#### Accepted Manuscript

Variation of radiative forcings and global warming potentials from regional aviation  $NO_X$  emissions

Agnieszka Skowron, David S. Lee, Ruben R. De León

PII: S1352-2310(14)00991-1

DOI: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2014.12.043

Reference: AEA 13493

To appear in: Atmospheric Environment

Received Date: 9 August 2014

Revised Date: 12 December 2014

Accepted Date: 17 December 2014

Please cite this article as: Skowron, A., Lee, D.S., De León, R.R., Variation of radiative forcings and global warming potentials from regional aviation NO<sub>X</sub> emissions, *Atmospheric Environment* (2015), doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2014.12.043.

This is a PDF file of an unedited manuscript that has been accepted for publication. As a service to our customers we are providing this early version of the manuscript. The manuscript will undergo copyediting, typesetting, and review of the resulting proof before it is published in its final form. Please note that during the production process errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.



# Variation of radiative forcings and global warming potentials from regional aviation NO<sub>x</sub> emissions

4 Agnieszka Skowron<sup>\*</sup>, David S. Lee and Ruben R. De León

6 Dalton Research Institute, Manchester Metropolitan University, John Dalton Building, Chester Street,
7 Manchester M1 5GD, United Kingdom.

9 \*Corresponding author. E-mail: a.skowron@mmu.ac.uk, tel: + 44 (0) 161 247 6703 (A. Skowron).

11 Abstract: The response to hemispherical and regional aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions is explored by 12 using two climate metrics: radiative forcing (RF) and Global Warming Potential (GWP). The 13 global chemistry transport model, MOZART-3 CTM, is applied in this study for a series of 14 incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission integrations to different regions. It was found that the 15 sensitivity of chemical responses per unit emission rate from regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions 16 varies with size of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission rate and that climate metric values decrease with 17 increasing aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates, except for Southeast Asia. Previous work has 18 recognized that aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> GWPs may vary regionally. However, the way in which these 19 regional GWPs are calculated are critical. Previous studies have added a fixed amount of NO<sub>x</sub> 20 to different regions. This approach can heavily bias the results of a regional GWP because of 21 the well-established sensitivity of O<sub>3</sub> production to background NO<sub>x</sub> whereby the Ozone 22 Production Efficiency (OPE) is greater at small background NO<sub>x</sub>. Thus, even a small addition of NO<sub>x</sub> in a clean-air area can produce a large O<sub>3</sub> response. Using this 'fixed addition' method 23 of 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>, results in the greatest effect observed for North Atlantic and Brazil, 24 ~10.0 mW m<sup>-2</sup>/Tg(N)yr<sup>-1</sup>. An alternative 'proportional approach' is also taken that preserves 25 the subtle balance of local  $NO_x-O_3-CH_4$  systems with the existing emission patterns of 26 aircraft and background NO<sub>x</sub>, whereby a proportional amount of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub>, 5% (N) yr<sup>-1</sup>, is 27 added to each region in order to determine the response. This results in the greatest effect 28 observed for North Pacific that with its net NO<sub>x</sub> RF of 23.7 mW  $m^{-2}/Tg(N)yr^{-1}$  is in contrast 29 30 with the 'fixed addition' method. For determining regional NO<sub>x</sub> GWPs, it is argued that the 31 'proportional' approach gives more representative results. However, a constraint of both 32 approaches is that the regional GWP determined is dependent on the relative global emission 33 pattern, so if that changes in the future, the regional NO<sub>x</sub> GWP will change.

34

3

5

8

10

35 Keywords: Aviation, regional emissions, nitrogen oxides, GWP, non-linearities

#### 36 **1** Introduction

37 38

Aviation  $NO_x$  emissions result in a short-term increase in tropospheric ozone (O<sub>3</sub>) and the long-term destruction of a fraction of the ambient methane (CH<sub>4</sub>), with positive and negative radiative forcing responses, respectively. In addition, the CH<sub>4</sub> reduction results in a long-term reduction in tropospheric O<sub>3</sub> and a long-term reduction in stratospheric water vapour from reduced oxidation of CH<sub>4</sub>, both negative radiative forcing effects. The aircraft net NO<sub>x</sub> response (the sum of all these components) is thought to result in a positive (warming) radiative forcing (RF) under constant emissions assumptions (e.g., Lee et al., 2010)

46

The geographical imbalance of climate impact from  $NO_x$  emissions is a result of both the short-term nature of the chemistry and the heterogeneous pattern of emissions; as well as, it arises from complexity of the response of  $NO_x$  effect components. The short-lived  $O_3$  change (positive climate forcing, warming) is inhomogeneous, concentrated mainly where the  $NO_x$ emissions occur. The CH<sub>4</sub> response (negative climate forcing, cooling), due to its decadal lifetime, is homogenously spread over the globe. Thus, even if these two effects might cancel as a global mean, they do not on a regional scale (e.g., Prather et al., 1999).

54

55 The same amount of  $NO_x$  emissions might lead to different regional climate impacts. The  $O_3$ 56 production formed from NO<sub>x</sub> emissions strongly depends on the background conditions that 57 are distinct for specific spatio-temporal locations. The O<sub>3</sub> response is influenced by the 58 background NO<sub>x</sub> concentrations (e.g., Isaksen et al., 1978, Berntsen and Isaksen, 1999), the 59 abundance of HO<sub>x</sub>, VOCs (e.g., Lin et al., 1988, Jaeglé et al., 1998) or the intensity of solar 60 flux. These different influences result in quite a specific behaviour, as different climate 61 responses might result from equal global mean RFs arising from the same amount of emitted 62 NO<sub>x</sub> at different locations (e.g., Berntsen et al., 2005, Shine et al., 2005).

63

In this study we explore the global responses form regional emissions, by employing the 'popular' metrics: radiative forcing (RF) and Global Warming Potential (GWP), that have been successfully exploited in other regional studies (e.g., Berntsen et al., 2005, Fry et al., 2013). However, in order to explore the different aspects of regional and sub-global patterns of responses, the new concepts have been also developed, e.g., the non-linear damage function 69 (Shine et al., 2005, Lund et al., 2012) or Absolute Regional Temperature Potential (Shindell,

- 70 2012, Collins et al., 2013).
- 71

There are only few studies dealing with geographical effects from aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions 72 73 (Grewe and Stenke, 2008, Stevenson and Derwent, 2009, Köhler et al., 2013). Grewe and 74 Stenke (2008) and Köhler et al. (2013) have shown that different latitudinal bands give 75 different RFs per unit aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission; the RFs resultant from O<sub>3</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> changes at 76 low latitudes are significantly greater than RFs from those changes at higher latitudes. Köhler 77 et al. (2013) also presented the aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> impact over four geographical regions, where tropical locations, China and India, with their net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs of 14.3 mW m<sup>-2</sup> per Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> and 78 12.6 mW m<sup>-2</sup> per Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>, substantially exceed the northern mid-latitudinal net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs, of 79 ~2 mW m<sup>-2</sup> per Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>, over Europe and USA. On the contrary, the study of Stevenson and 80 81 Derwent (2009) results in strong compensations between O<sub>3</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> responses for July's 82 pulse aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions at 112 different cruise altitude locations, where, in most cases, the short-term  $O_3$  positive RFs was overwhelmed by the long-term  $CH_4$  negative RFs. In order 83 84 to illustrate the dependence of the aviation  $NO_x$  effect on the location of emission, the 85 regionally fixed amount of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> was applied in both, Stevenson and Derwent (2009) 86 and Köhler et al. (2013), studies.

87

Taking into account that the future growth of air traffic is predicted to be inhomogeneous, 88 89 where Asia with its developing economies is leading the way (ACI, 2011), it is important to 90 understand the spatial aviation climate responses. In this study, the atmospheric impact of a 91 series of regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates is investigated using a global chemistry transport 92 model, MOZART-3 CTM. The responses from Northern and Southern Hemisphere along with 93 eight regions: Europe, North America, Southeast Asia, North Pacific, North Atlantic, Brazil, South Africa and Australia are explored. This study will show that the net NO<sub>x</sub> effect, and the 94 95 associated ozone and methane responses, depend not only on the location of emission, but also 96 that they vary under different experimental approaches.

- 97
- 98
- 99
- 100
- 101
- 102

103	2	Methodology
104		
105	2.1	Chemistry transport model
106		
107	The M	Model for Ozone and Related Tracers, version 3 (MOZART-3) was applied for this study.
108	This	is a 3D Chemistry Transport Model (CTM) designed to simulate atmospheric ozone and
109	its pr	recursors. It was evaluated by Kinnison et al. (2007) and used for various application
110	studie	es, e.g., Sassi et al. (2004), Liu et al. (2009), Wuebbles et al. (2011). Recently,
111	MOZ	CART-3 was exploited in studies dealing with an impact of aircraft $NO_x$ emissions on
112	atmo	spheric composition, e.g., Skowron et al. (2013), Søvde et al. (2014).
113		
114	MOZ	CART-3 accounts for advection based on the flux-form semi-Lagrangian scheme of Lin
115	and F	Rood (1996), shallow and mid-level convection (Hack, 1994), deep convective routine of
116	Zhan	g and MacFarlane (1995), boundary layer exchanges (Holstag and Boville 1993), or wet
117	and o	dry deposition (Brausser et al. (1998) and Müller (1992), respectively). MOZART-3
118	repro	duces detailed chemical and physical processes from the troposphere through the
119	strato	osphere, including gas-phase, photolytic and heterogeneous reactions. The kinetic and
120	photo	ochemical data are based on the NASA/JPL evaluation (Sander et al., 2006).
121		
122	The a	anthropogenic and biomass burning emissions are taken from Lamarque et al. (2010) and
123	repre	sent year 2000, while the biogenic emissions are from POET (Granier et al., 2005).
124	Aircr	aft emissions are represented by the REACT4C base case inventory (e.g., Søvde et al.,
125	2014	) for the year 2006 (CAEP/8 movements). The horizontal resolution is T42 (~ 2.8° x
126	2.8°)	and the vertical domain spans 60 hybrid layers between the surface and 0.1 hPa. The
127	meteo	orological fields are from European Centre for Medium Range Weather Forecast
128	(ECN	AWF), reanalysis ERA-Interim data for the years 2004–2006 (Dee et al., 2011).

129

#### 130 2.2 Incremental regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions

131

132 In order to explore the impact of regional aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions on climate, ten geographical 133 domains were defined: Europe (EUR), North America (NA), Southeast Asia (SE ASIA), 134 North Pacific (NPAC), North Atlantic (NATL), Brazil (BR), South Africa (SAFR), Australia 135 (AU), Northern Hemisphere (NH) and Southern Hemisphere (SH) (Figures 1 and 2). The 136 aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions are characterized by a heterogeneous pattern, where more than 50% of

137 aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions is present over North America, Europe and Southeast Asia. The 138 selected geographical domains constitute 62% (based on REACT4C 2006 inventory) of global 139 total aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions. Each region represents different chemical and meteorological 140 background conditions that will influence the aircraft  $NO_x$  perturbation.

141

142 Incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions constitute a series of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates that were 143 applied to one region per experiment (Table 1). The injections of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions are valid for all altitudes in the defined domains. Each incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> case is based on 144 145 either an equal mass or a relative mass of emissions. The equal mass of emissions constitutes 146 different relative addition of emission to the total NO<sub>x</sub> in each region, e.g., the injection of 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> is equal to ~30% increase of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> for northern continental regions 147 148 and it rises to ~160% or ~400% for oceanic or southern continental domains, respectively 149 (Table 1). The relative mass of emissions result in different amount of emitted  $NO_x$  in each region. The 5% NO<sub>x</sub> increase per year is smaller than addition of 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> by  $\sim$ 80– 150 151 95% for most of the regions. The 100% NO<sub>x</sub> increase per year is greater than addition of 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> by ~70% for continental regions, but it is still smaller by ~40% for oceanic regions. 152 153

These two experimental designs address different natures of investigations. The question addressed with 'fixed NO<sub>x</sub>' experiments is the regional sensitivity to unit mass of emission. The employment of relative aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions might be more realistic in terms of defining the actual aviation NO<sub>x</sub> effects or the assessment of the future air traffic growth. Anyway, both types of experiments give useful insight into regional NO<sub>x</sub>–O<sub>3</sub>–CH<sub>4</sub> systems.

159

160 Forty six experiments were performed, one reference (base aircraft emission) run and forty 161 five perturbations (incremental aircraft emission) simulations, each starting in January 2006 162 and finishing in December 2006; each simulation was preceded by a two-year spin-up, 2004– 163 2005. The aircraft perturbation is derived by extracting the difference between 'aircraft' and 164 'incremental aircraft' experiments. Since our experiments are performed for 3 years, the 165 magnitude of aircraft stratospheric  $O_3$  response is not fully represented. Thus, the  $O_3$  column 166 change presented in this paper is overestimated by 1.1%; however, the resultant O<sub>3</sub>RF is not 167 affected.

- 168
- 169
- 170

- 171 2.3 Metrics calculations
- 172

173 The monthly O<sub>3</sub> MOZART-3 outputs are used for short-term O<sub>3</sub> radiative forcing (RF) 174 calculations, using an off-line Edwards - Slingo radiation code (Edwards and Slingo, 1996). 175 The model calculates the radiative fluxes and heating rates based on the  $\delta$ -Eddington form of the 176 two-stream equations in both, the long-wave and short-wave spectral regions. Cloud treatment is 177 set up based on averaged ISCCP D2 data (Rossow and Schiffer, 1999), which are used to 178 determine the position and amount of ice clouds and water in the atmosphere. Climatological 179 fields of temperature and specific humidity are determined by ERA-Interim data (Dee et al., 180 2011).

181

The CH<sub>4</sub> concentrations change is assumed to be in equilibrium with the OH change due to the aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> perturbation from constant emissions (Fuglestvedt et al., 1999). These steadystate CH<sub>4</sub> aircraft responses are further used for long-term CH<sub>4</sub> RF calculations, using the simplified expression defined in Myhre et al. (1998). The additional long-term effects, consequently also assumed as steady-state changes, CH<sub>4</sub>-induced O<sub>3</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> impact on stratospheric water vapour (SWV) are also calculated and defined as 50% of CH<sub>4</sub> RF (Myhre et al., 2013) and 15% of CH<sub>4</sub> RF (Myhre et al., 2007), respectively.

189

190 The calculations of Global Warming Potentials (GWP) are based on a methodology described 191 by Fuglestvedt et al., (2010). Assuming, that the constant one-year emission is a step emission 192 and the successive decay occurs of the resulting steady-state forcing ( $\Delta F^{SS}$ ) from the end of 193 the year, the AGWP can be calculated through: AGWP (H) =  $\Delta F^{SS}$  (1 –  $\alpha(\exp(-(H-1)/\alpha) - \exp(-H/\alpha))$ ), where H is the time horizon and  $\alpha$  is lifetime (primary-mode lifetime in case of 195 CH<sub>4</sub>-induced O<sub>3</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub>). The CO<sub>2</sub> AGWPs are taken from Joos et al. (2013).

- 196
- 197

#### **3** Effects of hemispherical and regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions

- 199
- 200 3.1 Chemical perturbation
- 201

The peak of  $O_3$  perturbation is concentrated at cruise altitudes in all regions (Figure 3); however, the same amount of additional aircraft  $NO_x$  (0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>) emitted from various locations leads to different magnitudes and extents of  $O_3$  perturbation. The NH's  $O_3$ 

205 perturbation is concentrated mainly at cruise altitudes, where most of the emissions occur, 206 whilst the SH's  $O_3$  response is observed throughout the vertical domain. This might be 207 explained by the fact by that SH's aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions are concentrated mostly in the low-208 latitudes (there are hardly any SH's emissions for latitudes greater than 52°S), where the 209 convective transport is strong. This is the case also for BR and AU, where the chemical 210 impact has a greater vertical extent than for other regions.

211

212 The aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> perturbation in different regions shows disparities in their impact on global 213 O<sub>3</sub> burden and CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime change (Table 2). The Southern Hemisphere produces 40% more 214 O<sub>3</sub> per emitted aircraft N, and is twice as efficient in CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime reduction, than the Northern 215 Hemisphere. A similar pattern in O<sub>3</sub> change is observed if the North Pacific is compared with 216 Europe. In general, the efficiency of ozone production for remote northern oceanic regions is 217 greater than for northern continental regions by 34% and this results in the larger O<sub>3</sub> burden 218 change for NPAC and NATL compared with EUR and NA. Among continental regions, 219 southern AU gives the greatest mass of perturbed  $O_3$ . The largest  $O_3$  change did not always 220 introduce the greatest CH<sub>4</sub> reduction. The CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime reduction over NPAC is almost as high 221 as over SE ASIA, however NPAC's CH<sub>4</sub> follows the high O<sub>3</sub> burden change, which is not 222 observed for SE ASIA's O<sub>3</sub> burden change. The least efficient CH<sub>4</sub> loss occurs over NATL, 223 the greatest efficiency in CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime reduction is observed over southern BR, SAFR and AU. 224

225

3.2

#### Radiative forcings and global warming potentials

226 227

The latitudinal distributions of short-term  $O_3$  RF for different geographical regions are shown in Figure 4. In general, these patterns of RFs are governed by latitudinal profiles of regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions. However, the magnitudes of O<sub>3</sub> RF responses differ: the SH's O<sub>3</sub> RF is much larger, by 52%, than NH's short-term forcing and NPAC, NATL exceed, by 29%, the O<sub>3</sub> responses from northern continental regions. The greatest magnitudes of short-term O<sub>3</sub> RF responses are those from southern low-latitudes: BR, SAFR and AU, that is in contrast to their aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions magnitudes.

Figure 5 shows the normalized net global annual mean RF and the four component forcings, for different geographical regions. The inter-hemispheric differences in the resultant effects are significant: both short-term  $O_3$  RF and long-term negative RFs are twice as strong over SH than over NH. The greatest net NO<sub>x</sub> RF value is observed over North Atlantic and Brazil,

which is the result of strong positive short-term  $O_3$  RF and relatively weak long-term negative forcings for NATL and very strong positive short-term  $O_3$  RF for BR. The largest short-term  $O_3$  RF and long-term CH<sub>4</sub> RF among northern regions is found for NPAC and SE ASIA, respectively, whilst among southern regions for AU. The negative forcings play a relatively large role at low-latitudes, where an efficient CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation leads to substantial reduction of the net NO<sub>x</sub> RF for BR, SAFR and AU, but also SE ASIA. The smallest net value of positive and negative forcings is observed for North America and Europe.

246 While RF indicates the climate effects between past and present point in time, GWP gives the 247 perspective for future impact of current emissions. The aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> GWPs from regional 248 emissions differ greatly; however, the net NO<sub>x</sub> GWP values are positive for all regions and 249 each time horizon (Table 3). There are substantial differences in calculated GWPs; the 250 greatest values are calculated for a 20-year time horizon for each region and the significant, by 251 ~80%, reduction of GWPs appears with larger time horizons. The largest GWP values are 252 calculated for Brazil; however, for greater time horizons the North Atlantic's GWPs are 253 equally high, that is caused by less pronounced long-term negative RF effects. The smallest 254 GWP values are found for Europe for each time horizon.

255

#### 256 3.3 Discussion

257 The differences in magnitudes of  $O_3$  perturbation originate from various background 258 conditions specific for each region. The spatial variation of O<sub>3</sub> burden change has a strong 259 correlation with NO<sub>x</sub> background concentration at flight level (Figure 6), which was also 260 presented by Stevenson and Derwent (2009), but for O<sub>3</sub> integrated RFs. Generally, the largest 261 global and annual  $O_3$  burden change is observed for locations where NO<sub>x</sub> background is low 262 and it is decreasing with greater  $NO_x$  concentrations. The SE ASIA, with large  $NO_x$ 263 background, is an exception here, as the efficiency of  $O_3$  production charged by the intensity 264 of solar flux results in relatively large O<sub>3</sub> burden change.

265

The large  $O_3$  response over remote oceanic regions might be unravelled by small background NO<sub>x</sub> concentrations (Figure 6). The large  $O_3$  response over SE ASIA might be additionally explained by the intensity of solar irradiance that drives the photochemistry: taking into account the high NO<sub>x</sub> background conditions in this region, the magnitude of  $O_3$  change is

substantial. The mean concentration of NO<sub>x</sub> at 227 hPa is 93 pptv, as modelled by MOZART-270 271 3; however, mean local annual NO<sub>x</sub> concentrations reach  $\sim$ 400 pptv for SE ASIA, while these 272 over mid-latitudinal regions are ~70 pptv. One of the factors that significantly modify SE 273 ASIA's NO<sub>x</sub> background at flight level is the NO<sub>x</sub> source from lightning. The SE ASIA region 274 is a receptor of 30% of global total lightning  $NO_x$  emissions at cruise altitudes; in comparison 275 to 8% for BR and less than 1% for the rest of the regions, SE ASIA's lightning NO<sub>x</sub> is 276 significant. The southern BR, SAFR and AU O<sub>3</sub> responses are driven by both relatively low 277 NO<sub>x</sub> background and solar intensity. Not only NO<sub>x</sub> background alone, but also the relationship 278 between abundances of NO<sub>x</sub> and photochemically generated hydrogen oxide radicals (HO<sub>x</sub>) 279 influence the amount of  $O_3$  that can be formed. The shift in the  $HO_x$  balance towards OH, 280 having at the same time relatively higher  $NO_x$  levels compared to  $HO_2$ , that is the case for 281 EUR (Figure 6), increases the importance of OH+NO<sub>2</sub> termination reaction chain that in turn 282 decreases the  $O_3$  production.

283

284 The concentrations of CH<sub>4</sub> differ between regions within 1% range, also CO is relatively 285 uniformly distributed among investigated regions (Figure 6); both CO and CH<sub>4</sub> are an 286 important O<sub>3</sub> precursors. The CH<sub>4</sub> perturbations depend highly on the place and extent 287 (latitude and altitude) of the O<sub>3</sub> perturbation (Köhler et al., 2008), as both temperature and 288 concentrations of OH and CH<sub>4</sub> affect the efficiency of CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation. The most efficient CH<sub>4</sub> 289 lifetime reduction occurs over SE ASIA and southern regions, BR, SAFR, AU, where 290 temperature and oxidizing conditions are the most favourable among the investigated 291 domains; the least pronounced CH<sub>4</sub> response is observed for NATL, that is not the case for 292 another oceanic region, NPAC. The OH and CH<sub>4</sub> backgrounds are of similar magnitudes over 293 NPAC and NATL; however, the temperature pattern shows differences, being higher over North Pacific, by  $\sim 6^{\circ}$ K ( $\sim 3\%$ ) and the lower temperature slows down the CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation. 294 295 Moreover, the cruise altitudes for NATL are at 10.98 km that is one level higher than for 296 NPAC (Figure 2); aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions emitted at higher altitudes result in reduced potential 297 in CH<sub>4</sub> change (e.g., Skowron et al., 2013). These might be the one of the reasons of the less 298 efficient CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime reduction over North Atlantic.

299

301

300 Recently Köhler et al. (2013) presented results for regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> impacts from four regions: USA, Europe, India and China. The 0.036 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> was injected

302 through all vertical layers into limited domains. In their study the greatest O<sub>3</sub> mass change and

303  $O_3$  forcings, as well as net NO<sub>x</sub> forcings were found for low latitudinal regions compared with

304 northern continental regions and the net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs and GWPs are positive. This is in agreement 305 with results from this study. However, some discrepancies appear when magnitudes of 306 responses are compared. The "continental mid-latitudinal" O<sub>3</sub> RFs are smaller in this study by 307 15–26% than Köhler's et al. (2013); however, the net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs are reported to be greater for 308 this work, by 6% for EUR and 38% for NA. It is difficult to compare the results for "northern 309 low-latitudinal" regions, as the geographical extents of investigated domains differ: in this 310 study it reaches the 12°S circle of latitude, in Köhler's et al. (2013) – 6°N. Moreover, SE 311 ASIA region in this study is characterized by very high NO<sub>x</sub> background concentrations from 312 lightning emissions, while Köhler's India and China are relatively 'free' from those high NO<sub>x</sub> 313 lightning emission, as modelled by MOZART-3. These might be one of the reasons of the 314 substantial differences in O<sub>3</sub> response and the resultant NO<sub>x</sub> RFs over Asia.

315

316 Whilst there is a general qualitative agreement in general properties of regional responses 317 between Köhler et al. (2013) and this study, the comparison with Stevenson and Derwent 318 (2009) becomes more complicated. Their study presents integrated radiative forcings (IRF) 319 over 100-year time horizon of positive and negative responses of chemical system due to aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions. The aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> increase (4 kg(NO<sub>2</sub>) s<sup>-1</sup> = 0.04 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>) was 320 321 injected for a period of month (July) at cruise altitudes (~200-300 hPa) in a limited 322 geographical domains. Unfortunately, a detailed comparison is not possible as Stevenson and Derwent (2009) did not provide an exact number for their AGWPs. However, some 323 324 peculiarities are noticed, e.g., the net IRFs are negative for most of the locations. The inter-325 model differences might play a role here; however, other aspects exist as well. Firstly, the 326 aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> increase was performed only for a period of one month, July. The small Asian 327 short-term O<sub>3</sub> response may indicate that it can influence the results to some extent (the NO<sub>x</sub> 328 background (due to lightning) is greater in this region during summer compared with winter 329 months, when the lightning  $NO_x$  'moves' more south from the equator). The response of a 330  $NO_x-O_3-CH_4$  system is highly dependent on the state of the atmosphere into which aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> is injected (e.g., Stevenson et al., 2004) and a single month perturbation is not 331 332 representative and comparable with annual integrations when the regional responses are 333 investigated. Secondly, the amount of emitted NO<sub>x</sub> during one month is the same as the 334 amount of NO<sub>x</sub> applied in this study and by Köhler et al. (2013), but for a period of year. As it 335 is shown in the forthcoming Section 4, the size of NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates influence the response 336 of the chemical system due to regional emissions.

337

### 338 4 Response of the NO<sub>x</sub>-O<sub>3</sub>-CH<sub>4</sub> system for different rates of regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions

340

341 The responses of the chemical system from regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> perturbations vary with the 342 size of the  $NO_x$  emissions rate and in a non-linear way (Figure 7); the greater  $NO_x$  emission 343 rates lead to weaker O<sub>3</sub> responses and less pronounced CH<sub>4</sub> reductions. However, each region 344 has its own distinctive sensitivity in the response of chemical system. The O<sub>3</sub> response over 345 Southeast Asia is much less sensitive to different aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates than over oceans, 346 where the  $O_3$  change depends significantly on the amount of emitted  $NO_x$ . For example, as a result of 6.39 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> experiments, SE ASIA has the greatest global O<sub>3</sub> burden change and 347 NATL's  $O_3$  is observed to be of similar magnitude as  $O_3$  for EUR, which is in contrast to what 348 349 was presented in the section above. The CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime reduction also changes with aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> 350 emission rates. The non-linearity of CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime reduction is stronger at low latitudes, where 351 conditions for CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation (high temperature and concentrations of OH) are advantageous, 352 compared with mid-latitudes. Thus, CH<sub>4</sub> over SH, SE ASIA, BR, SAFR and AU follows 353 strictly the  $O_3$  sensitivity to additional  $NO_x$  emissions: the rate of the compensation between 354 O<sub>3</sub> and CH<sub>4</sub> remains almost the same for each incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> case (Figure 8). The 355 ratio of the CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime change per unit of O<sub>3</sub> change for SH, SE ASIA, BR, SAFR and AU 356 changes by no more than 2%, with greater NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates. This is not observed for other 357 regions, especially oceanic domains, where  $CH_4/O_3$  ratio becomes significantly greater (44%) 358 for NATL) with larger  $NO_x$  emission rates. These results show that the variation in 359 experimental design strongly influences the magnitude of the contribution from individual 360 regions to overall chemical perturbation, e.g., the greatest O<sub>3</sub> burden change, can easily belong 361 to either NPAC, or SE ASIA depending on the size of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates.

- 362
- 363

### 364 5 Variation of the effects of hemispherical and regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> 365 emissions

366

The varying regional chemical responses depend on the size of the aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions (Figure 7), being especially pronounced for remote domains. The regional  $O_3$  and  $CH_4$ responses saturate with greater aircraft  $NO_x$  emission rates, where scale of this processes reach different limits for each region. Equal mass of aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions leads to substantially

- 371 different, sometimes unrealistic, relative increases of aircraft  $NO_x$  (Table 1), which means that 372 each regional domain is pushed to different regimes of its local  $NO_x$ – $O_3$ – $CH_4$  system, when it 373 'deals' with additional  $NO_x$ . In order to try to preserve the subtle balance of regional  $NO_x$ – $O_3$ – 374  $CH_4$  systems with the existing emission patterns of aircraft and background  $NO_x$ , the 375 experiments with equal relative aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions are employed (Table 1).
- 376

377 The net NO<sub>x</sub> radiative forcing from regional perturbations are found to be greater for experiments with lower aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates, which is the 5% (N)  $yr^{-1}$  case and tend to 378 379 decrease with greater aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions (Table 4). The net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs of EUR, NA and NATL are larger by ~33% for 5% (N) yr<sup>-1</sup> compared with 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>, the difference for 380 381 NPAC's net NO<sub>x</sub> RF increases to 157%. The short-term O<sub>3</sub> RF variation ranges from 10% for 382 NA to 44% for NPAC; CH<sub>4</sub> RF variation ranges from up to 8% for continental regions and 383 rises significantly for oceanic regions reaching 64% for NATL. In general, for smaller aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions rates short-term  $O_3$  RF is calculated to be the greatest and CH<sub>4</sub> RF, and 384 385 consequently CH<sub>4</sub>-induced O<sub>3</sub> RF and SWV RF are calculated to be the smallest (less 386 negative) compared with greater aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions rates.

387

There is one exception, SE ASIA: the values of net  $NO_x$  RFs for different incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission cases stay within a ~2% range. The SE ASIA short-term O<sub>3</sub> RF increases with increasing NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates and it is observed to be 7% lower for 5% (N) yr<sup>-1</sup> compared with 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>, and 1% different for 100% (N) yr<sup>-1</sup> compared with 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>.

392

393 The background atmospheric conditions of SE ASIA domain might explain this distinct 394 behaviour. The HO<sub>x</sub> background at flight level over SE ASIA is one of the highest, next to 395 BR, among all investigated regions (Figure 6), having at the same time low NO<sub>x</sub> background 396 (< 1 pbbv). Under this condition an important termination chain for HO<sub>2</sub> would be HO<sub>2</sub> + HO<sub>2</sub>. 397 (Seinfeld and Pandis, 2006). This finds further explanations in Lin et al. (1988) box model 398 study, where it is shown that for low  $NO_x$  background the radical combination reactions (RO<sub>2</sub>) 399 and HO<sub>2</sub>) supress the non-linearity of  $O_3$  production efficiency. Additionally, Wu et al. (2009) 400 found that the non-linearity of  $O_3$  production, but in the continental boundary layer, is much 401 weaker for NO<sub>x</sub>-limited conditions.

402

403 It is worth to note that SE ASIA is much larger than other investigated geographical regions;404 thus, e.g., it represents a wider range of meteorological phenomena over the year. However, as

it is presented in Supplementary Information (SI), it is not likely that the size of the domainmight influence the observed linearity of SE ASIA's effects.

407

408 The regional ratios of the CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime change per O<sub>3</sub> burden change vary with different sizes 409 of emitted aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> and they decrease with increasing aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions (Figure 9). 410 The greatest differences are found to be over oceans, where the  $CH_4$  lifetime change per  $O_3$ 411 burden change varies by 54% for NATL and 47% for NPAC between aircraft emissions of 0.71 and 1.42 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>; the continental (EUR and NA) differences constitute ~10% between 412 0.71 and 1.8 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>. The CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime change per O<sub>3</sub> burden change for SE ASIA varies 413 414 only by 3% for different aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions rates, which results in relatively constant 415 magnitudes of net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs (Table 4). The regional metric values are significantly correlated 416 with ratio of CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime change per  $O_3$  change (r=0.7, p<0.001). The remote oceanic 417 regions, with small  $CH_4$  lifetime change per  $O_3$  burden change values, give larger net  $NO_x$ 418 GWPs than continental regions with greater  $CH_4/O_3$  ratios. In general, regional aviation net 419  $NO_x$  GWPs decrease with increasing aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions; consequently, the SE ASIA is 420 again an exception.

421

The spread in the reported regional net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs and GWPs differs between different 422 423 experimental designs (Figure 10). Experiments with 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> have shown reduced 424 variability of calculated metrics, mainly through supressed NPAC response. The aviation net NO<sub>x</sub> GWP varies from 25 (EUR) to 110 (NATL) for 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> incremental aircraft 425  $NO_x$  emissions experiments. The 5% (N) yr<sup>-1</sup> incremental aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions case results 426 427 in new values ranging from 31 for EUR to 256 for NPAC. Regional application of an equal 428 mass and a relative mass of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission result in significant difference in the 429 magnitudes of calculated metrics that constitutes ~49%, as an average among investigated 430 regions.

- 431
- 432
- 433
- 434
- 435
- 436
- 437
- ....
- 438

#### 439 **6** Conclusions

440

441 Aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions injected into different geographical locations, based on MOZART-3 442 simulations, affect the sensitivities of global chemical responses and the compensating 443 balance between  $O_3$  and  $CH_4$  is specific for each regional domain. The resultant  $O_3$  burden 444 change varies by 54% between different regions, where Europe and Australia result in lowest 445 and greatest O<sub>3</sub> perturbation, respectively. The aviation net NO<sub>x</sub> GWP<sub>100</sub> varied from 25 for Europe to 110 for the North Atlantic (based on 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> 446 447 emission experiments). Significant hemispherical disparity in the resultant effects from 448 aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> perturbation was also found, where Southern Hemisphere's short-term and long-449 term responses were twice greater than those for Northern Hemisphere. The remote oceanic 450 region of North Atlantic, along with tropical Brazil, turned out to result in the greatest magnitude of aircraft net NO<sub>x</sub> effect, ~10.0 mW m<sup>-2</sup>/Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>. The low-latitudinal regions 451 452 appeared also to have the greatest compensation between the short-term O<sub>3</sub> effect and long-453 term CH<sub>4</sub> responses that efficiently reduced their net NO<sub>x</sub> climate impacts.

454

455 The regional chemical perturbations varies with the size of aircraft  $NO_x$  emission rate; 456 therefore, experiments based on equal mass of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions might imply violation 457 of the subtle balance of the regional NO<sub>x</sub>-O<sub>3</sub>-CH<sub>4</sub> systems. This affects mainly geographical 458 domains with low NO<sub>x</sub> concentration (e.g., remote oceanic regions), where injected NO<sub>x</sub> often 459 constitutes a significant relative increase, which pushes the local NO<sub>x</sub>-O<sub>3</sub>-CH<sub>4</sub> balance into a 460 saturation regime and reduces its aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> effect. The experiments with small equal 461 relative aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions revealed the new potential of regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> effects. The greatest effect was observed for North Pacific with its net NO<sub>x</sub> RF of 23.7 mW m<sup>-2</sup>/Tg(N)yr<sup>-1</sup>. 462 The 5% (N) yr<sup>-1</sup> incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission case resulted in a net aviation NO<sub>x</sub> GWP<sub>100</sub> 463 464 ranging from 31 for Europe to 256 for North Pacific, representing much greater spread in the 465 reported regional metric values.

466

The size of the aircraft  $NO_x$  emission rate and consequently an experimental approach strongly influence both the magnitudes and the perception of regional dependencies, where e.g., the greatest net  $NO_x$  effect interchangeably belongs to either North Pacific or North Atlantic and Brazil. Thus, it is important to apply an appropriate experimental design depending on the nature of investigations.

472

473 Acknowledgements: Ivar Isaksen is acknowledged for helpful discussions and anonymous reviewers
474 are thanked for their comments. This work was funded by the United Kingdom Department for
475 Transport.

- 476
- 477 478

#### 479 **References**

ACI, 2011. ACI Global Traffic Forecast 2010-2029. Airports Council International, Montreal, Canada.
 http://www.aci.aero/publications.

482

Berntsen T. K., Isaksen I.S.A., 1999. Effects of lightning and convection on changes in tropospheric
ozone due to NO<sub>x</sub> emissions from aircraft. Tellus 51B, 766-788.

485

Berntsen, T. K., Fuglestvedt J. S., Joshi M. M., Shine K. P., Stuber N., Ponater M., Sausen R.,
Hauglustaine D. A., Li L., 2005. Response of climate to regional emissions of ozone precursors:
sensitivities and warming potentials. Tellus, Series B: Chemical and Physical Meteorology 57, 283304.

490

Brasseur G. P., Hauglustaine D. A., Walters S., Rasch P. J., Müller J.-F., Granier C., Tie X. X., 1998.
MOZART, a global chemical transport model for ozone and related tracers, Part 1: Model description.
Journal of Geophysical Research 103 (21), 28265-28289.

494

Collins W. J., Fry M. M., Yu H., Fuglestvedt J. S., Shindell D. T., West J. J., 2013. Global and
regional temperature change potentials for near-term climate forcers. Atmospheric Chemistry and
Physics 13, 2471-2485.

498

Dee D. P., Uppala S. M., Simmons A. J., Berrisford P., Poli P., Kobayashi S., Andrae U., Balmaseda
M. A., Balsamo G., Bauer P., Bechtold P., Beljaars A. C. M., van de Berg L., Bidlot J., Bormann N.,
Delsol C., Dragani R., Fuentes M., Geer A. J., Haimberger L., Healy S. B., Hersbach H., Hólm E. V.,
Isaksen L., Kållberg P., Köhler M., Matricardi M., McNally A. P., Monge-Sanz B. M., Morcrette J. J.,
Park B. K., Peubey C., de Rosnay P., Tavolato C., Thépaut J. N., Vitart F., 2011. The ERA-interim
reanalysis: configuration and performance of the data assimilation system. Quarterly Journal of the
Royal Meteorological Society 137, 553-597.

506

Edwards J. M., Slingo A., 1996. Studies with a flexible new radiation code. I: Choosing a
configuration for a large-scale model. Quarterly Journal of the Royal Meteorological Society 122, 689719.

510

Fry M. M., Schwarzkopf M. D., Adelman Z., Naik V., Collins W. J., West J. J., 2013. Net radiative
forcing and air quality responses to regional CO emission reductions. Atmospheric Chemistry and

- 513 Physics 13, 5381–5399.
- 514

515 Fuglestvedt J. S., Berntsen T. K., Isaksen I. S. A., Mao H., Liang X. Z. and Wang W. C., 1999.

516 Climatic forcing of nitrogen oxides through changes in tropospheric ozone and methane; global 3D

- 517 model studies. Atmospheric Environment 33, 961-77.
- 518

- Fuglestvedt J. S., Shine K. P., Cook J., Berntsen T., Lee D. S., Stenke A., Skeie R. B., Velders G. J.
  M., Waitz I. A., 2010. Transport impacts on atmosphere and climate: Metrics. Atmospheric
  Environment 44, 4648-4677.
- 522

523 Granier C., Guenther A., Lamarque J. F., Mieville A., Muller J. F., Olivier J., Orlando J., Peters G.,
524 Petron G., Tyndall G., Wallens S., 2005. POET, a database of surface emissions of ozone precursors.
525 (available at http://www.aero.jussieu.fr/projet/ACCENT/POET.php).

525 526

529

532

535

527 Grewe V., Stenke A., 2008. Airclim: an efficient tool for climate evaluation of aircraft technology.528 Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 8, 4621-4639.

- Hack J. J., 1994. Parameterization of moist convection in the NCAR community climate model(CCM2). Journal of Geophysical Research 99, 5551-5568.
- Holstag A., Boville B. A., 1993. Local versus nonlocal boundary-layer diffusion in a global climate
  model. Journal of Climate 6, 1825-1842.
- Isaksen I. S. A., Hov Ø., Hesstvedt E., 1978. Ozone generation over rural areas. Environmental
  Science and Technology 12, 1279-1284.
- 538

Jaeglé L., Jacob D. J., Brune W. H., Tan D., Faloona I. C., Weinheimer A. J., Ridley B. A., Campos T.
L., Sachse G. W., 1998. Sources of HO<sub>x</sub> and production of ozone in the upper troposphere over the
United States. Geophysical Research Letters 25, 1709-1712.

542

Joos F., Roth R., Fuglestvedt J. S., Peters G. P., Enting I. G., von Bloh W., Brovkin V., Burke E. J.,
Eby M., Edwards N. R., Friedrich T., Frölicher T. L., Halloran P. R., Holden P. B., Jones C., Kleinen
T., Mackenzie F. T., Matsumoto K., Meinshausen M., Plattner G.-K., Reisinger A., Segschneider J.,
Shaffer G., Steinacher M., Strassmann K., Tanaka K., Timmermann A., Weaver A. J., 2013. Carbon
dioxide and climate impulse response functions for the computation of greenhouse gas metrics: a
multi-model analysis. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 13, 2793-2825.

Kinnison D. E., Brausser G. P., Walters S., Garcia R. R., Marsh D. R., Sassi F., Harvey V. L., Randall
C. E., Emmons L., Lamarque J. F., Hess P., Orlando J. J., Tie X. X., Randel W.,
Pan L. L., Gettelman A., Granier C., Diehl T., Niemeier U., Simmons A. J., 2007. Sensitivity of
chemical tracers to meteorological parameters in the MOZART-3 chemical transport model, Journal of
Geophysical Research 112, D20302.

- 555
- Köhler M. O., Rädel G., Dessens O., Shine K. P., Rogers H. L., Wild O., Pyle J. A., 2008. Impact of
  perturbations of nitrogen oxide emissions from global aviation. Journal of Geophysical Research 113,
  D11305.
- 559

Köhler M. O., Rädel G., Shine K. P., Rogers H. L., Pyle J. A., 2013. Latitudinal variation of the effect
of aviation NO<sub>x</sub> emissions on atmospheric ozone and methane and related climate metrics.
Atmospheric Environment 64, 1-9.

563

Lamarque J. F., Bond T. C., Eyring V., Granier C., Heil A., Klimont Z., Lee D., Liousse C., Mieville

- A., Owen B., Schultz M. G., Shindell D., Smith S. J., Stehfest E., Van Aardenne J., Cooper O. R.,
- 566 Kainuma M., Mahowald N., McConnell J. R., Naik V., Riahi K., van Vuuren D. P., 2010. Historical

- 567 (1850–2000) gridded anthropogenic and biomass burning emissions of reactive gases and aerosols:
  568 methodology and application. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 10, 7017-7039.
- 569

573

576

579

583

587

593

596

Lee D. S., Pitari G., Grewe, V., Gierens K., Penner J. E., Petzold A., Prather M., Schumann U., Bais
A., Berntsen T., Iachetti D., Lim L. L., Sausen R., 2010. Transport impacts on atmosphere and climate:
Aviation. Atmospheric Environment 44, 4678-4734.

- Lin S. J., Rood R. B., 1996. A fast flux form semi-Lagrangian transport scheme on the sphere.
  Monthly Weather Review 124, 2046-2070.
- Lin X., Trainer M., Liu S. C., 1988. On the nonlinearity of the tropospheric ozone production. Journalof Geophysical Research 93, 15879-15888.
- Liu Y., Liu C. X., Wang H. P., Tie X. X., Gao S. T., Kinnison D., Brasseur G., 2009. Atmospheric
  tracers during the 2003–2004 stratospheric warming event and impact of ozone intrusions in the
  troposphere. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 9, 2157-2170.
- Lund M., Berntsen T., Fuglestvedt J., Ponater M., Shine K., 2012. How much information is lost by
  using global mean climate metrics? an example using the transport sector. Climatic Change, 113, 949963.
- Müller J.-F., 1992. Geographical distribution and seasonal variation of surface emissions and
  deposition velocities of atmospheric trace gases. Journal of Geophysical Research 97, 3787-3804.
- Myhre G., Highwood E. J., Shine K. P., Stordal F., 1998, New estimates of radiative forcing due to
  well mixed greenhouse gases. Geophysical Research Letters 25, 2715-2718.
- Myhre G., Nilsen J.S., Gulstad L., Shine K.P., Rognerud B., Isaksen I. S. A., 2007. Radiative forcing
   due to stratospheric water vapour from CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation. Geophysical Research Letters 34, L01807.
- Myhre G., Shine K. P., Rädel G., Gauss M., Isaksen I. S. A., Tang Q., Prather M. J., Williams J. E.,
  van Velthoven P., Dessens O., Koffi B., Szopa S., Hoor P., Grewe V., Borken-Kleefeld J., Berntsen T.
  K., Fuglestvedt J. S., 2011. Radiative forcing due to changes in ozone and methane caused by the
  transport sector. Atmospheric Environment 45, 387-394.
- 601
- Myhre G., Shindell D., Bréon F.-M., Collins W., Fuglestvedt J., Huang J., Koch D., Lamarque J.-F.,
  Lee D., Mendoza B., Nakajima T., Robock A., Stephens G., Takemura T., Zhang H., 2013.
  Anthropogenic and natural radiative forcing. Climate Change 2013: the Physical Science Basis.
  Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on
- 606 Climate Change. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
- 607
- Prather M., Sausen R., Grossmann A. S., Haywood J. M., Rind D., Subbaraya B. H., 1999. Potential
  climate change from aviation. Chapter 6 of 'Aviation and the global atmosphere'. In: Penner J. E., et
  al. (Eds.), Special Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge University
  Press, Cambridge.
- 612
- Rossow W. B., Schiffer R. A., 1999. Advances in understanding clouds from ISCCP, Bulletin ofthe American Meteorological Society 80, 2261-2288.

	A CCEDTED MANUSCODT
(15	ACCEPTED MANUSCRIPT
615 616 617 618 619 620	Sander S., Friedl R., Ravishankara A., Golden D., Kolb C., Kurylo M., Molina M., Moortgat G., Finlayson-Pitts B., Wine P., Huie R., Orkin V., 2006. Chemical kinetics and photochemical data for use in atmospheric studies – evaluation number 15. Technical report, Jet Propulsion Laboratory (JPL) of the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA).
621 622 623	Sassi F., Kinnison D. E., Boville B. A., Garcia R. R., Roble R., 2004. Effect of El Niño – Southern Oscillation on the dynamical, thermal, and chemical structure of the middle atmosphere. Journal of Geophysical Research 109, D17108.
625 626 627	Shindell D. T., 2012. Evaluation of the absolute regional temperature potential. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 12, 7955-7960.
628 629 630 631	Shine K., Berntsen T., Fuglestvedt J., Sausen R., 2005. Scientific issues in the design of metrics for inclusion of oxides of nitrogen in global climate agreements. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 102, 44, 15768-15773.
632 633 634 635	Skowron A., Lee D. S., De Leon R. R., 2013. The assessment of the impact of aviation $NO_x$ on ozone and other radiative forcing responses – The importance of representing cruise altitudes accurately. Atmospheric Environment 74, 159-168.
636 637 638 639 640	Søvde O. A., Matthes S., Skowron A., Iachetti D., Lim L., Owen B., Hodnebrog Ø., Di Genova G., Pitari G, Lee D. S., Myhre G., Isaksen I. S. A., 2014. Aircraft emission mitigation by changing route altitude: A multi-model estimate of aircraft $NO_x$ emission impact on $O_3$ photochemistry. Atmospheric Environment 95, 468-479.
641 642 643 644	Stevenson D. S., Doherty R. M., Sanderson M. G., Collins W. J., Johnson C. E., Derwent R.G., 2004. Radiative forcing from aircraft NO <sub>x</sub> emissions: Mechanisms and seasonal dependence. Journal of Geophysical Research 109, D17307.
645 646 647	Stevenson D. S., Derwent R. G., 2009. Does the location of aircraft nitrogen oxide emissions affect their climate impact? Geophysical Research Letters 36, L17810.
648 649 650 651	Wu S. L., Duncan B. N., Jacob D. J., Fiore A. M., Wild O., 2009. Chemical nonlinearities in relating intercontinental ozone pollution to anthropogenic emissions. Geophysical Research Letters 36, L05806.

- Wuebbles D. J., Patten K. O., Wang D., Youn D., Martínez-Avilíes M., Francisco J. S., 2011. Threedimensional model evaluation of the Ozone Depletion Potentials for n-propyl bromide,
  trichloroethylene and perchloroethylene. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 11, 2371-2380.
- 655
- Zhang G. J., McFarlane N. A., 1995. Sensitivity of climate simulations to the parameterization of
  cumulus convection in the Canadian climate centre general circulation model.
  Atmosphere-Ocean 33, 407-446.

REGION	Net NO <sub>x</sub> RF [mW m <sup>-2</sup> /Tg(N) yr <sup>-1</sup> ]				
REGION	0.035 Tg(N) yr <sup>-1</sup>	$5 \%(N) yr^{-1}$	100 %(N) yr <sup>-1</sup>		
SE ASIA	5.33	5.26	5.25		
S ASIA	6.51	6.67	6.35		
E ASIA	4.65	4.59	4.46		

Table SI 1: Normalized aircraft net  $NO_x$  radiative forcings for different Asian incremental aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions. Net  $NO_x$  accounts for short-term  $O_3$  RF, CH<sub>4</sub>-induced  $O_3$  RF and CH<sub>4</sub> with SWV RF

Table 1: Description of regional domains along with changes in aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions for a series of experimental cases and each regional domain.

			Fixed m	ass incremental a	ircraft N	Relative increa	mental aircraft N*
REGION	Geographical extent	Aircraft NO <sub>x</sub> [Tg(N) yr <sup>-1</sup> ]	$[\Delta N/base N]$			$[Tg(N) yr^{-1}]$	
			0.035 Tg(N) yr <sup>-1</sup>	0.71 Tg(N) yr <sup>-1</sup>	6.39 Tg(N) yr <sup>-1</sup>	5% (N) yr <sup>-1</sup>	100% (N) yr <sup>-1</sup>
EUR	10°W-30°E; 40°N-60°N	0.112	0.32	6.3	57.2	0.006	0.112
NA	120°W-75°W; 30°N-50°N	0.132	0.27	5.4	48.5	0.007	0.132
SE ASIA	95°E-145°E; 12°S-45°N	0.128	0.28	5.5	50.0	0.006	0.128
NDAC	180°W-140°W;	0.021	1.67	22 4	200 6	0.001	
NPAC	150°E-180°E; 20°N-60°N	0.021	1.07	55.4	500.0	0.001	0.021
NATL	50°W-15°W; 30°N-60°N	0.023	1.54	30.8	276.8	0.001	0.023
BR	60°W-36°W; 36°S-6°S	0.010	4.43	69.7	_	_	_
SAFR	16°E-32°E; 36°S-18°S	0.003	12.2	224.2	_	_	_
AU	134°E-154°E; 38°S-22°S	0.009	4.84	78.0	_	_	_
			Y				
NH	180°W-180°E; 0°-90°N	0.653	0.05	1.1	9.8	0.033	0.653
SH	180°W-180°E; 0°-90°S	0.057	0.62	12.4	111.9	0.003	0.057
Global	180°W-180°E; 90°S-90°N	0.71	0.05	1	9	0.035	0.71

\*The regions BR, SAFR and AU were excluded from these experiments, as aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions for these regions are marginal, their contribution to aircraft  $NO_x$  global total constitute 1.5%, 0.5% and 1.3%, respectively. Thus, the signal from any small relative incremental aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions experiments for these regions is barely visible in CTM results.

Table 2: The global and annual mean  $O_3$  burden change (in Tg) and the CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime reduction (in yr) due to the aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions in different geographical regions. Calculations are done for surface–1hPa domain and are based on 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission. All values are on a per Tg N basis. The CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime for the year 2006, as modelled by MOZART-3, is 8.5 years.

DECION	O <sub>3</sub> burden change	CH <sub>4</sub> lifetime change	ge	
KLUIUN	(Tg)	(yr)		
Global	5.65	-0.081		
NH	5.33	-0.074		
SH	8.82	-0.160		
EUR	4.22	-0.057		
NA	4.73	-0.067		
SE ASIA	5.51	-0.093		
NPAC	7.28	-0.087		
NATL	6.32	-0.057		
BR	7.94	-0.158		
SAFR	7.77	-0.139		
AU	9.11	-0.173		

Table 3: Aviation net  $NO_x$  Global Warming Potentials (GWP) for Northern and Southern Hemisphere and regions: Europe, North America, Southeast Asia, North Atlantic, North Pacific, Brazil, South Africa and Australia for 20-, 100and 500-year time horizons. All values are on a per kg N basis relative to  $CO_2$  and are based on 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> incremental aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions.

REGION	GWP			
	H=20	H=100	H=500	
Global	322	59	17	
NH	305	57	16	
SH	458	70	20	
EUR	164	25	7	
NA	234	40	11	
SE ASIA	329	57	16	
NPAC	477	99	28	
NATL	478	110	31	
BR	542	109	31	
SAFR	416	70	20	
AU	480	87	25	

DECION	Net NO <sub>x</sub> RF [mW m <sup>-2</sup> /Tg(N) yr <sup>-1</sup> ]				
REGION	0.035 Tg(N) yr <sup>-1</sup>	5 %(N) yr <sup>-1</sup>	100 %(N) yr <sup>-1</sup>		
Global	5.51	5.51	4.89		
NH	5.31	5.32	4.76		
SH	6.45	9.02	6.42		
EUR	2.32	2.90	1.97		
NA	3.73	5.07	3.52		
SE ASIA	5.33	5.26	5.25		
NPAC	9.22	23.73	9.53		
NATL	10.21	14.06	10.38		

Table 4: Normalized aircraft net  $NO_x$  radiative forcings for different regional incremental aircraft  $NO_x$  emissions. Net  $NO_x$  accounts for short-term  $O_3$  RF,  $CH_4$ -induced  $O_3$  RF and  $CH_4$  with SWV RF.

CER AND



CEPTER MARK









CHR HAND



CER MAN











the second



Figure SI 1: SE ASIA domain partitioned to smaller domains: E ASIA and S ASIA.

Figure SI 2: Scatter plot of  $CH_4$  lifetime change per  $O_3$  burden change for different Asian domains and a series of aircraft  $NO_x$  emission (dots are individual experiments, lines are the linear best fit lines).

Figure 1: Regional domains selected for this study: Europe (EUR), North America (NA), Southeast Asia (SE ASIA), North Atlantic (NATL), North Pacific (NPAC), Brazil (BR), South Africa (SAFR), Australia (AU), Northern Hemisphere (NH) and Southern Hemisphere (SH), along with latitudinal (right panel) and longitudinal (bottom panel) profiles of regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions.

Figure 2: The vertical profiles of regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions: Northern and Southern Hemisphere (left panel); Europe (EUR), North America (NA), Southeast Asia (SE ASIA), North Atlantic (NATL), North Pacific (NPAC), Brazil (BR), South Africa (SAFR) and Australia (AU) (right panel).

Figure 3: The global and annual mean vertical distributions of  $O_3$  changes (in ppbv) for aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission increases by 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> in different regional domains: Northern (NH) and Southern (SH) Hemispheres (left panel), Europe (EUR), North America (NA), Southeast Asia (SE ASIA), North Atlantic (NATL), North Pacific (NPAC), Brazil (BR), South Africa (SAFR) and Australia (AU) (right panel). The dashed black line represents the O<sub>3</sub> change from global aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission.

Figure 4: Zonal and annual mean net (long wave and shortwave) radiative forcing  $(mW m^{-2}/Tg(N) yr^{-1})$  from short-term O<sub>3</sub> for Northern (NH) and Southern (SH) Hemisphere (left panel) and regions: Europe (EUR), North America (NA), Southeast Asia (SE ASIA), North Atlantic (NATL), North Pacific (NPAC), Brazil (BR), South Africa (SAFR) and Australia (AU) (right panel). Based on 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> experiments. The dashed black line represents the O<sub>3</sub> RF from global aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission.

Figure 5: Radiative forcings per unit emission of N (in mW m<sup>-2</sup>/Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>) due to short-term  $O_3 (O_3)$ , CH<sub>4</sub>-induced  $O_3 (^{CH4}O_3)$ , CH<sub>4</sub> (CH<sub>4</sub>), stratospheric water vapour (SWV) and NO<sub>x</sub> (net of all 4 components) for Northern and Southern Hemisphere and regions: Europe, North America, Southeast Asia, North Atlantic, North Pacific, Brazil, South Africa and Australia. The short-term forcing values are given in red, the long-term forcing values (sum of CH<sub>4</sub>,  $^{CH4}O_3$  and SWV) are shown in blue and the net NO<sub>x</sub> RF magnitudes are presented in green. Based on 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> experiments.

Figure 6: Relationship between background conditions and aircraft  $O_3$  burden change. A) Scatter plot of global and annual  $O_3$  burden change due to aircraft  $NO_x$  emission increase by 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> in different regions against background  $NO_x$  concentration at 227 hPa (dots are individual experiments, line is the best-fit curve). B) Heat map of background conditions (CO concentrations,  $HO_x$  concentrations,  $NO_x$  concentrations and  $OH/HO_2$  ratio) at 227 hPa and aircraft  $O_3$  burden change (aircraft  $O_3$ ) for different regional domains. All variables are presented as an annual mean. The percentage fraction presents how the specific combination of region and background condition contribute to the specific total regional background condition.

Figure 7: The normalized  $O_3$  burden change (red bars) and  $CH_4$  lifetime reduction (blue bars) for a series of geographical regions and aircraft  $NO_x$  emission rates.

Figure 8: The ratio of the  $CH_4$  lifetime change to the  $O_3$  change for a series of geographical regions and aircraft  $NO_x$  emission rates.

Figure 9: Scatter plot of  $CH_4$  lifetime change per  $O_3$  burden change for different regions and a series of aircraft  $NO_x$  emission (dots are individual experiments, lines are the linear best fit lines).

Figure 10: The spread in regional aviation net  $NO_x$  RFs (left) and aviation net  $NO_x$  GWPs (right) for different incremental aircraft  $NO_x$  emission, 5% (N) yr<sup>-1</sup>(blue), 100% (N) yr<sup>-1</sup> (red) and 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup> (green).

- The effects from hemispherical/regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions are explored using 3D CTM, MOZART-3.
- The climate metrics values decrease with increasing regional aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates, except for Southeast Asia.
- Regional applications of an equal mass and a relative mass of aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission result in different regional dependencies.
- > The greatest net  $NO_x$  radiative forcing is observed for remote northern oceanic regions.

1 ว

4

5 6

### Supplementary Information:

## Variation of radiative forcings and global warming potentials from regional aviation NO<sub>x</sub> emissions

Agnieszka Skowron<sup>\*</sup>, David S. Lee and Ruben R. De León

Dalton Research Institute, Manchester Metropolitan University, John Dalton Building, Chester Street,
Manchester M1 5GD, United Kingdom.

10 \*Corresponding author. E-mail: a.skowron@mmu.ac.uk, tel: + 44 (0) 161 247 6703 (A. Skowron).

11 12

14

9

#### 13 SI 1 Additional experiments

The supressed non-linearity of  $O_3$  production and net  $NO_x$  effects is observed for SE ASIA region (Section 5). In order to investigate whether the size of the SE ASIA domain could influence this behaviour, an additional set of experiments was performed using MOZART-3 CTM.

19

The SE ASIA domain was partitioned to two smaller geographical regions, E ASIA (95°E-145°E; 20°N-45°N) and S ASIA (95°E-145°E; 12°S-20°N) (Figure SI 1). The methodology of applied experiments is consistent with what is described in Section 2 and the size of injected aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> rates is the same as it is presented in Table 1.

24

The magnitudes of ratio of the CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime change per unit  $O_3$  change vary for different Asian domains (Figure SI 2). The magnitudes of S ASIA's ratio is greater by 15% and E ASIA's ratio is smaller by 6%, compared with SE ASIA CH<sub>4</sub>/O<sub>3</sub> magnitude (based on 0.035 Tg(N) yr<sup>-1</sup>). The CH<sub>4</sub> lifetime change per O<sub>3</sub> burden change for E ASIA and S ASIA varies only by 3% for different aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emissions rates, which, similarly as for SE ASIA, results in relatively constant magnitudes of net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs.

31

The values of net NO<sub>x</sub> RFs for E ASIA and S ASIA for different incremental aircraft NO<sub>x</sub> emission cases stay within a ~5% range, that is slightly larger than SE ASIA's 2% (Table SI 1). However, as well as for SE ASIA, the short-term O<sub>3</sub> RFs for E ASIA and S ASIA increases with increasing NO<sub>x</sub> emission rates and they are observed to be ~3% lower for 5%

- 36 (N)  $yr^{-1}$  compared with 0.035 Tg(N)  $yr^{-1}$ , and 1% different for 100% (N)  $yr^{-1}$  compared with 37 0.035 Tg(N)  $yr^{-1}$ .
- 38
- 39