis of who wears a sari reinforces these divisions of non-Hindu communities who are always marked by their ‘otherness’. She concludes by examining saris and their inextricable ties to Mother India (Bharat Mata, the national personification of India as a Hindu mother goddess in a saffron or orange sari, holding a flag and next to a lion). This idea is both recent and invented, the origins of which can be found in western nationalism (Ramaswamy, 2009). This analysis of dress as being a symbol of religion segregates women from non-Hindu communities who are characterised by their different attire, which also symbolises a lack of assimilation. Ideas of nationhood are almost always attributed to women who are seen as reproducers of the national ideal (Yuval-Davis, 1997). Bollywood normalises the problem of belonging to a community by playing on the idea of dress
as a matter of religious identity.

There is an underlying nationalism in India associated with dress, particularly women’s dress. It is an obvious symbol of belonging and of the perpetuation of Indian social values through women. While the sari would have had its origins in Hindu India, its usage is not limited to the community. Dwyer (2000) also points out the changing trends in India and the shift from Indian dress to more western or fusion dress. However, her analysis does not reflect those changes or contradictions in women’s dress but reaffirms stereotypes about communities. Some of the changes in either accepting or rejecting the sari have been a way of making a political statement, of rejecting a certain ideal that may not be accompanied with a religious explanation.

Discrepancies in dress are often due to diversity in regional norms. Northeast India is a region where women don’t wear saris or salwar kameez (a long tunic top worn over loose pants, with a long scarf). The people of the northeast are also absent from Bollywood films and analysis. Most analysis of Indian culture revolves around northern Indian culture with a few objectionable references to the south and almost none to the northeast. The book Filming the gods: Religion and Indian cinema (Dwyer, 2006) examines this lack of representation and even misrepresentation of minority communities. While being a part of a religion does shape identity, it intersects with regional and geographical identities also. Saris have been the only dress worn by south Indian women for many generations irrespective of their religion. While writing about India, contradictions within Indian culture are often ignored and many prejudices get reinforced in the bid to present an authentic India. Minorities such as Christians and Muslims are almost always misrepresented and presented as non-Indian communities whose culture has no variation. Sahu and Rehmani (2010) discuss the way minorities in Indian cinema are given scant
attention or portrayed through prejudiced eyes, never as the main character but always on the margins. They argue that minorities are almost always presented through negative stereotypes.

Regional identities sometimes overshadow religious identities and vice versa, as do notions of female modesty which in some cases problematises wearing saris. Women’s dressing in India has been undergoing change in recent years. Western dress is fast becoming the preferred style of dress, but this change is not always met by approval. In Kashmir for instance, a switch to jeans and other western clothing has been met with hostility and even acid attacks. Newspaper reports (Nelson, 2012) describe these attacks and why the attackers felt that a change of dress implied a loss in cultural values and also a loss of modesty.

5.3.4 Hidden from plain sight

The Northeast is persistently portrayed as either savage or exotic; the more recent documentaries, being sympathetic, focus on the exotic. Sen (2011) notes how there are no reliable images of the Northeast that reaffirm the negative ideas already held about them (savage, tribal, violent or backward). His analysis explores the idea of folk and classical culture, and mainstream Indian culture being classical, tends to make folk culture look savage or inferior. Bollywood tends to portray the idea of the savage ‘other’ when it comes up against groups that are considered minorities. As a person with mixed ethnic identity, both Northern and Southern Indian, and a Christian religious identity, I find that Bollywood rarely provides any meaningful or realistic images of those identities, instead it provides negative stereotypes which are offensive and do little justice to minority communities. As someone who belongs to mainland India, the only knowledge I have had about the North eastern states has
been negative. Even living in the north east did not help change the perception most Indians have of people of the region. As people whose ethnicity, race, language, dress and religion is different from most of the country, their community is often thought of as being inferior if not savage. It is only through meeting people from that region and living there that I got to know about a part of India that is often never mentioned in any media. Bollywood, as Dwyer claims (2000), is based on a tradition of northern India (Punjab), or at least it’s influential directors are, which ignores any other contradiction presented to it.

5.3.5 The othering of minorities and their women

Indian cinema serves the function of reifying dominant ideas of society and of helping maintain polarities in communities. Communities are portrayed through the lens of imagined stereotypes, they lapse into tropes and have a corrective function. They maintain the status quo in terms of being peripheral characters. Benegal (2007) states that Indian cinema operates in the role of maintaining a balance between the real world and projecting a ‘normative ideal’.

In terms of tactics the minority character is never the principle character of the film, but always on the margins or marginalised (Sahu and Rehmani, 2010; Essa, 2006). They serve a moral function of warning others. Minorities represent the undesirable nature of the ideal Indian society and as such their position in the film remains subordinate or peripheral. In terms of portraying gender, religion and social problems the portrayal remains superficial, the engagement remains distant. Undesirable ideas of alcohol consumption or drug use get superficial treatment, it is only a problem of an alien community which does not affect the majority.
Cinema in India reproduces the boundaries and prejudices maintained in everyday social life. It often amplifies these divisions by exaggerating the characters (Sahu and Rehmani, 2010). While it is difficult to establish whether cinema portrays real life or if real life imitates cinema, the process seems to work both ways. Cinema tends to influence the way ideas are perceived and propagated. Often cinema portrays ideas in ways that influence the way one thinks of them. Links between films as tools of propaganda are documented. Over time various nations have employed films as a source of state sponsored propaganda asserting the supremacy of national ideologies and even colonialism (Chowdhry, 2000; Kotkin, 2008; Rentschler, 1996; Woods, 1995).

Gender also plays into this notion of the other. The hero in Hindi cinema is almost always Hindu, depicting the notions of both power and rationality. While the nation is imagined as a woman, its following is usually dependant on men and masculinity. Masculinity is depicted as rational and loyal to the nation. India is depicted as female, ‘Mother India’, however her followers and defenders tend to be male. Imagining India as the body of Mother India began as a nationalist enterprise in pre-independence colonial India. Evoking the image of female violation through colonialism, the idea has been imprinted (Ramaswamy, 2001). Given this nationalist imagining of the nation as a mother, it was not long before a challenge was thrown. Katherine Mayo's book Mother India was a polemic pointing out the cruel conditions imposed on women in India. Sinha (1994) points out the imperialistic nature of this work and also the disavowal it received from nationalists. The image of mother India continues to dominate the Indian imagination, informing a national ideal for womanhood through her symbolic body which in turn informs geographical and bodily boundaries (Thapar-Björkert and Ryan, 2002).
Cinema exploits this angle of nationalism and depicts the lead main character as male, Hindu and a defender of national values. Women are used in the role of a source of community identity. The gaze in Indian cinema is ultimately a moral and male one. The national ideal is represented by a disciplined female body.

5.4. Change in the nation and its cinema

There has been a change in Indian cinema over the past few decades, nationalism and secularism have been replaced by religiosity and difference in identities (Dwyer, 2006). Post independence cinema is marked by ideas of uniting as a nation, of moral uprightness. As a nation that had to witness the horrors of a difficult partition the emphasis in cinema was on uniting communities. Once sufficiently united those ideals were no longer needed, identity has come to play an important role in the formation of national boundaries. One can see a change in films where there is a clear emphasis on identity and religious difference being a cause for difference.

Dwyer (2010) points out the imbalance about the portrayal of minorities in Hindi films, she examines notions of policing and morality in her analysis. Stereotypes in Hindi cinema are often based on imagined ideas about communities seen from the perspective of a dominant community, those ideas are amplified and made either comical or frightening. The negative qualities of a character are embodied by minorities.

These films essentialise Muslims as feudal and, by implication, anti-modern. Thus, Muslim portrayal in Hindi cinema has been communal. In average Hindi films portraying family drama, Muslim socials were shown as non-political and thus conveniently avoided the identity crisis of Muslims.

(Kumar, 2013:463)
It can be argued that socially unacceptable qualities are portrayed by minorities in cinema as a means to justify the dominance of the majority.

5.5. Cinema and television

In recent years liberalisation of the Indian economy has seen a change in the way films are viewed from cinema to regular broadcasts on television. The development of technology and the ready availability of television sets has made the spread of film and also television soaps possible. While films have been popular, television in India was limited to a single state owned channel - Doordarshan. Post-liberalization (1991) of the economy saw the introduction of satellite networks which broadcast 24 hours a day with multiple channels catering to every preference (Williams-Ørberg, 2008). Problems such as loss of electricity in Indian homes and poor transmission plagued the development and growth of television. Problems in broadcasting were followed by the legend ‘Rukawat Ke Liye Khed Hai’ (Sorry for the interruption) now a phrase used commonly in Hindi. Doordarshan is still available, however it has been overtaken by more reliable and creative channels.

In India in particular the change in economy and the growth of satellite television in the 1990s has meant the rapid spread of visual media (Jensen and Oster, 2009). In its early days Western programs such as The Young and the Restless, The Oprah Winfrey Show, The Bold and the Beautiful and The Crystal Maze were broadcast (Mankekar, 2004). Amidst this boom in mass media were fears that western television would

---

29 Introduced as an experimental telecast starting in Delhi on 15 September 1959. As a state run network it has been used by the government for spreading propaganda especially during the emergency era. ‘But television did not become a standard, taken-for-granted part of the fabric of Indian everyday life until the mid-1980s’ (Mazzarella, 2012) – when 24 hour satellite channels first appeared.
erode or contaminate Indian culture. After the initial novelty wore off, Indianised versions of these programs were produced to suit the local audience. The demand for films and programs related to films is still high, movies are regularly broadcast on satellite television and film related programs fill several channels\(^{30}\).

With the introduction of satellite television in the last few decades soap operas have become a popular medium of entertainment. With channels in regional languages and international channels, television in India has become a very popular and economically viable means of communication. Indian adaptations of popular international programmes exist alongside their foreign counterparts. Rather than spelling the death of cinema, the rise of satellite television has made broadcasting films to remote areas with no access to cinemas easier.

Like films, television content too has undergone a metamorphosis. In recent years drama series have become popular and are made in most regional languages. These series are often centered on the family and portray family struggles. The majority of the cast is female, however these dramas are far from sympathetic to women. Images of heavily made up women in over the top clothing are shown pitted against each other. Storylines are melodramatic, exaggerated emotional scenes are repeatedly shown. Mankekar (2004) argues that the introduction of transnational globalised media has not diminished nationalist feelings but has reified them. These series portray women and minorities in a very poor light, usually just as supporting actors. Right wing Hindu elements in these series are a common feature; images of worship, gods and goddesses are commonly woven into the plot. This stands in contrast to popular Bollywood films where women are being shown as westernised and not

---

\(^{30}\) Channels such as MTV would regularly broadcast film music as part of their programs much in the same way pop music was broadcast in the west.
solely based around family life. Westernised women are often portrayed as vampish in stark contrast to the protagonists who are idealised Indian women. These right wing portrayals have not gone unchallenged. Images on screen reflect changes in Indian society that is becoming more polarised.

5.6. **Violence in cinema and real life**

The link between on screen and off screen violence is often interpreted in simplistic terms. Studies on the subject matter (Phillips, 1974) have shown links between watching violence and aggressive behaviour, however cause and effect is too simplistic to be generalisable. While there have been some instances of real life violence being inspired by films, I would argue that this is rare and not the norm. The films and incidences of violence discussed in these chapters are not inspired by each other but one can see a similar discourse running through each of them.

Surrealistic as Bollywood films may be, they carry within them the prejudices of the makers which in turn are the prejudices of the nation. In most cases these prejudices remain unchallenged as they are not seen as biases, because these are the views of the majority.

Cinema has the power to inform which it does both consciously and unconsciously. Indian art films try to overtly challenge prejudice and social problems, Bollywood on the other hand is more subtle in the way it plays with ideas. This is ironic as Indian art films are subtle stylistically, whereas Bollywood tends to lean towards the dramatic. It is the repeated validation of prejudices on screen and absence of minority subjects that contributes to the discourse and prejudice seen in real life.

Images of women consuming alcohol or drugs are persistently seen as ‘foreign’ and
violence against them justified. On screen, this is dramatic and part of the narrative, off screen this turns into violence which is justified on similar grounds. To attribute these crimes to films would be too simplistic, denying agency to the perpetrators for their actions. Images on screen play on perceptions rather than actions. The evocative power of images is such that it creates feelings of anger, hurt, loss and even difference (Jain, 2005). This is not a conscious attempt but rather a by-product of cinema.

These images are prevalent in cinema across the world (Mountian, 2004; Etorre, 2007). Similarly Bollywood has the same effect. Fears that Bollywood cinema glamourises alcohol and tobacco consumption have lead to several bans of advertisements and depictions in films (Reddy et al, 2005). Films that depict scenes of smoking in particular have several warning messages shown before, during and after the scene. Refusal to comply to these guidelines have lead to directors refusing to screen their films, a case in point being Woody Allen’s film Blue Jasmine (O’Brien, 2013). While this might seem like a harsh judgement and an infringement on creativity it has been argued that Bollywood is an influential medium and therefore should be more responsible (Prasad, 2009).

Ray & Chugh (2008) go further and elucidate that the hero, villain and comic in Bollywood are all seen to romanticise drunkenness in various situations. Arguing that these films are made for general consumption they argue that the viewers range from the very young to the very old.

In a film-crazy nation such as India, where people idolize their ‘Bollywood’ heroes, it can be assumed that the young and gullible mind would be tempted to adopt the reel life as real life.
Tracing the influence of films on television shows and reality television shows, they go on to point out that it is necessary to check the way alcohol consumption is portrayed on screen.

5.6.1 History and crime

Stephen (2013) observes a similarity between crimes committed against women and similar stories of mutilation in Hindu scriptures. She argues that such crime is easily traced back to cultural and historic roots. Ghai makes a similar case in her work (Ghai, 2002; Singh and Ghai, 2009). While one can observe a similarity between crimes presented in Hindu mythology and present day India, to attribute these crimes to an ancient continuous past would be anachronistic. History has been evolving and these crimes though embedded in a cultural context are a product of their present history. Acid attacks for instance are an easy method of committing violent personal assault, due to ready access to the required chemicals\textsuperscript{31}. While the idea may have something in common with the past and mythology in terms of causing hurt and humiliation to the body to publically shame a woman, the means have changed. To assume that gendered violence is enduring over generations would also do disservice to eras where women have had freedom of expression without violence. To reinterpret the past through a modern understanding would be to negate the achievements of that era.

\textsuperscript{31} A bottle of industrial acid is easy to buy over the counter and is relatively inexpensive. At less than 50 rupees a litre it makes an easy weapon. (50 rupees approximately equal to 50 UK pence)
5.7. **Diaspora and the motherland**

While Bollywood films have made an impact on non-Indian viewers, they have also had an effect on the Indian Diaspora around the world. As a large majority of Indians are migrating around the world, Indian film and television have made their way across the oceans. It is not uncommon to see Indian films being screened in cinemas across the UK either in popular multiplexes or in more independent cinemas. 

Migration and the establishing of Indian communities abroad has contributed itself to being the subject of Indian films. The love of the motherland and its people are presented with nostalgia, immigration is depicted as an exile. The foreign nation is presented as a place of loss (loss of culture and values). Ideas of this loss can be seen in films such as *Dilwale Dhulianiya Le Jayegay* and *East is East*, with the patriarch of the family insisting that the motherland is corrective and also feeling the loss of national values in the way his children have lost values and imbibed values of a foreign nation (Uberoi, 1998; Takhar et al, 2012).

This portrayal has a dual purpose, it informs diasporans of their loss and it cautions citizens of the dangers of leaving home. In both these cases it is not the visual images but ones imagined by the characters on screen and off screen that are important.

---

32 I was made aware of these establishments via an American friend who was looking for cinema halls that screened International films. Her experience of watching a Bollywood film was surreal as she was surprised by the song and dance sequences and what she termed as sexual liberation. This was unexpected, as her experience of South Asian communities had led her to believe we were conservative and bound by tradition.

33 An interesting scene in the film occurs when the Khan family travel to Bradford from Salford and visit a cinema. The family are under the misapprehension that the theatre is showing the film *Chaudhvin Ka Chand*. The owner of the cinema hall, known to the family, changes the movie mid-screening in order to accommodate his ‘family’. A point to note here is that the film in question is Indian and not Pakistani (the Kahn family are Pakistani).
Images of the motherland are more evocative than genuine, they are meant to create a feeling of imagined solidarity and belonging. Takhar et al. (2012) claim that Bollywood films have had an influence on the Indian Diaspora in three distinct ways:

1. Reaffirming pride in Indian heritage;
2. Evoking romance and longing; and
3. Reinforcing family values and a sense of kinship within the British Sikh diaspora.

(Takhar et al, 2012:267)

They go on to tell us how the medium was ‘favoured’ over local entertainment and was used as a means of teaching Indianness. A point not unchallenged by the authors is the reinforcement of gender norms. Femininity and masculinity are treated as absolute in these films and reproduced accordingly. A case in point is Deepa Mehta's 2008 film *Heaven on Earth* or *Videsh* (foreign land), which tells the story of a young Sikh woman who marries a man in Canada and migrates to live with him. Domestic violence, poverty and abuse are a part of this community we are given to understand. However while this film raises a pertinent and relevant issue it did not receive much acclaim (Malani, 2009). Previous films by Deepa Mehta were met with riots and death threats by Hindu fundamentalists who claimed her films depicted Indian culture in a poor light and eroded Indian values. Unrealistic portrayals of the Indian Diaspora in cinema on the other hand make for popular film. In *Kabhi Khushi Kabhi Gham* (sometimes joy sometimes sorrow) the main characters live in a palatial house in England with helicopters for transport, they are affluent and have a strong sense of family values. Indian identity and values are positioned as superior and also self-redeeming.
5.8.  **Women’s bodies and cinema**

In recent years Bollywood has come under criticism for objectifying women. One of the selling points of popular films is the focus on women characters on screen. Making women visible and visually attractive is often played out as being liberating for the actress involved yet is commercially exploitative. Item numbers\(^{34}\) are often made the selling point of a film, these are exploitative and objectify women. Women’s bodies are held up for public viewing, as commodities. Directed at men these shots are meant to titillate.

Despite projecting itself as conservative, Bollywood films introduce elements of sexuality slyly or in the guise of entertainment (Dwyer & Patel, 2002).

5.9.  **Inventing Indian culture**

Hobswam and Anderson (Anderson, 1991; Hobsbawm and Ranger, 1983) have critiqued the production of culture to form national identity. The invention of ‘India’ and ‘Indian culture’ has become a commodity and become a tool of nationalism. Creating these two concepts has led to ethnocentrism.

While the modern nation of India does exist physically, it is very different from the nation that it claims to have been. The imagined boundaries of the past are different from the present ones. Both the physical and the cultural elements of the nation have undergone change and continue to do so. Created in the freedom struggle by nationalist leaders and modelled on western ideas of nationalism in order to free India of its superstitions (Nandy, 1988, 1994), India as we now know it was formed

---

\(^{34}\) Made popular in recent years ‘item numbers’ are performances which feature women singing songs that would be classified as cabaret. The content and dance moves in these songs tend to border on the obscene.
from kingdoms which were autonomous in their own right. Despite the unity of the freedom struggle, differences in identity remained and continue to be causes of division. Similarly, ‘Indian culture’ has remained in a state of flux. Often called upon to separate and maintain differences of ‘us’ and the ‘other’ the notion itself is not a universal one.

Said's work examines how the east was created and exoticised (Said, 1979). Ironically, in India’s case, this process of orientalising is often self-created. This gaze is both inwards and outwards demanding recognition of differences. The process of making India exotic is a strategy used by governments and the advertising agency. Campaigns such as ‘Incredible India’ present a host of images from around the country to sell India as a tourist destination. These images tend to focus on history and cultural differences in terms of region, language and ethnicity.

Creating ‘Indian culture’ maintains differences, becoming a means of social control and exclusion. These identities are resistant to change and become essential in maintaining a façade of superiority. Often one hears of ‘Indian culture’ being used in conjunction with crime, especially crime directed at women. Culture becomes such a rigid identity that changes brought to it are thought of as a loss. Culture and reproduction of culture being attributed to women makes women both victims and perpetrators of these crimes. Survival of one depends on the destruction of the other. Anzaldúa (1999) notes how women often are perpetrators of violence and inciting anger towards other women.

What is assumed to be Indian culture is not universal or universally met with conformity. While women are expected to maintain this culture, its transgressors are branded as western. This cultural transgression is often seen as losing authenticity.
Dangers of losing culture are imagined to be a loss to the self and the nation. Preserving the culture is seen as a necessity even at a personal cost.

While cultures may be categorised as different, differences are positioned in terms of superiority. This discourse of cultural difference keeps the notion of them and us alive, separating and maintaining hierarchies between cultures.

The creation of culture is alienating and often affects those who are caught in the midst of social change. Women for instance, who do not conform to the dominant culture find no support from either their own communities or from communities outside. Black feminists often are left out of women’s movements due to racism, these differences are invented and maintained (Amos and Parmar, 1984; hooks, 1981; Davis, 1983; The New School, 2014). Often positioned as opposing struggles, issues of white women and those of women of colour are assigned differing priorities. White women’s struggles are seen as trivial and problems of the developed world.

The work of Lorde (1983; 1984; 1985) looks at the inequalities within women’s movements and how race intersects to become a criteria of exclusion. While her work is still relevant today there is another side to this exclusion. Dividing feminism along the lines of colour these two movements stand as if opposed to each other.

5.10. **Image of male alcoholics and alcohol dependency in Bollywood**

While this thesis focuses on women’s alcohol and drug consumption, on screen comparison to male counterparts can help highlight the discrepancy in the images. The 1984 film Sharaabi (alcoholic) portrays the life of a young rich man who has lost his way but finds meaning eventually. Songs sung in a drunken moment or used to forget past sorrows are common tropes (Shree 420, Sholay, Amar Akbar Anthony,
Kati Patang). This trope is not isolated but one that repeats itself - intoxicated men in films are comical or suffer momentary bouts of destructiveness (Bhugra, 2005). Their behavior does not make them physically or sexually vulnerable, it is presented merely as funny or tragic with no lasting consequences. Often these scenes have been remembered for their comic effect rather than their depiction of a moral or psychiatric problem (TNN, 2011).

One famous case of the hopeless alcoholic does survive in Indian cinema - Devdas. Based on the Bengali novella of the same name written by Sarat Chandra Chattopadhyay in 1917, adapted for film, theater and television and translated into several Indian languages, the earliest film was made in 1928, since then numerous versions of the story have been told (Creekmur, 2007). The film portrays the life of an indecisive obsessive man with little courage. Turned into a romantic tale over the years the film evokes pity turning Devdas into the ultimate fallen hero of Indian cinema.

While the male portrayal of drug and alcohol use depicts a comic, destructive or even villainous character it is neither sexualised nor does it look at morality in the way women on screen are scrutinized for their behaviour.

5.11. **Conclusion**

Bollywood films and its history can be read as a history of the Indian nation through the process of storytelling, projecting national anxieties and ideals, even reproducing national struggles. While representing history, it makes visible national ideals of gender, beauty, community at the same time as hiding from public view that which it deems unfit. Shaping and shaped by national anxieties, the medium has come to represent the nation and become its representative around the world.
Bollywood has come to create its own unique version of history in the process of capturing and transmitting history. It has created its own culture too, playing into the national unconscious. An influential medium, the impact of films can be felt in economic and cultural terms.

Though lacking in realism these films represent a deeper reality when it comes to conveying the inequalities in Indian society on the grounds of gender, ethnicity, religion and nationalism. An overt reading of these films as melodramatic entertainment can be dismissive of the underlying narrative that plays out in the way characters are projected and their story unfolds.
"Tum kya karo ge sun kar mujh se meri kahani
Bay lutf zindagi ke qisay hain pheekay pheekay"

Why do you want to listen to my story:
Colourless tales of a joyless life.

- Meena Kumari

6.1. Introduction

Following on from the previous chapter, this chapter will examine a few Bollywood films in detail, exploring common tropes and visual symbols employed in Bollywood films. While in recent years Indian cinema has gained attention around the world, global distribution of these films began earlier (Rao, 2007). Some of the films discussed in this chapter have gained critical and commercial acclaim nationally and internationally. Considered to be landmarks in Indian cinema they have been written about extensively (Bhattacharyya and Gabriel, 1994; Dwyer, 2005; Joshi, 2001; Rajadhyaksha and Willemen, 2014).

The popularity of these films can be measured in the way they are referenced in everyday conversations and are further referenced in other popular culture (Srinivas, 2005). Popular dialogues and songs from these films have found their way into everyday communication. To dismiss these films and their impact as trivial does a great injustice to the stronghold they have on everyday life. The dissemination of Bollywood into material and social culture is vital to understand how we imagine ‘modern India’. While the hegemony of Hollywood is often mentioned when writing about world cinema the hegemony of Bollywood over Indian communities remains
Some of the films analysed in this chapter have been remade over the decades, sometimes into other Indian languages, some have been remade into Hindi from other regional languages. Some of these remakes are glamorised versions of a film originally portraying a gritty reality. With a focus on female sexuality, the posters and films are often marketed for titillation rather than artistic reinterpretation.

The focus of this chapter is to analyse how Indian cinema interprets issues of gender and alcohol and drug consumption. While alcohol or drug consumption is not the same as addiction (as a medically defined disorder), excessive use and binges are treated as problems and sometimes equated as being the same. Cinematic narratives portraying such states are not fixed but have been changing over time (Grist, 2007).

Social change is reflected in these films, as are historic events, though they are fictionalised and coloured by cinematic imagination. These films represent different historical eras in India’s development from a former colony through to being a nation which has carefully carved out its national identity, contending to be a world power. An in-depth look is taken at how Bollywood films portray social problems and their treatment of serious subject matter. It examines in detail how the treatment of subject matter has changed against the context of history and social change.

Beginning in 1961 and going through a fifty-year period up to 2011, the role of alcohol/drugs as part of the plot and a larger social narrative will be examined with the focus on women. Situating these films in their historical context gives us an idea about the social events that shaped and came to define an era. Political changes in India and its changing national identity post independence have had an impact on the content of films.
6.1.1 Films examined

The films examined in this chapter are the following:

- **Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam** (1962), produced Guru Dutt, directed Guru Dutt and Abrar Alvi, written Abrar Alvi and Bimal Mitra. Based on a Bengali novel, Shaheb Bibi Golam by Bimal Mitra.

- **Purab aur Paschim** (1971), produced and directed Manoj Kumar, written Shashi Goswami and Manoj Kumar.

- **Hare Rama Hare Krishna** (1971), produced, directed and written Dev Anand.


- **Fashion** (2008), produced Madhur Bhandarkar, Deven Khote, Ronnie Screwvala and Zarine Mehta, directed Madhur Bhandarkar, written Ajay Monga, Madhur Bhandarkar and Anuraadha Tewari.


6.1.2 Rationale for using the films

The films used in this chapter were recommended by Indian people in India and in
the UK. When asked in conversations and in interviews that I carried out during my M.Phil about films they remember about alcoholism or addiction, these films were suggested. Some people declared that they were not thinking about addiction in the clinical sense, but the use of alcohol, drugs and tobacco used as props to develop the plot or the character. Some mentioned these films as their first glimpse of what they then thought alcoholism and addiction must look like.

I found several of these films mentioned in books about Indian cinema by authors whose work is now seminal eg. (Derné, 2000; Dwyer, 2005; Rajadhyaksha and Willemen, 2014). Over the years several film critics have praised these films for their artistic and entertainment value. The older films used in this analysis are considered landmarks in Indian cinema and have been remembered through their songs (Anantharaman, 2008). Dum maro dum (take a drag) the song from Hare Rame Hare Krishna is iconic, it is still played on the radio, at parties and even hummed by a younger generation (Booth, 2012; Gehlawat, 2012). At one conference when I presented a paper about this film an Indian scholar who attended the session said to me “I love this song so much, do you have a copy of it now?” Conversation about the film revealed the impact the film had on her mother’s generation. When asked about this film, my mother remembered how she and other female members of the family imitated the ‘Janice look’. They remembered the catchy music and the way in which India saw a rise of tourism in that era. Speaking to family members who had served in the armed forces revealed how powerful the medium was across the hostile India-Pakistan border. Soldiers would often sing songs from popular films or ask for them to be screened in such a manner that they could be viewed on both sides of the border. Similarly I have heard diasporans mention some of these films as their first means of socialisation into popular Indian culture.
The films chosen for analysis have become an integral part of Indian culture; they are part of everyday memory and language, these films have been super-hits in their time taking significant returns at the box office. In addition to this they are written about extensively by academics from disciplines as diverse as tourism studies, film studies, sociology, gender studies, psychiatry and literature (Dudrah, 2012; Takhar et al, 2012; Uberoi, 1998). Some of the newer films have less literature to back them up but they have been commercially successful and have used aggressive marketing to promote them. Merchandise from these films could be found in shops across the country.

Representation of films between the 1980s and early 1990s is limited, as during this period Bollywood suffered a decline, producing films that were formulaic and rife with melodrama and not much else. The rise of video cassettes led to a decline of cinema goers as well as the kind of films that were produced for film goers. Cinema of this era produced films that lacked in content or novelty. Garish song and dance sequences, double entendres and over the top action sequences were part of this tried and tested formula. A few films did break the mould however they were few and far between.

So it was a vicious circle. Films started to deteriorate in their content because they had to appeal to the lowest denominator, which meant much more basic kind of films - crude films. Action, thrills, a crude kind of romance - which drove even the occasional viewer from the other classes further away’.  

(Sippey, 1996 online)

There is also an issue of class that led to the decline in cinematic content. Films of the eighties and nineties did not appeal to elite urban audiences. This era also saw the
rise of art cinema as distinct from commercial cinema, with its emphasis on reality, complex plots and deep characters. Ganti (2012) and Punathambekar (2013) note the decline in Bollywood over the period 1985 to 1994, citing social class and cinematic quality as factors in decline. Mainstream cinema with its vulgarity and violence suffered reducing audiences. Coupled with the lack of content was the manner in which cinema halls became a space for men and young men in particular (Ganti, 2012; Jain, 1991). This decline was also felt abroad as documented by Hansen with regards to the diasporic community in South Africa (2005).

Films of this era are not exceptional in the manner in which they portrayed female characters but were a norm. The generic treatment of characters and lack of originality in plotlines meant films of that era often used exaggeration and melodrama to highlight their story. While the films might seem to have differences in their treatment of alcohol consumption, the link between sexual promiscuity and loss of Indian culture is still a dominating idea.

This decline in Bollywood can be felt in the discussion of films of this era, which are not as critically acclaimed as the earlier films (Khanna & Dutt, 1992; Chatterjee, 1993). Nevertheless, they were commercially successful. The material they provide for analysis is scant and lacks in the depth provided by the films of previous and later eras. However they do provide an insight into how the issue of women consuming alcohol and drugs on-screen is portrayed.

6.1.3 Themes for discussion

On viewing the films certain wide themes emerge, some of which have features that are common to several films. Existing literature and my reading of the films have
helped generate this list of themes. The themes draw on intersectional feminism, post-colonialism and anti-racism as theoretical resources to read the text accordingly. These themes have been collected and a few common features have been categorised under three main headings listed below.

• Nation

  ◦ The nation in the film
  ◦ Westernisation vs Modernisation
  ◦ Indian culture and its morals
  ◦ Nostalgia for the past
  ◦ Diaspora and loss of self
  ◦ Land of redemption
  ◦ Nation and its minorities

• Gender

  ◦ Interrogating heteronormativity
  ◦ Home is where the hearth is
  ◦ Female bodies and exploitation
  ◦ Women’s pseudo liberation
• Disorder

  ○ Agency and consumption

  ○ Bollywood and madness

  ○ On-screen death

These themes and sub-themes will be discussed in greater detail in the remainder of this chapter.

6.2. **Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam**

*Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam* stars veteran actors Meena Kumari, Waheeda Rehman Guru Dutt and Rehman. Both Guru Dutt and Abrar Alvi are said to have directed this film. Translated, the title means master, wife and servant. Released in 1962 this black and white film is considered a masterpiece in Indian cinema (this is the only black and white film used in my analysis). Based on a Bengali language novel *Shaheb Bibi Golam* by Bimal Mitra, the novel was first adapted into a Bengali film in 1956 (Kabir, 1996:82). The year 2011 saw a spinoff called *Sahib Biwi Aur Gangster* (master, wife and gangster) which does not resemble the original except for a few minor details.

*Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam* was commercially and critically successful, and won a number of Filmfare Awards35. It was also chosen as India’s official entry to the Academy Awards, but the nomination was reportedly rejected by the Academy on the

---

35 Honours awarded annually by The Times of India, for excellence in the Hindi language film industry.
basis that a plot involving a woman who drinks was not acceptable in the Indian
culture (Roy, 2013).

6.2.1 Synopsis

Set in colonial Bengal of the late nineteenth century the film is told through the eyes
of Boothnath, a young educated man from a village who comes to Calcutta\textsuperscript{36} to seek
his fortune. The film opens with the now older and more successful Bhoothnath who
visits the old haveli as part of his work recalling his life and relationship with the
Chowdhury family. His character’s innocence is in stark contrast to the decadence
around him. A worker at the Mohini Sindoor\textsuperscript{37} factory run by the Chowdhury family,
he is privy to their lives. The Chowdhury family are wealthy zamindars\textsuperscript{38} and a
vestige of the past. Some of the things he witnesses in the grand haveli\textsuperscript{39} are new to
him, being an unsophisticated villager. He meets the tragic but beautiful Choti Bahu
(younger daughter in law of the Chowdhury’s). Choti Bahu’s sophistication and class
intimidate Bhoothnath at first but he comes to be her confidante. Their relationship,
though platonic, is a source of contention for the Chowdhury patriarchs, especially
Majhle Babu.

\textsuperscript{36} Calcutta, now known as Kolkatta, was the capital of India at the time. Delhi became the capital in
1911.

\textsuperscript{37} Sindoor also known as vermilion is worn by married Hindu women in Indian. Worn in the parting of
the hair this practice is similar to a wearing a wedding ring. Married women in India also wear silver
toe rings, magalsutras (a holy thread and a wedding necklace made of gold and beads), and bangles.

\textsuperscript{38} Zamindars were a class of landowners created by the Mughals. They collected taxes, they ranged
from independent nobility to landowning peasants. Their title was hereditary and was abolished after
independence in 1947. In early cinema they were portrayed as a dying and decadent class living on
former glories. Their ancestral wealth and historical privilege made them easy villains in early cinema.

\textsuperscript{39} The word haveli means mansion and refers to large independent houses built by landed gentry.
The last we see of Choti Bahu is when she, along with Bhoothnath, is going on a pilgrimage. Intercepted on the way by armed men (sent by Majhle Babu) this is the last time Bhoothnath sees her, with terrified screams to indicate her violent death. Years later her skeleton is found buried in the haveli by Bhoothnath, who finally identifies her as Choti Bahu through her jewellery. Kothatri and Raheja (1996) observe how the death and decay of the zamindar family on screen is symbolic of the death of the feudal system as a whole:

The film was set in a nineteenth century Calcutta mansion, that stood as an architectural metaphor for a crumbling age, succumbing to British exigencies.

(Kothari & Raheja, 1996:59)

Her burial in the haveli can be read as the death of the zamindars, symbolising the death of the last vestiges of the feudal system and the power it held over people, yet with traces that can still be found under the surface.

6.2.2 Analysis

Choti Bahu’s character is treated with sympathy as a woman trapped in a disastrous marriage to Chote Babu, the youngest zamindar of the Chowdhury family. Her character can be compared to the haunting spectre of Charles Dickens’ Miss Havisham, who is trapped in her mansion in her wedding dress. There is an air of doom and despair that surrounds both characters. The poetic and aesthetic qualities Miss Havisham possesses are similar to the ones Choti Bahu possesses.

Choti Bahu drinks to attract her husband, who in a fit of rage asks her to drink to be as appealing as the Kothawalis (courtesans) he visits. Her drinking is prompted by her husband, and not for her own pleasure. On his coaxing she drinks to win his
favour, but even this does not attract him to her. He claims that while he can hold his
drink, she loses control and descends into madness when she drinks. Chote Babu
asserts that as a man he does not have to listen to his wife, she should be like the
other daughters-in-law and amuse herself with getting jewellery made. Her response
is that unlike other women in the household, she has no children, and her life is
empty despite her violating Hindu norms and drinking. She is called mad which hurts
her deeply and makes her cry hysterically. Her realisation that her husband does not
love her hurts her deeply. She violates the social norms for a woman of her stature
only in order to win her husband’s favour, as a reaction to his failure to be a good
husband. Self aware of this violation she exclaims ‘have you ever heard of a woman
in a Hindu household drink?’. Her descent into alcoholism is indicative of the
corruption of the zamindars who are at the heart of the problem and she its victim.

The murder of Choti Bahu would, in the present day, be classified as an honour
crime. It has all the tell tale signs of the silencing that accompanies such an act. Choti
Bahu’s growing dependence on alcohol and her platonic relationship with
Bhoopnath do not find acceptance with the patriarchs of the family. Her
transgression violates the rigid boundaries of gender, class and caste norms. While
the killing is not shown in the film it is implied. Choti Bahu’s loud screams when she
is dragged out of the carriage signal the violence of the attack. This crime is not
condoned but is seen as the last straw that finally breaks the stronghold of the
zamindars. Their ruined haveli and death of the patriarchs are inevitable and almost
retributive.

Obedience and devotion to one’s husband are considered to be values to which
Indian women are expected to conform. The husband on the other hand does not
need to defer to the woman, he is free to act towards her in any manner he deems fit.
Chote Babu believes this to be true of him, his drunken behaviour, adultery and mistreatment of his wife are justified on the basis that he is a man and his inherited class and privilege allow him to behave in this manner. He eventually comes to realise his mistake but it is too late and his wife can no longer live without alcohol. Their physical weakening as a couple and childlessness points to a deeper pathology in the lives of the zamindars and their eventual death of their own making. Decay, weakness and death characterise the second half of the film which builds up to Choti Bahu’s death and Bhoothnath’s later finding of her grave.

An idea presented in this film and several films since is that once married a woman leaves her father’s house to go to her husband and in laws home and is to leave that home only at the time of death. A woman’s identity is tied to the men in her life as her father’s daughter and as the wife of her husband. Marriage is the only life choice that a woman is expected to aspire to. This entails being devoted to one’s husband and his family but also having children, preferably male. Cinema alone is not responsible for propagating this idea. Indian society is structured in a manner that expects the propagation of a strict heterosexuality. In recent years this has been tied to romantic love but the expectations for a woman remain the same. Being trapped in an unhappy marriage is seen as a woman’s fault, she is not trying hard enough to make her husband happy.

The film makes a case for female emancipation and Hindu reform. Bramho Samaj\textsuperscript{40} was a movement that began in colonial Bengal and was associated with progressive

\textsuperscript{40} Bramho Samaj began in Calcutta (now known as Kolkatta) in 1828 as a reformation movement within Hinduism. Started by Raja Ram Mohan Roy and Debendranath, it was the beginning of the Bengal Renaissance. Roy is best remembered for his effort to ban the practice of Sati (the suicide by fire of a widowed woman) and his work around gaining equal rights for women in India.
thought and the ushering in of the Bengal Renaissance. Suvinay Babu, the manager of the Mohini Sindoor factory, and his daughter Jabba belong to this movement. Opposed to superstition and oppressive practices in Hinduism this movement helped change the lives of women in India and also brought into awareness issues Indian woman faced. Both father and daughter are shown to be the new face of independent India. Embedded in social history the film touches on issues of caste and subjects that are not seen in popular Indian cinema anymore. It touches on Hindu reform which created a new Bengali sensibility fostering intellectualism, female emancipation and the rise of the underclass. For its time the film was considered bold even facing criticism on its release (Kabir, 1996). However in the present time a film such as this would not only be criticised but also be likely to be met with violent resistance.

6.2.3 Meena Kumari

Mahjabeen Bano or Meena Kumari as she was known on screen, earned the title of ‘tragedy queen’ in Bollywood; she plays the role of the doomed Choti Bahu. Characters portrayed by her were often deeply melancholic women trapped in an existential and societal crisis. Urdu poetry composed by Meena Kumari reflected this melancholy. Her personal life was marked with tragedy similar to the kind she portrayed on screen, exploitation by her family, estrangement from her director husband Kamal Amrohi, alcoholism and eventually death in poverty. Her failed marriage to the much older and divorced Kamal Amrohi is said to have driven her to drink to the point of drunkeness (Mehta, 2013). Her last film Pakeezah (pure) which was directed by her husband Kamal Amrohi took nearly 14 years to complete. Ill

---

41 The name Mahjabeen Bano is of Muslim origin and Meena Kumari is of Hindu origin.
health and the pain of many years can be seen in many scenes of the film and this has been noted by many viewers and critics. Her death a few weeks after its release helped make the film a hit and a landmark in Indian cinema. Meena Kumari’s career in Indian cinema began in early childhood and she was the main breadwinner in her family. Eventually succumbing to death by liver cirrhosis at the young age of 39, she is remembered as a hauntingly beautiful figure. Of her performance in Sahib Biwi Aur Gulam, Kothatri and Raheja (1996) remark:

... Meena gave a performance of such exhilarating and cauterising beauty, that it is widely regarded as one of the peaks of histrionics in Hindi cinema. As the doomed chhoti bahu, she was beautiful, she was pathetic, she was a goddess, she was a mess. She had everything except love.

(Kothari & Raheja, 1996:43)

Her films have been seen as portrayals of her own reality, the melancholy which marked most of her life was reflected in the characters she played on screen. The film Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam can be viewed as a premonition of her life.
6.3. **Purab aur Paschim**

*Purab aur Paschim* translates as ‘East and West’. Released in 1971, the film was written, directed and produced by Manoj Kumar, who also starred as the lead male character. The lead female role was played by Saira Banu, who appeared with blond hair, wearing western style short dresses. Set in London and India this film begins in pre independence India. Often cited as a patriotic film it is memorable for the lead characters iconic characters. Spinoffs from this film have been created over the decades, some even referencing it in dialogues.

6.3.1 **Synopsis**

The story begins in pre independence India in 1942. An Indian freedom fighter Om is spotted by Harman, an Indian working for the British. Caught and executed on the spot his death profits his betrayer who departs with his son to London, leaving his
pregnant wife Kausalya alone. Om’s widow Gaga, who is heavily pregnant, gives birth to a son Bharat (another name for India). Kausalya gives birth to Gopi. Until this point the film is presented in black and white but changes to colour on Independence Day, 15th August 1947. Raised by his widowed mother and by Harnam’s father Guruji, he grows up to be a dutiful son. Patriotism and Hindu spirituality are introduced in the film early on. The theme of national integration through a love of Indian culture and the Hindi language are stressed. Duty to one’s elders and nation are tied in together. However Bharat has to leave India and study in England. There is a tearful exchange as his Guruji mourns how at one time people around the world came to India and now people are leaving India to seek knowledge. Bharat explains that it is only to study science that Indians leave and India still has a great deal of spiritual knowledge to teach in India.

On arrival in England Bharat meets an Indian family friend, Mr Sharma, whose family have lost their connection to India and have assimilated English values. Sharma is the only one who has any connection with Indian values, his wife Rita is a westernised woman as is his daughter Preeti. His son Shankar, played by popular comedian Rajendarnath, is a hippie. Preeti, the heroine, is oblivious about her culture and knows next to nothing about her Hindu religion. She is interested in living a fast paced life, drinking, smoking and partying. From her appearance one can tell she is trying to look like an Englishwoman, her mannerisms are indicative of a dissolute life.
Bharat meets Harnam and his son Omkar who do not reveal who they are. Several confrontations occur involving the anglicised Indians, Bharat’s conversations with these people points out to the audience how empty these wayward Indians are. A subplot in the story involves an acquaintance of Bharat, Mohan, who has been living in England for 8 years, in which time he has met an Englishwoman with whom he is having an affair. His father in law has been pleading with him to return to his wife and child, only to be physically assaulted in return. Bharat mediates and prevents Mohan from re-marrying and reunites the family.

Preeti’s stance towards Bharat softens as he teaches her about Indian culture. Omkar is enraged by this and attempts to rape her, Bharat defends her honour and Preeti’s attraction for him grows stronger. This is a common trope in Bollywood films, the hero of the film thwarts a rape attempt and the heroine of the film falls in love with him (Roy, 1994). Preeti’s attraction grows for Bharat, however learning about Indian culture is still alien to her, and she does not always agree with the ideas he shares with her. Sharma, seeing the decline of his family’s values and Preeti’s attraction to Bharat, asks him to marry her. Being a dutiful Indian he obeys Sharma and Guruji’s orders. However the condition of marriage is that they should go back to India and spend time with his family, and then eventually Preeti is to live with him. This idea is
met with resistance at first, however the family relents and goes back to their roots.

![Image](image.jpg)

**Figure 6:** But you love your country more than me

India is presented as a place where people are warm and loving, even if not being as clean or advanced as England. Lalchand, the servant, is reunited with his wife who has been waiting for him patiently for many years. Each member of Sharma’s family reacts differently to the Indian experience, some rejecting it, some accepting it wholeheartedly and others - Preeti - being ambivalent to it. Demure Gopi is shattered by Bharat’s decision to marry Preeti as she has secretly loved him, however he assures her love would be reciprocated by Shyamu, of whose affections she is unaware. Kausalya is reunited with her long lost husband. The reunion is melodramatic and involves repentance mainly by the Anglicised Indians. This section of the film reads simplistically and is full of melodrama, it also stresses the need to connect with one’s Indian roots.
Happy with all the good things happening in their lives Guruji recalls his promise and suggests they go on a pilgrimage. Omkar, still seething from Preeti’s rejection, tries to kidnap her only to shoot Guruji by mistake. The family salvages itself and realises the folly of chasing after a false dream. Preeti has a change of heart and in a pensive moment throws her cigarette and alcohol down a drain. Choosing to stay in India the last scene shows her praying in a temple in a red sari (the colour worn by brides). She has finally become the ideal Indian woman as she was meant to be.

6.3.2 Analysis

Often seen as a patriotic film, *Purab aur Paschim* presents a simplistic view of India
and the west. Its popularity lies in its easy descriptions, lack of grey areas and chauvinistic nationalism. Comments on YouTube videos of the film reiterate and exaggerate the claims the film makes. Hate speech against British and even Mughal rule are used to point out the position India was in. Perhaps the most disturbing of all comments are the ones that use rape and incest language to critique white women, Indian women who imitate white women, British rule and the present state of government.

Figure 9: YouTube comments - nationalistic hate speech

The rape scene in the film plays on the idea that a woman who does not conform is asking for it. Similar discourse surrounds comments made by viewers. Despite this overt nationalism there are also dissenting voices (Mani, 2012).

Alcohol and tobacco consumption, along with the mini dresses Preeti wears, play a role in the justification of her sexualisation.

While *Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam* problematises the notion of a wife’s obedience to her husband, this film valorises it. Choti Bahu’s obedience brought out the dangers of female passivity in service to masculine authority, and critiqued the idea of devotion of a wife to her husband. The women in this film are expected to conform, which is then validated by the male characters. Indian values are forcefully reiterated in this film; obedience, shame, shyness, passivity, endurance and respect are presented as values only India truly possesses. An obvious means of propaganda, the film
promotes India as a nation that has always been advanced due to its rich spiritual tradition, which makes it superior to the west. Unlike in *Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam*, the British are the enemies in this film. India and Indians themselves are beyond reproach, even when they seem to have lost their way, they are redeemable because their culture has the power to heal them.

While the film might capture one national dilemma, that of Indians losing their culture in a foreign land, it does not look into the condition of Indian immigrants in 1970’s Britain. Racism against the community is almost never depicted, however the makers of the film project their own racism against Afro Caribbean people. When Bharat is called to a club in London to be killed it is black and not white men who are hired to be the killers (although the eventual murder of a young hippie involves a white man killing another white man). Indians are treated as spiritually superior people from whom spiritually empty westerners are trying to gain salvation.

While Preeti is subject to the male gaze she is also an object of ridicule. Her mannerism and ignorance of Indian traditions makes her subject to jokes. It also emphasises her otherness. An object of public mockery her acceptance into Indian society rests on her giving up her western identity.

While promoting female modesty the film nevertheless features gratuitous shots of female bodies. While pointing out western immodesty, the gaze of the camera and the audience is still firmly voyeuristic. There is an element of subversive eroticism creeping in, on the one hand there is a defence of the Indian way of life on the other there is a scopophilic element that proves otherwise.
6.4. *Hare Rama Hare Krishna*

The film *Hare Rama Hare Krishna* (1971) was a popular movie of its time that portrayed the hippie movement as a corrupting force that particularly adversely affected the youth. Written and directed by and also starring Dev Anand (an iconic Indian actor), the film was partly based on a true story. In an interview, Dev Anand spoke about how he was invited by the King of Nepal to make a film about a condition that adversely affected both nations. It introduced actress Zeenat Aman who became an overnight sensation and sex symbol. This film was so popular that people imitated the new hippie fashions depicted in the film. Hippie clothing and accessories worn by Aman in the film were copied by many women across India (Times of India, 2015).
6.4.1 Synopsis

The film opens with a monologue on how degenerative western culture is and its need to seek solace in eastern mysticism. The hippie movement which began in the west to validate non-western cultures was looked at with suspicion in India.

“**Their people oppressed by financial gain and machines ..... And having lost their inner peace was now seeking it. Chanting the mantra Hare Ram Hare Krishna stirring the need for change. The mantra is a balm for their hungry and thirsty souls ...**

The narrator goes on to deliver a monologue on the origins of the hippie movement with hippies in the background smoking.

“**Their religion is opium, cocaine, hashish, and lsd. They believe in open relationships and they live from minute to minute. Intoxicated. High. Lost to themselves, their families and the world, society’s dropouts- they are called hippies...**

![Figure 11: ...and having lost their inner peace...](image-url)
Hare Rama Hare Krishna revolves around a dysfunctional Indian family, who at the opening of the film are living in Montreal, Canada. The father Mr Jaiswal is openly having an affair. Mrs Jaiswal is trapped in a bad marriage and as a result is angry and takes her anger out on their children. Prashant, the older of the two children, is well behaved and responsible. His sister Jasbir on the other hand is wilful and attention seeking. Constant fights between the parents and children and between the parents themselves are a regular feature of the family.

Mr and Mrs. Jaiswal decide to separate each taking one child with them. Jasbir grows up traumatised by her parents’ separation and the loss of her older brother who was the only kind person to her. Years later, her brother is working as a pilot in India and hears a rumour that his sister is in Nepal. He goes to find her and sees her amongst hippies. She has fallen into bad company and goes by the name Janice. The group of hippies are barely tolerated as they are short of money and their moral values clash with the local Nepalese values which are more simple and honest. Prashant tries to get Jasbir to leave the group and return home to her family, but he is unsuccessful,
she does not even recognise him - Janice has blocked out all memory of her early life and is descending into alcohol and drug addiction.

The moral decline of Janice is contrasted with the life of Shanti, a poor, beautiful woman who works as a salesgirl in the village. She has little but is honest and hard working, her morality is shown in the way that she fends off sexual advances from her lecherous boss, Drona. Shanti is presented as an ideal, she is feminine and traditional, needing protection from the immorality of those who seek to corrupt her. Prashant becomes attracted to her and they fall in love.

In a sub-plot, Drona and some of the hippies are shown to be engaging in criminal activity, stealing idols from the local temples and selling them abroad. Because of Shanti spurning his advances, Drona decides to get revenge on her and Prashant by framing them for the thefts. This distracts and delays Prashant from his primary purpose of rescuing Janice.

In the final sequence, Prashant and Janice’s father and mother both arrive in Nepal, having been contacted by a friend of the father, the local police commissioner. Prashant clears his name and Drona is exposed as the real villain. However it is too late to help Janice, she has sunk too far into her addiction. When she finally recognises her brother and parents, she realises that her life has become irredeemable. Running away from them, she commits suicide. Unable to rescue Janice, Prashant is heartbroken. However after the death of Janice/Jasbir the remaining family members seem to reunite.
6.4.2 Analysis

We are introduced to Janice through her body, dancing obliviously. Erotic shots of her body in the opening scene of the film establish how she is to be treated throughout the film as a sexualised young westernised woman. The viewer is the voyeur who is constantly shown images of women’s bodies, all the while the women are reprimanded for this act.

The film is simplistic in its portrayal of characters who have no shades of grey in them. The simplicity is one of the hallmarks of Bollywood and other cinemas which use visual cues to further the plot. This on screen reduction is also indicative of off screen reductionism where women who drink or smoke are treated as all bad. Janice has very few redeeming qualities which makes her death easy to bear and even inevitable.

From the first scene the film establishes the east-west dichotomy with the east being portrayed as the a superior culture. The idea of the east being a place of mysticism and a solace for lost westerners plays on Indian ethnocentrism. Loss of ‘culture’ and
of social propriety are a consequence of adopting this foreign culture, for the women it also implies transgressing gender boundaries. While the cinematic gaze on the male subject is one of pity, the female subject is sexualised, her body becomes open to voyeurism from the characters on screen and from the viewers. Gazing is an integral part of the cinematic process each kind symbolising a different emotional state (Taylor, 2002).

Despite being a Bollywood film made for an Indian audience, one cannot help but notice how the film distances itself from India in terms of geography and culture. The Jaiswal family are Indian but live in Montreal. It’s not Jasbir who is an addict, but Janice. By distancing the problem of broken homes and addiction the shock of both these ideas are subdued. Janice the addict is more acceptable than Jasbir the addict. Identity and the way it plays a role in politicising addiction helps make addiction look alien to ‘Indian culture’. Janice is a Christian (assumed foreign) name and therefore her behaviour does not transgress Indian culture.

Jasbir’s death is inevitable, her possession by Janice is what causes her death. The addict Janice can only enter into a troubled soul and take the life out of it. While addiction as a psychological and medical reality are acknowledged, ideas of the old spirit world and its hold on humans still dominate this narrative. The analogy is an interesting one and it makes it easier to relate to in film and nation which is still trapped in narratives of its spiritual greatness.

Ideas of outsiders violating tradition appeal to a deep sense of nationalism. In cinema and in real life the need to portray unpleasant ideas as alien to ‘Indian culture’ have an appealing quality, they establish a false sense of propriety.
6.4.3 A bitter end

As the film goes on, one sees the extent of Janice’s ‘moral degradation’ and her brother’s character in a good light. Prashant wins over the support and good will of the town and its people. However Janice is so entrenched in her addiction that she has no choice but to take her own life. Her death symbolises the end of a worthless life. Her life has been so miserable that she cannot see a way out.

Her death also shows the double standards in India when it comes to men and women and addiction. Men are allowed to get drunk and it is considered natural, whereas a woman entering a man’s territory is to be punished. Janice is not offered any solution, as it is unthinkable to see an Indian woman ‘high’ and worse to offer her help. This idea is still prevalent in services designed for women addicts (Rhodes & Johnson, 1994).

Ideas of what bad parenting and an uncaring stepmother can do are to help us understand the development of Jasbir from a naughty child to Janice the drug addict, her death is more relief than tragedy for the family.

Though the film is primarily focused on Prashant finding his sister Jasbir (now Janice) who is leading the life of a hippie, another woman is introduced in this narrative. Shanti is presented as an ideal Indian woman, feminine and traditional, Janice on the other hand is bossy, in control and deceitful. A similar theme is found in the movie Purab and Paschim, the female characters are wayward and have lost their ‘Indian identity’, and are therefore in need of male correction.
6.5. Julie

Directed by K.S Sethumadhavan this Hindi film was released in 1975. The Hindi version of the film is based on a 1974 Malayalam\textsuperscript{42} film, it was then remade again in Telegu in 1975. The actress Laxmi portrayed the character of Julie in all three versions. Much later in 2006 the film was remade again in Kannada. There is also a 2004 Hindi film called Julie which has no relationship to this film.

A popular song from the film \textit{dil kya kare} (what should the heart do?) was remixed in the mid 90s by the pop group Instant Karma and was just as popular as when it was released in the film. An English language song \textit{my heart is beating} also featured in the film. The film stars popular actresses and actors such as Nadira, Sridevi, Rita Bhaduri, Utpal Dutt and Sulochana. Both Nadira and Sulochana belonged to the Baghdadi Jewish community, a small and fast disappearing community. In her youth Nadira was known for playing the role of a westernised woman who was frequently seen drinking and smoking and often a wealthy arrogant woman.

6.5.1 Synopsis

The film depicts a happy go lucky, somewhat dysfunctional Anglo-Indian Christian family. Both these identities establishes them as western ‘others’. They are confined by the British side of their identity, caught in a country they do not consider home. Julie the eponymous character is a young woman trapped in an unhappy family life in a small town. This is an India that is familiar to many, the architecture, small town

\textsuperscript{42} Malayalam, Telegu and Kannada are three of the four main languages spoken in southern India, Tamil being the fourth. Southern India is made up of four states and each of these states has their own regional and linguistic identity. Each of these languages have their own regional cinema and television production centres and it is not uncommon to see popular films being remade by directors of other language.
communities and familiarity makes up a large part of the nation. Set in 1975, nearly thirty years after independence, the film examines how Anglo-Indian families deal with the issues of identity, migration and assimilation. Julie’s father Morris is an alcoholic who works in the railways. Their family is not very wealthy but they seem to manage with the money they have. While the father is happy living in India, the mother Maggie longs to go back to England. They have four children, Julie being second oldest.

As a Christian and an Anglo-Indian woman Julie, like her mother and sister, dresses in western style, which makes her an easy target for men’s lust. A local Muslim shopkeeper often tries to molest her and ask her for sexual favours. Her youth, sexuality and religious identity make her an easy target. There is no male figure to protect her, her perpetually drunk father needs constant care and does very little in the way of supporting his children. She finds male protection in the form of her boyfriend Sashi, her friend Usha’s older brother. Usha and Sashi are the children of Mr Bhattacharya who is Morris’s boss. Another friend Richard, who like her is an Anglo-Indian, does not find much favour from her despite being sympathetic to her.

The smells of meat and liquor distress Julie and she often visits Usha whose home is free from these smells. The Bhattacharya’s are Brahmins for whom both these food items are forbidden and considered ritually impure. That they are freely consumed in the Christian’s household makes Julie’s family impure. Meat eating to a practising Brahmin family represents a wasteful decadent life, its stench mixed with the stench of alcohol are similar to a moral miasma.

Julie becomes pregnant by Sashi, this is portrayed as being a trap that she falls into.

\[43\] Railway work is a common stereotype associated with Anglo-Indians.
in the same way that many women her age are thought to caught out if not given the right alternatives or their sexuality left unchecked. Sashi’s role in getting her pregnant is not debated in the film until the end, his responsibility in the affair is negated by Maggie and also by the directors. Indian morality is invoked against an affair such as this. Julie is to blame in this affair more than Sashi for whom the consequences are not severe.

Julie is forced to leave home and live with an aunt for the duration of her pregnancy, and when the child is born she is pressured to give it up for adoption. Ultimately the film is brought to a happy conclusion when Sashi’s father intervenes and allows that Sashi and Julie should be married, rather than losing his grandchild.

6.5.2 Analysis

The film resorts to easy stereotypes to convey its message. A mainstream film, one can see how Bollywood cinema of this era was creating a genre of films that were to be characterised by morally simple narratives and characters with few plot complications. Cinema from this era has become the quintessential Bollywood most people associate the genre with. It has all the elements of a popular mainstream film - music, a love story, a conflict of interests and a happy ending.

The tensions in Julie’s household are indicative of a family that is neither Indian nor English and cannot decide on one identity. This tension is pathologised by those around them as being indicative of their dual heritage. Their Hindi is broken (another sign of not being Indian) and Julie’s dress and mannerisms are western. Her actions (being an unwed mother who crosses the religious divide) make her even less Indian.

There is however a redemptive element in Julie that embraces the ritually pure Hindu
way of life. Her frequent visits to the Bhattacharya household, despite insults, indicate her need for stability which as the film suggests is only possible through assimilation to the larger Brahminic Hindu community. D'Cruz (2007) points out the treatment and mistreatment of the Anglo-Indian subject in art cinema, Bollywood and Hollywood. He notes how Bollywood creates simplistic and even one-dimensional characters who are stereotypical and on the margins. One can see the Indian Hindu identity becoming the norm and creeping back in through nationalistic discourse throughout the film.

The motif of a young woman trapped in a love affair with a child out of wedlock is common to other films too. Dwyer (2006) mentions the film Aradhana (1969) in which the unwed mother is punished in several ways and then redeems herself by taking the blame for crimes she didn’t commit. This is a recurring theme not only in films but also in plays (Robinson, 1999). Unwed motherhood is not looked upon favourably in India, motherhood is a life process that is reserved for married women. The issue of abortion and giving up the child after birth is often used in these films as a way of developing the plot, but not as a way of social comment.
6.6. **ChaalBaaz**

Directed by Pankaj Parashar this film was released in 1989. The title translates as ‘trickster’. The film stars Sridevi who has acted in Tamil, Hindi, Telegu, Kannada and Malayalam films. Legendary south Indian actor Rajnikanth is one of the male leads of the film. Sridevi plays a double role in the film which is a remake of the 1972 film *Seeta Aur Geeta* (Seeta And Geeta). A comedy film, it has the hallmarks of Bollywood cinema, song and dance with melodrama and action added in.

6.6.1 **Synopsis**

Anju and Manju are twin daughters of a wealthy family who are separated at birth when Manju is kidnapped by a maidservant who is thought to be mentally unstable. In their distress, the parents of the girls upon the fathers avaricious younger brother Tribhuvan for help. Anju grows up with her parents, but loses them in a car accident at the age of ten. It is speculated that Tribhuvan caused the accident. Under these
suspicious circumstances Tribhuvan marries his sister in law Amba who is equally shrewd and greedy. The character of Aunt Amba is dressed in 80s western fashion, wearing dresses in bold colours, flamboyant makeup and an unconventional hairstyle. Realising they could not just kill Anju as they would lose her wealth, Tribhuvan and Amba become abusive towards her both physically and psychologically. Anju grows up to be a timid woman who dresses traditionally and wears her long hair tied in a braid. While her aunt and uncle are abusive, Anju has the support of her nephew and an old manservant who are very loving towards her. After a particularly cruel beating Anju contemplates suicide but she is reassured by the manservant that her life will change. Amba’s nephew Batuknath Lalanprasad Maalpani moves into the house and he attempts to rape Anju, this prompts her to run away from home.

The other twin, Maju, grows up in poverty in a poor neighbourhood. Unlike her sister she dresses in western clothes and is a confident woman, physically tackling men who try and take advantage of her. She has a friend in Jaggu, a taxi driver who occasionally defends her. A confident trickster, Manju knows how to evade her creditors. However Maju’s life is not all that rosy as the maidservant who kidnapped her, who Maju believes is her mother, has been committed to an institution.

Suraj, the son of a wealthy friend of Tribhuvan, is urged by his father to marry. However as a young adventurous man he wants to marry a woman who is just as adventurous as himself. In Manju he finds a suitable companion who shares in his masculine pursuits.

While on the run Anju ends up being mistaken for Manju, gets to live in her home and begins to endear herself to Jaggu. Manju ends up in Tribhuvan and Amba’s
house, mistaken for Anju; sensing that Anju has been treated cruelly she begins to exact revenge on the cruel family. This charade persists for a while however it causes confusion. Matters come to a head when Batuknath Lalanprasad Maalpani notices that it is not Anju who has changed, but that there are two women who look alike. Anju and the maid (Manju’s foster mother) are kidnapped. It is revealed that the aunt and uncle plan to kill Anju and make it look like a suicide. However Manju, Suraj and Jaggu intervene; a fight ensues but not before Anju is made to swallow poison. The film ends on a happy note when it is revealed that both sisters are married and give birth to twins on the same day.

6.6.2 Analysis

The contrast between Indian and westernised identities is stark. The traditional Anju meek, passive and a perpetual victim. The westernised aunt Amba is cruel, Manju the heroine is westernised but she still has a few redeeming qualities. While Manju’s drinking is not treated as badly as in other Bollywood films, nevertheless her alcohol fueled bold behaviour provides the comedy in the film. She is often seen in masculine spaces and this is seen as an aberration. In similar manner the super-hit film *Maine Pyar Kiya* (I Have Loved), released in 1989, portrays the vamp who drinks as being sexually provocative but with hardly a role except to provide a foil to the heroine, who is an embodiment of traditional Indian values (Derné, 1999). While both young women in the film are presented as attractive, it is the heroine wins the hero’s heart as she is a model of domesticity. The vamp while socially of the same class loses out due to her urbanised and westernised ways, her use of alcohol symbolises corruption, moral degradation and avariciousness.

In ChaalBaaz, Manju becomes her sister’s keeper, defending her from all peril.
Manju’s drinking and Anju’s abstinence become a source of constant jokes. Manju while not treated as an aberration, is still not treated with the same respect as her sister. Jaggu often threatens to hit her, Suraj assumes she is unfaithful. When Jaggu does hit her, he defends his action by using the analogy of a hitting a broken machine to start it.

Conversely, Anju is seen as more worthy of sympathy as she is a victim who never fights back but passively accepts the abuse meted out to her. She is a stereotypical Indian heroine who is dressed in traditional Indian clothing, worships god and is domestic.

![Film poster for ChaalBaaz](image)

Figure 15: Film poster for *ChaalBaaz*

### 6.7. *Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge*

This cult film was released in 1995 and is remembered for its dialogue, songs, costume and foreign locations. The film stars Shah Rukh Khan and Kajol, and has a cast of many other famous Indian actors. *Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge*, popularly
known as DDLJ, became the highest grossing Bollywood film of the year.

### 6.7.1 Synopsis

“The Big-Hearted Will Take Away the Bride”, is how the title translates. The story begins in London with Baldev Singh, a Non Resident Indian (NRI), feeding pigeons in Trafalgar Square. He muses about his life in the United Kingdom and his own homeland. He is a shopkeeper with a family consisting of his wife and two daughters. He is a strict father who is wary of British culture.

The hero of the film is Raj, who grows up with a liberal indulgent father. One day Raj and his friends enter Baldev’s shop at closing time to buy some beer. Baldev refuses so Raj grabs a case anyway, throws the money on the counter and rushes off with his friends.

Baldev’s daughter Simran is dreamer who wishes to meet her ideal man. Her dreams are shattered when Baldev tells her she is to marry Kuljeet, the son of his friend Ajit, a promise made twenty years earlier. Simran is heartbroken, however decides she will comply if she is allowed to travel with her friends across Europe.

Simran meets Raj on the train and while he constantly flirts with her she is annoyed by his advances. Raj is a lively man while Simran is reserved. The two of them end up missing their train to Zurich and are separated from their friends. They decide to travel together and slowly begin to fall in love with each other. One night Simran has a few drinks and wakes up in bed with her clothes changed and a hangover, thinking she has been raped. When she confronts Raj he tells her he is an Indian, he knows modesty is an Indian woman’s greatest asset, and never would he take advantage of such a situation. At the end of the journey when Simran arrives in London she
realises she has fallen in love with Raj. Simran confides in her mother Lajjo that she has fallen in love, however her father overhears and is furious, he decides to move the family to India the very next day.

Similarly Raj confides in his father who encourages him to pursue Simran. Once in India Simran is depressed, and takes an immediate dislike to Kuljeet who is an arrogant man with no respect for women. Raj meets up with Simran in India and she urges him to elope with her. Raj refuses and says he will only marry Simran with her father’s consent. Befriending Kuljeet, Raj soon gains the acceptance of both families, even Baldev’s who recognizes Raj. Raj’s father arrives and the preparation for the wedding begins. Baldev discovers a picture of Raj and Simran, he deducts that Raj is the boy Simran fell in love with, and he asks Raj to leave.

Kuljeet hears of this, he follows Raj and his father to the train station and starts attacking Raj. Baldev and Ajit arrive to stop the fight. Simran tries to join Raj on the train as it is departing but is stopped by Baldev. Baldev realises Raj truly loves his daughter. He lets her go, and she runs and catches the train as it departs.

6.7.2 Analysis

The film drives home the message of Indian values transcending geography. Baldev is a patriot despite living in a foreign country. He maintains strict discipline at home, especially with his daughters who he fears will be corrupted by western culture. Simran is a dutiful daughter, however she is also a dreamer. Longing for the ideal man she is unhappy that she will marry someone she has never met. Even when she is given the chance to let her hair down she remains serious. Her one attempt at rebellion is not one she is happy with. When she does get drunk she begins singing
and runs around Switzerland. In true Bollywood style she dances and sings coherently even though inebriated. She is in for a rude shock when she wakes up in Raj’s bed, wearing some of his clothes. Fearing she has been taken advantage of she begins to cry. Her character is impeccable, even when presented the opportunity to take advantage of her freedom she stays true to her Indian roots. Simran is not an alcoholic or a habitual drinker, she is deeply tied to her culture and that protects her as it protects Raj from taking advantage of her. While the scene is not a long one it is pivotal in establishing the role of Indian values and their psychic extension in the west. The redemptive quality of Indian culture forms the central theme of the film.

Thus, at every turning point in the film narrative, and with every existential crisis, the protagonists pause to remind themselves and each other of what it means to be ‘Indian’ (usually rendered as ‘Hindustani’). In fact, the gesture is so conspicuous that it is just short of comical.

(Uberoi, 1998:309)

Perhaps the most striking feature of the film is how the issue of forced marriage is treated as a romance. The film turns a serious issue like forced marriage into the background of romance. While the film glorifies the Indian culture in the west the reality in Asian Britain was very different. Black women’s groups in Britain were challenging cases of forced marriage and honour violence at the time (Gupta, 2003; Warsi, 2011). Culture and tradition that were being valourised on screen in reality were the very things a section of the British Asian community were fighting against.

As a commercially successful Bollywood film Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge in typical Bollywood fashion does not engage with social issues deeply. It addresses modernity and the anxieties it produces by providing solace in tradition. Around the
same era Indian born American director Mira Nair directed a commercially successful film *Monsoon Wedding* (released 2001):

Monsoon Wedding presents the contradictions of everyday life that an opening of India to globalization has introduced. The film destroys any lingering image of a nation mired in some premodern space as a traditional land with ancient customs and beliefs. It reveals a postmodern world in which cell phones and e-mail coexist with age-old rituals and occupations. In the foregrounding the clash of modernity and tradition, Nair makes explicit the anxieties about a national identity underlying the commercially successful films of Indian cinema, commonly known as Bollywood in reference to Bombay as the Hollywood of the Indian film industry.

(Sharpe, 2007:38)

Instead of romanticising the role of the Indian family Nair introduces taboo subjects such as child abuse and the bride’s affair to her married boss, thereby subverting the idea of the Indian family and its women as virtuous. In fact Nair’s film can be read as ‘diasporic feminist rescripting of the Bollywood genre of the wedding movie’ according to Gopinath (2005:162). While the characters are not depicted in any moralistic tone they are nevertheless seen as ordinary people caught up in dilemmas that are very real. Several women guests and the mothers of the bride and groom both drink and smoke, and even order drinks from the bar, yet this is not an aberration. None of this is depicted as dysfunctional but as mundane.
The contrast between the two films could not be greater. The upper middle class Punjabi family of *Monsoon Wedding* has its own dysfunctions, the women drink, smoke and have premarital affairs. The families often quarrel about mundane things that come with sharing a common house. Culture is not invoked continually, instead cosmopolitanism is embraced. On the other hand in *Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge* modernity is looked upon within suspicion, so much so that it transports the characters back to India to provide resolution of the conflicts against a familiar traditional background. While one film problematises modernity the other learns how to negotiate it while not retreating into Indian ethnocentrism at every moral crisis.

Figure 16: Film poster for *Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge*

### 6.8. Fashion

*Fashion*, similar to several other films by Madhur Bhandarkar, follows a Hogarth style of narrative of a young woman being corrupted by the big city, Mumbai in this case. The background of these films is always a powerful industry such as the film world, corporate world or even journalism. Middle class India and its values are
thought to be protecting and redeeming. Fashion, as the title suggests, is set in the fashion world and exposes the bleakness of this industry. The film features several Indian celebrities in cameos.

6.8.1 Synopsis

Fashion traces the rise and eventual fall of supermodel Meghna Mathur. Meghna is a middle class girl from Chandigarh⁴⁴, north India. Her parents are not happy with her aspiration to be a model, a career they think is not suitable for a middle class girl. Defying parental control she leaves for Mumbai where she struggles to find work. She soon realises work involves being arm candy to rich businessmen and exposing her body. We are introduced to supermodel Shonali Gujral, someone who is arrogant and disdainful of those around her, especially of Meghna. Shonali is also an addict trapped in an abusive relationship. As her addiction spirals out of control, her rise is followed by a fall, this foreshadowing Meghna’s future. Meghna manages to impress Abhijit Sarin who runs a successful modeling agency. Her appointment leads to the redundancy of Shonali. Her rise in fame does not come without a price. Odd hours at work and busy schedules make her a callous person, and she eventually has to leave the house of her aunt and uncle and then her boyfriend who do not agree with her lifestyle.

She eventually gains fame and has an adulterous affair with Abhijit who is married. Fame goes to her head, she loses her morality and drinks heavily. She is rude to designers, both the ones that used to be disdainful of her and the ones who helped her

⁴⁴ Chandigarh is both a city and union territory in North India, apart from that is also the state capital of two states Punjab and Haryana. It is the first planned city in post Independence India. Master plans for the city were developed by architect Le Corbusier and this has put the city on the international map for architecture and design.
on her way up in the business. Her affair with Abjijit leads to pregnancy and she is forced by the terms of her work contract to have an abortion. Abjijit does not want to leave his wife and children for her. This disappointment drives her into recklessness, drinking and taking drugs. She reveals to Abhijit’s wife Avantika that she had an abortion and the child was his. This leads to her termination at the modelling agency. Her addiction leads to promiscuous behaviour and a one-night stand. She crashes her car, and the story is picked up by the press. Meghna’s downfall makes her introspective, eventually picking up the pieces and even becoming friends with Shonali. Meghna finally does become the supermodel she dreamed of, however Shonali dies, prompting her to think about her life and the fashion industry differently.

6.8.2  Analysis

Both the models in the film are used and discarded by the men in their life, Shonali by her abusive addict boyfriend, Meghna by her manipulative boss. While chastising women in the film it also exploits them and their bodies in different aspects of nakedness. Life in the fashion world is presented as an illusion. Sexual promiscuity, homosexuality (portrayed in a stereotypical manner but not necessarily negatively), drugs and alcohol, infidelity and ruthlessness dominate this world. All relationships are a front and are marred by a sense of competitiveness and the desire to be successful.

On screen lives of models in the film are said to resemble the lives of some Indian and non-Indian models (Gupta, 2008). The most prominent ones being Shivani Kapur, Alicia Raut, Geetanjali Nagpal and Kate Moss. Bhandarkar denied any connection between the links and insisted the story might seem similar to real life
people but was not reflective of them.

The film panders to the fear of the big city and social change (Nandy, 2007). Mumbai while economically beneficial is shown to be a city that robs morality out of those who come to seek their fortune. This is a theme found in several films by Bhandarkar over the decades. Mumbai embodies qualities viewed as negative in Indian society. It creates a drinking woman who is trapped by a profession that expects her to drink and lead a promiscuous life in order to succeed. They are a new generation of women to aspire to be, but only from a distance.

Homosexuality had not been decriminalised in India at that point, but one could see it get an acceptable outlet in the fashion industry. Not overtly discriminatory but positioning it again as western, modern and foreign, acquired through losing one’s culture and adopting another. The two gay men in the film are part of the fashion industry, which is shallow, but this is the only place they are allowed to exist freely. While to western viewers this stereotype is negative, in India where homosexuality has been recriminalised this is a bold portrayal though not a challenging one. Gay designer Rahul Arora marries to keep up appearances. His wife and friend Janet maintain a façade while knowing he is gay and being aware of his boyfriend. It is a relationship not unlike many in India where social pressures expect people to marry regardless of their sexual orientation. Rahul’s marriage, like the rest of the characters in the film, is respectable on the outside, he represents an acceptable face of homosexuality. It is notable that Rahul’s boyfriend is never seen on screen.

---

45 Section 377 of the Indian Penal Code dates back to 1860. Under this section of the law homosexual acts are punishable under the law. In 2009 this was declared unconstitutional by the High Court of Dehli, however in December 2013 the Supreme Court of India overturned this ruling. While conviction under this law is extremely rare, hate crime against LGBT people or media associated with them is not.
This world of perversity engages the viewer as a voyeur, we are called to gaze at the bodies of models who are semi naked. A loss of control is tied to a loss in morality. Difficult emotions are quelled with the help of a drink, a smoke or a pill. Troubles that plague ordinary Indians are not to be found in this world of glamour.

*Fashion* was a hit film which helped make the careers of the actors in the film and push Bhandarkar into the spotlight. An earlier film by him *Chandini Bar* (2001) was a commercial failure but critical approved, this film focused on the exploitative and often violent life of Mumbai’s bar dancers. Unlike the glamorous world of Meghna Mathur, the protagonist Mumtaz of *Chandi Bar* is exploited sexually. Mumbai as the big city is built up on robbing people of their morality and money. Violence and crime go hand in hand in this dystopian environment. Meghna’s exploitation is surrounded in glamour almost protected by the wealth surrounding her. Mumtaz does not have that luxury, poverty and all the ills around her trap her and her children further in a never ending cycle of exploitation and crime.
6.9. Tanu weds Manu

Wanted bride (for son) girl should be Fair (gori), beautiful, professional girls, homely, with good habits 21-26 years

- standard requirements on Indian matrimonial adverts

This 2011 film was directed by Anand L. Rai and was a box office success. The film has also been translated into German. Set in small towns of North India’s infamous Hindi belt, the film described as a romantic comedy looks at an arranged marriage between Manu Sharma, a doctor working in London, and Tanu Trivedi a woman living in Kanpur\textsuperscript{46}. Through a series of chance meetings the two come to love each other and eventually marry. The film contains some disturbing assumptions about

\textsuperscript{46} Kanpur is a city in the state of Uttar Pradesh situated on the bank of the river Ganga (Ganges in Anglicised English). It is second largest city in the Hindi belt of India.
female consent and passivity and the concept of romantic love.

6.9.1 Synopsis

Manu Sharma, who has just arrived from London, meets Tanu’s family in Kanpur. Her mother requests the two speak alone in private, as Tanu is not feeling well. Manu falls in love with the veiled Tanu at first sight, who is revealed to be unconscious. A photograph and a kiss of the unconscious Tanu is all it takes for Manu to consent to marriage. The two families decide to go on a pilgrimage to Vaishno Devi\(^{47}\) where a cigarette smoking Tanu reveals she has a boyfriend and had overdosed on sleeping pills and vodka on purpose to be rejected by Manu. She proceeds to show him a tattoo of her boyfriend on her chest. Manu is forced to break up this engagement. He goes on to meet several women, none of them appealing to him. He meets a woman with a disability, and while he thinks this woman is wonderful he rejects her as he is still in love with Tanu. He meets Raja in this house who takes a liking to Manu as he says he is an honest man.

Manu decides to give up his search and enjoy the rest of his leave. He travels to Kapurthala\(^{48}\) in Punjab to the wedding of his friend Jassi (a Sikh man). His friend Jassi is getting married to Payal whose best friend is Tanu. Though there is an initial awkwardness between the two of them they go on to spend some happy times together which makes their friends believe they are in love. The sudden arrival of both their parents frightens Tanu who shrinks back. Manu decides to leave as he can see people around him are unhappy. It is at this point he meets Raja again who tells

---

\(^{47}\) A manifestation of the Goddess Durga and also known as ‘Mata Rani’ (queen mother). Her shrine is in Katra in the Northern state of Jammu and Kashmir. Most pilgrims walk to her shrine, however transports links are making this place more accessible.

\(^{48}\) Kapurthala is a city in Punjab state, once a the capital of the princely state of Kapurthala.
him he has come to marry his girlfriend (later revealed to be Tanu). Raja promises that he will convince the woman Manu loves to marry Manu. When it is revealed who Raja wants to marry, Manu, heartbroken, agrees to help them, even going as far as recommending Raja to Manu’s family. At the coaxing of Payal, Tanu begins to realise she loves Manu. A fight between Raja (and his family), Tanu’s family and Manu ensues with a tense moment between Raja and Manu as they reach the wedding venue. Raja, who has come armed, gives in and allows the good doctor to marry.

6.9.2 Analysis

While Manu is portrayed as a gentle, honest, yielding man, Tanu is the opposite. She is unfeminine in her behaviour, drinks, smokes and is promiscuous. Her character is eventually tamed by Manu and those around her who are in favour of Manu. Her repeated rejections of Manu are dismissed until she eventually falls in love with him and agrees to marry him. She is controlled by Manu, not through coercion but by the promise of romantic love. She is portrayed as attention seeking and fickle, the very same qualities that are changed by the end of the film.

While on the one hand the film portrays the small town girl as feisty and carefree it does not take this idea further. The northern towns portrayed in this film are not unlike the ones where I grew up. On one level I could relate to the dialect of Hindi spoken in the film and also to the social mores of the region which a lot of women my age would have described as oppressive. The film reveals the prejudices of Indian society and double standards involved in Indian arranged marriages. Mrs Sharma, who bemoans the fact that there is a drought of nice women in the country, is not an aberration, she is the norm. Indian cinema is full of examples of the jealous cruel
mother in law\textsuperscript{49}. Her remarks on dowry, on Ayushi who has a disability, whilst rude are not out of place in India. Newspapers, matrimonial websites, television shows, conversations between families reflect these prejudices and this gender policing (even marital violence) carried out by mothers of prospective grooms (Bhat and Ullman, 2014). These are not uncommon complaints, having witnessed this first hand around me this aspect of gender was always present. While pointing out the promiscuity of Tanu she fails to take in her son’s obsessive love for this woman whose own behaviour is not above reproach.

The principal characters are Brahmins which is reflected in their surnames. Jassi is a Sikh man and his wife Payal is a Bihari (a state notorious for its crime and ‘backwardness’ in comparison to the rest of the country (Kumar,1999)). Commonly held prejudices are not challenged but are condoned and written into the script for comedic or dramatic effect.

\textsuperscript{49} It is interesting to note Lalita Pawar who is commonly associated with the cruel mother in law stereotype only got these roles by accident. Slapped by a male actor during an intense scene she developed partial facial paralysis and a squint (Singh, 1998). That her disability made her a perfect villain is very telling.
6.10. **Discussion and further analysis of themes**

*Sāre jahān se acha, Hindositān hamārā*

*Ham bulbule hai is kī, yih gulsitān hamārā*

*Yūnān o-Miṣr o-Rūmā, sab mit ga'e jahān se*

*Ab tak magar hai bāqī, nām o-nișṭān hamārā*

“Better than the entire world, is our Hindustan,

We are its nightingales, and it (is) our garden abode…”

In a world in which ancient Greece,

Egypt and Rome have all vanished without trace

Our own attributes (name and sign) live on today.”

*Sare Jhan se Acha - Muhammad Iqbal*

Looking at these films one can see a constantly changing India. A nation that has improved the technology of filmmaking but has become regressive in storytelling.
There is no denying Bollywood produces entertaining cinema, however it lacks complexity. Certain themes emerge while viewing these films. Common patterns of how these films portray characters and ideas remain similar. This similarity is part of the charm Bollywood exerts over audiences. There is a sense of gender, nationality and culture being thrust upon the audience constantly, of tradition being used as a means of propaganda. None of this is subtle, melodrama being a hallmark of this genre.

6.10.1 The nation in the film

Through all eight films the nation is a silent but ever present backdrop. Changes in national outlook can be witnessed through changes in the social outlook presented in each film. Ever present, it is articulated through various characters at different times. The strength of the nation lies in how it functions like an ever-present point of reference. Invisible yet exerting power through ideology, the character of the nation resembles Foucault’s extension of the concept of Bentham’s panopticon (Foucault, 1977). India as the mother nation is ever present in films and defended by her dutiful sons, women are often the stray daughters who need to be corrected. Different aspects of the nation and its construction in relation to gender and sexuality contribute to an understanding of its nature.

6.10.2 Westernisation vs Modernisation

India’s relationship with modernity is complex and tenuous at best.

   Modernity is disavowed even as it is endorsed; tradition is avowed even as it is rejected’

(Mishra, 2002:4)
Negotiating these boundaries against the social backdrop can be challenging if not dangerous. Williams-Ørberg (2008) traces the contradictions that characterise the mindset of Indian youth. Tradition plays a role in shaping one’s identity however modernity too has its role:

An imaginary national identity and sense of belonging emerges with modernity and with the capitalism that made possible increasing dissemination of newspapers and the novel form, in a common language linked to national identity

(Datta, 2000:71)

It is interesting to note how Datta conceptualises this identity as imaginary. Perhaps this is why in the films used it was important to stress this idea of identity constantly, and to reconfigure its boundaries continually. Yet this concept is further stratified though the use of gender. Through most of the films the west and Westernisation have been portrayed as a degenerating force as opposed to modernisation, which is presented as a means of improvement and a stepping stone to being on a par with the west.

These women, through their very ‘modernity’ and bold sexuality, violated traditional social mores. This often-outlandish modernity, as in Rohini Hattangadi’s character in ChaalBaaz, was shown to be the root of their unmotherly sadism, and this helped to reinforce the undesirability of the modern self-seeking woman, and conversely deify the virtuous, sacrificing, traditional ideal mother.

(Sarkar, no year:5)

Modernisation is embodied in masculine rationality whereas westernisation is
perceived as a feminine irrationality. Westernisation is viewed with suspicion and is seen as a force that works at corrupting the domestic sphere which makes it all the more dangerous. For example, male characters in the films (Bhootnath, Bharat, Sashi and Manu) seek a western education as a means of furthering their careers. It is in the service of the nation, a selfless act for the benefit of the nation. Migrating to a foreign land is not viewed with suspicion as they are seen as strong, good rational men who are above vices. This idea not only creates two dichotomies - rational and irrational, it also positions science as a masculine pursuit.

Preeti, Janice, Meghna and Tanu on the other hand have brought those western ‘values’ home, as the bearer of Indian culture they have transgressed the boundary of domestic and public. Meghna, unlike the rest of them, transgresses those boundaries further by working as a model. Their habits put them in the public eye, they have crossed the domestic sphere and have entered a masculine world. Their clothing, mannerism, habits and values make them a threat to the survival of ‘Indian culture’; while drinking, smoking and wearing western clothes may seem harmless fun, but when they come into contact with patriarchal authority they become a threat to the family and nation. Gender is implicated in the transmission of these two ideas.

Harding (1986) provides a feminist critique of science and of the grand narrative it provides to justify its existence in modernity. While this argument points to a masculine understanding of science it can be taken further and critiqued on another aspect - nationalism. Rajan (2005) looks at the deeply nationalistic science that is promoted in India. The rational secular edifice that has been built up over the decades after independence has created its own hegemony:

Scientists have become one of the three ultimate sources of legitimacy for the
Indian state among the middle classes - the other two being the development experts and the experts on national security … … Moreover, the Indian state bureaucracies internalize, propagate and reproduce the myths that the science/state nexus produces - myths of value-neutrality, objectivity, reason, discipline, uniformity, progress, democracy, and modernity. To dissent is to be irrational.

(Rajan, 2005:7-8)

Claims of ancient Indian science are commonly promoted and referenced through Hindu mythology. Evidence for this advanced science is provided through religious texts such as the Ramayan and the appearance of Hindu gods (Rahman, 2014; Betageri, 2015). Prime Minister Modi (elected in 2014) has made speeches promoting these ideas, which might seem ridiculous at first but are easily accepted by groups who support Hindutava ideology. Science (modernity) is used to promote a sense of national solidarity through the threat of persecution by western civilisation. Loss of scientific thinking is attributed to previous colonisations too, which fuels ideas of a persecuted Hindu nation. Recovery of lost knowledge is promoted through an aggressive, chauvinistic, nationalistic science. The hegemony of science over dissent and difference has meant that arbitrary lines are drawn against what is acceptable and what is not. It is not surprising then that rational men of films (heroes and fathers) are also scientists or doctors in some cases. What passes off as neutrality is in actual fact hegemony over marginalised identities.

6.10.3 Indian culture and its morals

The idea of preserving ‘Indian culture’ is a not a new one, it was a staple argument used by nationalists during pre independence struggles (Chatterjee, 1989). Witnessed
through the gendering and selective appropriation of western culture, these contradictions are deliberate. McClintock (1993) points out how the gendered nature of nationalism constructs both men and women in the former colonies. Those gender constructions are reconstructed with the independence of a nation. The formulation of Indian values are constantly affected by the negotiations between the former colonialists and new globalising powers. Fears of decimation through colonisation and in recent years through globalisation have contributed to the reactions against it. Taking McClintock’s idea further, it could be argued that not only gender but sexuality is of importance in constructing nationalist arguments. Hetrosexuality is also used as a means of creating an identity for the nation leading to the reproduction of ideas and citizens. This tension of losing out to a degenerative culture has led to the rise of right wing groups, which view ‘pub culture’ or ‘western values’ as dangerous. This idea is conveyed through film too.

_When we got married my parents warned me..... That this might happen if I married someone living abroad..... God forbid._

_Mrs Jaiswal (Hare Rama Hare Krishna)_

Janice is raised in Montreal and has assimilated western values, her brother is raised in India and is portrayed as an ideal (Indian) son. Migration too can cause this loss of values, a very real fear which can be observed in diasporan communities maintaining a link to their homelands. In the case of Julie the homeland is not India but the United Kingdom, which explains the lack of morals in the family. Endurance and historicity are assumed to be two features of these Indian values.

However, irrespective of differences in religious faith and practice and times of cultural upheaval, the primacy of the cultural ideals held the people
together, particularly so during the British occupation and hopefully also now in the present age dominated by avaricious multinational corporations.

… the project of western modernity has remained central as it underpins the philosophy of consumer capitalism.

(Mohan, 2011:217)

The need to portray western culture as empty and greedy is necessary in order to make Indian culture look appealing and superior. In her paper on westernisation Mohan talks about the dominant religions/communities in India (Hinduism, Islam and Sikhism) ignoring the ‘minority anglicised’ religions and westernised individuals. Excluding the Christian, Jewish and Zoroastrian community is not an accident but a deliberate attempt to prove their inferiority and western origins. Myths of historical forced conversions from Hinduism to the religions of the foreign overlords are often used to justify violence against Christians and Muslims in India (Menezes and Kanekar, 2015). Loss of Indian values is synonymous with a loss of Hindu values which one hopes to reclaim by restructuring society to fit a modernised upper caste Hindu norm.

6.10.4 Nostalgia for the past

Notions of Indian culture and what it stands for are almost always invoked when faced with social change. In Purab Aur Paschim and Hare Rama Hare Krishna the achievements of ancient India are brought up as a means of conveying the merits of the Indian nation. History in these contexts is more an emotive weapon than a factual reference point. Given the censorship against the writing of history books it is not unusual for history to be treated as a sentiment amenable to political and economic

---

50 Examples FP Staff (2014), NDTV India (2014).
changes (Bose, 2007). Censorship of history is also extended to films, books (fiction and non fiction) thereby producing a warped understanding of communities and individuals in India. Noted Bollywood actor Abhay Deol speaks about the lack of creativity in popular media which is partly based on economic concerns but also conformist due to fears of censorship (Deol, 2012). Economic aspects of cinematic representation help create an easily recognisable formulaic cinema. Bollywood is no exception, producing masala (spicy or popular) films (Kaur and Sinha, 2005). Casteism and sexism find their way into popular cinema. All the male and female characters in the eight films are upper caste Hindus. The culture and traditions alluded to are not universal but exclusive to the upper castes, the projection of this universal ideal makes it difficult to acknowledge historical oppressions or histories of other communities.

Issues like addiction are seen as the influence of western culture. The movie takes that idea up in the way it portrays addiction as a product of westernisation. That idea can still be seen in the way in which ‘Indian culture’ is viewed as respectful to women and treating them as goddesses. The lack of historical and factual portrayal contributes to the creation of simplistic characters. Preeti, Janice, Julie, Meghna and Tanu only exist to be herded back to their cultural roots. Undefined, this glorious past and the culture of India are merely a form of patriarchal power.

6.10.5 Diaspora and loss of self

Bollywood as an educational medium was analysed in the previous chapter. The issue of how Indian migrants are treated on screen is the focus of this analysis. Many Indians left their home country to seek work or become indentured labourers before the new wave of migrants from the 1970s caught the attention of cinema makers.
India and its values are seen as a saving grace in the western world, which while materially superior is spiritually inferior. The west is almost like a miasma contaminating all who come in contact with it. Popular films exaggerate these negative effects. Hindi cinema is not the only branch of Indian cinema to use this trope, Malayalam cinema presents diasporans in an equally negative light.

Lukose (2009) examines the Malayalam film Dollar (dir. Joseph, 1993) which portrays similar fears about Indians living abroad. In this case the family lives in America, the elderly mother from Kerala (South India) visits her children and is disappointed to see the disarray her family is in. The daughter in law is negligent and overbearing. The teenage granddaughter is described as “cavorting in bars and nightclubs, a narrative trope that relies on a racialised imagination of America as a space of criminality and vice” (Lukose 2009:73). In addition to this she is having an affair with an African American man, she is promiscuous and uses alcohol and drugs. Matters come to a head when the grandson dies while trying to protect his sister from her boyfriend. The son realising that nothing good can come out of living and raising children in America, asks his mother to take the infant daughter back to Kerala to be raised in the traditional Indian way. The characters are not that dissimilar from those in Purab Aur Paschim where moral degradation is associated with the West.

Western culture is presented as dangerous to Indian femininity. These fears are not the same for Indian male migrants who are positioned as rational and do not have the burden of cultural reproduction attached to them.

In Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge, Simran’s father worries about his daughters chastity, despite the fact they give him no cause for complaint. On the other hand Raj, whose behaviour is less than exemplary, is understood to be able to improve
given the right circumstances, in this case due to falling in love with Simran.

6.10.6 Land of redemption

Despite the female characters straying away from the nation and family, the redemptive nature of India corrects them. Returning home to India or giving up one’s western ways helps restore order. *Purab Aur Paschim* sets a path out for most Bollywood films in the manner in which the Diaspora is treated. While Bharat does alter her thinking and behaviour, it is living in India that finally brings about that change. Uberoi (1998) terms this as ‘disciplining desire’, returning to India helps shed these inauthentic modes of living. Themes of wayward Indians living in the west form a significant plotline in several films (*Pardes, Dilwale Dulhania Le Jayenge, Namaste London, West is West*). It is only through experiencing Indian culture that the Diasporans find peace.

6.10.7 Nation and its minorities

While attempting to portray a unified idea of the nation, Bollywood films have invariably created characters whose otherness provides comic relief at best. This theme of the non-Hindu other runs through all eight films, with *Julie* standing out most obviously. Fernandes (2015) points out how *Julie* is not an exception but a rule when it comes to portraying the Christian community on screen. The Anglo Indian community, as the name suggests, is of mixed origins. A product of colonialism and the British Raj, the community is misunderstood and is in recent years dying out (Nelson, 2011; BBC News, 2013).

According to the description in the Constitution of India, ‘An Anglo-Indian means a person whose father or any of whose male progenitors was of
European descent, but who is domiciled within the territory of India, and is or was born within such territory of parents habitually resident therein, and not established there for temporary purposes only.’


Prominent Anglo-Indians include the actor Ben Kingsley, and singers Sir Cliff Richard, Engelbert Humperdink and Russell Peters. It is not uncommon to allude to their ‘bastard origins’ in India. Trapped between culture and race the community faces discrimination on the grounds of not being authentic enough to either their Indian culture or their race. While some Anglo-Indians pass as being white, those whose skin colour is more brown than white are often ostracised for being too anglicised. Post independence many of the community felt an acute sense of betrayal by the British, for being left behind. While the community represents a blending of two cultures and races this hybridity is not always welcomed. An article describing the shrinking number of the community had this particular comment ‘Remnants of colonialism should go the same way’. With growing tensions around identity and western symbols, the community now more than ever is unwelcome unless they assimilate.

Figure 19: Comment made about article on Anglo Indian communities

51 Cliff Richard (Harry Webb) and I were baptised in the same Church in Northern India. This town once had a thriving Anglo-Indian presence. The Church has been subject to violence and been robbed on several occasions, in the present day it is a mere skeleton of what it used to be. The loss of the material aspects of Anglo-Indian/Christian culture is matched by the community’s decline.
While there were comments in support of the community and their contribution, this comment is an indication of how communities in India are viewed. This comment is not an isolated one but an ongoing process of discrimination. Various derogatory terms and phrases are used to convey a sense of disgust at Anglo-Indian people.

Phrases such as “Bastards of the Raj” and “Midnight’s Orphans” are often invoked to describe the Anglo-Indian’s predicament.

(D'Cruz, 2003:106)

This language is commonly used and is meant to critique hybridity which makes the Anglo-Indian subject an anomaly and an antithesis to Indian culture, which is assumed to be of one single race without mixing. Easy distinctions of the bad west and the good east clash when the Anglo-Indian subject resists these easy definitions of the self and community.

It is a widely held belief that in order to compensate for their marginalization, Anglo-Indians have sought solace in the dissolute trappings of western culture. Consequently, they have traditionally been represented as a people corrupted by alcoholism, sexual promiscuity, indolence and lax morality.

(D'Cruz, 2003:106)

While other ethnic groups in India are equally liable to succumb to such ‘trappings of western culture’, Anglo-Indians are held responsible as their hybrid ethnicity is not thought of as being discerning. Julie’s family represents all these problems, her father is an alcoholic, Julie is sexually promiscuous. Their indolence comes from their position in society and the lack of sensible decisions. The family vehicle is an old broken car, which is symbolic of their position in India - a relic of the past that cannot function in the present.
While Anglo-Indians are thought to be inferior, discourse can also point to their own arrogance and exaggerated sense of superiority. The statement below was taken from the comments section of an online newspaper article.

In light of the Ghar Wapsi movement this statement cannot be read merely as an exceptional opinion, but as an expression of a state sponsored progression towards extremism. An exact translation of the phrase is ‘return home’, and it is used by the BJP led government and its leaders who have threatened violence to those who do not go back to the Hindu faith (HT Correspondent, 2014). Ilaiah (2015) challenges this notion of the Ghar (house) and if Christians and Muslims still have a place in it after all these years of living in a different faith. Attacks on minorities have become common under the present government, whose policies have asked for re-conversion to Hinduism (Jain, 2015). Ilaiah (2004) terms this nationalism in India as ‘Buffalo Nationalism’ to symbolise the upper caste roots of this form of nationalism which interferes in the private sphere of the citizen.

Figure 20: Online comment - Anglo Indians considered to be arrogant
Statements such as these constantly undermine the existence of non-Hindu (uppercase communities). Angry comments on online forums while not representative of the entire nation do give us an insight into how being anonymous online leads to the release of anger and pent up frustrations against individuals or communities. Assumptions about how racial purity of Indians is thought to be a homogenous thing, the Anglo-Indian subject by contrast is impure and therefore not real or Indian enough. Their allegiance to India is repeatedly questioned despite having lived in the country all their life. This lack of heterogeneity is problematic in a nation that is gradually becoming intolerant of difference (Ashraf, 2015; Roy, 2014; Sharma, 2011). The above comment is indicative of the opinions of many Indians who view their heritage as superior.

For Julie to choose Sashi over Richard is also indicative of how the sexuality of the community is viewed, with Julie seen as a corrupting force out to convert the Bhattacharya family though insidious means. Richard is not seen as a suitable match despite being kind to Julie. While one is seen as sexually promiscuous the other is given an emasculating role. Both are doomed to failure. This is not dissimilar to how Anglo-Indians are portrayed in other films, as spinster or widow, teachers or as sexually promiscuous dancers. The Anglo-Indian body embodies the negativity of the west, especially the female body which is viewed as a source of corruption.

*Julie* was no exception to the idea that the west and western women in particular were sexually wild and lacked the demureness which Indian women possess. *Maine Pyar Kiya* (I have loved), a hit film in 1989, played on the idea that the western woman was inferior to the submissive Indian woman. Marked by offensive stereotypes most of these films played on deep-rooted prejudices. These films lack depth but are very popular for their easy viewing.
6.11. **Gender in film**

Since the nation is a gendered entity the production of the national ideal is similarly structured to ensure the fulfilment of ideology. Films are the perfect medium to convey a sense of the national ideal as well as the feminine ideal. It is difficult to separate the feminine from the nation, especially in Indian films. The Indian film industry thrives on its female actors. Iconic women in film are remembered through their acting skills, songs and costumes. A history of women in cinema can be told through the tropes associated with their roles, weeping mothers, demure heroines, sexy vamps and noble courtesans. Scripted to perform a certain function on screen these women have come to perform specific roles for which they are remembered. In the previous section the nation was discussed as a silent character, the women in films and the ones under discussion are anything but silent. Tied deeply to the nation, the women in all eight films have an important role to play, their positioning and treatment in the films reveal preoccupations with sexuality, domesticity and the propagation of nationalism.

Roles for women in Indian cinema have not remained the same because the culture that surrounds them has changed. While one would expect modernity to produce liberation this is often a paradox. While women do have greater visibility they are increasingly sexualised in the media. An example is shown by the documentary *The World Before Her (2012)* where right wing Hindu ideology and neo-liberal middle class values influence the lives of the two young women upon whom the documentary is based. Though both speak for emancipation, they are both exploited by ideology.

The first film in this analysis was a black and white film that boldly portrayed an upper caste Hindu woman’s struggle in the face of a dying feudal society. It was met
with opposition on release. Our last film in this analysis takes up a similar issue but fails to let the woman remain autonomous in her acts of rebellion. Both films feature marriage, while the older film is critical of marriage the newer one reinforces marriage as a means of finding fulfilment (Mehta, 2005).

6.11.1 Interrogating heteronormativity

Women’s roles in Bollywood are entwined with their sexuality which can sometimes be read as exploitative. In previous sections we have looked at the subversive nature of eroticism in Bollywood films, a similar theme runs through all eight films. While *Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam* has the style of the art film, the others being popular commercial films are more explicit in their depiction of female sexuality. While autonomous expressions of female sexuality are frowned upon they find an acceptable outlet channelled into heterosexual patriarchal expressions. Marriage is understood to be important as a means of taming the desires of the heroine and even the hero in some cases. Emphasis on channelling female sexuality remains a preoccupation through all these films.

The feminine corpus represents the nation as (hetero)sexualised, pure, and solidly bounded yet highly vulnerable to foreign penetration, rape, and racial impurity. Thus, the defence of national territory is also a symbolic defence of the racial purity of the nation.

(Mohammad, 2007:1021)

In the light of the analysis above all nine heroines in the films are in some way rebellious or caught up in the drama of enacting heterosexuality. Choti Bahu demands attention and children, Preeti requires taming, Janice requires stability, Julie
wants to be reunited with her son, Anju and Manju have to be reunited with each other and find their rightful partners, Simran has to find her true love through difficulties, Meghna has to undo the damage of her adulterous life, and Tanu has to come to choose between two lovers. Extra martial affairs are treated as anomalies from which the women need rescuing, even the platonic relationship between Choti Bahu and Bhoothnath causes a scandal in her aristocratic family. Tanu’s promiscuity makes her desirable but unmarriageable. Heterosexuality in these films is not only desirable but also meant to be strictly controlled through marriage among equals (Nast, 1998). Disorderly marriages such as the Jaiswals and the Morris’s affect not only the couple but also the family which curiously produces honourable sons but wayward daughters. ‘Mere maternal automatons’ is a term Kakar (1989) uses to define female gender role expectations in India. For the lovers in the film romance is but a temporary state, domesticity demands an asexual motherhood. Julie’s passion for Sashi cools once she gives birth to their son. Tanu goes from self-willed to dependent. Janice turns from her drug-induced arrogance to helplessness. Choti Bahu’s tragic life encompasses desire for her husband’s attention and the longing for a child.

While Lesbian/Gay/Bisexual/Transgender/Questioning/Intersex (LGBTQI) activism has recently gained wide national and international publicity, in India normative heterosexuality remains the only imaginable way of conceiving the adult Indian (Misra, 2009). Shamim (2015) points out how homosexuality is forced into being thought of as a mental illness in India. It is interesting to note how the link between sexual transgression and mental illness is made. This link goes further, in a recent move even mentioning the word ‘lesbian’ has been banned in cinema (Sharma, 2015). Given the push towards heterosexuality it is not surprising then that it is
imperative for women in films to prove their worth through their acceptance of a normative heterosexuality.

6.11.2  Home is where the hearth is

As these eight films progress the dichotomy between good and bad is played out through the notion of masculine rationality and female irrationality; an older brother looking after his naughty sister, an honourable man marrying the woman he impregnates. The narratives are simplistic in the way they portray the good and bad characters. Being a good woman almost always equals suffering. Good and bad are portrayed without shades of grey in absolute terms. The clinical can be seen working in tandem with the moral, often being used in the service of reiterating social prejudice. In the case of *Hare Rama Hare Krishna*, building up a psychological profile of Jasbir as a wilful child neglected in childhood tells us more about social expectations than it does about developing pathology. Viewers are almost expected to believe Jasbir will be a disorderly adult given her childhood trauma. Bad parenting, unbalanced cruel mothers, wilful women, are not characters on screen, they represent prejudices towards a certain kind of womanhood. They represent deep fears around femininity. The strong message of gender conformity is sent out to the viewer who learns about normality through a constant repetition of what is acceptable as (Indian) feminine. Suffering women who rely on others to rescue them are valourised, autonomous and ambitious women receive little or no help but ridicule. Meghna Mathur in *Fashion* embodies this wish fulfilment, her arrogance and success leads to her downfall. The audience can almost feel a sense of revenge seeing these women fall from grace.

In most Bollywood films the woman is presented as either suffering (an ideal) or as a
woman with her own desires who is eventually shunned or has to change to fit in to Indian society. Shanti provides us with an ideal that Janice fails to live up to. Shanti is helpless and a victim, Janice is domineering and in charge of the men in her life. A suffering Indian woman is accepted, as she does not upset the gender status quo. Dwyer (2006) points out how this role of the passive suffering woman is valourised in Hindi films. Anju is a model for valourised suffering, she has internalised the role of a humble maid servant to such an extent that even when she is on the run and disguised as Manju, she ends up acting as Jagu’s housekeeper.

Women who suffer are avenged by honourable men in the form of a son, husband, and father in law, but mostly through their sons. *ChaalBaaz* is exceptional as Manju joins in the fight to rescue her sister. This aspect of female passivity in the face of injustice and the role of the avenging son are reiterated by Nandy (1976). The onscreen portrayal is a more melodramatic version of the relationship mothers share with their sons in India. Corrective violence against unmarried women then is seen as necessary to prepare them for the role of a regimented motherhood.

### 6.11.3 Female bodies and exploitation

Going back to the concept of subversive eroticism, several shots of women’s naked sexualised bodies appear in the films. Working its way up to their faces, the camera introduces us to Preeti and Janice. Their bodies in short tight western clothing tells us of their embracing of western ways and also titillates the audience who learn this is unacceptable, yet obtain voyeuristic pleasure. Derné in his work examines the role of Bollywood cinema in the sexualisation and exploitation of women (Derné, 1999; Derné and Jadwin, 2000).
If female autonomy is of concern there is the genre of revenge film, which provides a contradiction to the viewer predicated on the idea that the heroine is a victim of rape. These type of films exploit the female subject by making her the subject of male violence. Rape is commonly used as a trope to establish the moral decency of the hero and to reaffirm the helplessness of the heroine. Preeti, Shanti, Janice, Julie, Meghna and Shonali have to contend with unwanted male advances. Alcohol and tobacco consumption along with the mini dresses Preeti wears, play a role in her (justified) sexualisation. While maintaining the guise of Indian decency the film nevertheless presents several prolonged shots of women’s bodies. Female desire is pathologised whereas male desire even in the form of a rapist is created for viewing pleasure.

The avenging women genre can actually be said to be a giddy masculine concoction. The rape scene provides the narrative ruse for the revenge plan while providing the spectator with a range of scopophilic pleasures.

(Datta, 2000:75).

Arundathi Roy terms this ‘The Great Indian Rape Trick’. In her now seminal article about the film The Bandit Queen (Roy, 1994), she criticises how the film takes liberties in depicting rape scenes which were not a part of Phoolan Devi’s biography. For a film based on real life events the director did not respect the integrity of the source material.

6.11.4 Women’s pseudo liberation

Increasingly, films like Fashion are being categorised as women centric and celebrated for casting the female character as the lead on whom the story rests
Mere presence is not indicative of liberation. Films like *Fashion* and *Tanu weds Manu* may belong to the category of woman centric films, but catering to female audiences and families they could be compared to their western equivalents - chick flicks. Celebrating these films as indications of female liberation is pre-emptive. hooks (1996) is critical of the notion of narrowly defined liberation and the way in which it ends up affirming patriarchal power. *Fashion* exemplifies this tightly reined patriarchy. The viewers are treated to several prolonged shots of women’s bodies, all the while learning the fashion industry is made up of vapid women and men. Similarly in both the first scene and last scenes where we see Tanu, she is presented to us as passive, helpless and feminine, firstly dressed in a sari and finally in her wedding dress. By the end of the film her days of promiscuity are over and she is now to lead the life of domesticity with Manu who has finally tamed her. For a little while in between we see a ‘liberated’ woman, however liberation in this instance is defined in a narrow sense, through her choosing and discarding boyfriends, smoking, drinking and speaking boldly; tropes of pseudo liberation according to hooks. Manu falls in love with the sleeping Tanu, who he kisses in her sleep. When awake the same woman is indifferent to his affections asking him to break off their engagement. Despite all her headstrong ways, Tanu, coaxed by her friends, ends her relationship with Raja and settles down to a life of domesticity with Manu.

While *Tanu Weds Manu* is a film of domesticity, *The Dirty Picture*, another blockbuster film that was released in 2011, brought home the message of dangerous untamed female sexuality. The film is loosely based on the life of southern actress Silk Smitha, who was known to play vampish roles. Often playing the seductress she was never the heroine of the film. In 1996 Silk was found dead in her home, she had
taken her life at the age of 35 (Rowena, 2012). *The Dirty Picture* is loosely based on her life. Raunchy song and dance numbers, failed relationships and alcoholism mark out the tragic life of Silk in the film.

Exposing the ugly exploitative side of southern cinema, the film was praised by women’s groups. However, one aspect of this film has been criticised by Dalit writers - the erasing of Silk Smitha’s Dalit identity. Silk, the dark skinned woman of lower caste and class remained the seductress on screen and never progressed in her career due to the aforementioned qualities. Her portrayal in the film bypassed these important issues, she was played by a fair skinned upper caste woman. In real life, as in the film, Silk was an independent woman whose hard work made her a success. However the patriarchal society she lived in caused her ruin. Her unchecked independence remains undomesticated which is why it necessary for her to die in the film as in real life. Tanu domesticates her desires, channels them into marriage and gets to live. As in *Hare Rama Hare Krishna* the failure of the ‘loose woman’ (Jasbir/Janice) to change her stance leads her to an on screen death. Respectability is the key here. Silk and Janice refuse to conform to the moral code of Indian society and rather than engage with them, the film’s plot requires them to die, thereby
quelling an onscreen tension. Conformity to the ‘Indian’ way of life is not only desirable but ensures the safety of women.

Lives of actresses on screen sometimes mirror the dilemmas they go through in their personal lives. Despite their privilege they are still trapped in a film industry that exploits them, a society that thinks of them as objects. Womens’ liberation is a thinly veiled disguise of capitalism and neoliberalism according to Fraser (2009), who terms it as a ‘feminist romance’. Similarly Chatterjee (2012) examines the nature of work rather than its ties to women’s autonomy.

Where do women in Indian cinema stand in relation to patriarchal and casteist structures? Are we doomed to viewing only an objectified sexualised woman on screen? Can we have a Choti Bahu, Janice, Shonali who do not die but live instead?

Was he free? Was he happy? The question is absurd:

Had anything been wrong, we should certainly have heard.

WH Auden - The Unknown Citizen

6.12. Disorder in films

The two previous sections looked at how the nation in its gendered manifestations normalises gender creating acceptable outlets of desires. Where does that locate disorder in the national quest for normalising its subjects? Despite its best efforts there is a resistance to this national preoccupation with homogenising. While there is a push to homogenise the Indian state it would be impossible to come to a singular understanding of a nation that is home to over 1.2 billion people.

Addiction represents this disorder (resistance to homogeneity) in both clinical and non-clinical terms. While the clinical regulates the social understanding of who
embodies disorder it finds its own explanations and through our understanding of what it means for a group of individuals. Who can drink or use drugs is a question of power, the disorder attributed to it similarly is dependant on the amount of power the addicted subject holds.

6.12.1 Agency and consumption

Bollywood films as a means of entertainment and education embody a didactic element within them. Mental illness is often used to develop characters or to function as a trope (Bhugra, 2003). According to Byrne (2009) there are four types of addicts on screen (in Hollywood films) - the tragic hero, rebellious free spirit, demonic/homicidal maniac and humorous/comedic user. Women in Bollywood unfortunately have not had the luxury of existing in more than one trope.

Women who drink or take drugs in Bollywood are almost always influenced by western culture, except Choti Bahu who drinks on the insistence of her husband. Wealthy zamindars of the Choudhry family are normal in their love for drunken dissolute behaviour, their class protects them. Choti Bahu as a woman and as a childless daughter-in-law causes distress to her family, class does not protect her. The men of the fashion industry can drink and indulge in extra-marital affairs, women who emulate them do not share their luck. In the sixty years that have been covered in this analysis a lot has changed but some things have remained the same. Women entering male territory still risk severe punishment, in many cases even so far as death. Meghna’s and Shonali’s drinking, smoking and recreational drug use is tolerated briefly as they are a part of the fashion industry. While class and affluence shields them from social sanction, it is a limited protection and one that is withdrawn to teach them a lesson.
Morris can afford to be drunk, he is comical in his drunkenness, as an Anglo Indian it is expected and his family is almost expected to be dysfunctional in contrast to those around him.

6.12.2 Bollywood and madness

Bollywood has shared a strained relationship with individuals on the margins, representations of mental illness is one of those categories. The trope of the mentally ill person as dangerous has been used often in both Bollywood and cinema around the world. Mental illness is a condition that is stigmatised and poorly understood around the world, alcohol and drug consumption inhabits the categories of mental illness and criminality. Its representation on screen especially Bollywood has been problematic to say the least. Amitabh Bachan’s portrayal of the angry young man who drank till he got drunk, won him awards and is still remembered with fondness (Jha, 2003; Nayar, 1997). Termed as the ‘angry young man’ his roles made him a positive role model.

Another aspect of representing mental illness on screen is to highlight the national anxieties of an era (Bhugra, 2009). While all the women in the eight films analysed are pathologised, their pathology is specific to the era in which they belong. Meghna, a woman living in post independence Mumbai, shares very few of the concerns Choti Bahu has. Similarly Tanu’s marriage to Manu has a strong element of romantic love coupled with several love affairs in the past, Preeti by contrast is chaste.

6.12.3 On-screen death

As the film progresses and Choti Bahu, Janice and Shonali are hopelessly lost in their addictions, there is a feeling of inevitability about their deaths. On screen their death
is a failure to imagine another option for women like them. Off screen it acts almost like a public health warning - women who drink will die. It is almost inconceivable to imagine a life for any of these women. Choti Bahu is of no further use to her husband or the larger family whose decline is inevitable, she is childless and cannot produce an heir for the family. Janice is reluctant to change, with no prospects of finding a husband she has no chance of redemption. Shonali unlike Meghna has no career prospects nor is she willing to change, her death is a wake up call for Meghna. While it is not universal across the films that the use of alcohol by the female characters ends in death it is significant that those who use are seen as beyond redemption or treatment. The psychiatric aspects of addiction and treatment are not called into question but it is understood in terms of a social pathology (Mountian, 2005). Addiction unlike other mental disorders touches upon social morality. The use of alcohol and drugs tied to gender, caste, freedom struggle and western decadence is unlike anything the modern Indian is willing to accept as part of their national culture, which makes it not only essential to distance the addict but also for them frequently to die.

6.13. Conclusion

The films discussed in this chapter have been made in different eras and represent the dilemmas of those eras. While some features in these films have remained the same, the treatment of gender in conjunction with alcohol use has evolved from being portrayed as a problem thrust upon an Indian woman to being represented as a loss of Indian values. This progression from indigenous to foreign is reflective of an India which is constantly reconstructing its modernity and national identity (Chatterjee, 1997). The female protagonists treatment on screen can be read as reflective of the way India has come to view alcohol/drug consumption and attributes it to
‘westernisation’. Reconstructing gender and reclaiming national identity through women’s morality has meant that some aspects of gender have evolved.

As a nation, whose national identity is established six decades after independence, the past is accompanied by a sense of nostalgia. Structures that were once considered oppressive and in decline have now regained popularity. They have been associated with a past and communities that have been lost due to modernity. This notion of loss (of ‘culture’) is a common thread in most films discussed. However, this discourse is also reflected in everyday speech to invoke an idea of a perfect past. What is resolved in film through plot complications is solved by violence off-screen. Yet Bollywood does not portray Indian social problems but rather turns them into a fantasy, it is escapist, yet at the same time it provides the masses with a solution delivered in three hours.

The analysis began with a black and white film considered to be a classic in Indian cinema, it ends with a colour film set in our present era. Both films present hetronormative values, marriage, domesticity and female docility. While the older film challenges ‘Indian culture’ the newer film embraces it and even puts a (pseudo) feminist spin on it. Films in the intervening years have produced similar discourse on female sexuality and its perfection through nationalistic ideals. Psychological disorders, manifested in the form of alcohol and drug consumption, are more social and national problems than being the clinically defined entities we have come to associate them with.

Women in Indian cinema have not remained the same because the culture that surrounds them has changed. While one would expect modernity to produce liberation, this has been a paradox in the case of India. Cinema that is challenging is
feared, while near pornographic cinema is applauded. This notion of the sensation over the erotic is emphasised by Lorde (1984). Her work in light of Indian cinema challenges how we view the superficial.

While women do have greater visibility in the public sphere in India, they are increasingly sexualised in the media. The idea that films have become more woman centric is a myth. Indian cinema has always featured women, only the quality of their roles has varied. In some ways visibility on screen often mirrors the discourse used against women off screen in the everyday violence against women. It is difficult to disentangle the cinematic from the everyday in some cases. While on screen this violence finds validation through the art of storytelling and the magic that is Indian cinema, off screen these similar acts of violence have a detrimental effect on the lives of women.
CHAPTER 7

7 Gender violence and Nationalism

He said I was a flower of the mountain, yes,
But now I’ve powers o’er a woman’s body, yes.

Kate Bush, 1988

7.1. Introduction

The previous chapter examined sexualised and violent representations of women who use alcohol and drugs on screen. If this violence were only contained within the confines of the cinema hall it would not be continually challenged. However it spills out of the screen and is internalised by the audience (predominantly male) who react to these images by hooting, clapping and even whistling songs to harass women. Bollywood films have had an impact on behaviour and thought which warrants its study. Derné and Jadwin (2000) observe the manner in which Bollywood cinema interacts with everyday life. This chapter will explore how Bollywood cinema has an impact on the perception and treatment of women. The aim is to explore how on screen discourse is similar to that played out in everyday incidents.

Discourse in Bollywood films around the subject of women’s shamed bodies calls for their humiliation and eventual death. This same discourse plays on women’s bodies in a less melodramatic manner in real life incidents. Headlines in national and international media have brought to attention some of these crimes against women. The victim’s identity or transgression is used against her to perpetrate these acts of violence. These acts of violence are supposedly carried out to correct women and to preserve ‘Indian culture’. Culture and nationality are invoked to normalise the
brutality of these acts by men/right wing groups, which seem to be on the rise. While Indian law defines these incidents as crime, vigilante justice assumes it is on the side of the state and helping to build a cleaner society. In some of these cases, the state has had an implicit role in the mistreatment of women. What makes this discourse particularly disturbing is the use of terms such as ‘culture’ and ‘tradition’ to make a distinction between crimes against western and non-western women. The state has often had an implicit role in colluding with the perpetrators of these crimes. Invoking an exotic cultural specificity has ensured such crimes are thought to be a feature of Indian culture which creates a divide between women in the global south and north.

Incidents in the past few years, which have led to public outrage, will be discussed. Some of these incidents were followed by nationwide protests and are widely known internationally. Often after such incidents the media frenzy picks up statements from those in power highlighting the misogynistic views held by politicians and self-titled god men. The rise of citizen journalism has brought issues seldom discussed in Indian society to the forefront. Unfortunately these discussions are not sustained and have not transformed into action. The aim of this chapter is to examine how on screen violence influences the Indian mindset and is replicated in everyday life.

7.2. **Link between on screen and off screen violence**

Fears of violence in popular media being replicated in everyday life are not unfounded. Desensitisation and the glamourising effect of on screen violence are issues often debated in India and around the world. Often the argument against on screen misrepresentation and violence is that it will provoke audiences to imitate those acts. However I would suggest that there is a continuum between film and real life, rather than two distinct entities one influencing each other. Violence on screen is
sometimes inspired by real life incidents and sometimes real life incidents seem to imitate on screen violence. Fears of popular media influencing real life violence have not been unfounded. The phenomena termed as the Werther Effect (Phillips, 1974), the idea that a well publicised suicide will lead to copycat suicides, has its base in the fear that popular media and popular people have a strong effect on people which leads to imitation. I would argue that the real-reel dichotomy is a continuum, both merging together at some point, the lines of reality blurring. In the case of Indian cinema Kakar (1981) points out that cinematic reality is not a clear-cut case of portraying reality as it actually is:

Hindi films may be unreal in a rational sense, but they are certainly not untrue. Their depiction of the external world may be flawed, their relevance to the external life of the viewer remote, yet as we shall see, the Hindi film demonstrates a confident and sure-footed grasp of the topography of desire and vicissitudes.

(Kakar, 1981:14)

However, the link between on screen violence causing off screen violence is often presented in over simplistic terms. While some acts of violence might have been inspired by events portrayed in visual media, some ideas propagated in films go deeper. A better way of understanding this link would be to use the metaphor of the Möbius strip, a continuum of the inside and outside merging by being indistinguishable from each other. Similarly it is hard to extricate artistic imagination from real life inspiration. Violence on screen is made for entertainment, it erases the

52 Named after one of its two creators (August Ferdinand Möbius and Johann Benedict Listing), the Möbius strip is a one sided surface which appears to have two sides. If one were to attempt to trace a line around the outside only of the figure, it would prove futile, as the figure curves in a manner such that outside and inside merge into a single surface.
complicated factors involved in its perpetration. Off screen violence is often based in identity politics, in complex power struggles, in notions of honour. On screen this violence is part of the melodrama that moves the story forward, it makes for emotive story telling, it exaggerates and suppresses.

At an empirical level, violence has been an obvious, but unfortunately ignored characteristic of the actual history of the subcontinent. Because the concept of a pan-Indian nationalism was born only under the aegis of Mahatma Gandhi, we have tended to emphasize the non-violence aspects of the Indian lifestyle, glossing over the bitter truth - the ideal being substituted for the actual.

(Saari and Chatterjee, 2009:112)

The use of anger in films tends to be gendered, action films mostly feature male actors and are produced for a predominantly male audience, romance and drama films for a female audience. Amitabh Bachan as the ‘angry young man’ was iconic in his use of anger on screen. This anger is not different from the anger expressed by Indian men in various social contexts, it is hyper masculine and socially validated. On the other hand, angry women out for vengeance are self sacrificing to the end. Gopalan (1997) argues that these films while presenting themselves as feminist alternatives have a scopophilic element to them, almost all begin with the rape of the heroine. A real life example of an avenging woman would be Phoolan Devi whose life inspired a controversial film *The Bandit Queen*.

Portraying everyday life, even exaggerated versions of it, is not an uncommon phenomenon in cinema. However the exaggerations and distortions that are used to produce a film can be considered to be an act of aggression by the filmmakers who wish to sublimate history. Alcohol and drug consumption in this case are treated not
only through a psychiatric lens but turned into a trope. In the films analysed the drunken heroines lose all sense of inhibition and sing to an audience, who while disapproving of their drunkenness are silent for the duration of the song. Their clothing and affluence are used against them to indicate a pathology. This pathology while not meeting clinical definitions certainly plays on the social imagination of what madness looks like.

Vigilante justice, which is validated on screen, is often replicated off screen. In films this plays out in the form of a lone hero taking on an unjust society, fighting them alone. In real life these incidents are more complex, the violence and destruction more frightening than the sublimated entertainment of cinema (Bennett-Smith, 2013; Jain, 2005; Sharma Bawa, 2015).

The following sections will discuss how on-screen violence has made its way into everyday acts of harassment and even planned attacks on women, indicating how these are significant in critiquing Bollywood.

### 7.3. Custodians of Indian culture

‘Ram Sena on pub attack: We're custodians of Indian culture’ read the newspaper headlines (TNN, 2009). Headlines such as these would not stop for days or weeks. On 24th January 2009 a group of forty men belonging to right wing Hindu group Sri Ram Sene (or Sri Ram Sena) entered a pub in Mangalore (a town in southern India) and attacked a group of young women (The Hindu, 2009). Claiming that the men and women were violating traditional Indian values, they beat them up. Videos of this shocking event went viral; one video on Youtube has over one million views as of 2015.
The rise of the Hindu right wing has seen incidents of violence to protest against violations of Indian/Hindu culture (Kumar, 2014; Wankhede, 2013). Against the backdrop of a globalised neo liberal economy, these extremist groups seem out of place, yet their presence and those who they accuse of ‘corrupting Indian culture’ make up this new Indian culture, both extremes in their own right. As pointed out by Hall (1993) the clash between these two extremes is inevitable in a post modern society. The question of authentic ‘Indian culture’ and its acceptable expression is a contentious one. This effort to preserve and even return to a state of pre colonial ‘perfection’ throws up differences in the experience of culture and its inevitable immutability.

January 2009 brought two important changes in India. It brought to the forefront the presence of Indian right wing groups infiltrating south India (considered a peaceful non right region). It also was the start of a new kind of activism powered by people challenging the right of women to enjoy the fruits of globalisation. The specific incident in question was the brutal Mangalore pub attack, which was recorded on camera and played over and over again on television news channels. Pramod Muthalik53 (leader of the Ram Sene group) commented on the attack carried out by his group, condemning the violence but condoning the ideology behind the attack as ‘saving our mothers and daughters’ (World Watch Monitor, 2009). When questioned about their actions a spokesperson of the Sri Ram Sene, Pravin Valke54, said the

---

53 They justified this attack by saying they did this to protect women from the dangers of alcohol and the unwanted male attention they would get by wearing western clothes and dancing. They claimed to be saving women from the dangers of westernisation and the loss of morality that comes with adopting western lifestyles. As a response to this incident nationwide protests ensued one of the campaigns included sending Pramod Muthalik pink knickers on Valentine’s Day (pink chuddi campaign).

54 One of the founding members of Sri Rama Sene, described as ‘a 40 year-old, fifth standard drop-
following:

‘These girls come from all over India, drink, smoke, and walk around in the night spoiling the traditional girls of Mangalore. A girl from Punjab was drugged, raped, and killed last month. There was no hue and cry then. Why should girls go to pubs? Are they going to serve their future husbands alcohol? Should they not be learning to make chapattis? Bars and pubs should be for men only. We wanted to ensure that all women in Mangalore are home by 7 pm, - You think the boys didn’t know what they were getting into. They did it in broad daylight before TV cameras. Don’t you think every girl will now think twice before entering a pub? The strategy was a success.’

(Johnson, 2009)

Ideas of outsiders violating tradition appeal to a deep sense of nationalism. The outsiders in some cases can be Indians from different regions. The antagonism between the north and south and their collective antagonism to the northeast runs deep. What is surprising about the statements made by these men to the media is the way they seem to normalise and justify these attacks. Their language is contradictory to their action, they use words such as ‘save’ and ‘tradition’ while enacting violence against the very people they say they are saving.

Attacks on women by right wing Hindu groups are often carried out in order to protect women from the perils of Western values (pub going, drinking, smoking, dancing, wearing western clothes) which are thought of as a corrupting force which makes an individual lose out on their ‘Indian’ values and identity.

out’ (Johnson, 2009)
Over the last twenty years India has seen an emerging right wing force which is predominantly Hindu. Hancock (1995) documents some of these changes in ideologies and how they have reached parts of India which were once thought of as politically neutral. The focus of this new nationalism is almost always on women and how this process affects them and the impact it will have on the larger society (McClintock, 1995). Women are often thought of as preservers and reproducers of their culture and therefore their behaviour comes under greater scrutiny (Yuval-Davis, 1997). Drinking/drug use is one such activity that challenges the role of the feminine and therefore Indian identity; while a psychoactive substance isn’t masculine or feminine or grounded in national identity, certain substances are classified socially as male or female. Male and female areas are clearly demarcated. Women violating these unwritten norms are subject to violence. The use of illegal substances is a legal transgression, however vigilantes use this as an opportunity to send out an ideological message.

Behaviour that is considered sexually deviant (drinking, wearing western clothing, going out to pubs etc) is treated as a crime against the well being of the community. Mountian (2004) points out how fears of losing out on an unborn generation combined with a notion of nationhood play on the way westernised women are positioned as a threat to the well being of the (Indian) state. However as these are not crimes against the nation, groups who perceive this as a crime deal with them by inflicting violence upon the victim.

‘Consortium of Pub-going, Loose and Forward Women’ launched a nationwide campaign called the ‘pink chuddi campaign’ (pink knickers) to shame the perpetrators of the pub attack. The Bangalore based group was to collect pink knickers from women and men to send to Pramod Muthalik, the leader of Sri Ram
Sene. Their Facebook page carries this description:

The Pink Chaddi Campaign kicked off on 5 February 2009 to oppose the Sri Ram Sena. The campaign is growing exponentially (31,888 members at this point in the life of our Consortium of Pub-going, Loose and Forward Women) and that is not surprising. Most women in this country have enough curbs on their lives without a whole new franchise cashing in with their bully-boy tactics. Of course, a lot of men have joined the group as well.

(Consortium of Pub-going, Loose and Forward Women, no date)

The organisers of this campaign also called for Pub Bharo action (Fill the pub) where they urged people to visit a pub and raise a toast. They did not urge anyone to drink but to show solidarity with those trying to overthrow the culture police. This movement was short lived, as over the years threats of violence against people celebrating Valentine’s Day in India have only gotten stronger and so has violence against women (Bennett-Smith, 2013). Activism and memory have been short lived in this case and subsequent cases.
This was not the first incident of its kind, similar incidents had taken place before and continue to do so after this incident. Media and activists have observed the rise of groups protecting the youth from the dangers of ‘western culture’. This worrying trend is split along the lines of class, religion, region and gender. Women of all classes are vulnerable to crimes that are peculiar to their position in society. In the same article as the one above an acquaintance of one of the victims had this to say:

According to her, there is a level of class resentment, especially among boys of the same age group as the girls who were attacked at the pub. Upper class women are perceived as arrogant who deserve to be subjugated. The girls were doing what a man is doing spending money, showing signs of freedom, and hanging out in a posh locality, she says, accusing politicians of exploiting caste, class, and religious differences. The seed of distrust has been sown. We have been divided, she says.

(Johnson, 2009)
Invariably the perpetrators of these crimes resort to playing the victim. Their retreat to culture and patriotism is an attempt to mitigate the nature of their crime.

### 7.4. The stuff of Myths and Legends

The events of January 2009 are not unique to modernity. There is a glorification of violence against women in India, it is present in myths and is part of a culture that sees violence against women as an act of comedy. An example of this is in a popular story from The Ramayan.

The widowed demoness Surpanakha spent her time between Lanka and the forests of Southern India, visiting her forest-dwelling relatives Asuras, from time to time. According to the Valmiki Ramayana, during one such visit she met the young Prince of Ayodhya, Ram, who was in exile with his brother Laxman and wife Sita. Surpanakha was immediately smitten by his youthful good looks. Ram, however, spurned her advances, telling her that he was devoted to his wife, Sita, and that he would never take another wife. Ram then slyly suggested that she approach his younger brother, Laxman, with her proposition. Laxman reacted in a similar manner, deriding Surpanakha and telling her that she was not what he desired in a wife. Realising eventually that the brothers were making fun of her, the humiliated and jealous Surpanakha attacked Sita to abduct her but this attempt was thwarted by Laxman, who cut off her nose, ears, and breasts, and made her look hideous and sent her back to Lanka.

(Magley, no date; Rao, 2009)

The image of the seductive Surpanakha being taught a lesson by a virtuous Laxman is embedded into the Indian subconscious through hearing the tale at an early age and
watching renactments. Every year at the Ramlila\textsuperscript{55} staged during the Hindu festival of Dussehra this scene is played out as a comedy. It is a cautionary tale to all women who express sexual desire towards men and transgress gender boundaries. Surpanakha’s character stands in stark contrast to Sita who is a dutiful woman venerated for her subservience. Surpanakha embodies the typical ‘evil’ woman in Indian mythology; she is bold and sexually free which is seen as both comic and vampish (Erndl, 1991). Her punishment for sexual transgression is public humiliation and visible scars. Though this story of Surpanakha is not a justification of violence, nor universally applicable in all Indian contexts, the theme that runs through this is a powerful one.

Stephen (2013) argues this myth is not confined to being a play alone, tracing similar incidents of violence against women through popular mythologies she presents a picture of how acts of violence are historically justified. Pointing out the nature of myths Nandy (1995) conceptualises them as moral:

All myths are morality tales. Mythologization is also moralization; it involves a refusal to separate the remembered past from its ethical meaning in the present. For this refusal, it is often important not to remember the past, objectively, clearly, or in its entirety. Mythic societies sense the power of myths and the nature of human frailties; they are more fearful than the modern ones - forgive the anthropomorphism - of the perils of mythic use of amoral certitudes about the past.

(Nandy, 1995:47)

\textsuperscript{55} Ramlila, translates as “Rama’s play”, it is a performance of the Ramayan epic in the form of scenes that include song, narration, recital and dialogue. It is performed across northern India during the festival of \textit{Dussehra}, held each year around the months of October or November. (UNESCO, 2005).
While myths constitute a very real implication of danger to Stephen, Nandy sees them in a distant manner without the violence they cause. Terming them as human frailty and thought of as fearful, Nandy’s mythologised society is not one women and especially Dalit women are a part of.

7.5. **Limits of Indian identity**

Nandy (1994) examines the mythic entity of the Indian state that has been built up by nationalists who seek to revive ‘Indian culture’ and bring the nation (a Hindu state) back to its former glory. Assumptions that Hinduism is the dominant and original religion of India which has been hijacked by Muslims and Christians, play into ideas of a persecuted nation which needs to fight for the restoration of a lost identity. Vandevelde (2011) examines the language and dilemmas around the issue of conversion and reconversion and the threat posed to national identity, Hinduism being assumed to be the natural identity of Indians. Often the idea that Indian identity is based on being Hindu plays into the fear that conversion leads to a loss of national identity. The idea that the nation can return to a previous state of being all Hindu is met with resistance from urban Indians and non Hindus or even less orthodox Hindus who are fast imbibing the lifestyle of their global counterparts and have internalised many aspects of a global culture. Clashes between class, gender and caste are played out in the way women of privilege are treated.

Events that unfolded in December 2012 are an example of how the intersection between class, gender and caste play out in the way violence is inflicted on women’s bodies. On the night of December 16th 2012 a woman (aged 23, a physiotherapy intern) with her male friend caught a bus to return home at night after watching a movie. During the course of the journey the woman was brutally gang raped by the
bus driver and his friends, beaten and violated with a metal rod. Her male friend who was with her was beaten when he tried to defend her. Both their bodies were thrown by the side of the road in the cold (The Hindu, 2013). Termed as Nirbhaya by the press, she succumbed to her injuries on 28th December 2012. This horrific event sparked protests around the nation and also led to the government changing legislation around rape and other sexual crimes. The Verma Commission was set up as a response. At first this was viewed as a crime perpetrated against an upper class women (and hence the public attention), however it was later revealed the victim’s family were not wealthy and had struggled to pay for her education.

Figure 23: Cartoon by Syam (Sundar, no date)

The panel on the left reads ‘look what kind of clothes she is wearing, aren’t they ashamed?’ The role of the police in stripping the woman of her clothes is seen to be no different from the moral policing done by the masses as they view images of women on television.

Television news carried comments by politicians and godmen who displayed a lack of sensitivity, these statements sparked further protests (Daniel and Bhattacharjya,
2013). Asaram Bapu (a Godman) claimed the victim was equally guilty in the act of rape and should have pleaded to the men on grounds of religion. Social media and international media carried analysis about why Indian men are so violent and if stricter punishment could help change the situation. Both Indian and western media focused on tradition but in different ways - one side tired of it, the other feeling helpless at the state of affairs but too wary of seeming ignorant of a foreign culture.

7.5.1 A question of honour

The following is an excerpt of a sketch from the popular comedy series Goodness Gracious Me. It is a dialogue between two women, one of them (unnamed) a lady seeking refuge from her violent husband, the other (Jacinta) a counsellor:

Jacinta: Is he of your people? Do you share the same mother soil?
Woman: Well yes, but what's that got to do with anything?
Jacinta: Umm, and this knife he had, it wasn't in any way a ceremonial dagger was it?
Woman: Well the handle was covered in blood and it had a sharp pointy tip, I don't know I didn't look!
Jacinta: It's just that if it's a traditional implement it comes under cultural practices, and I can't interfere.
Woman: What?
Jacinta: Well you see, it might be something I know nothing about, you know like dowry dispute or female infibulation. The things that make you different and special.

56 A British Asian satirical comedy series that challenged racial stereotypes and prejudices. See Appendix E - Goodness Gracious Me.
Woman: Are you mad! He's going to kill me!

Jacinta: Well, I'm sorry but I can't help you, because I might be culturally oppressing you.

(Full transcript, see Appendix E - Goodness Gracious Me)

The humour in the sketch comes from the fact that culture is placed above crime and protecting gender. Difference in experience is both created and maintained by the counsellor who positions infibulations as making women of colour different. Culture and feminism are positioned in opposition to one another, as the two are mutually exclusive. The counsellor tries to normalise her distress by placing it outside her cultural reality. By citing difference (culture in this case) she alienates the woman of colour and colludes with her husband who wants to kill her. Her participation in the actual crime is minimal but she almost justifies its existence and perpetuation.

The terms ‘honour’ and ‘tradition’ are often used to describe these crimes against women of Asian origin. However they are deeply misleading terms and convey the message that somehow these crimes are justifiable or sanctioned by the culture in question. By definition, ‘honour’ describes something of high morality or something worthy of respect, when used in conjunction with ‘crime’ the term takes on a new meaning, acting as a euphemism and viewing the crime from the perpetrator’s perspective, to whom the crime might be justified as an act of honour.

The term “honour crimes” has come to encompass a variety of violence against women, such as murder, assault and detention, most of which involve preventing a person from exercising their choice in marriage or relationships. Such crimes are often committed by the family or by members of the community which perceives that there has been a “threat to honour” (a
perceived sense of honour), thereby giving the crime a social sanction.

(Arya & Khurana, 2014:41)

Ramaseshan (2010) examines the use of the word honour, which is absent in Indian law except when used to defend a crime against a woman:

In this context, there is a publicly articulated “justification” that is attributed to a social order claiming to require the preservation of the concept of “honour” vested only in male (family and/or conjugal) control over women.

(Ramaseshan, 2010:114)

‘Honour’ or ‘tradition’ when used in conjunction with a crime has the propensity of justifying the actions of the perpetrators of those crimes. Using affirming terms as an adjective to describe this kind of crime also perpetuates the idea of a feudal India where crime is a long-standing feature of society. Orwell (1946) in his essay “Politics and the English Language” warns against using euphemisms for the fear that they might detract from the horror of the events they are trying to normalise. The term honour crime conflates two opposing ideas to hide an act of violence and subvert the horror of the act. Words such as ‘tradition’ and ‘culture’ are attempts to evade moral responsibility and make crime in non-western nations seem normal and justifiable almost as if the crime is a part of the social system of that particular culture. Gill (2009) argues that the notion of honour ‘acts as a smoke screen’, a nod to an extrinsic value system that masks the fact that judgments about honour are made according to internally defined gendered criteria. There is also a danger of colluding with the perpetrators by letting them believe they are in fact protectors of ‘tradition’. Victims of these crimes tend to be ignored or treated as objects whose narrative is lost in the ‘othering’ of crime. Yuval-Davis (1998) examines the use of words such as ‘culture’
and the way in which they are used to justify racism and xenophobia. Media reporting of these crimes often focuses on the cultural and racial aspects of the crime, thereby making violence against women seem exotic and alien to the society in which they are committed. Wade (2009) explores a similar idea of how female genital mutilation is reported in western media. By focusing on culture and the exotic aspect of crime, the victim and the crime perpetrated against her, gets less attention as compared to the perpetrator whose actions are articulated in terms of race and culture. Bringing culture into the narrative of crime almost justifies it by giving it the appearance of being socially sanctioned or intrinsic to a particular society.

A similar idea can be found in the term ‘correction rape’ which is applied in the context of raping a lesbian\textsuperscript{57} in order to correct her of her ‘faulty’ sexual orientation. Di Silvio (2011) describes this crime perpetrated in order to “cure” lesbians of their nonconforming sexual orientation - or “correct” it - the belief being that homosexuality is an imported white disease. It is a term used by perpetrators of the crime to justify their actions.

Examining crime without tying it to notions of culture yet understanding that some crime is based in cultural struggles, is challenging. Perpetrators of these crimes claim that they are fighting to preserve what they think is their version of ‘Indian culture’; to brand their idea of culture as a universal Indian culture would justify their actions. On the other hand, to think of these crimes as exclusive to one culture produces a notion that crime against women in western countries isn’t horrific, or that ‘modern’ women, as opposed to ‘traditional’ women, are not susceptible to crime (Wade, 2009). This dichotomy between modern/traditional women and the crimes

\textsuperscript{57} Practised in South Africa under the misguided belief that rape can change one’s sexual orientation.
perpetrated against one group polarises and creates two groups who face similar
kinds of violence but in different contexts, using the word ‘traditional’ creates a
notion of violence being socially sanctioned. While ‘honour crime’ is indeed based
within a few south Asian nations it would be wrong to assume that it is naturally a
part of the community and a part of the social system. Honour crime is not justified
by the constitution of India but it is justified on the social level by the perpetrators
and enablers of these crimes. These crimes are also region specific. Universalising
these crimes onto the entire community has the effect of blaming the community;
however denying that these crimes are community specific takes away the
significance of these crimes. George (2006) makes a distinction between the ways in
which honour is experienced and its distinction between gender and the domestic and
public sphere. Afzal58 (Gentelman, 2014) argues that crimes such as these should not
be justified in the UK on the basis of multiculturalism. Focusing on the injustice of
profiling the perpetrators detracts from the crimes and almost colludes with the
perpetrators.

While culture does indeed produce gender roles and these crimes are grounded in a
particular culture, they are not justifiable on those grounds alone. Accepting the
perpetrators’ claims of cultural authenticity colludes with their actions. An example
of this is how stalking inspired by Bollywood films was successfully used as a
defence by a lawyer in Australia to exonerate an Indian man of all charges. Culture
and future employment were accepted as reasonable arguments against a conviction
(Dhaliwal, 2015; Child, 2015). The perpetrator’s right to exercise his culture was
given precedence over the victim’s right to personal safety. Cinematic culture is

58 Crown prosecution Manchester, appointed in 2011 as the Chief Crown Prosecutor of the Crown
Prosecution Service for North West England.
implicated in this case which has influenced how gender and sexuality are viewed. While this case illustrates how powerful Bollywood is when it comes to exerting an influence, it does pose a worrying trend for those who are victimised by cinematic expressions of sexuality.

The Delhi gang rape case as it has come to be known has captured the attention of the media and activists worldwide, sparking off debates around race, crime, gender and region. In the wake of this news, vulgarity in the Indian media was discussed. Cases have been brought to legal attention. Culture is often used to promote the idea of inferiority of women in different parts of the world where colonialism created the notions of inferiority based on gender (Chatterjee, 1989). While culture is often used to justify these crimes it helps us understand how these crimes against women are presented in a different way from across the world.

### 7.6. Reclaim the past

Postcolonial theorists (Chatterjee, Nandy, Kakar) often look at how colonisation had an effect on the formation of Indian identity. Despite not giving into notions of nationalism they inadvertently tend to sell their own brand of nationalism by dividing it from what they term as the ‘west’ or ‘modern’. Arguing for a state of pre-colonial perfection they ignore pre-existing hegemonic violence that existed in the Indian nation which was often paid no attention by colonial powers. Indian culture then is understood as corrupted by colonial rule, a corruption of these ideas is often held by right wing nationalists who believe they can bring India back to its former glory.

Bonnett (2012) critiques the arguments of Ashis Nandy, he argues that Nandy provides necessary myths of the ‘west’ or ‘modern’. When these ideas trickle down from academic discourse they take on the form of essentialising ‘Indian culture’ and
‘restoring’ its past. McClintock (1995) points out how most male theorists have failed to make a vital connection between nationalism and gender. For instance, most crimes perpetrated against women in India are justified as trying to help protect women.

Nandy provides a framework for understanding the Indian psyche, damaged by the process of colonialism. History, mythology and religion play a role in how Indian people are understood to negotiate the world. Explanations such as these are very similar to that expounded by Dinanath Batra. In a recent television debate Batra claimed that science in India was Sanatani and westernisation prevents us from learning about the Indian past (NDTV India, 2014). He makes a claim to reject westernisation, however he is open to modernisation - ‘Let us modernise ancient wisdom’, he claims. Going into detail he argues that India is an ‘ancient land of culture giving rise to a science and religion’. These are almost the exact words used in the films Purab Aur Paschim and Hare Rama Hare Krishna. Despite approaching the nation through a different perspective, all three manage to convey the same notion of Indian superiority and an enduring culture. Science emerging from religious ideology is utilised to convey this sense of superiority.

Nandy (1984) is critical of modernity, and, using notions of progress, attempts to

59 A retired school teacher and the founder of educational activist organisations Shiksha Bachao Andolan Samiti (save education). Batra has also served as the General Secretary of Vidya Bharati, the school network run by the Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh (RSS) a right wing Hindu group. He recently came to attention when he advocated banning Wendy Doniger’s book and for rewriting Indian history textbooks. He is anti western influence in Indian cultural life, arguing that Indians need to return to their roots. (Sharma, 2014)

60 A Sanskrit word meaning eternally pre-existing, which is often used by various Hindu denominations to claim national legitimacy.
show the redemptive features of tradition and traditional forms of behaviour, however he inadvertently ends up colluding with the perpetrators of violence.

7.7. **Indian women and violence**

India has been described as the fourth most dangerous place in the world for women to live in (Afghanistan is ranked first on the list followed by Congo and Pakistan) (TrustLaw, 2011). Female foeticide was cited as one of the major crimes against women in India. Violence against women in India makes the female body the site of violence by disfiguring and disabling, some of these crimes include publicly stripping women, publicly raping/molesting them and throwing acid at them. In recent years India has seen a rise in acid attacks, even the threat of an acid attack is used as a way to get women to conform (Thakur, 2008; Nelson, 2012). Acid attacks have been described as a premeditated crime with an intention to kill or maim (Thakur, 2008). Most acid attacks involve a perpetrator using strong acids\(^1\) which cause permanent and irreversible damage to the body. Apart from disfiguring the body physically and causing damage to major organs, acid attacks also cause psychological harm. Furlong (2012) describes the nature of acid attacks: ‘attackers often target the head and face in order to maim, disfigure and blind. Acid violence rarely kills but causes severe physical, psychological and social scarring, and victims are often left with no legal recourse, limited access to medical or psychological assistance, and without the means to support themselves’. Some of the reasons cited for this crime are jealousy and being rejected. Research suggests that in South Asian countries acid attacks are primarily directed against women (Coomaraswamy, 2005; 61

---

\(^{61}\) Acids used in these attacks are sulfuric, nitric, or hydrochloric acid which are classified as strong acids used in industrial processes. Some of the damage caused by acid attacks include dissolving of bones, organ damage, burning the skin and even death.
While acid attacks are physical, crimes such as publicly stripping women or raping them also attack the body psychologically. Female bodies become associated with shame and crime, the alleged transgression becomes tied to their bodies which become public spectacles.

7.7.1 Recent crime not historical

It would be easy to ascribe these crimes against women to a longstanding patriarchal system, however these crimes are embedded in modernity. Tracing acid attacks to the tale of Surpanakha might seem logical and even culturally justifiable, however it does not account for variations and contradictions in history and social change. The language of tradition and history is used by the perpetrators to justify the existence of these crimes.

John (2013) analyses gendered crime in a historical context, her analysis focuses on rape but it can also be applied to other gendered crimes whose origins lie in their historical context:

Clearly, rape can present itself as an omnipresent practice throughout the process of continuous social change only if we work with ahistorical notions of gender differences and presume an unchanging human sexuality. There is, unfortunately, a strong tendency towards constituting gender segregation as a system/division that is independent of prevailing historical socio-economic conditions. Consequently, it is believed that the gender-based social division leading to a subdued female sexuality and aggressive male sexuality was uncharacteristic of primitive human societies in which such social relations of
domination were more or less absent.

(John, 2013:online)

As with most crime directed against women it is meant to make a spectacle of the victim and her crime (real or imagined). Women have to carry the scars of these attacks forever. Acid attacks do not just scar the body physically but also cause deep emotional trauma and prevent women from resuming their lives as they did prior to the attacks. Shirin Juwaley, an acid attack survivor and activist, often explores issues relating to physical disfigurement and the way ‘physical anomalies’ are treated in India. She writes about the exclusion she faces from institutions and people (some of whom are women) who either stare, or make derogatory comments about her appearance (Juwaley, no date; Bhutia, 2011; INKtalks, 2012). Female bodies in these cases are not only sites of violence but also provide a public spectacle of what transgressing social norms entails. Foucault (1977) talks about the ‘spectacle’ of execution, this violence serves a role in society to either shame or draw pity to the victim. Disfigured, disgraced female bodies provide a similar spectacle, which is possibly why the violence takes on a brutal form with permanent effects. Like the mythical Suparnakha these women become the object of public ridicule, fascination, shame or pity. The spectacle of their disfigured, dishonoured bodies is often a permanent reminder to those whom they come into contact with.

7.8.  *History repeats itself*

Events of 2009 mobilised a large group of people in India to challenge right wing vigilante justice, however this was short lived. Activism and awareness has grown

---

62 Shirin Juwaley is the founder of Palash foundation (India) an organisation that attempts to socially and economically re-integrate people with disfigurement.
but so has the violence (Basu, 1992; Ray and Korteweg, 1999). On the night of 9 July 2012 a woman aged 17 was coming out of a pub in Guwahati (a city in north east India) when she was dragged and molested by a group of men. A journalist who was present at the time filmed this entire incident capturing the faces of the perpetrators who were smiling into the camera. The attack lasted for about 45 minutes, the victim begged for help. She was injured and burnt with cigarettes, by the men who were thought to be drunk (Fernandes, 2012). Due to the public nature of this event videos have been circulated on Youtube and other social media. Questions about ethics in media and also the role of bystanders have been raised through this incident. The editor of the channel the journalist belonged to claimed the recording was made to help the police catch the criminals (Fernandes, 2012). Scopophilia generated by this event should not be underestimated; it is quite similar to prolonged rape scenes in Indian films. Dwyer describes how medical and even art films that depict nudity are often marketed as soft pornography in India (University Of Rhode Island, 2009). Confusing the erotic with violent and grotesque can explain how gender and sexuality are understood by men in India. Female subjects are understood in terms of passive participants subservient to masculine gaze. The context of the film, completely lost on the audience, acquires the meaning of pornography, a forbidden pleasure, and one enjoyed in the dark confines of the cinema hall, (re)enacted outside the cinema hall.

While outrage and anger characterised the debates in India, in the UK the Guardian newspaper captured this story on its front page with the headlines “Why is India so bad for women?” (Pidd, 2012). Reader comments pointed out the implicit racism involved in writing such an article, others spoke about the indelible mark colonialism left on the landscape of the country. Pidd goes onto list the number of horrific crimes
perpetrated upon women in India, mentioning how the law does little to intervene in these cases. While Pidd herself only pointed out the current state of things the positioning of western and Indian women should not be lost on the reader. A few pages after this article the paper carried a story about the 2012 Olympic athletes drinking and enjoying the nightlife London had to offer. The difference between these two stories carries with it a sense of valiant female liberation in the west and the subaltern position of women in the global south. Roggeband and Verloo (2007) see this nationalistic politic play out in the way native and migrant women are conceptualised in policy. Indian women in this case are then thought of as victims who need perpetual western support and western women as responsible for their own liberation. Nationalism plays out in the way women’s rights are subsumed into national identity. Women in both nations are subject to oppression through the system that sublimates oppression into a cultural invisibility. Both groups are subjected to violence that is justified as culturally acceptable by painting a picture of abject marginality on the side of the subaltern other.

Culturally sanctioned violence then becomes a disciplinary tool by which society at large helps protect the perpetrators, even rewarding them. Migrant women in the western world are the exotic other characterised as victims of a violent culture. Similarly in India, westernised and western women are seen as deserving of violence. Both conceptualisations suggest violence is an inherent condition of certain societies and women are its inevitable victims.

Culture and tradition operate as a smokescreen obscuring the existence of violence in society. There is a sense of injustice in how culture is used in the context of power. Williams (1985) has argued that ‘culture’ is one of few difficult to define words in the English language. Tied to power structures, power can be seen in manifestations
of culture. Usage of the term is deliberate. Used to define oneself in terms of morality the term is selective in what it considers to be moral.

7.8.1  The female body as a site of ‘corrective violence’

Attacks on women are carried out with a view to correct them of their western ways. The idea presents itself as a favour to women at the same time as serving as a warning. Boundaries of class and caste discontent are played out by violating women’s bodies, which are both a public example and unspoken social norm. Public displays of disfigured and shamed female bodies are reminders of these mores, the spectacle of disfigurement is a public punishment for the group and for all those who might want to transgress social boundaries. Foucault (1977) analyses how the body became the source of public spectacle in public executions, similarly violence against the female body sends a dual message of public reminders and of female submission. Violence directed at the female body subdues resistance and subversion of patriarchy. Brownmiller (1993) examines the role violence, rape in particular, has on reaffirming the power patriarchy has on women.

“Women's bodies are often read as repositories of community honour but shame can also be experienced individually by women who may have experienced sexual violence. So dishonouring a woman can lead to a symbolic dishonouring of the community and can sometimes lead to an increased threat of honour-based violence, including murder”.

(Burnell, 2012:online)

The transgression by itself does not matter so much as the idea of transgression. Women who enter supposedly ‘male territory’ or challenge male power are brought
back into submission. Disfigured, violated, naked female bodies are held up as an example of correction, almost as if the violence to the female body cleanses society of its ills. As a battle between class, caste and religion plays out the violated body of the transgressor, in this case a female, is symbolic of a group that has been defeated. Women while being upheld as being transmitters of their culture are also its most vulnerable.

When westernisation affects women it becomes particularly dangerous. Western women are perceived negatively, westernised Indian women are then thought of as vulnerable to the ‘vices’ of their western counterparts. Western women are not immune to this violence, they are often victims of sexual violence in the United Kingdom. The Rochdale grooming scandal\textsuperscript{63} of 2012 (Carter, 2012; BBC News, 2012) highlights the nature of communities perpetrating violence on women with the idea shaming a community. Western/white women are seen as objects of lust and women whose bodies are available for violence and sex trade. Discourse around these crimes revolves around either examining the race and religious identities of the perpetrators or ignoring it. One cannot ignore that these crimes do position western women as ‘sexually available’, an idea that is then transferred to Indian women who are westernised. Both India and Pakistan share similar cultural values and some crimes against women are based in common regional cultures rather than religion. Honour based crime and patriarchal systems that support such violence are deeply embedded in the northern region of the subcontinent (Abu-Lughod, 2011; Baxi et al, 2011).

\textsuperscript{63} Involving a group of men who preyed on under age girls in Rochdale, Greater Manchester. Nine men were convicted in 2012 of offences including rape, trafficking girls for sex and conspiracy to engage in sexual activity with a child. All the men were of Muslim backgrounds, mostly of Pakistani origin, and all the girls were white. The abuse had been systematic over a number of years, with a failure to investigate by the authorities even after a complaint had been made by one of the girls.
This is a region that is strongly patriarchal and women have a limited role in public life, they are expected to conform to rigid social norms. Kaur (2010) points out the role of the Panchayat (system of governance that involves five elders) system that exists in villages and dominates over decisions that adversely affect women’s lives from birth, marriage and education.

Debates in the Rochdale case focused more on the racial aspects of the crime (both for and against profiling) and very little on the nature of the crime.

Now, coming to “Western” culture - the first thing that pops into the mind of an average Pakistani on hearing the words, “Western values,” is the image of a scantily clad blonde chugging (drinking) down beer in a sleazy bar.

(Talat, 2011)

Notions of what western culture stands for and linking it to sexual promiscuity have meant that all behaviour attributed to western women is sexualised. In India fair skin is a quality much valued in women and recently in men (Beteille, 1967; Karnani, 2007; Shevde, 2008). However, fairness in women is much prized when it comes to marriage. This connection is deeply entrenched in the way crime against women is gendered and also fetishised. Lorde (1984) makes an argument about the way women are positioned in discourses on race, she questions the position black women hold when it comes to being victims from white culture and also from black men. Skin colour and sexual attraction are tied together in the Indian subcontinent.

This stereotypical image of a sexualized western woman affirms the idea of women being sexually easy and also in need of correction. Western women are perceived in terms of their sexuality under a male gaze, and this idea then finds its way into the way Indian women are viewed when they emulate their western counterparts.
Nationalism in India is embedded in notions that Indian identity is tied to Hinduism. Indian women behaving like western women breaks the norms of what is acceptable in terms of faith and also national identity. A paternalistic notion runs through the idea of what is imagined to be the west and the corrupting power it has over women both western and native, as the same argument is almost never used against men.

Public acts of violence against women serve as a means of social control. Exaggerated violence that makes a spectacle of the woman caution other women what their fate might be if they don’t conform to their gender role. Public spectacles are meant to shock and also to be visible reminders of patriarchal authority in society. Pain (1991) examines the role of violence and its different manifestation with regard to gender. Women, she concludes, are more fearful of sexual violence and crime that affects the body.

7.9. The dangers of orientalism

Post independence India is a nation that is carving out its identity through claims of authenticity. Locating authentic modes of thought and behaviour have often been followed by inventions of an interpretation of the past. Ideas that eastern cultures should be resistant to change and must remain unchanged often patronise and infantilise the east. Social change in non-white cultures is seen as loss or a shift from one’s history and tradition (Nandy, 1983; Mohan, 2011). Colonialism is often seen as a break in the trajectory of India’s development as a nation. In many ways this might be true, however what is lost in this narrative is that India was not paralysed but continued to develop its own culture within colonialism and also subcultures. Colonialism shaped India as we now know it. Reflecting on the past pre-colonisation often leads up to the rise in nationalistic sentiment and also for a longing of the
culture that would have changed over time, colonial occupation notwithstanding. Nandy often explores the way nationalists misread and exploit history to fit into their own agenda but are based in ideas that could only have existed within a colonial system. Often these views find their way into which western intellectuals have come to understand Indian society.

Adhering to the tenets of ‘traditional culture’ is understood to be the only way for non-western society to function. While looking out to non-western society, western culture is mistakenly seen as a default state of existence whereas culture is attributed to differences in the society it looks at. Volpp (2001) looks at the way feminism is positioned with regard to multiculturalism, culture is understood as a force that is harmful to non-western women. The two positions are seen as mutually exclusive and culture as something non-western women have to give up in order to be liberated. Words such as tradition take on a subversive meaning, while sounding like they try and understand the nuances of a culture, they actually homogenise a culture and give a false sense in its own past contributing to the rise of nationalism.

Often the position of the person studying the culture in question is left unchallenged. Western views of what constitutes ‘traditional culture’ are often looking for differences in another culture and romanticising what it fails to understand. When presented in Britain, crime in the Asian community presents itself as exotic tied to a community’s honour. Crime against women takes on a mythology of its own. Honour crimes are given a history of a feudal past, which is used as an explanation of the crime. While on the surface this idea might sound reasonably valid, it fails to highlight the differences in caste, class, religion, and the fear of westernisation that contribute to these crimes. Explaining these crimes as based within a certain culture works at making a culture seem barbaric as compared to ‘liberal western society.’
7.9.1 The romance of the orient

Notions of traditional cultures and their difference from western culture play on the ideas that India is not only just different but also not at par with western values. Common phrases such as eastern mysticism and Indian values not only provide a generalised and biased idea of India but also homogenise India culture (Hutnyk, 2000). Women’s changing social roles then prove to be incongruent to this stereotypical idea of the Indian woman who does not conform to the social roles expected of her. Chatterjee (1989) looks at the role of Indian women as defined by both colonial powers and by nationalists and how both these powers had to give Indian women a defining identity. Indian women are often caught in the act of being defined and spoken for as a homogenous group with no individuality. Contradictions in these ideas evoke a sense of loss of control over women. Economic freedom implies a loss of the traditional male role of being the breadwinner. While the harmless act of changing one’s dressing style is a personal matter and of style, it can be interpreted as violating a status quo.

7.9.2 Resisting Bollywood

Cinema’s misrepresentations are often easily dismissed as not having a direct effect on society, bell hooks (1997) challenges this assumption on the basis that popular culture is created deliberately, its production is a process that involves the volition of its creators. Its transmission and replication is a deliberate one she contends. Cinema, she argues, is a strong means of propagating ‘white supremacist, capitalist patriarchy’ (hooks, 1997:online).

In the case of Indian cinema it can be seen that popular culture and its violence is replicated off screen. In the year 2010 two Bollywood ‘item numbers’ made
headlines for all the right and then eventually wrong reasons. The songs ‘Munni badnaan hui’ (Munni was shamed) and ‘Shelia ki jawani’ (Shelia’s youthfulness) were instant hits and played on every radio station and music channel, they were performed on dance and talent shows across the nation. However there was a darker side to this. The songs were full of innuendos and suggestive dance moves. The songs were full of innuendos and suggestive dance moves (Goenka, 2015; Kaur, 2011; IBN Live, 2011) Women who were called either Sheila or Munni complained of harassment as these songs were sung by men around them with the intent to harass. Some of these women went onto take their lives due to the stress and trauma they were put through. It is not uncommon in India to face harassment of this kind publically. Men often hum songs or whistle at women as they pass by.

A Public-Interest Litigation (PIL) was made against the films using these songs and a ban on the songs demanded (Deccan Herald, 2013). However this action did not have any effect on the subsequent films produced, who took little or no notice of the issue raised by these actions.

In 2013, after the infamous Delhi Gang Rape Case, the song Fevicol se (with Fevicol) was brought to the notice of the high court (TNN, 2013). The complaint was filed on the grounds of vulgarity and in the wake of the aforementioned rape case. Despite mass protests this song was performed and broadcast publically. The grip Bollywood has on the public imagination is not to be underestimated.

Protests and public interest against vulgarity in item songs is not only condoned but also rewarded. Take for instance the rapper Honey Singh whose song ‘mein baltkari’

---

64 Both are item songs performed by famous actresses.
65 The song has several suggestive lyrics and dance moves. It featured in the film Dabang 2, a sequel to the box office hit Dabang in 2010.
(I am a rapist) went onto win several awards amidst protests (Singh, 2013; Tanna, 2014). He has also been signed up by various directors to provide the soundtrack for films that have gone on to become commercially successful. This act is not random or an exception, it is fast becoming a norm, misogyny is protected even justified as popular entertainment. Strong activist opposition to events or people is followed by silence until the next event.

While this is idea of harassment of women is not unique to India its frequency and intensity is. The singers of these songs have gone onto win awards and have made more music. While patriarchy is often blamed for the condition of women it has come to refashion itself through neoliberal feminism that has come to dominate certain sections of Indian society (Sharma, 2006). The actresses in these songs claim these as liberating and as choice, however for a vast majority of women in India this liberation is missing. The difference in privilege is obvious here, actresses are sheltered from everyday harassment due to their economic and social affluence. Women less privileged than them encounter such harassment on a daily basis. It is not uncommon to face harassment on public transport, at places of work, outside educational institutions etc. This harassment is intimidating.

7.10. Post 2012

The Delhi Gang Rape case started vital discussions across India, some of which have led to changes in legislation. There seems to be a visible exasperation with the authorities with the injustices most Indians put up with. News from this case has far from exhausted itself. Mukesh Singh, in a recent interview blamed the victim for

66 Driver of the bus and one of the rapists in the Delhi gang rape case, 16th December 2012. Convicted for the crime and at time of writing awaiting the death penalty.
fighting back (Freeman, 2015). He went on to warn against the death penalty which he felt would only encourage rapists to kill their victims.

“When being raped, she shouldn't fight back. She should just be silent and allow the rape. Then they'd have dropped her off after 'doing her', and only hit the boy.” “You can't clap with one hand - it takes two hands,” he was quoted as saying in the interview. “A decent girl won't roam around at 9 o'clock at night. A girl is far more responsible for rape than a boy. Boy and girl are not equal. Housework and housekeeping is for girls, not roaming in discos and bars at night, doing wrong things, wearing wrong clothes. About 20 per cent of girls are good.”

(India Today, 2015)

These words are a frightening reminder of how men (and Indian men) have constructed the role of women and their implication in violence. Being able to deflect the blame onto women makes the victim seem deserving of such crime. Right and wrong are attributed by those in power, in this case the rapist is still convinced his actions are valid. Dress, economic independence and westernised behaviour are only arbitrarily attributed, the real problem is how control and power function in these arguments are utilised to generate apathy for the victim.
This image illustrates the power the language of Bollywood has over the Indian mindset. Notions of a woman becoming a living corpse ties into how revenge against women is calculated and deliberate. Lorde defines rape as aggression that is sexualised.

7.11. Conclusion

Gendered violence in India is grounded in the discourse of nationalism, which is played out by inflicting violence on the female body in a public manner. Incidents of acid attacks, public stripping and other acts of public sexual violence are on the rise. The women victims of these acts of violence are disabled for life, their life choices reduced due to the violence inflicted on them and also from the stigma of their supposed transgression.
While situated within Indian culture these crimes do not constitute ‘Indian culture’
you are within the community but are not representative of what Indian identity
stands for. It cannot be denied that these crimes have their origins in Indian culture
and are a reaction to what is perceived as a loss of that culture. Ascribing these
cries as part of a cultural norm and describing it in terms of ‘honour’ justify the
crime and also make crime in non-western nations seem exotic. Notions of tradition
and culture are modern inventions often used by right wing groups to bring about
social change as demanded by them. A consequence of such discourse reifies ideas
that non-western nations are more violent and also justifies violence, which is seen as
a cultural norm. Gendered crime in India must be understood from the victim’s
perspective and not from that of the perpetrators’ justifications for their actions.
PART III - Reflexivity and Conclusions
CHAPTER 8

8 Reflexivity

We shall not cease from exploration
And the end of all our exploring
Will be to arrive where we started
And know the place for the first time.

T. S. Eliot, Little Gidding

8.1. Emotional landscapes

The previous chapters have been the work of several years of reflection and revision of ideas. It has been a painful process of unlearning ideas deeply ingrained in me as a researcher and as an Indian subject. This process is not an easy one, it involves letting go of ideas that give the illusion of protection. Just like a soothing bedtime story, narratives about people and the nation have a calming effect and offer gratifying solutions.

Being able to situate myself within my research has been a liberating process. Locating myself in a research work based in India but written in the UK has meant travelling back and forth mentally through time and space, this gave me an insight into how notions of scientific neutrality are unhelpful but also do not take into account the mental processes that develop a researcher. Identifying with my research material meant I would constantly locate myself in my writing as ‘we Indians’ ‘our nation’, this was an act of possession and not distancing myself from women in India. Perhaps taking possession was also an act of solidarity with the women of India who suffer violence and violation, my experiences are similar to theirs.
This was pointed out not as an aberration but as an issue to reflect upon. Locating oneself as an active participant taking ownership of one’s writing is not a new concept, it is reflected in the work of the theorists whose work I have used. Using one’s position as a metaphor and as a method of critique creates a methodology that holds the researcher ethically accountable.

I have not been immune to the issues I have written about. Acts of violence I have researched have affected me deeply, they have changed the way I behave and perceive the world. Be it sitting in a bus frightened after the Delhi Gang Rape case or crying in Piccadilly Gardens with other women of colour in the aftermath of the Chibok Kidnappings, these actions were emotional but also intellectual. Finding common ground through activism made a case for research being used as a tool rather than an intellectual exercise. This process began years ago in 2008-2009, when my growing dissatisfaction with academic Psychology began when I could see it being used as a weapon against women. Living in fear of being attacked modified the way I behaved. These fears were articulated within subaltern academia, they were given birth in language, nurtured in daily life, shared within queer circles.

Writing and activism within feminist, queer and black circles were a practical example of how ideas could be transformed into activism and also how these were to be lived. Reflexivity was not just a position but also a means of self-improvement, much like the 12 step program. If were to succeed it had to take in issues of intersectionality, of knowing how power operates through fragmenting individuals, creating discontent and even blind spots.

If neutrality was to exist I had physically cut myself off from India, yet these ties are hard to sever. What constituted as power in India was often a case of
disempowerment in the UK. Rising extremism in both nations also took away a sense of power and belonging. I found myself in a similar situation to the women whose stories I was going to tell - in no man’s land.

8.2. Impact of reflexivity

Stating reflexivity is not an end in itself, Parker (2005) critiques the notion of a reflexivity losing its grasp on the political as it becomes a self-centred activity of the personal gaining significance over the political.

Reflexivity should not be a self-indulgent and reductive exercise that psychologizes phenomena and psychologizes your own part in producing them. Instead, the reflexive work is part of the action, and in action research much of that reflexive work is undertaken alongside and in collaboration with co-researchers (and then they have some reflexive work to do with you as well).

(Parker, 2005:35)

Changes in my emotional and intellectual life alone would make this thesis self-indulgent, however there have been changes in the structure and content of my writing. This was to be a study conducted in India, meeting women addicts or service providers, similar to my M.Phil but on a larger scale. In the early months of writing it was apparent that the issue was not the women themselves but how the nation, psychology and national identity colluded to produce these identities. Social, historical and power structures went into making these identities. Biological explanations I had been taught had to be rethought of in light of this evidence. Temperance, although aggressively promoted, was not universally applicable to Indian men, much less women. Tradition and culture were often cited as reasons for
abstinence. Conformity was expected and even aggressively promoted, yet there were breaks and inclusions into foreign territory. Those transgressions were not always hidden, sometimes they were obvious and right in front of us. If there were traditional looking women who drank alcohol at parties in tall steel glasses, there were images of women on screen who drank and smoked. We seemed to be a society that actively chose to ignore contradictions, pretending we were an ideal nation state. Our glorious past was used to create a sense of belonging. That sense of superiority was a means of being recognised as a member of the state.

Women were the chief targets of this propaganda, on the one hand we were told we were the future of the nation, our achievements were beneficial to our families, yet on the other hand one could see success was not tolerated. I too have internalised those contradictions. In light of this evidence it was apparent I could not reproduce similar academic hegemony, I could not repathologise women who sought treatment, I had to question the Indian state and my own biases. I resist biological definitions alone as their existence is coloured in by social definitions. The research question formulated in the first chapter was “How are gendered narratives of alcohol and drug consumption represented in Indian society in general, and Bollywood movies in particular”. The thesis also explores to what extent, if any, such representations relate to the rise of violent nationalism within Indian society) began an intellectual process that culminated in collecting and analysing data. This lead to questioning what constitutes addiction and nationalism analysing Bollywood films lead to asking what effect representation has on the way women are perceived and treated. There was a move from purely looking at how addiction or rather consumption was represented in Bollywood films to how addiction/substance abuse was used in films to denote issues around nationalism, gender and the several intersections formed by these.
In India the social almost always overrules the legal, academic and formal. Social powers are the ones encountered by Indians in our daily life. While laws protect women, the people who are in charge of those laws often do not enforce them properly. Women and other minority groups often do not report crimes against them, as they know there is little chance of them being properly investigated. I had to look at propaganda that was around us, propaganda I was exposed to. Cinema stood out as the most obvious means of propaganda, it was everywhere in India, it was inescapable.

Watching films for leisure is very different from viewing them critically. One notices the subtle techniques used by film makers to produce their art. These subtleties are not always obvious at first, they work through repetition, embedding ideas in our minds. Accumulating over time, changing our perception slowly. Cinema in India has always been around, sharing a love hate relationship with its viewers who are polarised by its presence. Remembered in everyday conversations, used in academic writing to highlight the quintessential Indian life. Realisations like these changed the trajectory of my writing from the individual to the cultural, from the closed rooms of academia to everyday leisure.

As a *mestiza* I have no country, my homeland cast me out; yet all countries are mine because I am every woman’s sister or potential lover. (As a lesbian I have no race, my own people disclaim me; but I am all races because there is the queer of me in all races.) I am cultureless, because as a feminist, I challenge the collective cultural/religious male derived beliefs of Indo-Hispanics and Anglos; yet I am cultured because I am participating in the creation of yet another culture, a new story to explain the world and out participation in it, a new value system with images and symbols that connect
Anzaldúa’s analogy of her body and its transgressive challenges to mainstream systems provides a source of reflexivity as a method that is not defined and resistant to definition. The ties she speaks about to a community through ideology, breaks through nationalisms. Her subaltern position is a means of solidarity not fragmentation. Academically it translates into resistance to a practice that is embracing non-traditional sources of knowledge.

There is move to reject all things western, turn inwards into India’s past and look for ancient equivalents to present day problems. It is not uncommon to see a rejection of allopathy on the grounds that it is western. Given the imperialistic nature of these ideas it would be easy to look back to a non-colonial past. There is also the lure of modernity which is tantalising, as it brings with it ideas of neutrality, erasing social and historical superstitions. Both positions are equally dangerous and are state controlled ideas of science. Both obliterate the subject they are studying in favour of a political allegiance to science. Seeking authenticity they perpetuate violence on individuals who do not fit into their neat definitions of authentic.

8.3. Post colonialism - a symptom of casteism

"Brahmins and the upper castes have always held the most important and powerful portfolios in this state, irrespective of the party or coalition in power. It is indeed a paradox, but a very shameful one, that a state which has produced such great social reformers like Raja Ram Mohan Roy, Swami Vivekananda and Ishwar Chandra Vidyasagar continues to keep the SCs, STs, OBCs and minorities out of power," says sociologist Madhusudhan Ghosh.
Some of the prominent Indian thinkers whose work has been used in this thesis have stressed how the British Raj created a sense of inferiority in the Indian subject and the psychological impact the colonial enterprise had on the Indian psyche. This inferiority still lingers on in the Indian mindset. The creation of the modern Indian state, a Hindu right wing and borders between Pakistan and Bangladesh are all a result of colonisation. It is an active and powerful force which still presents the colonial subject as exotic, savage, irrational, run by passion and a homogenous group of people. In India we encounter this in the way we elevate the English language and reject those who do not speak the language (Aula, 2014). That mental colonisation is also a part of the former coloniser legacy. Despite the overt elitism in the use of the English language, Vaish (2005) argues that it is sits comfortably with the other languages used in the country cutting across boundaries. Perhaps this use of the language can be seen as a means of decolonising and even reclaiming a language.

Being asked several times if I spoke the English language in Britain when it was the language I was actually speaking in. Being asked why I don’t wear a hijab or why I don’t wear a red dot on my forehead. These micro-aggressions were a part of the colonial residue that still lingers on in how the oriental subject is perceived. Diasporans too had internalised these ideas of exoticism

Finding pride in ‘Indian history’ and ‘spirituality’ are seen as ways of reclaiming the damage done. However most of them represent an upper class elite, educated section

---

67 One incident I remember vividly was being asked if I had spoken the English language before. I responded that English was one of the many official languages used in India and I spoke it as one of my two mother tongues. This individual said ‘for someone who has only been living here for a year you have picked up the English language very fast’.
of the country. Most are of Hindu Brahmin origin and most are products of elite educational institutions where they have not been denied entry. While speaking about their own marginalisation through a psychic colonisation, they have marginalised groups that have historically been marginalised in India. Their powerlessness in western academia is their only acquaintance with being a minority. For example Nandy, whose work I have used extensively, claims the village is the site of peaceful pluralism (Nandy, 2007), yet does not take into account the violence women and especially Dalit women face in these villages (Prasad, 2014; AIDMAM, 2012).

Nandy routinely cites the west as being unable to grasp the concept of pluralism which he claims as a hallmark of Indian society, yet fails to acknowledge how that pluralism is only shared by a minority. Critiques against modern liberal and secular thought only romanticise an India that is not. It is at best upper caste nationalism, elegant and polished.

Women almost seem invisible in his writing, taking on the role of rejected wife, glorified through their conformity to traditional roles. His writing on freedom fighters exemplifies their rejection of British hegemony and turning to an ‘invented’ Indian identity. These were affluent Brahmin men who benefited from the British Empire, not as lackeys or babu’s but as high officials.

"His writings, starting from The Intimate Enemy clearly represent an Indianised version of Romanticism, the much-analysed trend of thinking which valourises pre-capitalist traditions, local cultures and subjectivities while critically opposing the rationalism and homogenizing values of industrial capitalism." This is a perceptive observation of Mr. Nandy's academic romanticism. Such romanticisation of caste and culture has deeper
Blind spots in these narratives led me to examine non-traditional academic material. Films, internet websites, youtube videos and various other mass media were sites of non dominant discourse. While print material was hard to come by in the UK, it was harder still to find indigenous authors who had been deliberately left out of public memory and some of whom were banned. I have learnt more about Indian history in the UK than in India where history is not factual but reduced to sentiment. While I am indebted to the elite authors for providing an initial framework, I found their work elitist in the way it skimmed over issues around gender, caste and religion and its valourising of tradition. Writings of Kakar and Nandy made me the western-Christian-Anglicised other. My inferiority lay in my religious and social identity, everything about me was foreign and invasive, an argument used commonly by the Hindu right wing.

The Internet became a subversive resource, it contained the voice of alternative academia that was not a part of mainstream work which claimed to be the voice of the oppressed (Somwanshi, 2015). Easily accessible and written in simple English or Hindi, this work came from individuals who were denied admission into formal academia. I was also fully aware of my privilege of being a part of formal education, however as an unfunded student I was very aware of the economic difficulties that came with this position. Marginalisation is not homogenous or all encompassing, these walls that engulf a minority have loose bricks and cracks. This is the case of Indian women, who are not a minority numerically but are minorities through biology, religion, ethnicity, caste and science. The minoritising is not complete as it affords some women patriarchal powers, this involves colluding with patriarchal
powers. Upper caste/class actresses, female psychologists (me included), mothers, mothers in laws, female friends, female politicians are all part of this patriarchy.

At present in India marginalised voices are being censored or written off. The voices of Gandhi and his supporters are upheld as being the voice of the nation. Voices that have challenged this hegemony have been written off or shut down.

Arundhati Roy (2014) critiques Gandhi’s title of ‘Mahatma’ (great soul). She points out how Ambedkar (who helped draft the Indian constitution) has been left out of history in India and the west. Ambedkar was an ‘untouchable’ who challenged Gandhi on this stance on the Caste system. Roy’s critique of Gandhi is also of the upper caste nation that has been created by him. As a member of the Dalit community, Ambedkar adopts western clothes, one who has been denied clothing all his life. Whose revolution is greater asks Roy (2014).

These writings only point to one side of oppression, one in which an elite caste of people were temporarily mistreated by another powerful group. Dominant voices in the postcolonial movement suppress the voices of individuals who have been historically oppressed by them. India as a nation of tolerance and pre colonial perfection is an active act of propaganda. Academic writing highlights this through a romantic lens. Privilege is seldom if ever acknowledged, it has done little to change the status quo in India. Traditionalism positioned as a state of refuge is from an upper caste perspective, change to that order is framed as colluding with modernity and westernisation. Yet the proponents of traditionalism have benefited from westernisation.

Spivak in her seminal paper asks ‘Can the subaltern speak? To which I ask will the subaltern be heard on their terms in their territory, outside academia?'
Recognising points of privilege in any oppressed community becomes important. That they are read and their work rewarded is a sign of them regaining that power. For example, the installation of a statue of Gandhi in Parliament Square in London has not taken into account the several voices of dissent, for whom Gandhi was not a liberatory force but one that suppressed them further (Suroor, 2014; Giles, 2014). Pointing out his misogyny and his caste bias, this project did not have the support of the entire Indian community. His popularity among the intellectual liberal classes in Britain reveals that he is not after all a marginalised brown man but one of the many who continue to dictate to the masses. This collusion of British liberalism with Indian sectarianism is what constitutes policies that marginalise resistance groups that have been and still are disempowered. If the white, public school, Oxbridge educated, heterosexual, able-bodied man is the privileged individual in British society then Gandhi is our equivalent. When in public policy women of colour are expected to conform to their patriarchal culture, the black intellectualism is not upheld but rather ghettoised.

Through my reading of the films and literature to understand it better, the absence of the British colonist was in pre-independent India. The film Sahib Biwi Aur Ghulam embodied this absence where the villains were not foreign but a section of the native Indian population that had lost their hold over an emerging enlightened class of Indians. This was a class that had benefited by the British presence but did little to change the status quo and an oppression that was pre-existing. Newer films in independent India would go on to present the west, modernity and western people as a corrupting influence in India. Terms like modern and western are a part of cinema, post-colonialism and neo-imperialism of academia.

Post independence India saw the emergence of the upper castes once again. The
dream of a casteless non-sectarian India is slowly vanishing. News about violence against ‘western’ concepts embodied in people is a daily occurrence. I have been caught in the middle of this violence enacted by vigilantes groups, I have seen hordes of men burning and breaking property and attacking people.

On screen this change was marked by a silence, which when broken is met with violence. The west is usually blamed for this liberal turn in events which is thought to disrupt the working of a ‘homogenous’ India. Dalit scholars have challenged this stance of blaming the west, which they point out only hides an ongoing oppression one which the ruling classes/ castes take no responsibility. The absence on the issue of non Brahmin women in cinema and academia is seen as deliberate, as crime against these women also remains unreported. Not just crime but also the negative stereotypes of these women seems to justify their mistreament.

The issue of drug and alcohol consumption is a problem only because it affects the upper caste/class woman. Marginalised women whose religion, regional, racial class and caste identities are perceived as important are free to intoxicate themselves as their bodies are bound to the male gaze. Sheer difference in identity makes them an object of moral censure and serves as a warning to the idealised upper caste woman who must not fall into the traps of this kind of womanhood.

8.4. Decolonisation and other fanactisms

As I wrote the final chapter of the PhD I was exposed to two new strains of thought - globalisation and decolonisation. Both have their place in India and both are useful, but can also become harmful as they polarise the nation into two discrete strains of thought. Decolonisation is a term widely used by my British colleagues who seek to resist and even reclaim their ethnic identity (Ramamurthy, 2003). While India may be
healing itself of the British Raj, diasporans living in the UK have to contend with its vestiges. The call for decolonisation has be understood in context, its cries must be seen in regard to dominant forces which silence migrant communities, segregating them and using them as scapegoats (Ramamurthy, 2006). To me the term decolonisation denotes a form of colonialism that is still continuing, with its end dependent on British benevolence. There is a sense that this is psychological state, where the old colonial master has left the nation, but its subjects continue in their slavery. This process is as much physical as it is psychological. Cutting of ties with the colonial state becomes part of the endeavour. For example the promotion of dressing in Indian dress (mostly applicable to women only), or even banning western festivals such as Christmas and Valentine’s Day (It’s official: Chhattisgarh renames V-Day as ‘Matru-Pitru Diwas’) (TNN, 2015). There is a strong desire to find Indian equivalents to these western maladies. For instance, retired schoolteacher and right wing Hindu party member Dinanath Batra has tried to reclaim the practise of celebrating birthdays in a more ‘Indian’ manner:

Batra writes against the celebration of birthdays with cakes and candles because it is a western practice. He writes, "Instead, we should follow a purely Indian culture by wearing swadeshi clothes, doing a havan and praying to ishtadev (preferred deity), reciting mantras such as Gayatri mantra, distributing new clothes to the needy, feeding cows, distributing prasad and winding up the day by playing songs produced by Vidya Bharati."

(FP Staff, 2014:online)

Though laughed at by many urban upwardly mobile Indians these claims to becoming authentic are often followed by violent attacks (Doctor, 2014). Postcolonial theorists would argue that these festivals are neo liberal modernist
gimmicks to distract an urban population from the ills that plague India, however, they end up affirming the actions of the far right. Critical of the quick denouncement of the modernist project Malik (2002) points out how ideas from the enlightenment era have often been adopted by anti colonial thinkers.

Fanon (1961) is critical of the national bourgeoisie in producing and maintaining structures that are associated with western decadence and also being complicit in comodifying their exoticism. In India that has led to a ‘spiritual tourist boom’. Marked as an exotic land of religion and spirituality, the dominant classes focus the oriental gaze straight onto themselves. In their bid to decolonise they have created an imaginary nation. This is the India of tourist advertisements, full of colour and exotic landscapes, the people in these advertisements are happy and all national tensions forgotten. Latching onto capitalism in a bid to promote this unified commodity of identity has meant that for most Indians India exists as a nation that is pure sentiment. Cinema nourishes this fanaticism for the state. Tied to capitalism its chief aim is economic exploitation and oppressing those already in marginalised positions (Shaoqi, 1952).

8.5. **Internationalism and Nationalism**

Bourgeois nationalism represents itself in the rediscovery of the past. Its main difference from lower class nationalism, apart from class itself, is the nature of violence it perpetuates. While violence is inherent in the systems of power it is a part of, this is enacted through ideology as opposed to physical violence.

Bourgeois nationalism is present in the new glamorous Bollywood films which separate individuals by identity. These identities are invented and also serve to simplify morality into good-bad, self-other categories. The Indian on screen is devoid
of realistic representations and instead has to make do with imagined caricatures of minorities. Heroes and heroines are easy to identify in these films, as are villains and comedians. It is familiar sight to observe such narratives in everyday violence where identity markers are used as being indicative of national pathologies. The western other, the tribal other, may not have much in common with each other except that they do not represent a homogenous India. Anglo Indian Julie represents the worst of the coloniser which is why everything is done to portray her in as negative a light as possible. If nationalism is gendered so is the process of decolonisation.

The rise of the postcolonial and more recently the decoloniser echoes these nationalisms. The good Indian self is constructed as ridding itself of colonial influence, to become authentic is to become free.

What constitutes this oppression is usually seen as superfluous to the identity of the Bourgeois nationalist. The use of the English language and all things western including clothing are seen as western.

Roy (2014) asks the question about Gandhi and Ambedkar and whose revolution seems greater, one who was never allowed to dress or one who was allowed to and then switched to Indian clothes. Ambedkar bypassed the Indian sahib and identified with the coloniser in his choice of dress, this was and still is a cause of moral outrage. Indian women who reject upper caste womanhood are met with similar outrage (Hardgrave, 1968). Wearing western clothing represents a loss of culture to those who benefit from it.

8.6. **Querying Indian culture**

The term Indian culture has been used throughout this thesis, it is a term I have been
hearing all my life, it is present in the mundane, used to settle arguments. There is an
air of finality that surrounds this term, its usage in any argument prevents further
debate. Cultural specificity can be argued, however it clashes with the interests of
those at the margins suppressed by that very culture. Ideas that non western subjects
are in possession of a unique culture have the power to essentialise and produce the
same discourse colonial ideology did. Exotic, savage or unique are all hallmarks of
this essentialism all are manufactured and used to justify a resistance to a globalised
identity.

Chibber (2014) argues that capitalism promotes and even revels in the production of
tradition and heterogeneity. A prime example of this is how Coca Cola in India
markets itself at Diwali, similar to the way it created Father Christmas in America.
Commodified understanding of the self in relation to the nation emerges out of this
economic system. Tradition then is tainted and not a pure repetition of the past.

8.7. When is it only a thesis?

Perhaps the worst experience I had during my thesis writing was an incident in early
September 2014. A transgender friend was drugged and raped. Everything I had
written about came flooding back like a nightmare brought to life.

I received a message on Facebook from an acquaintance who told me she had been
raped two days ago on canal street. She is transgender. We call the police and go to
the hospital. Questions are asked, questions that make her feel rotten about the whole
incident. She is asked if she was drinking at the time, this is irrespective of the fact
that her drink was spiked. Everything is done to discredit her claims. I give my
statement to the cops and everyone else. Her clothing, appearance, gender goes
against her. While she is not openly blamed for what has happened, it is implied.
It did not help that groups of activists had chosen to ignore repeated calls and emails sent to them. The policewoman I spoke to told me that she undertook special training to help victims of sexual violence. She met a woman a few years ago who had been brutally raped, they never found who did it. Angry and hurt by this injustice she had decided to learn more about gendered violence and its victims.

This case highlighted how gender violence, while deplored theoretically, is condoned when the victim is not an ideal victim. Class, race, ethnicity, gender, sexuality are used against the victim not the perpetrator. It also highlighted how ideas of retribution were deeply ingrained onto the social imagination. Notions of women asking for it reveal a bloodthirsty and vengeful streak in how we view women and inebriation. Is this any different from non western societies British newspapers continuously vilify for their backward attitude towards women?

![Figure 25: NHS poster “Know Your Limits” campaign](image)

The poster above was issued by the NHS “Know Your Limits" responsible drinking campaign which ran between 2005 and 2007. It was widely criticised because of the
victim blaming overtones of its message, implying that rapes happen when the victim has been drinking, it is the drinking habit of the victim that is the cause of the rape, it is not the fault of the rapist (Evans, 2014). The poster surfaced again during 2014, giving rise to a protest and petition run by the National Union of Students. Promises were made by government to cease the use of the poster, but no apology was given. (Sherriff, 2014)

While my thesis has looked at how Indians blame women who drink for violence enacted on them, is the UK any different? Nationalistic inspired ideology would argue that their nation is the safest, their women are treated in a more respectful manner. This is a divisive tactic, it serves to alienate women and propagate a false idea of female empowerment. Racist ethnocentric currents lie at the heart of this division. Indian women are cautioned against western ideas and men violating them, western women are warned against the man of colour posing a threat to her safety. Diverting the attention away from the perpetrators onto the victim and her trangressive behaviour helps keep these crimes being committed over and over again.

The image below was widely circulated on social media as a response to the poster above. The crossing out of words attempting to cancel out victim blame, and squarely blaming the perpetrators for their lack of control and violence rather than women.
My silences had not protected me. Your silences will not protect you.

Audre Lorde, the transformation of silence

8.8. Conclusion

While this process of reflexivity has begun with the writing of this thesis, it is by no means finished. A constant self-critique has become an academic stance but also a way of living.

When I began this thesis I started by questioning how addiction is treated in women, however undertaking this study has made me look at social, historical and national factors that shape our understanding. The term addiction too underwent questioning, as what constitutes recreational consumption in men is regarded as addiction or a loss of sexual morality in women. The term alcohol and drug consumption would broadly define the nature of pathology defined in social, cultural and gendered terms.
I became acutely aware of how the ‘Indian’ identity came into the foreground when speaking of either one of these issues. An ever present Damocles sword hanging above the argument.

Towards the end of my writing I came across another dilemma brought on by bell hooks - does an actor have any choice in their exploitation? She implicates women in their own exploitation. In the last few years I have heard debates of women’s autonomy and their freedom of choice in making decisions, as if they lived in a vacuum. Coercion was seen to be a physical force never as an insidious power operating though women. hooks (2014) argument challenged the way we position powerful, visible women in popular media. This led to me to rethink women’s exploitation in popular media. Could women extract themselves out of an industry that was inherently sexist whilst still being a part of it? Were the actresses on screen part of the problem? hooks and even Anzaldúa challenge the notion of women as perpetual victims. They suggest patriarchy is a force working within social structures affecting both men and women. hooks in her commentary on rap music implicates male rap artists for giving into social pressure and producing music that is misogynistic, they are not naive she comments, but aware of what image they want to sell. Towards the end of my writing I came across a story of Deepika Padukone being sexualised by a leading newspaper of the country (Khaleeli, 2014). Her reaction to this unwanted attention and subsequent debate makes me question the way women are encouraged to be sexual and yet punished for it. Actresses in particular are penalised for this. Being an actress in India is not seen as a ‘respectable’ option, however things have changed over the decades. Yet there is a sense that these women exist to be public spectacles. Can women and Indian women claim to be truly free? While on one hand some sections of our society are
economically and socially experiencing an exhilarating sense of freedom, the rest of the nation is still grappling with female feticide and infanticide. I am one of those women who can claim to be independent. I live alone in a foreign country and make most decisions independent of parental and spousal authority, yet I have felt powerless and oppressed in many situations. My independence is only relative. It is not absolute in every social situation, this for me is the crux of the ‘choice’ debate. Free as I am in England, I have felt vulnerable when I have picked up a glass of wine. I have noticed furtive stares, unfinished sentences, pointed comments such as ‘that is a glass of wine’. The numerous times I have been out on a weekend in Manchester and elsewhere I have heard jokes about drunk women. I have seen women being given a hard time when they drink, I have seen women being groped in the streets. Fresher’s week in universities have exploited this aspect of the student experience. Getting drunk is encouraged, alcohol is being treated as a means of being socially free, it is associated with what it can do rather than as a drink to be savoured.

This seems to be a change in the way people have begun to think about alcohol. I have met people both in India and the UK who think of alcohol very differently, they seem to drink it for different reasons too. When I have mentioned my research to people who have grown up in communities where alcohol is drunk as a part of meal, they have explained how they find it odious when people speak of getting drunk. Alcohol they have claimed is to be savoured and drunk for its rich flavours.
CHAPTER 9

9 Conclusions

‘Oh Manchester, so much to answer for’

The Smiths

What began as a study about women addicts in India took a different direction and expanded into a larger critique of a nation and its social systems. Disorder is constantly being contained within individuals and deeper still in their biological make up. This makes them easy to blame and ignores the overarching structures that create and maintain these maladies. Addiction is not just a disorder of an individual or a subculture, it is created through complex social, economic and political forces that benefit from its existence. Once being marked out with a pathology their mistreatment is easily justifiable. The (mis)treatment of individuals in mental health facilities is no different to their mistreatment outside. Prejudices are not halted by imaginary boundaries of science and neutrality, they are a living reality. These prejudices are everywhere, carefully cultivated and reduced to stereotypes they have the power to dehumanise.

Addiction is not only a disorder contained within clinical boundaries, but disperses into the everyday consumption of those substances. The opposite is true for gender which is expected to be contained within the narrow confines of the home, family, religion, region and nation. The imaginary lids on these boxes are often thrown open or shut down.

Three years of living and writing in Manchester changed the way I thought about the Indian nation, addiction, media and gender. Films were my connection with my
country, viewing them for pleasure and viewing them as national ideology changed my relationship with popular media. Intuitive ideas about Indian cinema were brought into language and discomfort felt by me was shared by other viewers as well. Popular media and its tropes were being studied by people around the world. Sharing that discomfort provided me with a sense of solidarity, knowing that misrepresentation is a deliberate act on the part of the film makers. Films are a resource of the subaltern, cheap and ubiquitous they are a source of education, despite this they do little justice to the subaltern subject. Cinematic eugenics are at work here, watching images of the least privileged in society violently eliminated plays a role in how we internalise patriarchal, casteist values. Writing helped me articulate the anger and disgust felt by sections of Indian society for whom those images are a constant reminder of the violence they have faced.

The way I viewed alcohol and drugs changed. Knowing the UK is a lot more tolerant to alcohol use (but not of drinking culture) changed the way I occasionally drank. Yet the fear of being branded an alcoholic remained, fears of being seen as an easy woman still haunt me. Individuals who reminded me that race reaffirmed those fears, culture and religion and not individuality were something I had to conform to. Culture became a barrier to other people’s understanding of people of colour as people first. Often insensitive comments about race and gender reflected the way in which society colludes with perpetrators of violence. This collusion was not unusual, women in India face the same prejudices when they speak of their experiences. Culture, religion ethnicity and nationality are used against them. Resisting such culture, religion and nation were necessary to break the cycle of violence. Acknowledging the individuality of Indian woman and their autonomy was necessary in order to see them as victims and not as cannon fodder.
The writing of women on the margins helped see another way of looking at femininity and masculinity and challenging patriarchal dominance over the mind. Queer women, trans women, mixed race women, black women, Dalit women who had been denied humanity, all articulated issues that are rarely spoken about. This was a section of academia that resists easy definition, constantly problematising the way dominant ideologies suppress those on the margins.

Addiction is gendered and nationalised

Nation is sexualised and gendered

Gender is nationalised and sexualised.

It is impossible to think of these three categories without each other. All three are inextricably linked with each other, all of them constructed and reconstructed. Despite the illusion of liberation each new definition asserts the same old dominance over individuals. Intersectionality was a vital link to bring these three issues together. Stripping addiction down to a clinical disorder does not take into account the way it is perceived and treated in society. While writing about the subject I came to realise it was not the clinical disorder alone that was pathologised, but the act of picking up a cigarette or a glass of liquor that branded women in India as ‘drunkards’. On screen this act represents a problem that is bigger than clinical pathology - it is a break from national traditional values and a rejection of gender roles. It became impossible to think of addiction as a disorder when consumption alone became the problem.

9.1. The problem with Bollywood

Bollywood exploits the notion of the inebriated woman to its advantage, on screen she is not much other than the westernised other, sexualised and objectified by a male gaze. Resisting correction can only lead to her being punished on screen. Death and
rape become tools of correction on screen, almost feeding into audience fantasy. It is almost expected that the body of such a woman is nowhere near the representation of an upper caste, upper class Hindu woman, she is either an exoticised Muslim courtesan or a westernised Christian woman. By contrast, when the Hindu woman drinks she is gradually corrected and brought back to normalcy.

If this problem were only contained on screen, only contained in cinema halls, writing about Bollywood would not fill several books. Unfortunately the violence on screen is replicated off screen, it is enacted over and over in streets, public transport, in homes and in universities. In recent years a few events have even been written about in the international media. There is a growing sense of fear in India around women’s safety, violence against women pervades all aspects of our lives. These fears are real, as they are based on both everyday experiences and widespread media reportage. Bollywood is not merely an industry that produces films, films are not merely a source of entertainment, they have become a source of education.

9.2. The problem with culture
Perhaps the worst blow women in India face is one meted out by ‘culture’. Trapped in discourses of reproduction and national image, the term culture has frightening consequences for women who do not fit into this narrowly defined definition of themselves. I have often heard this phrase being used to justify violence against women in India, we blame the victim for not being Indian enough. Western dress, alcohol and drug consumption, economic affluence, lifestyle choices are all used to justify the aggressors’ violence towards such women. It is a fear I have lived with constantly, trying to prove my Indianness and conform to feminine ideals. Culture as defined by patriarchal powers is a weapon of control. It divides women into good and
bad, worthy and unworthy. These notions of culture (patriarchal) I found are endorsed in the UK. Indian women and all women of colour are seen as part of culture and not as individuals. Perpetrators of crimes are theorised in relation to culture and religion, almost colluding with them and their ideas of culture. The strategic use of culture as a social weapon against individuals needs questioning.

9.3. The problem with postcolonialism

Halfway through writing I came to realise some of the thinkers whose work I was using did little in terms of representation of the voice of ordinary Indians. While their work is invaluable, it often romanticises the pre-colonial past which is also an issue the Hindu right wing in India endorses. Dalit scholars on the margins are rarely heard from. Those who neither benefited before or after the British Empire, those were the voices who pointed out inequalities that the Indian state deliberately ignores. While the colonial legacy left behind some deep and horrible scars, sections of independent India benefit from that legacy. Seeking out subaltern voices that did not problematise minorities as outsiders was essential, as for far too long non-Hindus have come to be seen as unpatriotic citizens. It was essential to point out that national heroes often had little effect on minorities in India, who now live a troubled existence. The rise of violent right wing groups has put into jeopardy the lives of Indians who do not comply with their values. In such a situation culture, tradition and history becomes the enemy of the subaltern who has been effectively erased out of these discourses.

9.4. Chapter summary

Chapter one. This chapter began with me tracing the antecedents that lead me to study women addicts. Tracing my journey back to my work in a rehabilitation centre and then to my M. Phil, where I attempted to establish my interest in the subject. I
am still learning more about the issue

Chapter two established the methodological framework the thesis was to take. Problems to be presented in the subsequent chapters. Feminist methodology seemed the most appropriate means for unravelling the discussions and problems presented in cinema. It was important to see how ideas of neutrality and objectivity plays a role in how we conceptualise science.

Chapter three has traced ideological, historical and antecedents that have shaped India and informed political debates in recent years. India is a large country which has a diverse population, its history is complex and often controversial. Piecing together aspects of history that are often excluded from mainstream books and debates, this chapter attempts to introduce non mainstream ideas that help contextualise the arguments in the chapters that follow it.

Chapter four briefly traced the history of addiction and the evolving ideas society has about drugs and alcohol use. Concentrating on the attributions ascribed to alcohol and drugs rather than their physiological effects, this chapter looks at how nationality is tied into the consumption of alcohol and drugs in India.

Chapter five looked at Bollywood, a film industry that is over one hundred years old. Economically and socially powerful it has seen many changes. The influence of this industry on Indian society cannot be underestimated.

In chapter six, eight Bollywood films were chosen and analysed. Some of these films are considered landmarks in Indian cinema. Costumes and songs from these films are iconic. What ties these films together is the use of alcohol and drugs which is central to the plot. The way female characters who engage in such un-Indian and western
behaviour are portrayed through the decades is telling of the way in which Indian society has come to view these substances.

Chapter seven continues on the theme of cinema and violence, looking at incidents of gendered violence in India. These horrific incidents were widely reported in India. While some of these cases have been forgotten over time, they have had an impact on Indian society. Protests, changes in legislation, activism have all tried to ask why India is so violent towards women. Why does on screen violence look similar to violence on our streets? Disabling women’s bodies the perpetrators of these acts keep reminding women that they are out to protect them from western vices, and the violence is only a means of correction.

Chapter eight recounts the intellectual and emotional changes this thesis has brought about in my way of understanding how identity and violence work in India this chapter tied in loose strands and summarised the research process. Changes in the trajectory of writing were important and had an impact on how I viewed India and academia in India.

Living in Manchester for three years exposed me to writing and discussions I had no access to in India. Learning more about my country whilst living in England gave me perspective on how India normalises crimes against women, and how Bollywood cinema seems strange when seen by people who have not been taught how to interpret its many tropes. The UK is not perfect either, it is trapped within colonial discourses about race class and gender, conceptualising diasporan communities as outsiders. Culture becomes a weapon in the hand of politicians, right wing groups and even everyday racism. Women are trapped within these discourses as passive victims or as exotic but pitiable people with little or no agency.
While I was physically living in England my mind travelled back to India, remembering how rape culture was used as a method of social control and how the country became less secular with the opening up of the economy frightened me. We were taught to believe India was moving forward, it was a place where women would have the same freedom men had. A liberalised economy would end religious and social violence. In 2015 those promises seem like a distant memory, India now seems more violent than it has ever been, identity has become a source of division. Religion has become a source for violence, gender and sexualised are being policed.

Yet amongst all this there are individuals whose lives and works has inspired me and others like me to write. There is hope that things will change if we keep speaking up.

I began this thesis with a quote by Audre Lorde and I will end with another one which best sums up three years of writing:

‘The women who sustained me through that period were black and white, old and young, lesbian, bisexual and heterosexual, and we all shared a war against the tyrannies of silence’.

(Lorde, 1984:41)

I will add just another category to this - transgender women and men.
PART IV - References and Appendices
References


http://www.ted.com/talks/chimamanda_adichie_the_danger_of_a_single_story?language=en


http://www.cs.jhu.edu/~bagchi/women.html


[Accessed on 23rd April 2015]

http://www.countercurrents.org/betageri140315.htm


[Online] [Accessed on 24th August 2014]


[http://digital.library.upenn.edu/women/bly/madhouse/madhouse.html](http://digital.library.upenn.edu/women/bly/madhouse/madhouse.html)


*Feminist Review*, 68(1) pp. 6-33.

[Online] [Accessed on 28th December 2012] Available from:

[http://tcs.sagepub.com/content/29/1/138.full.pdf+html](http://tcs.sagepub.com/content/29/1/138.full.pdf+html)


http://ir.uiowa.edu/etd/2464/

http://www.countercurrents.org/cc260214.htm


Scrol.in. [Online] [Accessed on 19th March 2015]


DeBode, L. (2014) *Why Indian women are victims of sterilization 'cattle camps'*
Aljazeera America [Online] [Accessed on 20th January 2015]


Dua, P. (No date) *Short Essay on Westernisation and Modernisation* [Online]
[Accessed: 4th September 2012]


    UK: Hachette


    London: Reaktion Book.


    Iordanova, D with contributions from Juan Goytisolo, Ambassador K.

    Gàjendra Singh, Rada [Štreve]\v{s}re\v{c}, Asuman Suner, Viola Shafik and

    P.A. Skantze.’ *South Asian Popular Culture,* 4(2) pp. 113-140.


    *Many Ramayanas: The Diversity of a Narrative Tradition in South Asia.*


    May 2013] Available at: http://publishing.cdlib.org/ucpressebooks/view?

    docId=ft3j49n8h7&chunk.id=d0e4061


    http://www.suedasien.info/analysen/1411


F. Entertainment. (2014) Stop whining! Manipur has banned all Hindi films, not just Mary Kom. [Online] [Accessed on 16th January 2015]


FP Staff. (2014) *Birthday cakes bad, 'Undivided India': Dinanath Batra's works now in Guj schools.* Firstpost [Online] [Accessed on 8th February 2015]


http://www.telegraphindia.com/1081027/jsp/entertainment/story_10020334.jsp

London: Zed Books

http://bio.sagepub.com/content/1/1/67


Haddad, J. (2014) *Those were the days*. Old photos highlight Lebanon’s more liberal past; yet times have changed Published: 14/04/2014 12:59 PM Updated: 16/04/2014. Now News [Online] [Accessed on 18th April 2014] https://now.mmedia.me/lb/en/commentaryanalysis/543229-543229-those-were-the-days


14th February [Accessed on 14th February 2012]
http://www.theguardian.com/film/filmblog/2012/feb/14/hollywood-
bollywood-us-india

Hobsbawm, E. and Ranger, T. (eds.) The Invention of Tradition. Cambridge:
Cambridge University Press.

Cambridge University Press.

Hobsbawm, Eric J. (1990) Nations and Nationalism since 1780. Cambridge:
Cambridge University Press.


coherence.’ Qualitative research, 3(3) pp. 345-357.


hooks, b. (1996) Reel to reel: Race, sex, and class at the movies. New York:
Routledge

hooks, b. (1997) ‘Representing whiteness in the black imagination.’ In Frankenberg,
179.


INKtalks. (2012) *What happens after your husband throws acid on your face?* 
[Online] [Accessed on 26th August 2012] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=N-pkM_6mWQ


jdevika. (2014) *Police Attack Youth at Thrissur: No, We Won’t Be Swept Away.* 
Kafila. [Online] [Accessed on 28th February 2014] 
http://kafila.org/2014/02/27/police-attack-activists-at-thrissur-no-we-wont-be-swept-away/


Kumar, R. (2014) Hindu right rewriting Indian textbooks. Round Table India.

[Online] [Accessed on 6th November 2014]


http://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424052702304259304576374803825478120


http://www.issues.org/17.3/leshner.htm


*Journal of Social History*, 38(4) pp., 915-935


Madsen, O. J. and Brinkmann, S. (2011) ‘The disappearance of psychologisation?’  
*Annual Review of Critical Psychology (Online)*, 8 pp. 179-199.


380


NDTV India. (2014) *Is it necessary to re-write the history being taught in Indian schools?*. [Online] [Accessed on 28th January 2015] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MIqrt-NFZgw


http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/india/9472909/Kashmir-women-ordered-to-cover-up-or-risk-acid-attack.html


http://kafila.org/2012/12/26/armed-forces-special-powers-act-provides-impunity-for-rape-warisha-farasat/


*Science as Culture, 14(3) pp. 1-17.*


http://www.valmikiramayan.net/utf8/aranya/sarga18/aranya_18_frame.htm

http://podcasts.ox.ac.uk/location-homophobia-oxford-transnational-and-global-history-seminar


http://scholarship.claremont.edu/scripps_theses/215


http://www.academia.edu/6749073/From_Sacrifice_to_Selfhood_Representations_of_the_Mother_in_Hindi_Films


[Online] [Accessed on 13th January 2014]
http://www.readersdigest.co.in/anna-hazare (Note: original link now dead, now available from:)
http://web.archive.org/web/20131104103415/http://www.readersdigest.co.in/anna-hazare


Somwanshi, G. (2015) *How can we exclude the storyteller from the story being told?* Round Table India. [Online] [Accessed on 8th April 2015]


Sukumar, N. (2014) *Dalit Revolution and Hindutva Counter Revolution in Indian Politics.* RoundTable India. [Online] [Accessed on 17th September 2014]


Sundar, U. S. (no date) Facebook page - Unnamati Syama Sundar cartoon. [Online] [Accessed on 14 November 2014]
https://www.facebook.com/unnamati.syamasundar/photos


http://www.apcss.org/Publications/OcasionalPapers/OPHinduNationalism.pdf [Accessed on November 18th 2013]


http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/south_asia/7270568.stm


Times of India. (2011) *Anna Hazare criticised for flogging alcoholics remarks.* The Times Of India. [Online] [Accessed on 25th September 2014]


http://www.thehindubusinessline.com/features/blink/talk/these-emotional-sons/article6107883.ece


WeAreManyMedia. (2014) *Arundhati Roy: The Doctor and the Saint* [Online] [Accessed on 2nd November 2014] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CrN8PgZzc6k


Williams, R. (1985) *Keywords: A vocabulary of culture and society*. New York: Oxford University Press.


**Filmography**


Appendix A - Crime timeline

February 2012
A few Asian boys walking behind me start getting crude and following me. I walk as fast as I can then run when I turn the corner. Got heavy groceries but I want to be safe.

March 2012
Late March, body of an Asian woman found outside Gaskell campus. Everything is quiet and tense on the street. No one is saying it but everyone suspects it is honour crime. I come back from work and the street is cordoned off, security personnel at MMU tell me to stay safe. I am terrified as I walk home. All the nights going out for a walk or a little drive on my bicycle. This is the last time I do it.

Attend lecture in the evening everything is shut on the way back home, not a sound in the neighbourhood. My friend and I are terrified we run back home call each other to say we have reached home.

July 2012
It’s summer now windows open working late into the night. Hear of a woman being molested in the streets of Guwhati for 45 minutes. There is a video of the incident on Youtube. I see online discussions about the ethics of this. I shut my windows every time I hear voices on the street, have fears someone might break into our house.

December 2012
It’s December its my first Christmas away from home. My Facebook feed is full of the story of a woman gang raped on a bus. Go out for tea with a friend and tell him
about this, he is shocked. We are at a friend’s house he sends me 3 texts he is worried about me. He has seen the details and is shocked. I meet him 2 days later in church and he is worried, he isn’t sure what to say but is concerned. Talks about violence against women, asks me how things are and if writing about it is difficult. It is difficult, I talk to a Pakistani friend who is angry but also notes how futile protests are because nothing changes in our part of the world.

**February 2013**

Another male friend says he heard a program on woman’s hour about women in Indian films. He says he has never given much thought to the impact films have, his girlfriend and I speak about sexism in the media. He is surprised at what we have to say. It makes me question how immune we have become to violence and misogyny around us.

**June 2013**

Two friends from Church talk about an incident that happened in Ashton. A few Asian boys attacked a few white girls. The EDL have picked up on this. They are both worried about my safety. Explaining what the EDL do, they worry that things are getting out of hand. The elderly gentleman says he is sorry that I am treated this way in Britain. This incident highlights how race and gender work. While I do condemn this violence against women, I don’t think it is particularly an Asian phenomena. It is very hard to fight stereotypes especially ones that claim to save women from their culture.

**July 2013**

There is a story in the local papers about the Gorton Gang Rape. This story isn’t talked about as much as the Delhi case. Is it because this happened in a deprived area
of Manchester? Is it because we don’t talk about problems in Britain in case people start questioning their supposed freedom. This incident disturbs me.

**September 2013**

My mother calls, she tells me about Muzzafarnagar burning, she has grown up in north India as I have and we know we can’t talk about crime against women. Somehow it is important to affirm this culture business and not the victim’s right to her culture. So women must be sacrificed in order to protect their culture.

**October 2013**

A friend who starts working with the Street pastors tells me about her training and talks about human trafficking on the Curry Mile and in China town. I can’t sleep, have bad dreams all night, I live only a quarter of a mile away. Feeling sick to my stomach. Why is it only Florence gets it. A friend comes over she listens. She visits me again in the morning and finds me next morning in an agitated state, she listens again.

**April/May 2014**

#bring back our girls. Over 200 nigerian school girls are kidnapped, they are to be sold as slaves. There is outrage but it isn’t doing much. The government of Nigeria doesn’t seem to care. We go out in the rain to protest. I meet someone whose cousins are among those kidnapped. My friend who is with me can’t stop crying, she is from Syria, she knows what this means, she know how women are unsafe where she comes from. She talks about how difficult it is for her, she hasn’t seen her family for years now. Her family are Christian which makes her an easy target. We talk about how things are changing in the global south for women for the worse.

**July/August 2014**
New house now. It's lovely to live alone but it has its downside. I am paranoid about locking doors and windows. I hear screams in the night, I call the police they ask where I live and tell me these things happen and if I am not sure where it happened they couldn’t do much. This is what it feels like to live in a deprived neighbourhood.

**August/September 2014**

I get a message on Facebook from an acquaintance who tells me she has been raped two days ago on canal street. She is transgender, we call the police and go the hospital. Questions are asked, questions that make her feel rotten about the whole incident. She is asked if she was drinking at the time, this is irrespective of the fact that her drink was spiked. Everything is done to discredit her claims. I give my statement to the cops and everyone else.

It doesn’t help that groups of activists have chosen to ignore repeated calls and emails I have sent them. these are people who are offended by inappropriate grammar and people looking at them. I guess when it comes to helping in serious situations most people find it easy to hide behind easy platitudes.

This case did bring to light how easy it was to blame the victim to avoid responsibility and how perpetrators can get away. The cop I spoke to tells me that she took this training to help victims. She met a lady a few years ago who was in a bad state, they never found who did it. I feel sick but also angry that this can happen and people are apathetic.

This is mass violence against women and its so under reported. Society seems to have forgotten about us. This incident has shaken me, I have had nightmares for weeks now. This is so close to what I am writing about. Everything I write about is so close to the bone and these incidents are indicative of how deeply violent society
is especially towards women.

**September 2014**

Fresher’s week now this is my second year in town, witnessing this every year. I watch as men and women join university, I get to see their social interactions. The men aggressive in their pursuit of women, drunk on freedom away from home. I get to see how young men and women behave and how women are conditioned into heterosexuality, to alcohol consumption, to what it means to be young and having fun.
Appendix B - The Bechdel test

The Bechdel test is a simple rule that has been put forwards as a method to call attention to gender inequality and the sexist under-representation of women in films. The test first appeared in 1985, in the form of a one page comic strip in Alison Bechdel’s *Dykes to Watch Out For* series, this strip was entitled *The Rule*, and was later collected in the first book of the series (Bechdel, 1986:20).

The full transcript of the strip is as follows:

Panel 1: Title displayed on illuminated sign above a cinema entrance: “Dykes to Watch Out For presents The Rule”.

Panel 2: Two women walking by a movie theatre, poster outside cinema shows a muscular male carrying a large gun, entitled “The Mercenary”. First woman says “Wanna see a movie and get popcorn?”.

Panel 3: Second woman says “Well, ... I dunno. I have this rule, see...”

Panel 4: Women standing by another movie poster, showing male wearing nothing but a loin cloth and carrying a large sword, entitled “The Barbarian”. Second woman “I only go to a movie if it satisfies three basic requirements. One, it has to have at least two women in it..”

Panel 5: Another movie poster, partial view of a man with a handgun, entitled “The Vigilante”. Second woman continues “..who, two, talk to each other about, three, something besides a man.”
Panel 6: Women walking down the road in silence, have gone past the cinema.

Panel 7: First woman says “Pretty strict, but a good idea.” Second woman replies “No kidding. Last movie I was able to see was Alien...”

Panel 8: Second woman continues “..the two women in it talk to each other about the monster.”

Panel 9: Women continue walking in silence.

Panel 10: Women seen in the distance at the end of street. Illuminated movie sign in foreground advertises “Rambo meets Godzilla”. First woman “Wanna go to my house and make popcorn?”. Second woman “Now you’re talkin’.”

Figure 27: Image excerpted from “The Rule”


The full strip is available online from Bechdel’s personal Flickr stream (Bechdel, 1985).
Map of India showing constituent states. The north eastern states are pinched away from the main body of India by the countries of Nepal and Bangladesh, joined only by a corridor of land less than 20 miles wide. India is approximately 2000 miles north to south, 1800 miles east to west.
Appendix D - The twelve steps to recovery

The 12 steps to recovery according to Narcotics Anonymous.

1. We admitted that we were powerless over our addiction, that our lives had become unmanageable.

2. We came to believe that a Power greater than ourselves could restore us to sanity.

3. We made a decision to turn our will and our lives over to the care of God as we understood Him.

4. We made a searching and fearless moral inventory of ourselves.

5. We admitted to God, to ourselves, and to another human being the exact nature of our wrongs.

6. We were entirely ready to have God remove all these defects of character.

7. We humbly asked Him to remove our shortcomings.

8. We made a list of all persons we had harmed, and became willing to make amends to them all.

9. We made direct amends to such people wherever possible, except when to do so would injure them or others.

10. We continued to take personal inventory and when we were wrong promptly admitted it.
11. We sought through prayer and meditation to improve our conscious contact with God as we understood Him, praying only for knowledge of His will for us and the power to carry that out.

12. Having had a spiritual awakening as a result of these steps, we tried to carry this message to addicts, and to practice these principles in all our affairs.

(Narcotics Anonymous, 1986: 2)
Appendix E - Goodness Gracious Me

*Goodness Gracious Me* was a BBC comedy sketch programme, originally in the form of a BBC Radio 4 show, later transitioning into a BBC Two television show that aired from 1998 to 2001. The show was created and performed by British Indian writers and actors, the main cast being Sanjeev Bhaskar, Kulvinder Ghir, Meera Syal and Nina Wadia, occasionally joined by a small number of white actors to play white British characters.

The show used comedic settings to explore the interactions between traditional Indian culture and modern British life. In some cases role reversal was used to show how British culture appeared from an Indian viewpoint. The Indian writers would frequently make fun of Indian stereotypes.

The ‘Jacinta’ sketch was shown as part of the Christmas Special episode, 1998:

Woman: Help me, please help!

Jacinta: Oh, well you've come to the right place sister. Welcome to the Women of Colour Shanti Azadi Drop-in Lounge. My name is Jacinta...

Woman: Oh shut up! Look my husband's after me!

Jacinta: Yes, I might have guessed. Is he stifling you with his phallocentric, patriarchal hate crimes?

Woman: No, he chased me out of the house with a big knife! Now, come on! He's coming this way!

Jacinta: OK, just pull up a bean bag and we'll take a few details.

Woman: But he'll be here any second!
Jacinta: [smiling broadly] Hmm, and in Indian time that's about half an hour, isn't it, sister?

Jacinta: Now, your husband?

Woman: Well he's six foot two, an ex-boxer with a very bad temper, hurry up!

Jacinta: Is he of your people? Do you share the same mother soil?

Woman: Well yes, but what's that got to do with anything?

Jacinta: Umm, and this knife he had, it wasn't in any way a ceremonial dagger was it?

Woman: Well the handle was covered in blood and it had a sharp pointy tip, I don't know I didn't look!

Jacinta: It's just that if it's a traditional implement it comes under cultural practices, and I can't interfere.

Woman: What?

Jacinta: Well you see, it might be something I know nothing about, you know like dowry dispute or female infibulation. The things that make you different and special.

Woman: Are you mad! He's going to kill me!

Jacinta: Well, I'm sorry but I can't help you, because I might be culturally oppressing you.

Woman: Listen, you stupid bint! There is nothing traditional about being hounded, abused, and tortured to death!

Jacinta: Do you know it's funny, but I had a burning bride in here yesterday who said exactly the same thing. Spooky.

Man - shouting from outside room: Asha! mein aa rahayan tere wastay! Mein tenu maaryan! [Punjabi, trans: “Asha! I’m coming to get you! I’m going to kill you!”]
Woman: Oh my god he's here! Well thanks for nothing sister. [runs and hides under table]

Man runs into room: [to Jacinta] Where is she!

Jacinta: I'm sorry, I'm unable..

Man: [threatening Jacinta with knife] Tell me!

Jacinta: She's under there.

Man crawls under table, shouting.

Woman: Screams in terror.

Jacinta: [to herself, smiling] Such a romantic language...

Sketch can be viewed on Youtube (Dandekar, 2012: 7 min 35 - 9 min 25)